



Real Estate Consultants

Plante Moran Cresa, LLC  
3000 Town Center, Suite 100  
Southfield, MI 48075  
Tel: 248.223.3500 | Fax: 248.223.3150  
pmcresa.com

January 16, 2023

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Asst. Superintendent of District Services  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for Construction Bids  
Franklin HS Tennis Court Replacement

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Project listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, Foresite Design, Inc., LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractors for these Projects.

On November 28, 2022, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On December 13, 2022, five (5) bid proposals for two (2) bid categories were received for the Project and were subsequently reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on December 14, 2022 and were attended by representatives from Foresite Design, PMC, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending the firms listed in Foresite Design's letter dated January 9, 2023.

Including hard construction of \$1,123,834 and construction contingency of \$89,906 (8%), this Project award recommendation equals **\$1,213,740.00**.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at [brian.weber@plantemoran.com](mailto:brian.weber@plantemoran.com).

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Livonia Public Schools

January 16, 2023  
Page 2

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Brian Weber  
Vice President

Enclosures:    Budget Summary  
                    Foresite Design, Inc. Recommendation Letter  
                    Bid Tabulation



SINKING FUND - FRANKLIN HS TENNIS COURT REPLACEMENT  
CONSTRUCTION BUDGET SUMMARY

	Hard Construction		
Buildings	Budget	Actual	Variance
Franklin HS - Tennis	\$ 1,142,600	\$ 1,123,834	\$ 18,766
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,142,600</b>	<b>\$ 1,123,834</b>	<b>\$ 18,766</b>

	Construction Contingency (8%)		
Buildings	Budget	Actual	Variance
Franklin HS - Tennis	\$ 91,400	\$ 89,906	\$ 1,494
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 91,400</b>	<b>\$ 89,906</b>	<b>\$ 1,494</b>

	Total Project Costs		
Buildings	Budget	Actual	Variance
Franklin HS - Tennis	\$ 1,234,000	\$ 1,213,740	\$ 20,260
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,234,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,213,740</b>	<b>\$ 20,260</b>

January 9, 2023

Philip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin High School – 2023 Tennis Renovations  
Letter of Recommendation

Dear Mr. Francis,

Enclosed, for your review, is a tabulation sheet of the bids submitted on December 13, 2022, for the Livonia Public Schools – Franklin High School 2023 Tennis Renovations. Proposals were separated into two bid categories, which we received a total of five bids.

Post Bid Interviews were conducted with the apparent low bidders on December 14th, 2022. Our recommendations for award to the lowest responsible bidders are as follows:

**Proposal A Site Work:**

We recommend **Nagle Paving Company** of Novi, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal A Site Work for the contract sum of **\$977,690.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Proposal A Base Bid:	\$ 977,690.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 977,690.00</b>

**Proposal B Fencing:**

We recommend **RMD Holdings d/b/a Nationwide Construction Group** of Richmond, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal B Fencing for the contract sum of **\$146,144.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Proposal B Base Bid:	\$ 146,144.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 146,144.00</b>

- The vendor recommended for award was not the “as-read” low bidder for this category but deemed to be the most responsive following the Post Bid Evaluations.

**The total amount recommended for award is as follows:**

<b>Nagle Paving Company</b>	<b>\$ 977,690.00</b>
<b>RMD Holdings d/b/a Nationwide Construction Group</b>	<b>\$ 146,144.00</b>
<b>Recommended Project Total</b>	<b>\$ 1,123,834.00</b>



Please advise our office of additional information that may be required from the recommended Contractor(s) so that we may secure on your behalf for presentation at the next Board of Education meeting.

If you have any questions or concerns pertaining to this information, please do not hesitate to contact our office.

Sincerely,

FORESITE DESIGN, INC.



Michael Sims

Encl : (2)



**Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin High School  
Tennis Court Reconstruction 2023**

Bids Due: 12/13/22 @ 2:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADD. #1		Proposal A - Site Work		
									BASE BID	Alt #1: Re-install aggregate stone	REMARKS
<b>Nagle Paving</b>	<b>BB</b>	<b>CC</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>\$977,690.00</b>	<b>-\$20,000.00</b>	Vol Alt (1)
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			

**\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder**



**Livonia Public Schools  
Franklin High School  
Tennis Court Reconstruction 2023**

Bids Due: 12/13/22 @ 2:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADD. #1		Proposal B - Fencing	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	REMARKS
<b>Motor City Fence</b>	<b>BB</b>	<b>CC</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>\$108,664.00</b>	
Nationwide Construction Group	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$146,144.00	
Action Traffic	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$154,550.00	
American Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$200,834.00	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		

**\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder**

