



Real Estate Consultants

Plante Moran Cresa, LLC  
3000 Town Center, Suite 100  
Southfield, MI 48075  
Tel: 248.223.3500 | Fax: 248.223.3150  
[pmcresa.com](http://pmcresa.com)

January 19, 2023

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Asst. Superintendent of District Services  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: 2021 Bond Program  
Contract Award Recommendation for Technology Contractor Bids  
Security Cameras – District Wide

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of a Technology Contractor for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, IDS and LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Vendors for these Projects.

On October 20, 2022, Bid Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan websites.

On November 10, 2022, twenty (20) bid proposals were received and publicly opened. Over the next few days, the bid proposals were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were held with the bidders over the course of the next few weeks. The scope of work, project schedule, phasing, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Bond Team is recommending **Sentinel** for contract award as detailed in IDS' recommendation letter dated January 13, 2023.

Including the Base Bid Amount of \$1,230,009.38, acceptance of Alternate 02 in the amount of \$360,533.28 and a contingency amount of \$300,000.00, the total Project award recommendation equals **\$1,890,542.66**.

The costs for this work will be detailed in the Contract, which was included in this RFP, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendations of the Bond Team. Please direct all questions through me via email at [brian.weber@plantemoran.com](mailto:brian.weber@plantemoran.com).

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Brian Weber  
Vice President

Enclosures:    Summary of Costs  
                  IDS Recommendation Letter



TECHNOLOGY - SECURITY CAMERAS  
BUDGET SUMMARY

	<b>Base Cost</b>		
<b>Buildings</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
District-Wide	\$ 1,410,000	\$ 1,590,542.66	\$ (180,542.66)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,410,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,590,542.66</b>	<b>\$ (180,542.66)</b>

	<b>Contingency</b>		
<b>Buildings</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
District-Wide	\$ 140,000	\$ 300,000.00	\$ (160,000.00)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 140,000</b>	<b>\$ 300,000.00</b>	<b>\$ (160,000.00)</b>

	<b>Total Project Costs</b>		
<b>Buildings</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
District-Wide	\$ 1,550,000	\$ 1,890,542.66	\$ (340,542.66)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,550,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,890,542.66</b>	<b>\$ (340,542.66)</b>

January 13, 2023

Mr. Phillip Francis  
 Assistant Superintendent of district Services  
 Livonia Public Schools  
 15125 Farmington Road  
 Livonia, MI 48154

Project Name: Livonia Public Schools  
 Security Camera Upgrades  
 Livonia, Michigan

IDS Project No.: 21191-1000 BP03

Dear Mr. Francis:

Bid specifications and drawings for the Security Camera Upgrades project were issued on October 20, 2022. The bid documents allowed for bidders to submit cloud based and/or on-premises video management systems for the district to consider. The bid scope included demolition of existing security cameras and installation of new security cameras. Reuse, relocate and provide new Category 6 data cabling and provide a new video management system. Also included was aiming, programming, testing, and documentation services. The bid documents requested pricing for 5 years (Base Bid), 7 years (Mandatory Alternate 1) and 10 years (Mandatory Alternate 2) of warranty, support and licensing to provide a turnkey security camera and video management system in all the District's buildings. The bid documents reflected an engineered solution and provided quantities and types of cameras as well as desired camera coverage for both interior and exterior locations.

Representatives from twenty-five (25) companies attended the pre-bid conference on October 27, 2022. The pre-bid conference was not mandatory.

Twenty (20) bids from seventeen (17) companies were received on November 10, 2022, as follows:

Bidder	Bid Bond	Required Affidavits	Base Bid	MA 1 7 year warranty & licensing	MA 2 10 year warranty & licensing
Vector Tech Group	Yes	Yes	\$131,012.00	N/A	N/A
Sentinel - Bid 2	Yes	Yes	\$1,230,009.38	N/A	\$360,533.28
Sentinel - Bid 1 (withdrawn)	Yes	Yes	\$1,437,587.40	\$72,304.64	\$175,484.48
Telecom Technicians	Yes	Yes	\$1,495,471.00	\$2,720.00	\$6,800.00
Amcomm Telecommunications	Yes	Yes	\$1,507,100.00	N/A	N/A
Delta Network Services	Yes	Yes	\$1,525,430.57	\$17,356.34	\$43,390.86
Modern Fire & Security Systems	Yes	Yes	\$1,568,474.13	\$156,847.41	N/A
Moss Telecom	Yes	Yes	\$1,625,719.13	N/A	N/A
Creek Enterprises	Yes	Yes	\$1,663,898.00	\$357,738.00	\$534,111.00
People Driven Technologies	Yes	Yes	\$1,711,265.27	\$147,655.20	\$369,138.00
Security 101	Yes	Yes	\$1,731,257.98	\$188,955.78	\$274,843.56
ADT Commercial	Yes	Yes	\$1,749,461.47	\$49,771.00	\$100,067.00
CBTS	Yes	Yes	\$1,877,718.99	N/A	N/A
Knightwatch - Bid 2	Yes	Yes	\$1,886,422.02	\$144,361.76	\$309,014.78
Convergent Technologies	Yes	Yes	\$1,999,771.00	\$245,000.00	\$785,000.00
D/A Central	Yes	Yes	\$2,022,858.00	\$95,000.00	\$287,500.00
Inacomp TSG	Yes	Yes	\$2,295,550.00	N/A	\$732,105.57
CDW Education - Bid 1	Yes	Yes	\$2,337,488.14	\$41,429.99	N/A
Knightwatch - Bid 1	Yes	Yes	\$2,363,950.05	\$264,528.90	\$593,929.51
CDW Education - Bid 2	Yes	Yes	\$3,261,059.37	N/A	\$335,458.20

During the technology team's review of the bids, it was determined that Vector Tech Group's bid submission was noncompliant as they did not include security cameras and the video management system as part of their bid. Amcomm Telecommunications bid did not include Mandatory Alternate pricing for 7 years and 10 years of warranty, support and licensing as required.

Interviews were conducted with Sentinel, Telecom Technicians and Delta Network Services.

Sentinel: Sentinel submitted two (2) bids for two (2) different cloud based security camera systems. During the technology team's review, various pricing and equipment discrepancies were noted between Sentinel's Base Bid, their Bid Form and their included Bill of Materials for both of their submitted bid responses. Sentinel subsequently withdrew their Bid No. 1 as well as Voluntary Alternate No. 1 for their Bid No. 2 response for an alternate camera model. During their interview, Sentinel stated they would provide the quantity and types of cameras necessary to achieve the coverage and design intent of the Bid Documents for their Base Bid amount as submitted. Additional performance discrepancies were noted with some of their submitted equipment and cabling. Sentinel stated they would provide equipment and cabling models that meet the Bid Specifications. The manufacturer that Sentinel submitted includes a standard 10 year hardware warranty. Sentinel's Mandatory Alternate pricing discrepancies were discussed and clarified, and Sentinel stated that their Mandatory Alternate No. 2 included pricing for 10 years of licensing for all the equipment being provided.

Telecom Technicians: Telecom Technicians submitted a bid for an on-premises based security camera system. During the technology team's review, discrepancies were noted in the quantity of cameras included in their Bill of Materials. Telecom Technicians subsequently clarified that using their included unit pricing, the cost to add those cameras to their Base Bid would be \$31,533.00. Additional performance discrepancies were noted with the cabling part number submitted. Telecom Technicians stated they would provide cabling that meets the Bid Specifications. The manufacturer Telecom Technicians submitted does not offer warranties longer than five (5) years. Telecom Technicians mandatory alternate prices included labor only for them to troubleshoot the issue. Replacement/repair of the equipment is not included in their pricing.

Delta Network Services: Delta Network Services submitted a bid for an on-premises based security camera system. During the technology team's review, discrepancies were noted in the quantity of cameras included in their Bill of Materials. Delta Network Services subsequently clarified that using their included unit pricing, the cost to add those cameras and additional server storage to their Base Bid would be \$47,269.35. Additional performance discrepancies were noted with the cabling part number submitted. Delta Network Services stated they would provide cabling that meets the Bid Specifications. Delta Network Services Mandatory Alternate pricing included all warranty, support and licensing costs in their pricing for all equipment with the exception of the storage appliances. The manufacturer would only provide a five (5) year warranty. Delta Network Services received confirmation from the manufacturer that their Mandatory Alternate pricing as submitted does include the storage appliances for a total period of seven (7) years. The manufacturer was not able to offer a warranty extension to ten (10) years for the storage appliances.

After the interviews, the Livonia team requested additional product demonstrations from the bidders. While all three (3) solutions were deemed acceptable, the Livonia team strongly preferred the video management system interface, analytics and search capabilities of the cloud based solution submitted by Sentinel as Bid No. 2. **IDS recommends award of the Security Camera Upgrades bid to Sentinel in the amount of \$1,590,542.66 which includes Base Bid \$1,230,009.38 + Mandatory Alternate 2 for a 10 year warranty and licensing \$360,533.28. In addition to the award amount, IDS is recommending a construction contingency be established in the amount of \$300,000.00.**

Sincerely,

Integrated Design Solutions, LLC



Scott Smith  
Senior Associate



Rock Morey  
Project Manager

ec: T. Klan, LPS  
B. Weber, PMC  
File