



April 8, 2016

Ms. Lisa Abbey  
Assistant Superintendent of Business Services  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for 2016 Pavement Replacement Projects  
Hayes Elementary / Kennedy Elementary / Riley Upper Elementary

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for this Project.

In March 2016, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan websites.

On April 6, 2016, three (3) bid proposals were received, and over the next two days were reviewed to determine budget implications. An interview with Best Asphalt was conducted on April 7th and was attended by representatives from PMC, NTH Consultants, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interview, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending Best Asphalt for contract award at Hayes Elementary, Kennedy Elementary, and Riley Upper Elementary. The award recommendation includes acceptance of Alternate #1 at Hayes Elementary and acceptance of Best Asphalt's combined bid savings.

Including hard construction (\$454,500) and construction contingency (\$45,450) dollars, the total Project award recommendation equals \$499,950.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2007 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in blue ink, reading "Scott Smith".

Scott Smith, LEED AP  
Senior Consultant

Enclosures:     Cost Summary  
                     Bid Tabulation



### Hayes / Kennedy / Riley - COST SUMMARY

	Hard Construction
<b>Building</b>	Actual
Hayes Elementary	\$ 186,626
Kennedy Elementary	\$ 97,498
Riley Upper Elementary	\$ 170,376
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 454,500</b>

	Construction Contingency (10%)
<b>Building</b>	Actual
Hayes Elementary	\$ 18,662
Kennedy Elementary	\$ 9,750
Riley Upper Elementary	\$ 17,038
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 45,450</b>

	Total Project Costs
<b>Building</b>	Actual
Hayes Elementary	\$ 205,288
Kennedy Elementary	\$ 107,248
Riley Upper Elementary	\$ 187,414
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 499,950</b>



**Proposal: Pavement Replacement at Hayes / Kennedy / Riley**

**Location: Livonia Administrative Offices - Conference Room "C"**

**Date: April 6, 2016 at 12:30 pm**

**Recorded By: Celia Davis**

**Witness: Harry Lau**

Contractor Name	Bid Security	Bid Formality				Base Bid Amounts				Combined Bid	Alternates		Comments / Voluntary Alternates
		Add	EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Hayes	Kennedy	Riley	Total		Hayes - Alt. #1	Franklin - Alt #1	
Best Asphalt, Inc.	Yes	1 & 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 183,000	\$ 99,000	\$ 173,000	\$ 455,000	\$ 448,000	\$ 6,500	\$ 154,000	Offered Combined Bid Savings of \$7,000 if Awarded All 3 Projects
Nagle Paving Company	Yes	1 & 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 198,890	\$ 93,390	\$ 173,890	\$ 466,170	\$ 466,170	\$ 11,000	\$ 167,190	
Pavex Corporation	Yes	1 & 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 185,000	\$ 94,000	\$ 187,000	\$ 466,000	\$ 464,000	\$ 6,025	\$ 137,325	Offered Combined Bid Savings of \$2,000 if Awarded All 3 Projects

**Hayes Alternate #1 - Provide Mill & Cap of Asphalt at Bus Loop in lieu of Crack Filling & Sealcoating**

**Franklin Alternate #1 - Provide Pavement Replacement and Mill & Cap Along Western Parking Lot**