

227 N. Fourth Street
Geneva, Illinois 60134
630/463-3000
630/463-3020
Fax: 630/463-3029



Scott K. Ney
Director, Facility Operations

**Community Unit
School District 304**

TO: Dr. Kent Mutchler
FROM: Scott Ney
RE: 2021-22 GMSS Boiler and Domestic Hot Water Storage Tank Replacement
DATE: January 19, 2021

Bids were publicly posted on Thursday, November 19, 2020 in the Daily Herald.

On December 15, 2020 at 4:00 pm, bids were opened and read aloud for GMSS boiler and hot water storage tank replacement.

Nine (9) bidders responded. The results are shown below. The low bidder is highlighted.

The contractors submitting bids were:

ACSI Mechanical Group	AMS Mechanical Systems, Inc.
Commercial Mechanical, Inc.	Cyril Regan Heating, Inc.
F.E. Moran, Inc.	Helm Mechanical Group
Independent Mechanical Industries, Inc.	Oak Brook Mechanical
Voris Mechanical, Inc.	

Results are as follows:

Contractor	Base Bid	Total
	Five (5) boilers and two (2) domestic hot water heaters	
ACSI Mechanical Group	\$982,771.00	\$982,771.00
AMS Mechanical Systems, Inc.	\$830,597.00	\$830,597.00
Commercial Mechanical, Inc.	\$984,000.00	\$984,000.00
Cyril Regan Heating, Inc.	\$838,516.00	\$838,516.00
F.E. Moran, Inc.	\$973,000.00	\$973,000.00
Helm Mechanical Group	\$943,000.00	\$943,000.00
Independent Mechanical Industries, Inc.	\$878,650.00	\$878,650.00
Oak Brook Mechanical	\$975,000.00	\$975,000.00
Voris Mechanical, Inc.	\$1,027,000.00	\$1,027,000.00

It is my recommendation that AMS Mechanical Systems, Inc. be awarded the Base Bid contract for \$830,597.00, which includes a \$75,000.00 Owner's Contingency Allowance. This equipment has been included in the 2020-21 Geneva CUSD #304 7-year Capital Improvement Plan.



Cashman Stahler Group

January 12, 2021

Mr. Scott Ney
Director of Facility Operations
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
227 N. Fourth Street
Geneva, IL 60134

**Boiler Replacement - Geneva Middle School South
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
Project Number: CSG730**

RE: Bid Recommendation

Scott,

I am writing in regards to the bidding for the referenced project and to recommend a bidder to you and the Board of Education. First, I would like to provide a little background regarding the project and the bidding.

Project Scope of Work

In general, the project scope of work includes the replacement of three (3) existing antiquated boilers with five (5) modular energy-efficient hot water boilers at the middle school. In addition, the existing domestic hot water storage tank will be replaced with two (2) high-efficiency domestic water heaters. The renovation also includes related pumps, expansion tanks, piping, flues, building automation system controls, and supporting electrical work.

Bidding Approach

Bids were solicited from mechanical contractors who will act as general contractors for the project. We published a bid notice for the project in the Daily Herald on Thursday, November 19, 2020.

To solicit additional interest in the project, we contacted ten (10) mechanical contractors that have successfully completed previous projects for our firm or the CS2 Design Group or submitted a bid on the previous boiler replacement project for our firm.

Beyond the firms we contacted, nine (9) additional mechanical contractors requested the bid documents after seeing the bid notice published in the newspaper.

The bid documents consisted of seventeen (17) 30"x42" drawings and five hundred eighty-seven (587) pages of Specifications and contract requirements in a Project Manual. The bid documents were issued on Thursday, November 19, 2020 to all interested bidders electronically.

On Tuesday, December 1, 2020, we held a mandatory pre-bid meeting at Geneva Middle School South to review important project requirements with interested bidders and to tour the project area. A total of sixteen (16) mechanical contractors attended the pre-bid meeting.

Prequalification Submittal

As part of the bid document requirements, interested bidders were required to submit prequalification documents via email to the Architect by 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, December 8, 2020. A total of eleven (11) bidders submitted the required documents.



Cashman Stahler Group

Bid Opening

On Tuesday, December 15, 2020, at 4:00 p.m., we held a public bid opening at Geneva Middle South School. The bid opening was attended by eight (8) bidders while nine (9) bids were delivered by bid time.

We received sealed bids from the following bidders and the bids were publicly opened and read. We were pleased to receive so many bids for the project.

<u>Bidder</u>	<u>Base Bid Amount</u>
1. ACSI Mechanical Group	\$982,771
2. AMS Mechanical Systems	\$830,597 (low bidder)
3. Commercial Mechanical Inc.	\$984,000
4. Cyril Regan Heating, Inc.	\$838,516
5. F.E. Moran Inc.	\$973,000
6. Helm Mechanical Group	\$943,000
7. Independent Mechanical Industries, Inc.	\$878,650
8. Oak Brook Mechanical	\$975,000
9. Voris Mechanical, Inc.	\$1,027,000

Comparison to Budget

We were pleased to receive so many bids. The District budget for the work was Eight Hundred Sixty Thousand Dollars (\$860,000) so we were happy that two of the bids were under the budgeted amount with a third just above the amount. The base bid amount also includes a Seventy-Five Thousand Dollar (\$75,000.00) Owner's Contingency Allowance so we believe we are adequately covered for any unforeseen conditions costs.

Bid Analysis - Evaluation of AMS Mechanical Services

The lowest apparent bidder was AMS Mechanical Systems, Inc. (AMS) is located in Woodridge, Illinois. The Cashman Stahler Group has worked with AMS on several large and complex mechanical projects since 1994. They were incorporated in 1967 and are one of the largest and most sophisticated mechanical contractors in the Midwest. AMS has more than 700 employees and experience in many project sectors including heavy industrial, industrial refrigeration, food process piping, HVAC, plumbing and have in-house professional engineers and design services. Due to the quality of their work and staff, they have worked for over 25 years with one of our public school clients, New Trier High School.

AMS's bonding capabilities are \$150,000,000 for a single project or \$300,000,000 aggregate. That speaks to the size of their firm and their project capabilities. In 2019, AMS had approximately \$50,000,000 under contract and completes an average of \$70,000,000 in construction per year over the last five years. They have their own in-house electrical and BAS control services which will be a benefit on this project. Their proposed team includes a union pipefitting superintendent with over 18 years of experience at AMS.

Safety is critical on all projects and a firm's low insurance experience modification rating (EMR) typically reflects the success of the firm's safety programs. It is a number used by insurance companies to gauge both past cost of injuries and future chances of risk. The lower the EMR for a contractor, the lower their worker compensation insurance premiums will be. An EMR of 1.0 is considered the industry average. AMS has a current EMR rating of 0.64. That is an excellent rating and should reflect a successful safety program at AMS.

Regarding project experience with AMS Mechanical Systems, the Cashman Stahler Group has extensive experience with the firm and CS2 Design Group is currently working with AMS on a boiler replacement project. Below is a partial listing of specific project experience with AMS Mechanical:

- Starting in 1994 at New Trier High School' Winnetka Campus, AMS was the mechanical piping contractor for an extensive, two-year, phased, mechanical and electrical system renovation encompassing five floors and over 350,000 square feet of project area. The project involved the replacement of 1930s and 1950s steam heating systems with a new hot water heating system and variable air volume air conditioning with a total contract sum over \$13,000,000.
- In 2007, AMS Mechanical successfully completed a \$1,262,491 steam boiler system replacement at New Trier High School's Northfield Campus, replacing four existing steam boilers and related pumps, piping and controls dating from 1967.



Cashman Stahler Group

- In the winter and spring of 2020, AMS Mechanical Systems completed a challenging \$261,200 rooftop chiller replacement at Westmont High School with challenging existing conditions & hoisting requirements.
- Currently, the CS2 Design Group, the mechanical and electrical engineers on this project, are working successfully with AMS Mechanical Systems on a \$1,799,000 seven (7) boiler plant project at Palatine School District 15.

On January 7, 2021, Steven J. Schafer, PE, the project mechanical engineer at CS2 Design Group, held a scope review meeting with Rob Inzinga, project manager at AMS Mechanical. Mr. Inzinga confirmed that AMS Mechanical Systems' bid includes the complete scope of work indicated in the Contract Documents and the project schedule requirements and are prepared to enter into a contract with Geneva Community Unit School District 304.

Recommendation

In conclusion, our firm and our consulting engineers have direct experience working with AMS and have found them to be highly qualified and one of the top mechanical contractors in the Chicago area. We recommend AMS Mechanical Systems without reservation and routinely invite them to bid on our public school projects.

The Cashman Stahler Group recommends that the Geneva Community Unit School District 304 Board of Education award an Owner-Contractor Agreement to **AMS Mechanical Systems Inc.** for the Work indicated in the Contract Documents for the Contract Sum of **Eight Hundred Thirty Thousand Five Hundred Ninety-Seven Dollars (\$830,597.00)**.

If you have any questions or comments, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

CASHMAN STAHLER GROUP, INC.

A handwritten signature in green ink that reads "Stephen J. Cashman".

Stephen J. Cashman, AIA, LEED AP BD+C
Principal Architect

cc: Project File
Mr. Steve Schafer, CS2 Design Group

Attachments: None