

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION**

**Regular Meeting
February 26, 2024 - 6:30 PM
Board Room
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, Michigan 48154**

AGENDA

- I. ROLL CALL: Madeline Acosta, Tammy Bonifield, Karen Bradford, Colleen Burton, Crystal Frank, Liz Jarvis, Mark Johnson**
- II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**
- III. COMMUNICATIONS**
 - A. Principals' Week Resolution 3**
 - B. Recognition of CTE Month 5**
 - C. District Update from the Superintendent**
 - D. Written Communications**
 - E. Response to Prior Audience Communications**
 - F. Audience Communications (limited to 15 minutes, with remainder taking place prior to HEARING FROM BOARD MEMBERS)**
- IV. CONSENT AGENDA--Items marked with an "*" will be considered in one motion. These routine items have been individually reviewed by Board committees and were unanimously recommended for placing on this consent agenda. Any member of the Board may remove items from the consent agenda prior to voting. 6**
- V. DISPOSITION OF MINUTES**
 - A. *Minutes of the Special Meeting of January 29, 2024 7**
 - B. *Minutes of The Regular Meeting of January 29, 2024 8**
 - C. *Minutes of the Special Meeting of February 12, 2024 24**
- VI. BUSINESS MATTERS**
 - A. Approval of Candidate for MASB Board of Director Voting 32**
 - B. Approval of Limited Schools of Choice 2024-2025 40**
 - C. Approval of Network Switches Replacement - 2021 BOND 41**
 - D. Approval of Summer 2024 Demolition Projects - 2021 BOND 44**
- VII. INSTRUCTION MATTERS**
- VIII. PERSONNEL MATTERS**
 - A. Teachers for Approval 53**
 - B. Teachers for Tenure 56**
 - C. Resignations 57**
 - D. Leave of Absence 58**
 - E. Retirement 59**
- IX. HEARING FROM BOARD MEMBERS**
 - A. Hearing from Board Members¹**

X. ADJOURNMENT

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: **Principals' Week Resolution**

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District adopt the attached resolution establishing the week of February 26, 2024, as Principals' Week in Livonia Public Schools.

RATIONALE:

Research has shown that one of the most tangible and indispensable characteristics of effective schools is their strong administrative leadership. The Livonia Public Schools' Board of Education believes this dedicated group of educators deserves this special recognition by proclaiming the week of February 26, 2024 as Principals' Week in the Livonia Public Schools School District.

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

None

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Stacy Jenkins

EXHIBITS:

Attached Resolution

*LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION
February 26, 2024*

*PRINCIPALS' WEEK
RESOLUTION*

WHEREAS, Principals' Week is dedicated to recognizing the significant contributions of Livonia Public Schools' principals and the commitment to providing quality educational experiences and guidance for their students; and,

WHEREAS, energetic and inspiring school leadership is essential if schools, teachers, and support staff are to implement college and career-ready standards and assessments; and,

WHEREAS, school principals play a vital role in the success of students and act as the liaison between the school and the community it serves; and,

WHEREAS, we join with educators, parents and students to raise awareness of the importance of educational leadership;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the trustees of the Livonia Public Schools Board of Education recognize the week of February 26, 2024 as

SCHOOL PRINCIPALS' WEEK

and encourage all citizens to thank and support the efforts of school principals in our community.

*Karen Bradford, President
Board of Education*

STATE OF MICHIGAN



CERTIFICATE OF PROCLAMATION

ON BEHALF OF THE PEOPLE OF MICHIGAN,
I, Gretchen Whitmer, governor of Michigan, do hereby proclaim

February 2024

as

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION MONTH

WHEREAS, career and technical education in Michigan prepares students at the secondary and postsecondary levels to have the academic, technical, and work-behavior skills to enter, compete, and advance in education and their careers; and,

WHEREAS, career and technical education offers a diverse delivery system that provides students with leadership opportunities in various career fields, allowing for the rigorous and relevant application of workplace skills while incorporating reading, writing, and mathematics; and,

WHEREAS, career and technical educational programs serve as a career and college-ready connection and are the foundation of a strong and well-educated workforce and should be available to students in every corner of Michigan; and,

WHEREAS, career and technical education offers students opportunities to earn college credit, industry certification, and licenses in high-wage, high-skill, and in-demand fields, as aligned with Michigan's Top 10 Strategic Education Plan to expand secondary learning opportunities for all students and increase the percentage of adults with a post-secondary credential; and,

WHEREAS, career and technical education provides students with work-based learning experiences to provide Michigan with a highly skilled, sustainable workforce, which will help achieve the state's goal of reaching a 60% postsecondary education attainment rate by 2030; and,

WHEREAS, according to the Michigan Department of Education, career and technical education enrollment in Michigan continued to rise by 2.6% in 2022-23 to 108,874 students enrolled in CTE compared to 2021-22, with 106,077 students, and CTE program completers increased by 8.4% from 44,609 in 2021-22 to 48,334 in 2022-23; and,

WHEREAS, during this month, we join with the Michigan Department of Education, the Michigan Department of Lifelong Education, Advancement, and Potential, the Michigan Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity, and the Michigan Association for Career and Technical Education to encourage youths and adults in Michigan to be ambassadors for career and technical education, and to send the message that Michigan career and technical education students are prepared for 21st-century high-wage, high-skilled, and in-demand jobs

NOW, THEREFORE, I, Gretchen Whitmer, governor of Michigan, proclaim February 2024 as Career and Technical Education Month in Michigan.



Gretchen Whitmer

Gretchen Whitmer

Governor



**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Consent Agenda

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the following consent agenda items, as recommended by the Superintendent:

- V.A. *Minutes of the Special Meeting of January 29, 2024
- V.B. *Minutes of the Regular Meeting of January 29, 2024
- V.C. *Minutes of the Special Meeting of February 12, 2024

RATIONALE:

The agenda for the Board of Education meeting has certain items designated and identified by an asterisk *. These items, identified in advance with the concurrence of all Board members present, will be acted upon in a single motion.

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

None

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Andrea L. Oquist, Superintendent

EXHIBITS:

Attached

Off/Supt/tg

**MINUTES
BOARD OF EDUCATION
Livonia Public Schools
Special Meeting
January 29, 2024**

President Johnson convened the meeting at 6:17 p.m.

Members Present Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Centers, Jarvis, Johnson

Members Absent None

**Election of
Officers**

President:

Mrs. Burton nominated Mrs. Bradford for the office of president.

Voting for Mrs. Bradford:

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson

Nays: None

Vice President:

Mrs. Frank nominated Mr. Johnson for the office of vice president.

Voting for Mr. Johnson

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson

Nays: None

Secretary:

Mrs. Jarvis nominated Mrs. Acosta for the office of secretary.

Voting for Mrs. Acosta

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson

Nays: None

Treasurer:

It was moved by Mrs. Bonifield and supported by Mrs. Jarvis that Alison Smith, Chief Financial Officer, be appointed Treasurer of the Livonia Public Schools School District until the next annual election.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson

Nays: None

Adjournment

President Johnson adjourned the meeting at 6:23 p.m.

Off/Supt/tg

**MINUTES
BOARD OF EDUCATION
Livonia Public Schools
Regular Meeting
January 29, 2024**

President Bradford convened the meeting at 6:30 p.m.

Members Present Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson

Members Absent None

District Update from the Superintendent Superintendent Oquist presented highlights of recent activities taking place across the District, as well as upcoming events.

Board Recognition Month Mrs. Stacy Jenkins, Administrator of Communications, recognized National School Board Month and honored the LPS Board of Education by reading a Recognition Resolution for Board members from the Wayne County Regional Educational Service Agency Board of Education. Superintendent Oquist also expressed her appreciation to the Board, on behalf of the District, for their outstanding work and dedication.

Written Communications None

Response to Prior Audience Communications None

Audience Communications A representative from Senator Cavanaugh’s office shared information about an upcoming District 6 Community Coffee event at the Livonia Fire Department.

Consent Agenda It was moved by Mrs. Acosta and supported by Mrs. Burton that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the following consent agenda items, as recommended by the superintendent:

V.A. *Minutes of the Regular Meeting of December 18, 2023

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson

Nays: None

Approval of HVAC Upgrades for Holmes and Emerson

It was moved by Mr. Johnson and supported by Mrs. Burton that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the purchase and installation of HVAC equipment from Engineered Comfort Systems, located in Taylor, Michigan, for the total amount of \$392,569 which includes hard construction and contingency.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Approval of Purchase of Kitchen Equipment

It was moved by Mrs. Bonifield and supported by Mrs. Jarvis that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the purchase of kitchen equipment from Stafford-Smith, Inc., located in Madison Heights, Michigan for a total cost of \$32,020.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Approval of LCTC 61c(1) Grant Purchase

It was moved by Mrs. Jarvis and supported by Mrs. Bonifield that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the purchase of two Susie S2000 Teatherless Simulators (mannequins) from Gaumard located in Miami, Florida for a total cost of \$69,054 and two SAM Auscultation Manikins with Wifi Simscopes from Cardionics located in Webster, Texas for a total cost of \$27,500. The total cost for these found equipment items is \$96,554.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Approval of Early Middle College Programming

It was moved by Mrs. Burton and supported by Mrs. Acosta that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve a collaborative agreement with Schoolcraft College to establish an Early Middle College.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Approval of Teachers

It was moved by Mrs. Frank and supported by Mrs. Acosta that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the superintendent and offer employment for the 2022-23 school year to the following teachers:

Domingo, Sarah	Teacher	1.0	Hayes
Merner, Nicole	Teacher	1.0	Franklin (.6), Emerson (.4)
Pajor, Kara	Teacher	1.0	Holmes
Rusinowski, Kara	Psychologist	1.0	Student Services Intern
Warner, Alisyn	SE Teacher	1.0	Webster MOCI

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
 Nays: None

Teachers for Tenure

It was moved by Mrs. Acosta and supported by Mrs. Bonifield that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the superintendent and acknowledge that tenure status has been granted to the following teachers on the respective date:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date</u>
Deren, Jeanne	January 10, 2024
Lanzon, Madison	January 26, 2024
Oliver, Caitlyn	January 26, 2024
Sieter, Kelly	January 07, 2024
Stephens, Eoghann	January 03, 2024
Urso, Gina	January 23, 2024
Wilson, Zachary	January 28, 2024

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
 Nays: None

Leaves of Absence

It was moved by Mr. Johnson and supported by Mrs. Frank that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the superintendent and approve the request for a leave of absence as listed below:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date</u>
Kubek, Julia	February 1, 2024
Rosner, Stacy	2024-2025 school year
Torkelson-Regan, Seth	April 18, 2024

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
 Nays: None

Resignations

The Board was informed of the following resignations:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date</u>
Boka, Laura	January 26, 2024
Ellis, Lauren	January 03, 2024
Hangstefer, Kristen	January 12, 2024
Newberry, Lynn	January 16, 2024

Retirements

It was moved by Mrs. Bonifield and supported by Mrs. Jarvis that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District adopt a resolution of appreciation for:

Donald Boka

WHEREAS, It has been brought to the attention of the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District that Donald Boka will retire from the district on June 15, 2024; and,

WHEREAS, Donald Boka has devoted 30 years of dedicated, loyal, and outstanding service to the students of Taylor elementary, Marshall Elementary, Hull Elementary, Nankin Mills Elementary, Grant Elementary, Hoover Elementary and Franklin High School as a teacher; and,

WHEREAS, He has made many contributions to the educational profession and has touched the lives of countless students during him tenure with the Livonia Public Schools;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED That the Board of Education does hereby congratulate Donald Boka on his years of service to the educational profession and expresses publicly its sincere appreciation and offers its best wishes for his retirement.

Patricia Wischmeyer

WHEREAS, It has been brought to the attention of the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District that Patricia Wischmeyer will retire from the district on February 29, 2024; and,

WHEREAS, Patricia Wischmeyer has devoted 21 years of dedicated, loyal, and outstanding service to the Livonia Public Schools as a clerk, secretary and bookkeeper at Hayes Elementary, Hoover Elementary, Stevenson High School, Garfield Elementary, Taylor Elementary and in the Business Office; and,

WHEREAS, She has given conscientious, careful, and loyal service to the students, staff, and community during her tenure with the Livonia Public Schools;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED That the Board of Education does hereby express its deep appreciation to Patricia Wischmeyer for her countless contributions to our school system and extends best wishes for an enjoyable and rewarding retirement.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

**Second Reading
Board Policy –
Instructional
Programs**

It was moved Mrs. Jarvis and supported by Mrs. Frank that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Policy Committee and adopt Board Policy language for the following policies:

**IHF – Graduation
Requirements**

**BOARD POLICY
IHF INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS
GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS**

**May 18, 2015
December 8, 2023**

**GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS
(2016 Class of 2025 and beyond)**

1. **Number of Classes:** Each student shall be registered as a full time student for a minimum of eight (8) semesters. Exceptions for the second semester of the senior year for which special schedule arrangements are necessary may be approved by the principals **with the support of the Director of Secondary Programs.**
2. **Credit Requirements:** A minimum of 23 units of credit (one unit equals one credit) must be successfully earned.
3. **Credit Earned Prior to High School:** A student who, prior to entering high school, successfully completes a course at a Michigan public school that is aligned with the high school course content expectations will earn credit toward fulfilling the graduation requirements. A list of courses for which this applies will be maintained by the ~~Office of Instruction~~ **Academic Services Department**. Grades for these courses will not be used in the calculation of the student's high school grade point average.
4. **Common Learnings:** Each student is required to earn a minimum of 18 credits in the area of common learnings outlined below:

A minimum of eighteen (18) units of credit must be earned in the following areas:

- A. Language Arts (Grades 9, 10, 11, and 12) 4.0 units
 - 1 unit Language Arts 9
 - 1 unit Language Arts 10
 - 1 unit - .5 Composition and .5 Literature **Language Arts 11**
 - 1 unit - Choice of 12th Grade Language Arts Classes **Language Arts 12**
- B. Mathematics..... 4.0 units
4 units of mathematics which must include at least Algebra I, Geometry and Algebra II ([or an equivalent](#)) with a math or math-related class in the final year.
- C. Science..... 3.0 units
 - 1 unit Biology
 - 1 unit Chemistry **or Physics (Beginning with the Class of 2025)**
 - **1 unit Science or completion of a CTE Program**
 - ~~1 unit /Physical Science or completes a CTE Program~~
- D. Social Studies .3.0 units
 - 1 unit World History
 - 1 unit U.S. History
 - 0.5 unit American Government
 - 0.5 unit Economics
- E. Physical Education 1.0 unit
 - 0.5 unit Personal Fitness
 - 0.5 unit Health

- F. Visual, Performing, and/or Applied Arts (VPAA) 1.0 unit
- G. World Languages ...2.0 units
 - 2 units of the same World Language, or
 - 1 unit of the same World Language and completes the completion of a Career and Technical Education (CTE) Program, or
 - 1 unit of the same World Language and 1 unit of VPAA in addition to required VPAA credit

TOTAL.....
 18 units

5. **Electives:** Of the 23 units required for graduation, 5 units of credit may be electives.
6. **Online Learning Experience:** Students are required to experience twenty (20) hours of online learning. The requirement will be met through online experiences provided in required high school core required courses.
7. **Personal Curriculum Plan:** A personal curriculum plan may be developed for a student in which graduation requirements are modified in accordance with the state mandated Michigan Merit Curriculum. For example, the VPAA requirement can be modified through a Personal Curriculum Plan for a student who takes additional credit(s) beyond the required credits in English Language Arts, Math, Science, or World Language or if the student completes a CTE program.
8. **Testing Out:** A student will receive credit for a Michigan Merit curriculum course in which the student earns a qualifying score on the test out that measures a student's understanding of the subject area content expectations that apply to the credit. Test out scores will not be used to calculate grade point average. Testing out is not a credit recovery option.
9. **Required Testing:** As a requirement for graduation, a high school student must participate in all state or federal academic testing programs which the School District is required to administer, unless otherwise indicated in an Individualized Education Program (IEP), a Section 504 Plan, or similar program of services. A high school student's failure to meet this requirement will render him/her ineligible for a high school diploma, and will preclude that student's participation in graduation commencement exercises. Any deviation from this requirement must be approved by the Superintendent or his/her designee.
10. **Early Graduation:** If a student meets all other requirements, approval for early graduation may be granted at the end of seven (7) semesters. To apply for early graduation, the Application for Early Graduation and a letter to the principal must be completed by the end of the first card marking of the student's senior year. Approval for early graduation will be contingent upon educational experiences or training in high school which have afforded the student early entry into college or an advanced training program, a concrete job offer utilizing these educational experiences, or family financial need. Diplomas will be issued in June. An exception to this section may be granted with approval of the Board of Education upon the recommendation of the Superintendent.

LEGAL REF.: MCL, 380.1166; 380.1278a; 380.1278b

ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES IHF(1)

**INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAM GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS
 TRANSCRIPT FEES**

Janu

ary 23, 2008
 December 4, 2023

Schools will handle all requests for high school transcripts as follows:

1. For a period of one year after graduation, graduating seniors will be provided the first three transcripts without charge. After that, there will be a charge of \$5.00 per copy.

- 2. All alumni(ae) will be charged \$5.00 per copy.
- 3. The school will incur all mailing expenses for transcripts mailed within the continental United States or Canada.
- 4. Schools will maintain a continuity of service throughout the year so that requests for transcripts are processed in a timely manner.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Frank, Jarvis, Johnson
 Nays: None

**First Reading
 Board Policy –
 Personnel**

**BOARD POLICY
 PERSONNEL
 TEACHER PLACEMENT**

**GBF
 MAY 17, 2024**

**GBF – Teacher
 Placement**

The Board of Education acknowledges that having teachers assigned in their area of certification and endorsement is highly valued. All elementary, secondary, and special education teachers must be certified or authorized to teach the grade levels and subject areas to which they are assigned.

Teacher placement is the determination of the classroom teaching assignment for a teacher. The decisions regarding teacher placement will be at the sole discretion of the Superintendent or designee. In order to be eligible for a teaching assignment, the teacher must be qualified for the teaching assignment, based on the criteria set by the Superintendent or designee, and have the appropriate certification. In the absence of a qualified teacher with appropriate certification, the School District may consider the ability to obtain an appropriate Michigan Department of Education permit.

LEGAL REF.: MCL 380.1233, 380.1233b, 380.1237, 423.215

**ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES
 PERSONNEL**

GBF

TEACHER PLACEMENT

April 15, 2013

**Reviewed 4/2021
 January 29, 2024**

Between qualified candidates, teacher placement will be based on the following criteria:

- Teacher certification, including whether such teacher placement decision will result in a classroom section not having a certified teacher;
- The school schedule;
- The prior year Effectiveness Rating of teachers qualified for the assignment;
 - Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.
- The teacher’s disciplinary record;

- The teacher’s attendance record;
- Relevant special training, including completion of relevant training other than professional development or continued education that is required by the District or by state law, including the integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way;
- The recency or relevance of a teacher’s experience in a grade level or subject area;
- The teacher’s length of service in a grade level or subject area. Length of service in a grade level or subject area may will be made up of two components:
 - Current length of service in the assignment, and;
 - Lifetime length of service in the assignment.

Teachers with no relevant special training, or service time with a particular teaching assignment are not qualified candidates for purposes of teacher placement and will only be considered for placement in the teaching assignment if there are no other qualified candidates.

The School District respects and values individual staff opinion regarding their placement. Staff members may request placement preference for District consideration by May 1. The School District will make an effort to notify staff of their placement in a prompt manner.

**First Reading
Board Policy –
Personnel**

**BOARD POLICY
PERSONNEL
STAFF REDUCTIONS AND RECALLS
STAFFING, LAYOFF, AND RECALL OF TEACHERS**

**GBG
MAY 17, 2021
JANUARY 29, 2024**

**GBF – Staffing
Reduction and
Recalls**

~~All personnel decisions shall be based on retaining effective teachers in situations involving a staffing/program reduction or any other personnel decision resulting in the elimination of a position. This policy shall also apply when recalling or hiring to fill a previous staffing/program reduction or any other personnel decision that resulted in the elimination of a position.~~

This policy relates to all teachers working for the School District as defined by the Michigan Teachers’ Tenure Act, MCL 38.71, et seq. As used in this policy, the term "personnel decision" refers to any situation where the School District is:

- Filling a vacancy;
- Placing a teacher in a classroom;
- Conducting a staffing reduction;
- Conducting a program reduction, or;
- Any other decision resulting in the elimination or creation of a position.

The Superintendent or designee will adopt clear and transparent procedures for all personnel decisions governed by Section 1248 of the Revised School Code. When adopting such procedures, length of service shall not be the sole factor in personnel decisions, and may only be considered as a tiebreaker if a personnel decision involves 2 or more employees and all other factors distinguishing those employees from each other are equal.

Personnel decisions must be based on relevant factors including, but not limited to:

- The prior year Effectiveness Rating of teachers qualified for the assignment;

- o Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.
- The teacher's length of service in a grade level or subject area;
- The teacher's disciplinary record, and;
- Relevant special training, which may be based on completion of relevant training other than professional development or continuing education that is required by the School District or by law, and integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way.

Subject to the limitations set forth herein through policy or regulation, the Superintendent or designee has sole authority to determine teacher placement, the existence of a teacher vacancy, or to implement a personnel or program reduction.

LEGAL REF.: MCL 380.1248, 380.1249, 423.215

ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES GBG
PERSONNEL
STAFF REDUCTIONS AND RECALLS
STAFFING, LAYOFF, AND RECALL OF TEACHERS

April 15, 2013

Reviewed 4/2021

~~Length of service or tenure status may only be considered by the administration when all other factors, as listed below, are considered equal amongst the potentially affected teachers.~~

~~The effectiveness of teachers shall be measured in accordance with the District's performance evaluation system developed under Section 1249 of the School Code, and the personnel decisions shall be based on the following factors:~~

~~A. Individual performance shall be the majority factor in making the decision, and shall consist of but is not limited to all of the following:~~

- ~~1. Evidence of student growth, which shall be the predominant factor in assessing an employee's individual performance.~~
- ~~2. The teacher's demonstrated pedagogical skills, including at least a special determination concerning the teacher's knowledge of his or her subject area and the ability to impart that knowledge through planning, delivering rigorous content, checking for and building higher-level understanding, differentiating, and managing a classroom; and consistent preparation to maximize instructional time.~~
- ~~3. The teacher's management of the classroom, manner and efficacy of disciplining students, rapport with parents/guardians and other teachers, and ability to withstand the strain of teaching.~~
- ~~4. The teacher's attendance and disciplinary record, if any.~~

~~B. Significant, relevant accomplishments and contributions. This factor shall be based on whether the individual contributes to the overall performance of the school by making clear, significant, relevant contributions above the normal expectations for an individual in his or her peer group and having demonstrated a record of exceptional performance.~~

~~C. Relevant special training. This factor shall be based on completion of relevant training other than the professional development or continuing education that is required by the employer or by~~

~~state law, and integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way.~~

~~A teacher who has been rated as "ineffective" under the performance evaluation system shall not be given any preference that would result in the teacher being retained over a teacher who is evaluated as "minimally effective," "effective" or "highly effective" under the performance evaluation system.~~

Teacher Vacancies

A teacher vacancy does not exist unless all the following criteria are met:

- The position is subject to Section 1249 of the Revised School Code;
- The ~~vacancy~~ position is posted by the School District in a manner which invites applicants.

A teacher vacancy may be created by the following, subject to approval by the Superintendent or designee:

- Transfer of an internal teaching candidate to a vacant position;
- A leave of absence ~~is extended beyond sixty school days;~~
- Retirement, resignation, or other departure at the end of a school year or immediately prior to the start of a school year.
- An ~~unplanned~~ mid-year retirement, resignation, or other departure occurs which that will require a long-term substitute for ~~sixty or more school days;~~
- The addition of a new classroom section.

No vacancy will be created when a position is first unfilled beginning in the second half of the school year, unless approved by the Superintendent or designee. The Superintendent or designee may close any vacancy in their sole discretion at any time.

Selection Process to Fill a Vacancy

- The Superintendent's or designee's most highly rated and qualified candidate will be selected for any vacancy.
- The top qualified internal candidate, plus other internal candidates in the discretion of the Superintendent or designee, may will be provided an opportunity to interview for any vacancy.
- ~~In the event that an internal candidate is the most highly rated qualified candidate, before filling the vacancy with the internal candidate, The Superintendent or designee shall consider the likelihood of filling any vacancy created by the selection of the internal candidate and the impact such vacancy will have on the instructional program. If the Superintendent or designee determines the selection of the internal candidate will negatively impact the instructional program, the Superintendent or designee may select the next most highly rated and qualified candidate.~~

In the absence of a qualified candidate, the Superintendent or designee may select a candidate who best demonstrates the following: is able to obtain temporary or alternative credentialing to be qualified for the position, has demonstrated an exemplary commitment to a school community and its students, and possesses relevant knowledge and skills for the position.

- ~~Ability to obtain temporary or alternative credentialing to be qualified for the position~~

- Commitment to the profession of teaching
- Commitment to the school community
- Commitment to the student body

Staffing Reductions

A staffing reduction is the decision to eliminate curricular sections or positions that will result in a reduction in the hours worked (FTE) of one or more teachers. The Superintendent or designee has the sole authority to determine and conduct a staffing reduction.

The Superintendent or designee will conduct any staffing reduction based on the department and location, using following criteria:

- The District shall reduce staff starting with the teacher with the lowest Effectiveness Rating and proceeding toward the teacher with the highest Effectiveness Rating in the department, unless such reduction will result in a classroom section not having a certified teacher.
 - Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.
- Teacher certification. In the absence of a teacher with appropriate certification, the School District may consider the ability to obtain an appropriate permit.
- The teacher's disciplinary record;
- The teacher's attendance record;
- Relevant special training, including completion of relevant training other than professional development or continued education that is required by the District or by state law, including the integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way;
- The teacher's length of service in a grade level or subject area. The School District will only consider a teacher's continuous and current length of service in a grade level or subject area.

Teachers with no relevant special training, or service time with a particular teaching assignment are not qualified candidates for purposes of a staffing reduction and will only be considered for such placement if there are no other qualified candidates.

Program Reductions

A program reduction is the decision to eliminate curricular courses or courses of study. The Superintendent or designee has the sole authority to determine and conduct a program reduction.

Upon the decision to implement a program reduction, the Superintendent or designee will review impacted staff and evaluate whether they are qualified, as defined by the Teacher Placement Procedure. Teachers with an effectiveness rating of effective or highly effective will displace others in another School District program with a rating other than effective or highly effective. (*"Highly Effective" will remain a legal rating until July 1, 2024.*)

Recall Process

A recall is when teachers that are placed on layoff become eligible to return to work at the School District.

The right to recall expires three years after the layoff becomes effective. Only teachers on layoff that are qualified for a vacancy are eligible for recall.

The right to recall is different based on the teacher's most recent evaluation rating:

- *Effective or Highly-Effective*: Teacher will be offered the opportunity to return to a vacancy for which they are qualified. ("*Highly Effective*" will remain the legal rating until July 1, 2024.)
- *Developing or Minimally-Effective*: Teacher will be offered the opportunity to interview for a vacancy for which they are qualified. ("*Minimally Effective*" will remain the legal rating until July 1, 2024.)
- *Needing Support or Ineffective*: Teacher will be notified of a vacancy for which they are qualified and the teacher may submit application materials for consideration by the Superintendent or designee. ("*Ineffective*" will remain the legal rating until July 1, 2024.)

Eligibility for recall will be determined based on the following criteria:

- The teacher with the highest evaluation rating will be eligible first, proceeding to the lowest evaluation rating;
 - Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.
- If two teachers are being considered and share the same evaluation Effectiveness Rating, then the Superintendent or designee must compare the potential individuals using each of the elements of the standards as set out below, subject to Section 1248 of the Revised School Code. Only when all elements within one level are equal and the candidates cannot be differentiated should the Superintendent or designee move to the next level.
 - The teacher's disciplinary record;
 - The teacher's attendance record;
 - Relevant special training, including completion of relevant training other than professional development or continued education that is required by the District or by state law, including the integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way;

The teacher's length of service in the grade level or subject area where the vacancy exists

GBIA – Teacher Evaluations

**PERSONNEL
TEACHER EVALUATIONS**

**MAY 17, 2021
JANUARY 29, 2024**

~~The Board of Education delegates to the Superintendent, or his/her designee, the function of adopting and implementing an evaluation tool for teachers that is consistent with the requirements of the law.~~

All teachers and administrators can improve their performance and should strive for excellence in order to provide the best possible education for the students of the School District. To that end, the School District will use a rigorous, transparent, and fair evaluation system for all teachers and administrators. This system will comply with Michigan law and include annual year-end evaluations for all teachers and administrators, unless otherwise permitted by Michigan law. The Superintendent or designee will provide inter-rater reliability training for all evaluators as required by law.

The evaluation system is intended to be used to improve the performance of all teachers and administrators and encourage professional growth. The system will be used, at a minimum, to inform decisions on the effectiveness and development of teachers, to grant tenure or full certification, and to remove ineffective tenured and untenured teachers. The Superintendent or designee will develop and implement any legally-compliant administrative regulations necessary to put this policy into effect with the involvement of teachers and school administrators. The regulations will use legally-compliant criteria to deem teachers and administrators unevaluated, whenever it is deemed appropriate to waive evaluation for a teacher or administrator in a given school year.

The Superintendent or designee is authorized to promulgate regulations based on changes of the law governing evaluations.

Teachers will receive ratings as prescribed by law. Any teacher rated less than effective Developing on a year-end evaluation will be placed on an individualized development plan (IDP). That teacher will be evaluated mid-year during the next school year, in addition to receiving a year-end evaluation. If the teacher continues to be found less than effective Developing for three consecutive years, the School District will act to discharge the teacher, either through termination (if probationary) or the filing of tenure charges (if tenured), unless special circumstances are found to exist.

LEGAL REF.: MCL 380.1249, 423.215

**ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES
PERSONNEL
TEACHER EVALUATIONS**

GBIA

**MAY 17, 2021
JANUARY 29, 2024**

- ~~A. The performance evaluation system will include at least an annual year-end evaluation.~~
 - ~~1. The annual year-end performance evaluation will be based in part on student growth and assessment data. The percentage of the annual year-end evaluation based on the student growth and assessment data will be equal to the percentage established by law. If student growth and assessment data is available for a teacher for at least three school years, the annual year-end evaluation shall be based on student growth and assessment data for the most recent three consecutive school year period. If not, the annual year-end evaluation shall be based on all student growth and assessment data that is available for the teacher.~~
 - ~~2. The annual year-end performance evaluation shall include specific performance goals. Specific performance goals will assist in improving effectiveness for the next school year and are developed by the school administrator or his or her designee conducting the evaluation, in consultation with the teacher, and any recommended training identified by the school administrator or designee, in consultation with the teacher, that would assist the teacher in meeting the goals. For a first year probationary teacher or a teacher who~~

~~received a rating of ineffective or minimally effective on his or her most recent annual year-end evaluation, the school administrator or designee shall develop, in consultation with the teacher, an individualized development plan that includes these goals and training and is designed to assist the teacher to improve his or her effectiveness.~~

~~B.—The performance evaluation system will include a mid-year progress report for a teacher who is in the first year of the probationary period, or who received a rating of minimally effective or ineffective in his or her most recent annual year-end evaluation. The mid-year progress report shall be used as a supplemental tool to gauge a teacher's improvement from the preceding school year and to assist a teacher to improve.~~

~~The mid-year progress report shall:~~

- ~~1.—Be based at least in part on student achievement;~~
- ~~2.—Be aligned with the teacher's individualized development plan under subdivision A.2. above;~~
- ~~3.—Include specific performance goals for the remainder of the school year that are developed by the school administrator conducting the annual year-end evaluation or his/her designee and any recommended training identified by the school administrator or designee that would assist the teacher in meeting these goals;~~
- ~~4.—Include a written improvement plan developed by the school administrator or designee, in consultation with the teacher, that includes these goals and training and is designed to assist the teacher to improve his or her rating; and~~
- ~~5.—Be developed in addition to an annual year-end evaluation.~~

~~C.—The performance evaluation system will include classroom observations. All of the following apply to these classroom observations:~~

- ~~1.—The manner in which a classroom observation is conducted shall be consistent with the selected state evaluation tool.~~
- ~~2.—A classroom observation shall include a review of the teacher's lesson plan and the state curriculum standard being used in the lesson and a review of pupil engagement in the lesson.~~
- ~~3.—A classroom observation does not have to be for an entire class period.~~
- ~~4.—Unless a teacher has received a rating of effective or highly effective on his or her two most recent annual year-end evaluations, there shall be multiple classroom observations of the teacher each school year.~~

~~D.—The performance evaluation system may allow an exemption of student growth data for a particular pupil for a school year upon the recommendation of the school administrator conducting the annual year-end evaluation or his or her designee and approval of the school district superintendent or his or her designee.~~

~~E.—The performance evaluation system shall assign an effectiveness rating to each teacher of highly effective, effective, minimally effective, or ineffective.~~

~~F.—The performance evaluation system shall provide that if a teacher is rated as ineffective on three consecutive annual year-end evaluations, the teacher will be dismissed from his or her employment.~~

~~G.—The performance evaluation system shall provide that if a teacher is rated as highly effective on three consecutive annual year-end evaluations, the school district may choose~~

~~to conduct a year-end evaluation biennially instead of annually. However, if a teacher is not rated as highly effective on one of these biennial year-end evaluations, the teacher shall again be provided with annual year-end evaluations.~~

~~H. The performance evaluation system shall permit a teacher who is not in a probationary period and is rated as ineffective on the annual year-end evaluation, to request a review of the evaluation and the rating by the school district superintendent. The request for a review must be submitted in writing within 20 days after the teacher is informed of the rating. Upon receipt of the request, the school district superintendent or designee shall review the evaluation and rating and may make any modifications as appropriate based on his or her review. However, a review as described in this paragraph may only occur twice in a three school year period.~~

Effective July 1, 2024, the evaluation tools for both administrators and teachers will be reclassified to have three ratings: Effective, Developing, and Needing Support. Student growth components for both administrators and teachers will be calculated based on the requirements of the Revised School Code. Any disputes regarding evaluations will be subject to the dispute process in Section 1249 of the Revised School Code.

Adjournment

Off/Supt/tg

The Superintendent or designee will evaluate administrators annually, unless otherwise permitted by Michigan law, using the School Advance model. Beginning in the 2024-2025 school year, for the first three years a school administrator is in a new administrative position, the Superintendent or designee will assign a mentor to the school administrator. The Superintendent or designee will, for each year the administrator is evaluated, conduct a midyear progress report.

Building School principals will evaluate teachers annually, unless otherwise permitted by Michigan law, using the 5D+ model. All teacher evaluations require at least two observations and at least one observation will be unscheduled. Any midyear progress meetings conducted by Administrators will review relevant student achievement data. The evaluation system will rate teachers with ratings as required by Section 1249 of the Revised School Code. Administrators will provide written feedback to teachers as required by law. Beginning in the 2024-2025 school year, classroom observations must be for a minimum of fifteen minutes, but need not be an entire class period. ~~One observation will be unscheduled.~~ Building School principals will meet with teachers following observations and provide written observation feedback within thirty (30) days of the observation.

~~Employees Whose Evaluations are Not Governed by Section 1249 of the Revised School Code.~~ The Superintendent or designee will determine the method of evaluation for in which such employees whose evaluations are not governed by Section 1249 of the Revised School Code.

President Bradford Adjourned the meeting at 7:43 p.m.

MINUTES
BOARD OF EDUCATION
Livonia Public Schools
Special Meeting
February 12, 2024

President Bradford convened the Special meeting at 9:24 p.m.

Members Present: Madeline Acosta, Tammy Bonifield, Karen Bradford, Colleen Burton, Liz Jarvis, Mark Johnson

Members Absent: None

Audience Communications: None

Approval of ECC Playground Site Work, Fencing, Landscape Project – 2021 BOND
It was moved by Mrs. Frank and supported by Mrs. Jarvis that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the recommendation from it's Owner's Representative, Plante Moran Realpoint, and it's Construction Manager, Clark Construction Company, to approve change order for the contractors identified to provide and install playground site work, concrete, fencing, and landscaping for the Early Childhood Center in the amount of \$560,845, which includes costs for hard construction, fees, and contingency.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Approval of Purchase of LMC Furniture – 2021 BOND
It was moved by Mrs. Bonifield and supported by Mrs. Frank that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation from the Owner's Representative, Plante Moran Realpoint, and approve the Phase Three purchase of furniture for the Library Media Centers at Hoover Elementary, Hayes Elementary, Roosevelt Elementary, Holmes Middle School and Stevenson High School from NBS Commercial Interiors, Troy, Michigan in an amount not to exceed \$872,000.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Approval of Elevator Renovation Project at Administration Building
It was moved by Mrs. Acosta and supported by Mr. Johnson that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation to replace the elevator and its mechanical system at the Central Office Administration Building from Kone Incorporated, located in Livonia, Michigan in the amount of \$240,000, which includes contingency.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

**Second Reading
and Adoption of
Board Policy –
Personnel**

It was moved by Mrs. Jarvis and supported by Mrs. Frank that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Policy Committee and adopt the following Board Policy language for Board Policy GBF – Teacher Placement:

**GBF – Teacher
Placement**

**BOARD POLICY
GBF**

**PERSONNEL
TEACHER PLACEMENT**

JANUARY 29, 2024

Teacher placement is the determination of the classroom teaching assignment for a teacher. The decisions regarding teacher placement will be at the sole discretion of the Superintendent or designee. In order to be eligible for a teaching assignment, the teacher must be qualified for the teaching assignment, based on the criteria set by the Superintendent or designee, and have the appropriate certification. In the absence of a qualified teacher with appropriate certification, the School District may consider the ability to obtain an appropriate Michigan Department of Education permit.

LEGAL REF.: MCL 380.1233, 380.1233b, 380.1237, 423.215

ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES GBF

**PERSONNEL
2024
TEACHER PLACEMENT**

JANUARY 29,

Between qualified candidates, teacher placement will be based on the following criteria:

- Teacher certification, including whether such teacher placement decision will result in a classroom section not having a certified teacher;
- The school schedule;
- The prior year Effectiveness Rating of teachers qualified for the assignment;
 - Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.
- The teacher's disciplinary record;
- The teacher's attendance record;
- Relevant special training, including completion of relevant training other than professional development or continued education that is required by the District or by state law, including the integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way;

- The recency or relevance of a teacher’s experience in a grade level or subject area;
- The teacher’s length of service in a grade level or subject area. Length of service in a grade level or subject area may be made up of two components:
 - Current length of service in the assignment, and;
 - Lifetime length of service in the assignment.

Teachers with no relevant special training, or service time with a particular teaching assignment are not qualified candidates for purposes of teacher placement and will only be considered for placement in the teaching assignment if there are no other qualified candidates.

The School District respects and values individual staff opinion regarding their placement. Staff members may request placement preference for District consideration by May 1. The School District will make an effort to notify staff of their placement in a prompt manner.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Jarvis, Johnson
 Nays: None

Second Reading and Adoption of Board Policy – Personnel

GBG – Staffing, Layoff and Recall of Teachers

It was moved by Mr. Johnson and supported by Mrs. Jarvis that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Policy Committee and adopt the following Board Policy language for Board Policy GBG – Staffing, Layoff and Recall of Teachers:

BOARD POLICY	GBG
PERSONNEL	JANUARY 29, 2024
STAFFING, LAYOFF, AND RECALL OF TEACHERS	

This policy relates to all teachers working for the School District as defined by the Michigan Teachers’ Tenure Act, MCL 38.71, et seq. As used in this policy, the term "personnel decision" refers to any situation where the School District is:

- Filling a vacancy;
- Placing a teacher in a classroom;
- Conducting a staffing reduction;
- Conducting a program reduction, or;
- Any other decision resulting in the elimination or creation of a position.

The Superintendent or designee will adopt clear and transparent procedures for all personnel decisions governed by Section 1248 of the Revised School Code. When adopting such procedures, length of service shall not be the sole factor in personnel decisions, and may only be considered as a tiebreaker if a personnel decision involves 2 or more employees and all other factors distinguishing those employees from each other are equal.

Personnel decisions must be based on relevant factors including, but not limited to:

- The prior year Effectiveness Rating of teachers qualified for the assignment;
 - Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver

rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.

- The teacher's length of service in a grade level or subject area;
- The teacher's disciplinary record, and;
- Relevant special training, which may be based on completion of relevant training other than professional development or continuing education that is required by the School District or by law, and integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way.

Subject to the limitations set forth herein through policy or regulation, the Superintendent or designee has sole authority to determine teacher placement, the existence of a teacher vacancy, or to implement a personnel or program reduction.

LEGAL REF.: MCL 380.1248, 380.1249, 423.215

ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES GBG

**PERSONNEL
STAFFING, LAYOFF, AND RECALL OF TEACHERS**

JANUARY 29, 2024

Teacher Vacancies

A teacher vacancy does not exist unless all the following criteria are met:

- The position is subject to Section 1249 of the Revised School Code;
- The position is posted by the School District in a manner which invites applicants.

A teacher vacancy may be created by the following, subject to approval by the Superintendent or designee:

- Transfer of an internal teaching candidate to a vacant position;
- A leave of absence;
- Retirement, resignation, or other departure at the end of a school year or immediately prior to the start of a school year.
- A mid-year retirement, resignation, or other departure that will require a long-term substitute;
- The addition of a new classroom section.

No vacancy will be created when a position is first unfilled beginning in the second half of the school year, unless approved by the Superintendent or designee. The Superintendent or designee may close any vacancy in their sole discretion at any time.

Selection Process to Fill a Vacancy

- The Superintendent's or designee's most highly rated and qualified candidate will be selected for any vacancy.
- The top qualified internal candidate, plus other internal candidates in the discretion of the Superintendent or designee, may be provided an opportunity to interview for any vacancy.
- The Superintendent or designee shall consider the likelihood of filling any vacancy created by the selection of the internal candidate and the impact such vacancy will have on the instructional program.

In the absence of a qualified candidate, the Superintendent or designee may select a candidate who is able to obtain temporary or alternative credentialing to be qualified for the position, has

demonstrated an exemplary commitment to a school community and its students, and possesses relevant knowledge and skills for the position.

Staffing Reductions

A staffing reduction is the decision to eliminate curricular sections or positions that will result in a reduction in the hours worked (FTE) of one or more teachers. The Superintendent or designee has the sole authority to determine and conduct a staffing reduction.

The Superintendent or designee will conduct any staffing reduction based on the department and location, using following criteria:

- The District shall reduce staff starting with the teacher with the lowest Effectiveness Rating and proceeding toward the teacher with the highest Effectiveness Rating in the department, unless such reduction will result in a classroom section not having a certified teacher.
 - Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.
- Teacher certification. In the absence of a teacher with appropriate certification, the School District may consider the ability to obtain an appropriate permit.
- The teacher's disciplinary record;
- The teacher's attendance record;
- Relevant special training, including completion of relevant training other than professional development or continued education that is required by the District or by state law, including the integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way;
- The teacher's length of service in a grade level or subject area. The School District will only consider a teacher's continuous and current length of service in a grade level or subject area.

Teachers with no relevant special training, or service time with a particular teaching assignment are not qualified candidates for purposes of a staffing reduction and will only be considered for such placement if there are no other qualified candidates.

Program Reductions

A program reduction is the decision to eliminate curricular courses or courses of study. The Superintendent or designee has the sole authority to determine and conduct a program reduction.

Upon the decision to implement a program reduction, the Superintendent or designee will review impacted staff and evaluate whether they are qualified, as defined by the Teacher Placement Procedure. Teachers with an effectiveness rating of effective or highly effective will displace others in another School District program with a rating other than effective or highly effective. (*Highly Effective* will remain a legal rating until July 1, 2024.)

Recall Process

A recall is when teachers that are placed on layoff become eligible to return to work at the School District.

The right to recall expires three years after the layoff becomes effective. Only teachers on layoff that are qualified for a vacancy are eligible for recall.

The right to recall is different based on the teacher's most recent evaluation rating:

28

- *Effective*: Teacher will be offered the opportunity to return to a vacancy for which they are

qualified. (“Highly Effective” will remain the legal rating until July 1, 2024.)

- *Developing*: Teacher will be offered the opportunity to interview for a vacancy for which they are qualified. (“Minimally Effective” will remain the legal rating until July 1, 2024.)
- *Needing Support*: Teacher will be notified of a vacancy for which they are qualified, and the teacher may submit application materials for consideration by the Superintendent or designee. (“Ineffective” will remain the legal rating until July 1, 2024.)

Eligibility for recall will be determined based on the following criteria:

- The teacher with the highest evaluation rating will be eligible first, proceeding to the lowest evaluation rating;
 - Evaluators of performance, as measured using the performance evaluation system required by law, will consider factors including, but not limited to, the following as prescribed by the evaluation tool: demonstrated pedagogical skills and content area knowledge, evidence of ability to successfully plan and deliver rigorous lessons, implementation of effective strategies for building higher-level thinking and differentiated instruction, classroom management, collaboration with colleagues, and other attributes/skills relevant to the teaching assignment.
- If two teachers are being considered and share the same Effectiveness Rating, then the Superintendent or designee must compare the potential individuals using each of the elements of the standards as set out below, subject to Section 1248 of the Revised School Code. Only when all elements within one level are equal and the candidates cannot be differentiated should the Superintendent or designee move to the next level.
 - The teacher’s disciplinary record;
 - The teacher’s attendance record;
 - Relevant special training, including completion of relevant training other than professional development or continued education that is required by the District or by state law, including the integration of that training into instruction in a meaningful way;

The teacher’s length of service in the grade level or subject area where the vacancy exists.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Second Reading and Adoption of Board Policy – Personnel

It was moved by Mrs. Burton and supported by Mrs. Frank that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Policy Committee and adopt the following Board Policy language for Board Policy GBIA – Teacher Evaluations:

GBIA – Teacher Evaluations

BOARD POLICY

GBIA

PERSONNEL
TEACHER EVALUATIONS

JANUARY 29, 2024

All teachers and administrators can improve their performance and should strive for excellence in order to provide the best possible education for the students of the School District. To that end, the School District will use a rigorous, transparent, and fair evaluation system for all teachers and administrators. This system will comply with Michigan law and include annual year-end evaluations for all teachers and administrators, unless otherwise permitted by Michigan law. The Superintendent or designee will provide inter-rater reliability training for all evaluators as required by law.

The evaluation system is intended to be used to improve the performance of all teachers and

administrators and encourage professional growth. The system will be used, at a minimum, to inform decisions on the effectiveness and development of teachers, to grant tenure or full certification, and to remove ineffective tenured and untenured teachers. The Superintendent or designee will develop and implement any legally-compliant administrative regulations necessary to put this policy into effect with the involvement of teachers and school administrators. The regulations will use legally-compliant criteria whenever it is deemed appropriate to waive evaluation for a teacher or administrator in a given school year.

The Superintendent or designee is authorized to promulgate regulations based on changes of the law governing evaluations.

Teachers will receive ratings as prescribed by law. Any teacher rated less than Developing on a year-end evaluation will be placed on an individualized development plan (IDP). That teacher will be evaluated mid-year during the next school year, in addition to receiving a year-end evaluation. If the teacher continues to be found less than Developing for three consecutive years, the School District will act to discharge the teacher, either through termination (if probationary) or the filing of tenure charges (if tenured), unless special circumstances are found to exist.

LEGAL REF.: MCL 380.1249, 423.215

ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES GBIA

**PERSONNEL
TEACHER EVALUATIONS**

JANUARY 29, 2024

Effective July 1, 2024, the evaluation tools for both administrators and teachers will be reclassified to have three ratings: Effective, Developing, and Needing Support. Student growth components for both administrators and teachers will be calculated based on the requirements of the Revised School Code. Any disputes regarding evaluations will be subject to the dispute process in Section 1249 of the Revised School Code.

The Superintendent or designee will evaluate administrators annually, unless otherwise permitted by Michigan law, using the School Advance model. Beginning in the 2024-2025 school year, for the first three years a school administrator is in a new administrative position, the Superintendent or designee will assign a mentor to the school administrator. The Superintendent or designee will, for each year the administrator is evaluated, conduct a midyear progress report.

School principals will evaluate teachers annually, unless otherwise permitted by Michigan law, using the 5D+ model. All teacher evaluations require at least two observations and at least one observation will be unscheduled. Any midyear progress meetings conducted by Administrators will review relevant student achievement data. The evaluation system will rate teachers with ratings as required by Section 1249 of the Revised School Code. Administrators will provide written feedback to teachers as required by law. Beginning in the 2024-2025 school year, classroom observations must be for a minimum of fifteen minutes, but need not be an entire class period. School principals will meet with teachers following observations and provide written observation feedback within thirty (30) days of the observation.

The Superintendent or designee will determine the method of evaluation for employees whose evaluations are not governed by Section 1249 of the Revised School Code.

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

**Approval of ECC
Contingency –
2021 BOND**

It was moved by Mrs. Burton and supported by Mrs. Jarvis that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the reallocation of Bond contingency dollars from previous bond projects to the ECC contingency in the amount of \$950,000, bringing it up to approximately 10% for the project, to ensure the ECC project has an appropriate safety net, if needed.

Special Meeting

-8-

2/21/2022

Ayes: Acosta, Bonifield, Bradford, Burton, Jarvis, Johnson
Nays: None

Adjournment

President Bradford adjourned the meeting at 9:40 p.m.

Off/Supt/tg

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: **Selection of Candidate for MASB Board of Directors**

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District designate Birgit McQuiston as the Region 8 candidate for the MASB Board of Directors and direct the Executive Assistant of the Board of Education to cast the vote accordingly.

RATIONALE:

The Michigan Association of School Boards (MASB) is holding an election for the MASB Board of Directors. Each district receives one ballot, which must be submitted electronically. The Board may cast a vote for one candidate in Region 8, for a three-year term.

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

None

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Karen Bradford, Board President

EXHIBITS:

Attachment

Off/Supt/tg



MASB
MICHIGAN ASSOCIATION
OF SCHOOL BOARDS

★ ★ ★

BOARD *of* DIRECTORS ELECTIONS

2024

MASB Bylaws – Article IV – Membership

Section 2. Active Members. The board of education of any public school district in Michigan may become an active member of the Association. Active members of the Association shall be divided into eight regions. The regions shall be designated according to intermediate school district boundaries. The regions shall be as follows:

Region 1. Copper Country ISD, Delta-Schoolcraft ISD, Dickinson-Iron ISD, Eastern Upper Peninsula ISD, Gogebic-Ontonagon ISD, Marquette-Alger RESA and Menominee County ISD.

Region 2. Alpena-Montmorency-Alcona ESD, Charlevoix- Emmet ISD, Cheboygan-Otsego-Presque Isle ESD, COOR ISD, Iosco RESA, Manistee ISD, Northwest Education Services and Wexford-Missaukee ISD.

Region 3. Ionia County ISD, Kent ISD, Mecosta-Osceola ISD, Montcalm Area ISD, Muskegon Area ISD, Newaygo County RESA, Ottawa Area ISD and West Shore ESD.

Region 4. Bay-Arenac ISD, Clare-Gladwin RESD, Clinton County RESA, Gratiot-Isabella RESD, Midland County ESA, Saginaw ISD and Shiawassee RESD.

Region 5. Genesee ISD, Huron ISD, Lapeer County ISD, Sanilac ISD, St. Clair County RESA and Tuscola ISD.

Region 6. Allegan Area ESA, Barry ISD, Berrien RESA, Branch ISD, Calhoun ISD, Heritage Southwest ISD, Kalamazoo RESA, St. Joseph County ISD and Van Buren ISD.

Region 7. Eaton RESA, Hillsdale County ISD, Ingham ISD, Jackson County ISD, Lenawee ISD, Livingston ESA, Monroe County ISD and Washtenaw ISD.

Region 8. Macomb ISD, Oakland Schools and Wayne RESA.

Active members shall also be divided into the following seven groups based on pupil membership.

Group I All intermediate districts;

Group II School districts with a pupil membership of 0 - 1,400;

Group III School districts with a pupil membership of 1,401 - 2,500;

Group IV School districts with a pupil membership of 2,501 - 5,000;

Group V School districts with a pupil membership of 5,001 - 11,000;

Group VI School districts with a pupil membership of 11,001 - 40,000; and

Group VII School districts with a pupil membership more than 40,000.

Table of Contents

Board of Directors' Elections—Candidate Information and Email Voting Procedures	4
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---

Region 5 (Three-Year Term)

Janice Holz	Huron Intermediate School District, Huron County	5
Roshawnda Williams	Beecher Community School District, Genesee County	6

Region 6 (Three-Year Term)

Robert Becker	Barry Intermediate School District, Barry County	7
Pamela Dickinson	Comstock Public Schools, Kalamazoo County	8
Elizabeth O'Dell	St. Joseph County ISD, St. Joseph County	9
Andrew Robinson	Berrien RESA, Berrien County	10

Region 7 (Three-Year Term)

Sharon Lee	Ypsilanti Community Schools, Washtenaw County	11
Michael McVey	Saline Area Schools, Washtenaw County	12
Jack Temsey	Eaton RESA, Eaton County	13
Mary Vincent	Monroe Public Schools, Monroe County	14
Dale Wingerd	Clinton Community Schools, Lenawee County	15

Region 8 (Three-Year Term)

Melandie Hines	Wayne Westland Community Schools, Wayne County	16
Birgit McQuiston	Lake Orion Community Schools, Oakland County	17
Evelyn Pridemore	Redford Union School District, Wayne County	18

Note: Incumbents are **bolded**

Board of Directors' Elections—Candidate Information and Email Voting Procedures

This year, nine seats on the MASB Board of Directors are up for election.

The MASB Board of Directors is comprised of 24 members, including three at-large directors. Sixteen directors shall be elected from the eight regions, with two elected from each region; and one director per group shall be elected from Groups V, VI and VII. Directors are elected by active member school boards and, each year, several seats are up for election. The MASB President will nominate a member to serve as an at-large director, subject to Board approval.

Board Limitations:

Article VIII, Section 6 of the MASB Bylaws permits only one director to be elected or appointed from any one local or intermediate school district board.

According to MASB Bylaws Article VIII, Section 8, if any nomination for the Board of Directors is unopposed, the Board of Directors shall declare the unopposed candidate elected without conducting an election for the uncontested group or region.

This year, the following seats on the MASB Board are up for election (one seat each, three-year terms unless otherwise noted): Regions 1 (open seat), 2, 3 (one-year term), 4 (one-year term), 5, 6 (open seat), 7, 8 and Group V (one-year term). If you're unsure of your district's region or group, please see the list on page 2.

- **Region 1 has a vacant seat as no nominations were received**
- **Region 2 will continue to be represented by Dawn Kaiser, Iosco RESA, (unopposed, no ballots will be sent)**
- **Region 3 will continue to be represented by Rick Dernberger, Zeeland Public Schools and Ottawa Area Intermediate School District, (unopposed, no ballots will be sent)**
- **Region 4 will continue to be represented by John Tramontana, DeWitt Public Schools, (unopposed, no ballots will be sent)**
- **Group V will continue to be represented by Stephen Hyer, Clarkston Community Schools, (unopposed, no ballots will be sent)**

Voting in Regions 5, 6, 7 and 8 will take place via an online ballot. No local district/ISD funds can be used to campaign for anyone running for a seat. To help your board make an informed decision, the following pages contain background information and statements from each of the candidates.

Each district received ONE ballot, which was emailed to the superintendent secretary on record with MASB on Jan. 26, 2024. These ballots **CANNOT** be forwarded to anyone else. Once your board makes a decision on which candidate it wishes to vote for, please convey this information to your superintendent secretary.

Completed ballots must be cast and confirmed by the superintendent secretary by **1 p.m. on Wednesday, March 6, 2024.**

Unofficial election results will be available on the voicemail recording at 517.327.5915 as soon as possible, but generally after 2 p.m. on the deadline date. They will also be sent out via email that afternoon. Official results will be approved at the March 22, 2024 Board of Directors' meeting, which newly elected directors should plan to attend.

To summarize:

- Ballot deadline is **1 p.m. on Wednesday, March 6, 2024.**
- MASB would like to remind all candidates for the MASB Board of Directors that no school district funds can be used for campaigning during the election. This rule prohibits a candidate from using their school district email account to send messages to other school board members. Therefore, a personal email account must be used for campaigning purposes when running for the MASB Board of Directors. If you have any questions about what may or may not constitute an expenditure of school district funds, please contact MASB's Legal Counsel Brad Banasik, J.D. at bbanasik@masb.org or **517.327.5929.**
- An electronic file containing the physical addresses and email addresses for the voting group or region shall be made available to each candidate running for election to the board of directors. The revokable license to use the addresses shall be limited to contacting school board members to share information about the MASB Board of Directors' election.
- Have questions? Contact Cheryl Huffman at **517.327.5915** or chuffman@masb.org.

Region 8 (Three-Year Term)



Melandie Hines

Wayne Westland Community Schools, Wayne County

**Time served
on this board:**

10 years

Offices held:

Vice President
and Secretary

MASB Certification:

Certified Boardmember Award

Award of Merit

Award of Distinction

Master Boardmember Award

Election Statement:

I have served on the Wayne Westland Board of Education for 10 years. In 2018, I was able to get a \$150 million bond passed successfully in six communities: Wayne, Westland, Dearborn Heights, Romulus and Inkster. I am a Master Boardmember with MASB. Additionally, I just got a \$24.5 million bond passed for the Westwood Community Schools. I'm working on a skill trades program with the Taylor Career Technical Center. I enjoy helping to bring funds to the local school districts. I am a true public servant.

Region 8 (Three-Year Term)



Birgit McQuiston INCUMBENT

Lake Orion Community Schools, Oakland County

**Time served
on this board:**

12 years

Offices held:

President, Vice
President, and
Secretary

MASB Certification:

Certified Boardmember Award

Award of Merit

Award of Distinction

Master Boardmember Award

Master Diamond Award

Master Platinum Award

President's Award of Recognition

Advocacy Specialty

Data Specialty

Election Statement:

I believe our children are our future, and advocating for their education while leading our districts is our high calling. Serving on the Lake Orion Board of Education, the Oakland County School Boards Association Board of Directors and the MASB Board of Directors is a distinct privilege that I value and am deeply committed to.

In my three years on the MASB Board of Directors, I have served on the Executive, Finance and Policy Committees. I currently serve as the Chair of the Government Relations Committee and have been appointed by the State Board of Education as the MASB representative to a three-year term on the Special Education Advisory Committee, which advises the State Board and the Michigan Department of Education on the needs of students with special challenges. I have learned so much by serving my community, county and state and hope to continue serving in these areas.

It is my desire to be a part of the ongoing work of developing outstanding board leaders and to advocate for equitable and exceptional public education for ALL students. I fully support and embrace the vision and mission of MASB. It would be an honor to continue serving Region 8 on the MASB Board of Directors.

Region 8 (Three-Year Term)



Evelyn Pridemore

Redford Union School District, Wayne County

**Time served
on this board:**

11 years

Offices held:

President, Vice
President,
Secretary and
Treasurer

Election Statement:

I have served my local district for almost 12 years and have discovered a passion for the work of creating equitable education opportunities for every student in the state of Michigan. I have been through deficit, declining enrollment and the unprecedented changes COVID brought to education. I have held every position from trustee to my current role as President. In addition, I was recently appointed to the leadership team for WCASB. I have helped guide my district through two superintendent searches, a multi-million-dollar bond initiative, served on policy, finance, curriculum and facilities committees.

On a personal note, I have a wonderful husband of 36 years, three amazing sons, two beautiful daughters-in-law and the joy of my life three awesome grandbabies. I say all of that to say this: every single child from my special needs grandson to my little baby granddaughter should have people fighting for their right to quality education. In addition to the children, the people who choose every day to enter a school building and pour into the lives this state's most valuable asset deserve to work in environments that are well funded, top in the country and where their daily sacrifices are valued.

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Limited Out of District Schools of Choice for 2024-2025

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Superintendent to participate in *Limited Schools of Choice* under Section 105 and 105c for the 2024-2025 school year. Openings to include at least one seat for grades kindergarten-sixth grade and not to exceed 165 total seats for grades Kindergarten-Sixth grade for the 2024-2025 school year.

RATIONALE:

Section 105 & 105c Limited Schools of Choice will bring additional revenue to the District in the amount of approximately \$1,500,000 if all seats are filled and preserve programs essential to the students of Livonia Public Schools including magnet program offerings at Niji-Iro and Webster ACAT.

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

Added revenue to the general fund – up to \$1,500,000

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

William Green, Director of Elementary Programs and District Services

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Approval of Network Switches Replacement - 2021 BOND

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the recommendation from its technology consultant, Integrated Design Solutions, to award the network switches upgrade project to Sentinel Technologies, Inc., located in Troy, Michigan, in the total amount of \$1,852,349.15, which includes contingency.

RATIONALE:

The purchase of this equipment will replace the current switches which are 10 years old. This will ensure properly working switches across the district. These switches enable the district's network, which includes phones, copiers, security cameras, Wi-Fi access points, and more. This project is eligible for E-Rate funding, which means 50% of the cost mentioned will be covered through the E-Rate program.

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

2021 Bond

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Phillip Francis, Assistant Superintendent of District Services

EXHIBITS:

Attached

February 2, 2024

Mr. Phillip Francis
Assistant Superintendent of District Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

Project Name: Livonia Public Schools
Network Switch Upgrades
Livonia, Michigan

IDS Project No.: 21191-1000 BP08

Dear Mr. Francis:

Bid specifications for the Network Switch Upgrades project were issued on December 22, 2023. The bid package scope includes new network switch hardware, network management licenses, engineering support to program and install the network switches, testing, warranty support and training.

Representatives from seven (7) companies attended the pre-bid conference on January 9, 2024. Four (4) bids were received on January 22, 2024. The bidders included the required Bid Bond, Familial Disclosure, Affidavit of Compliance and Criminal Background Affidavit with their bid submissions.

The technology team has reviewed the bids and conducted a post-bid interview with the apparent low bidder, Sentinel Technologies, Inc, on January 26, 2024. The bid was determined to be complete and compliant with the requirements of the bidding documents. The bill of materials pricing was determined to be in line with current industry trends and historical competitive bidding pricing models for projects of a similar size and scope.

The bid specifications requested several mandatory alternates and Sentinel Technologies, Inc provided several voluntary alternates for consideration. After reviewing the alternates, the technology team is recommending the following alternates be considered for award:

Mandatory Alternate No. 3: Delete the requirements to provide new District Headend Core Switches. The bid specifications requested new redundant core network switches for the District Headend. The proposed core switches were similar in features and functions to the existing core switches. The existing core switches are operational and are still current models and being supported by the manufacturer. This alternate will provide a credit/deduct of (\$50,082.16).

Voluntary Alternate No. 2: Shipping & Storage & Handling. The bid specifications required the bidder to receive and store all project related equipment at their warehouse. If the District accepts equipment shipments at their facilities and warehouse them until the time of installation, Sentinel Technologies, Inc will provide a credit/deduct of (\$6,000.00).

Voluntary Alternate No. 3: Fiber Patch Cable Allowance. The bid specifications required the bidder to reuse all patch cables throughout the District's buildings. As the condition of each patch cable is unknown and some network closets may have equipment moved with the IT racks to better organize the network equipment, it is expected that some quantity of patch cables will need to be purchased. This alternate establishes an "Owner Allowance" to cover these miscellaneous field conditions. As the project progresses, these purchases will be tracked, and any unused allowance will be credited back to the District at the end of the project. This alternate is an add of \$6,250.00.

Voluntary Alternate No. 4: Upgrade Cisco Core to High School Distribution to 25GB. The bid specifications required 10GB connections between each District building and the District's Head End. This refers to the speed and

bandwidth available to the students and staff. This alternate would increase the link speed from 10GB to 25GB between the District's larger buildings and the District headend. This alternate is an add of \$2,256.54.

Voluntary Alternate No. 5: Cisco Core and Meraki Distribution and Access – 5 years. The bid documents basis of design was for Cisco core switches and Cisco distribution and access switches. The bid documents required the equipment to be provided with 5 years of warranty, support and licensing. Sentinel Technologies Inc provided this alternate for a different distribution and access switch model. The Meraki switch line is owned by Cisco. Meraki provides a cloud-based management system and an easier, more robust management platform for day to day operations. The proposed Meraki switch models are more robust than the proposed Cisco models. This alternate is an add of \$350,417.60.

Voluntary Alternate No. 6: Meraki Access – Substitute UPOE for POE+. POE refers to “power over ethernet” and provides the ability to power end devices over the network without needing to plug them in. Devices that operate with PoE include: phones, wireless access points, security cameras and other devices. The bid specifications required all network switches to be provided with PoE capabilities. This alternate is to provide 1 network switch in each IT closet with higher power capabilities (UPOE). As the District upgrades their technology systems, they may require more power capabilities. This alternate will provide “future proofing” for the District's ongoing technology upgrades. This alternate is an add of \$26,984.04.

Voluntary Alternate No. 8: Meraki Access – Substitute 10 year license for 5 year. The bid specifications required 5 years of warranty, support and licensing for all equipment being provided. The bid documents also requested alternate pricing to provide 7 years and 10 years of warranty, support and licensing. This alternate is to provide 10 years of warranty, support and licensing for the Cisco Core and Meraki Distribution and Access solution (VA No. 5). This alternate is an add of \$346,244.11

IDS recommends the award of the Network Switch Upgrade project to the lowest qualified bidder, Sentinel Technologies, Inc., in the amount of \$1,764,349.15 which includes Mandatory Alternate 3 and Voluntary Alternates 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and 8.

In addition to the award amount, IDS is also recommending a construction contingency of 5% be established in the amount of \$88,000.00.

Sincerely,

Integrated Design Solutions, LLC



Scott Smith
Senior Associate

ec: T. Klan, LPS
B. Weber, PMC
File



Date: February 21, 2024

To: Andrea Oquist, Superintendent

From: Phillip Francis, Assistant Superintendent of District Services

Re: 2024 Demolition Contractors Rebid

I would like to present and discuss the rebid result for selective demolition for the Summer 2024 renovations. The demolition was part of the district's original Phase 3 bid pack 2 for summer 2024, which the Board previously approved. The originally awarded demolition contractor was unwilling to agree to the terms of the scope of the work required and the terms of the contract. Consequently, with the advice of the district's legal counsel, the Bond Team formally rebid for selective demolition in the summer 2024 buildings.

The result of the rebid for selective demolition is a recommendation to approve the low responsible bidder, Blue Star Inc., headquartered in Warren, Michigan. The district has contracted with Blue Star several times in the past and has been repeatedly satisfied with their work. Blue Star's bid came in at \$1,698,900, which includes 10 accepted alternates. With Clark Construction's recommended contingency of 7%, plus general conditions (2%) and fees (2%) the total amount for selective demolition comes to \$1,888,157.

Please note that the Board originally approved \$1,005,572, which included contingency and fees, for selective demolition in November 2023. Therefore, we are looking for approval of an additional \$882,585 in order to contract this project with Blue Star, Inc.

Attachments

PF/ko

c: Board of Education

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Approval of 2024 Contractor (rebid) – 2021 Bond

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District approve the recommendation from its Owner’s Representative, Plante Moran Realpoint, and its Construction Manager, Clark Construction Company, to approve Blue Star, Inc., located in Warren, Michigan, for the selective demolition rebid of the Phase 3, Bid Package #2 for 2024 renovations at Hayes Elementary, Hoover Elementary, Roosevelt Elementary, Holmes Middle School, Stevenson High School, Franklin High School pool room and Churchill High School pool room in the total amount of \$882,585, which includes costs for hard construction, fees, and contingency and authorize the Superintendent or her designee to negotiate and execute final contracts on behalf of the Board of Education with the awarded contractors.

RATIONALE:

The recommended contractor on this rebid for the 2024 summer projects will provide the selective demolition work needed to complete the renovations at Hayes, Hoover, Roosevelt, Holmes, and Stevenson, as well as the pool rooms at all three high schools.

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

2021 Bond

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Phillip Francis, Assistant Superintendent of District Services

EXHIBITS:

Attached

February 21, 2024

Mr. Phillip Francis
Asst. Superintendent of District Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: 2021 Bond Program
Contract Award Recommendation for Construction Bids
Phase 3 – Bid Pack 2B: 2024 Summer Renovations – Demolition Rebid
Hayes ES / Hoover ES / Roosevelt ES / Holmes MS / Stevenson HS (including Pool Room) / Franklin
HS (Pool Room) / Churchill HS (Pool Room)

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Realpoint (PMR) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Project listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMR, Clark Construction Co., French Associates, and LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractors for this Project.

Due to the previously recommended contractor's unwillingness to agree to the terms of the scope and contract agreement, Construction Documents for selective demolition were formally re-issued and made available on February 2, 2024. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper, posted to the required State of Michigan websites and forwarded to multiple construction bidding websites.

On February 20, 2024, 2 bid proposals were received, and reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were also held during this time and were attended by various members of the Bond Team.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Bond Team is recommending **Blue Star Inc.** as further detailed within Clark Construction Co.'s Award Recommendation Letter dated February 21, 2024, for contract award.

The recommendation includes the acceptance of multiple Alternates as further detailed in Clark's recommendation letter.

Including hard construction of \$794,120, CM costs and fees of \$32,877 and construction contingency of \$55,588, **this Project award recommendation equals \$882,585.00.**

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A132 – 2019 Standard Form of Agreements between Owner and Contractor pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendations of the Bond Team. Please direct all questions through me via email at brian.weber@plantemoran.com.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN REALPOINT



Brian Weber
Senior Vice President

Enclosures: Budget Summary
Clark Construction Co. Award Recommendation Letter
Bid Tabulation



PHASE 3 - BID PACK 2B: 2024 SUMMER RENOVATIONS
BUDGET SUMMARY

	Hard Construction		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Blue Star Inc	\$ 1,005,068	\$ 1,698,900	\$ (693,832)
Previously Approved Costs (Reese Contracting)		\$ (904,780)	
Total		\$ 794,120	

	CM Fees/Costs		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Staffing	Included within the CM Contract		
Reimbursables	Included within the CM Contract		
General Conditions (2%)	\$ 2,006	\$ 15,882	\$ (13,877)
CM Fee (2%)	\$ 2,146	\$ 16,994	\$ (14,848)
Total	\$ 4,152	\$ 32,877	\$ (28,725)

	Construction Contingency (7%)		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Total	\$ 7,020	\$ 55,588	\$ (48,568)

	Total Project Costs		
		Actual	Variance
Recommendation Amount		\$ 882,585	\$ (771,125) *

* The budget overage will be funded from the Owner's Contingency within the Bond Program

Schools Included:

- Hayes Elementary
- Hoover Elementary
- Roosevelt Elementary
- Holmes Middle School
- Stevenson High School (w/ Pool Room)
- Franklin High School (Pool Room)
- Churchill High School (Pool Room)



Headquarters
 3535 Moores River Drive
 Lansing, MI 48911
 517.372.0940 phone | 517.372.0668 fax
www.clarkcc.com

Southeast MI Office
 2660 Superior Court
 Auburn Hills, MI 48326
 248.286.1000 phone

Northern MI Office
 3432 US 23 South
 Alpena, MI 49707
 989.278.2272 phone

Livonia Public Schools – Phase # 3 -Bid Package No. 2 Summer 2024 Renovations

February 21, 2024

Mr. Phillip M. Francis - Asst. Superintendent of District Services
 Livonia Public Schools
 15125 Farmington Rd
 Livonia, MI 48154

Re: Livonia Public Schools – 2021 Bond Program
 Contract Award Recommendations 21-2867- Phase # 3 -Bid Package No. 2 Summer 2024
 Renovations Demolition Re-Bid

Dear Mr. Francis,

Bids for Summer 2024 Renovations Demolition Re-Bid were received on February 20th, 2024. Re-Bid of the Demolition scope of work was necessary due to the fact Reese Contracting failed to execute their Prime Contractor Agreement. Reese Contracting was previously recommended for an award on November 10, 2023 and approved by the board on 11/20/2023. Re-Bids were based on plans and specifications issued by French Associates dated 9/27/2023 including Addendums 1, 2, & 3. Clark Construction Company, French Associates, Unified Building System Engineering, Plante Moran Realpoint and Livonia Public Schools have conducted post bid interview meetings with the low qualified recommended bidders. Bidders have submitted information in Clark Construction pre-qualification database. The pre-qualification database includes trade contractors past financials, bonding capacity, safety rating, labor capacity during the project schedule and reference calls regarding past projects. Each Contractor has committed to meet the requirements in the Contract Documents.

In addition to the direct Trade Contractor costs, Clark Construction Company recommends including a Construction Contingency budget of 7% for any unforeseen issues and a General Condition budget of 2% related to items such as building permits, security and safety requirements, temporary utilities, etc. No costs will be committed without prior approval of the District Administration for each item. Clark Construction, Construction Manager's Fee of 2% based on the Trade Contract cost and Construction Contingency. Any unused Contingency and associated CM Fee's will be returned to Livonia Public Schools.

Clark Construction Company recommends Livonia Public Schools enter a contract with each of the Trade Contractor for the listed amounts below. The recommended Trade Contractor provided the lowest qualified bid for the work.



Michigan's First
 Platinum Contractor

2017, 2015 & 2013 AGC
 National Safety
 Excellence Award

An Equal Opportunity
 Employer



Headquarters
 3535 Moores River Drive
 Lansing, MI 48911
 517.372.0940 phone | 517.372.0668 fax
www.clarkcc.com

Southeast MI Office
 2660 Superior Court
 Auburn Hills, MI 48326
 248.286.1000 phone

Northern MI Office
 3432 US 23 South
 Alpena, MI 49707
 989.278.2272 phone

PHASE # 3 - BID PACK #2 - 2024 Summer Renovations – AWARD
RECOMMENDATIONS

Listed below are the Bidders for which we recommend Board of Education approval to issue contracts and enclosed are Bid tabulations for the recommended Bid Categories of Work.

Bid Category & Description	Contractor	Base Bid Amount	Accepted Bid Alternates	Trade Total with Alternates
02 - Demolition Re Bid	Blue Star Inc	\$1,648,650.00	\$50,250.00	\$1,698,900.00
02 Demolition	Reese Contracting	(\$783,000.00)	(\$121,780.00)	(\$904,780.00)
	Trade Contracts Total:	\$865,650.00	(\$71,530.00)	\$794,120.00
	Construction contingency (7%)	\$60,596.00	(\$5,007.00)	\$55,589.00
	Construction Cost Total	\$926,246.00	(\$76,537.00)	\$849,709.00
	Clark Construction Cost			
	General Conditions (2% x \$794,120.00) - Trade costs	\$17,313.00	(\$1,431.00)	\$15,882.00
	Construction Manager's Fee (2% x \$849,709.00) Trade costs + contingency	\$18,525.00	(\$1,531.00)	\$16,994.00
	Total contract Amendment cost	\$962,084.00	(\$79,499.00)	\$882,585.00

See enclosed for all accepted alternates.
 See Enclosed for Bid Tab

Please contact me with any questions at sjepesen@clarkcc.com

Sincerely,

Jim Kaiser
 Clark Construction Company



Michigan's First
 Platinum Contractor

2017, 2015 & 2013 AGC
 National Safety
 Excellence Award

An Equal Opportunity
 Employer

Demolition Re-Bid Alternates

Blue Star Inc.	
\$	825,000
\$	823,650

\$1,648,650

Alternate 04 - A4-ST Install epoxy flooring over existing mosaic tile throughout locker rooms.

Alternate 06 - A1-HO Remove storefront framing and portion of exterior wal and install new storefront framng W1 and tooth in brick.

Alternate 07 - A1-RO Remove and install new lobby display area.

Alternate 10 - A4-RO Remove exterior brick and install (5) new windows.

Alternate 11 - A5-RO Install new tile over existing wall tile.

Alternate 12 - A1-FR Remove exterior brick and install (4) new glass block clerestory windows.

Alternate 13 - A1-CH Remove brick and install (5) new glass block clerestory windows.

Alternate 14 - A2-CH Prep existing mosiac tile at pool deck and install new floor tile.

Alternate 15 - A3-CH Install new wall tile including prep of existing glazed CMU at natatorium pool deck.

Alternate 16 - A4-CH Demo Existing Bleachers and Install New Angle Frame Bleachers.

ACCEPTED ALTERNATE COST PER CONTRACTOR & BLDG

Total Recommended Award + Accepted Alternates

Cost	
\$	-
\$	5,950
\$	950
\$	9,950
\$	-
\$	14,950
\$	14,950
\$	-
\$	50,250
\$	3,500
\$	50,250
\$	1,698,900

Demolition Re-Bid Bid Tab

Blue Star	Christman
\$ 825,000	\$ 830,700
\$ 823,650	\$ 913,700

\$1,648,650 **\$1,744,400**

- Alternate 04 - A4-ST Install epoxy flooring over existing mosaic tile throughout locker rooms.
 - Alternate 06 - A1-HO Remove storefront framing and portion of exterior wal and install new storefront framng W1 and tooth in brick.
 - Alternate 07 - A1-RO Remove and install new lobby display area.
 - Alternate 10 - A4-RO Remove exterior brick and install (5) new windows.
 - Alternate 11 - A5-RO Install new tile over existing wall tile.
 - Alternate 12 - A1-FR Remove exterior brick and install (4) new glass block clerestory windows.
 - Alternate 13 - A1-CH Remove brick and install (5) new glass block clerestory windows.
 - Alternate 14 - A2-CH Prep existing mosaic tile at pool deck and install new floor tile.
 - Alternate 15 - A3-CH Install new wall tile including prep of existing glazed CMU at natatorium pool deck.
 - Alternate 16 - A4-CH Demo Existing Bleachers and Install New Angle Frame Bleachers.
- ACCEPTED ALTERNATE COST PER CONTRACTOR & BLDG
- Total Recommended Award + Accepted Alternates

Cost	Cost
\$ -	\$ -
\$ 5,950	\$ 70,700
\$ 950	\$ 1,550
\$ 9,950	\$ 27,730
\$ -	\$ -
\$ 14,950	\$ 15,300
\$ 14,950	\$ 14,700
\$ -	\$ -
\$ -	\$ -
\$ 3,500	\$ 18,700
\$ 50,250	\$ 148,680
\$ 1,698,900	\$ 1,893,080

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Approval of Teachers

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Superintendent and offer employment for the 2023-24 school year to the teachers listed on the attached document.

RATIONALE:

These teachers have been interviewed along with many other applicants for the vacancies which existed in our instructional program. We believe these teachers are the most qualified for the positions and recommend that they be approved for employment.

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

The positions listed are within the 2023-24 budget.

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Anthony Abbate, Director of Human Resources
Jennifer Keatts, Director of Human Resources

EXHIBIT:

Attached

ljn

**2023-2024 School Year
New Teachers for Board of Education Approval
February 26, 2024**

NAME	DEGREE/SCHOOL	FTE	ASSIGNMENT	MOST RECENT EXPERIENCE	TOTAL YEARS OF EXPERIENCE	STEP
Blair, Lori	Master of Arts in School and Community Wayne State University Bachelor of Science in Psychology Central Michigan University	1.0	School Psychologist Student Services January 26, 2024	Rehabilitation and IEP Parent Stakeholder Motts Children's Hospital Ann Arbor and Novi Community School District	3	Step 3 MA 5 years probatio
Dailey, Allison	Master of Arts in Educational Technology Michigan State University Bachelors of Arts in Elementary Education Eastern Michigan University	.49	Teacher-Computer Technology Shared Time February 20, 2024	K-8 Technology Teacher Tipton Academy	10	MA 18.75 hours 5 years probation
Farkas, Lisa	Bachelor of Science in Mathematics University of Michigan	1.0	Teacher-Math Franklin High School March 4, 2024	Secondary Mathematics Teacher Wayne-Westland Community School District	1	Step 1 BS 54 5 years probation
Mack, Chad	Master of Art in K12 Administration Eastern Michigan University Bachelor of Science in Psychology Eastern Michigan University	1.0	Teacher-Math Churchill High School February 1, 2024	Adult Education Instructor Livonia Public Schools	11	Step 7.5 MA 5 years probation
Miller, Katherine	Bachelor of Science in Secondary Cognitive Impairment Eastern Michigan University	1.0	Special Education Teacher Roosevelt Elementary School January 29, 2024	Substitute Teacher EduStaff Livonia Public Schools	.5	Step 0 BS 5 years probation

**2023-2024 School Year
New Teachers for Board of Education Approval
February 26, 2024**

NAME	DEGREE/SCHOOL	FTE	ASSIGNMENT	MOST RECENT EXPERIENCE	TOTAL YEARS OF EXPERIENCE	STEP
Prifti, Alketa	Master of Education in Teaching English to Speakers of other Languages Madonna University Bachelor of Arts in Geography and History University of Tirana	1.0	Teacher-ELL Academic Services February 5, 2024	ELL Teacher Hamtramck Public Schools	11	Step 8 MA 5 years probation
Utter, Megan	Bachelor of Science in Elementary Education and Special Education Eastern Michigan University	1.0	Teacher-Resource Room Grant Elementary School February 14, 2024	Special Education Teacher Plymouth Canton Community Schools	3	Step 3 BS 5 years probation 55

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Granting of Tenure Status to Specified Teachers

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Superintendent and acknowledge that tenure status has been granted to the following teachers, effective on the respective date:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date</u>
Michelle Geyman	February 8, 2024
Jill Grezak	February 28, 2024

RATIONALE :

These teachers have successfully completed the District's requirements for probationary teachers including years of service, evaluations, and overall performance, as well as student growth. We have carefully reviewed all of the supporting documents and based upon our review, as well as the recommendations of building principals, these individuals have achieved tenure status with the Livonia Public Schools.

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Jennifer Keatts, Director of Human Resources
Anthony Abbate, Director of Human Resources

EXHIBIT:

None

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Resignations

RECOMMENDATION:

As authorized in the Board of Education motion of June 19, 2023, the following resignations have been accepted by the Superintendent:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date Effective</u>
Lisa Kaiser	February 14, 2024
Cindy Long	March 1, 2024

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

None

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Jennifer Keatts, Director of Human Resources
Anthony Abbate, Director of Human Resources

EXHIBIT:

None

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Leave of Absence

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District accept the recommendation of the Superintendent and approve the request for a leave of absence as listed below:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date effective</u>
Devin Jaworowicz	February 21, 2024

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

None

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Anthony Abbate, Director of Human Resources
Jennifer Keatts, Director of Human Resources

EXHIBIT:

None

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

TOPIC: Resolution of Appreciation for an Employees Who is Retiring

RECOMMENDATION:

Move that the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District adopt the attached resolution of appreciation for services rendered by:

Cheryl Caskey

BUDGETARY INFORMATION:

None

RESOURCE PERSONNEL:

Jennifer Keatts, Director of Human Resources
Anthony Abbate, Director of Human Resources

EXHIBIT:

Attached resolution

**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
February 26, 2024**

RESOLUTION

Cheryl Caskey

WHEREAS, It has been brought to the attention of the Board of Education of the Livonia Public Schools School District that Cheryl Caskey will retire from the district on February 23, 2024; and,

WHEREAS, Cheryl Caskey has devoted 22 years of dedicated, loyal, and outstanding service to the Livonia Public Schools as a driver in the Transportation Department; and,

WHEREAS, She has given conscientious, careful, and loyal service to the students, staff, and community during her tenure with the Livonia Public Schools;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED That the Board of Education does hereby express its deep appreciation to Cheryl Caskey for her countless contributions to our school system and extends best wishes for an enjoyable and rewarding retirement.