



December 3, 2018

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for Roof Replacement Project  
Johnson Upper Elementary School

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of a Prime Contractor for the Project listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, Roofing Technology Associates, Ltd. (RTA), LPS administration and staff (the Project Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend a Prime Contractor firm for this Project.

On November 7, 2018, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On November 27, 2018, four (4) bid proposals were received for the Project and over the next several days were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on November 28, 2018 and were attended by representatives from RTA, PMC, and LPS. The scope of work (which includes full removal and replacement of the existing roofing system and metal fascia panels), project schedule, manpower requirements, safety, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Project Team is recommending JD Candler Roofing, Inc. as listed in RTA's recommendation letter dated November 29, 2018.

Including hard construction of \$1,484,000.00 and construction contingency of \$116,000.00 (approximately 8%), the total Project award recommendation equals \$1,600,000.00.

For the Prime Contractor, the cost for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, as modified, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at [scott.smith@plantemoran.com](mailto:scott.smith@plantemoran.com).

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP  
Senior Consultant

Enclosures:    Cost Summary  
                  Roofing Technology Associates, LTD. Recommendation Letter  
                  Bid Tabulation  
                  Existing Roofing Condition Map



**ROOFING REPLACEMENT - COST SUMMARY**

	Hard Construction		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Johnson Upper Elementary School	\$ 1,729,000	\$ 1,484,000	\$ (245,000)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,729,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,484,000</b>	<b>\$ (245,000)</b>

	Construction Contingency (8%)		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Johnson Upper Elementary School	\$ 138,320	\$ 116,000	\$ (22,320)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 138,320</b>	<b>\$ 116,000</b>	<b>\$ (22,320)</b>

	Total Project Costs		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Johnson Upper Elementary School	\$ 1,867,320	\$ 1,600,000	\$ (267,320)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,867,320</b>	<b>\$ 1,600,000</b>	<b>\$ (267,320)</b>



## ROOFING TECHNOLOGY ASSOCIATES, LTD.

---

38031 SCHOOLCRAFT  
LIVONIA, MICHIGAN 48150-1065  
(734) 591-4444 • FAX (734) 591-1660 • E-MAIL: rta@rtaltd.com  
Web site www.rtaltd.com

November 29, 2018  
Project No. 18-051

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia MI 48154-5474  
[pfrancis@livoniapublicschools.org](mailto:pfrancis@livoniapublicschools.org)

RE: BID EVALUATION  
Roof Replacement  
Johnson Upper Elementary School  
Livonia, Michigan

Dear Mr. Francis:

The bids for the referenced project were received by the School District on November 27, 2018 and opened in public. We have reviewed the bids which have been tabulated on the attached form.

The low bidder for Johnson Upper Elementary School is J.D. Candler Roofing, Inc. with a total price of \$1,484,000. We have reviewed their bids with them on November 28<sup>th</sup>. They completely understand the scope of work.

It is recommended to have a contingency fund for unforeseen conditions of approximately 8%.

We would recommend awarding the contract to J.D. Candler Roofing. They have indicated that they could meet the schedule for this summer. RTA has worked successfully with them in the past on several projects.

Sincerely,

ROOFING TECHNOLOGY ASSOCIATES, LTD.

Michael C. Bode, RRC  
Project Manager

MCB/lab

Attachment  
Cc: Scott Smith



## JOHNSON UPPER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL BID TABULATION

	JD CANDLER	LUTZ	BLOOM	QUALITY
<b>Base Bid</b>	<b>\$1,484,000</b>	<b>\$1,665,000</b>	<b>\$1,690,000</b>	<b>\$1,673,873</b>
<b>Unit price No. 1 – Wood Nailers (per l.f.)</b>				
1 x 4	4.00	3.00	2.00	3.00
1 x 6	4.00	3.25	2.50	3.00
1 x 8	4.00	3.75	3.00	3.00
2 x 4	4.00	4.00	3.00	4.00
2 x 6	4.00	4.75	3.50	5.00
2 x 8	4.50	5.25	4.00	6.00
2 x 10	4.50	5.75	4.50	7.00
2 x 12	4.50	6.75	5.00	8.00
½" plywood	4.00	6.50	3.00	4.50
¾" plywood	4.50	7.00	3.50	4.50
<b>Unit Price No. 2 – Sheet Metal Plate (per s.f.)</b>				
	3.50	3.50	3.50	4.00
<b>Unit Price No. 3 – Drain (per drain)</b>				
	1,200	2,000	1,500	3,000
<b>Unit price No. 4 - Deck (per s.f.)</b>				
	6.00	7.00	10.00	5.00

\*\* - **J.D. Candler** Bid Price does not include the cost for the removal and reinstallation of the exterior security cameras and speakers.

\*\* - **Lutz Roofing** not responsible for any conduit below or above the roof deck. The camera, speakers and signage is not included the scope of work.

\*\* - **Quality Roofing** proposal based on an Alternate Wall Panel "Kingspan KS Optimo 3" thick



GENERAL NOTES:

1. All areas and dimensions shown are approximate and based upon rough field measurements taken by representatives of Roofing Technology Associates, Ltd.
2. This drawing should not be used for bidding or estimating purposes. Contractors are responsible for their own field measurements, quantities and verification of conditions shown.

CONDITION		SERVICEABLE LIFE	RCI
failed		0 - 1 years	0 - 30
very poor		1 - 3 years	31 - 45
poor		3 - 6 years	46 - 55
fair		6 - 10 years	56 - 65
fair to good		10 - 15 years	66 - 75
good		15+ years	76 - 100

## ROOF AREA PLAN

not to scale

NOTE: components shown are new unless noted as existing



**ROOFING TECHNOLOGY ASSOCIATES, LTD.**

38031 SCHOOLCRAFT ROAD  
LIVONIA, MICHIGAN 48150-1065  
(734) 591-4444

LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS  
JOHNSON UPPER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL  
8400 NORTH HIX RD  
WESTLAND, MICHIGAN

**Project No:** 17-043

**Drawn By:** JDS

**Detail No:**

**Date:** JUNE, 2017

**Checked By:** MCB

15