

May 5, 2014

Ms. Lisa Abbey
Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Construction Bids
Entryway Projects at Coolidge, Cleveland, Rosedale, Cooper, Frost Schools

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, McCarthy & Smith, French Associates and LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractors firms for this Project.

On April 15, 2014 Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan websites.

On April 29, 2014 thirty-four bid proposals were received, and over the next several days were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were held over the next few days and were attended by various members of the Bond Team.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Bond Team is recommending the firms listed in McCarthy & Smith's Award Recommendation Letter dated May 2, 2014 for contract award. Including hard construction, CM fees and costs, and construction contingency dollars, the total Project award recommendation equals \$667,844.00. This cost also includes the re-bid of the window treatments at Cleveland, Coolidge and Rosedale Schools.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor. The CM costs and fees will be detailed in Amendment #02 to AIA – C132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Construction Manager, both pending final review and approval by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the interview process, or the recommendations of the Bond Team. Please direct all questions through me via email.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'P. Theriault', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Paul Theriault, PE, LEED AP
Vice President

Enclosures: Budget Summary
 Award Recommendation Letter
 Summary of Costs
 Bid Tabulations

CLEVELAND, COOLIDGE AND ROSEDALE - BUDGET SUMMARY

Building	Hard Construction		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Cleveland Elementary	\$ 120,000	\$ 112,718	\$ 7,282
Coolidge Elementary	\$ 120,000	\$ 121,981	\$ (1,981)
Rosedale Elementary	\$ 120,000	\$ 81,739	\$ 38,261
Cooper Upper Elementary	\$ 100,000	\$ 101,112	\$ (1,112)
Frost Middle	\$ 100,000	\$ 176,355	\$ (76,355)
Totals	\$ 560,000	\$ 593,906	\$ (33,906)

Building	CM Fees and Costs		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Cleveland Elementary	\$ 8,400	\$ 3,939	\$ 4,461
Coolidge Elementary	\$ 8,400	\$ 4,106	\$ 4,294
Rosedale Elementary	\$ 8,400	\$ 3,382	\$ 5,018
Cooper Upper Elementary	\$ 7,000	\$ 1,560	\$ 5,440
Frost Middle	\$ 7,000	\$ 1,560	\$ 5,440
Totals	\$ 39,200	\$ 14,547	\$ 24,653

Building	Construction Contingency		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Cleveland Elementary	\$ 12,000	\$ 11,272	\$ 728
Coolidge Elementary	\$ 12,000	\$ 12,198	\$ (198)
Rosedale Elementary	\$ 12,000	\$ 8,174	\$ 3,826
Cooper Upper Elementary	\$ 10,000	\$ 10,111	\$ (111)
Frost Middle	\$ 10,000	\$ 17,635	\$ (7,635)
Totals	\$ 56,000	\$ 59,391	\$ (3,391)

Building	Project Totals		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Cleveland Elementary	\$ 140,400	\$ 127,930	\$ 12,470
Coolidge Elementary	\$ 140,400	\$ 138,286	\$ 2,114
Rosedale Elementary	\$ 140,400	\$ 93,295	\$ 47,105
Cooper Upper Elementary	\$ 117,000	\$ 112,783	\$ 4,217
Frost Middle	\$ 117,000	\$ 195,550	\$ (78,550)
Totals	\$ 655,200	\$ 667,844	\$ (12,644)



McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Construction Services

May 2, 2014

Lisa Abbey, Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia Public Schools – 2013 Bond Program
Bid Package #2
Entry Archways and Interior Signage at Cleveland, Coolidge, Rosedale, Cooper and Frost
Window Treatments at Cleveland, Coolidge and Rosedale

SUBJ: Contract Award Recommendation

Dear Ms. Abbey,

On Thursday, April 29, 2014 at 12:00 p.m., sealed bids were received and publicly opened for the above referenced project. In attendance for the bid opening were representatives from Livonia Public Schools, Plante Moran Cresa, French Associates, McCarthy & Smith, Inc. and interested bidders. Bids were opened, recorded and tabulated. We received 34 bids covering 7 scopes of work.

The project team conducted post bid interviews with each of the qualified bidders for each bid division of work. During the post bid interview, the project team reviewed the scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and specified materials with each of the contractors. Based upon the project team's review of the proposals and bidders, we propose the following recommendations to Livonia Public Schools for contract award:

Bid Division 104: Concrete

Kevin Irrer

CI Contracting, Inc.

7135 Dan McGuire, Suite B

Brighton, MI 48116

Base Bid

\$ 247,150.00

PLM Bond (Hudson Insurance Company)

\$ 6,850.00

TOTAL

\$ 254,000.00

Bid Division 106: Masonry

Daniel Zimmerman

Zimmerman Masonry, Inc.

5895 Brighton Pines Court

Howell, MI 48843

Base Bid

\$ 66,300.00

PLM Bond (Westfield Insurance Company)

\$ 825.00

TOTAL

\$ 67,125.00

Bid Division 107: Steel

Tom Lunsford
Graph-X Signs
45650 Mast St.
Plymouth, MI 48170

Base Bid	\$	26,873.75
PLM Bond (Not Required)	\$	<u>0.00</u>
TOTAL	\$	26,873.75

Bid Division 120: Painting

Kanto Vushaj
Seven Brothers Painting, Inc.
50805 Rizzo Drive
Shelby Township, MI 48315

Base Bid	\$	60,876.00
PLM Bond (International Fidelity Insurance Company)	\$	<u>1,521.00</u>
TOTAL	\$	62,397.00*

***2nd low bidder. Apparent low bidder had a gross error in their bid, and respectfully requested their bid be withdrawn from consideration.**

Bid Division 122: Signage

Gary Geisler
J. L. Geisler Corporation
28750 Lorna Avenue
Warren, MI 48092-3930

Base Bid	\$	46,964.00
PLM Bond (Not Required)	\$	<u>0.00</u>
TOTAL	\$	46,964.00

Bid Division 130: Window Treatments

Paul Cole
Lake Orion Window Treatments, Inc.
47 S. Broadway Street
Lake Orion, MI 48362

Base Bid	\$	57,346.00
PLM Bond (CNA Surety Company)	\$	<u>1,720.38</u>
TOTAL	\$	59,066.38

***2nd low bidder. Apparent low bidder had a gross error in their bid, and respectfully requested their bid be withdrawn from consideration.**

Bid Division 143: Electrical

John Munro
Munro Electric Company, Inc.
48590 Downing Street
Wixom, MI 48393-0178

Base Bid	\$	75,980.00
PLM Bond (International Fidelity Insurance Company)	\$	<u>1,500.00</u>
TOTAL	\$	77,480.00

***2nd low bidder. Apparent low bidder had a gross error in their bid, and respectfully requested their bid be withdrawn from consideration.**

TOTAL AWARD RECOMMENDATION AMOUNT: \$ 593,906.13

I trust the above recommendation meets the approval of the administration and the Board of Education. I will be in attendance at the May 5, 2014 board meeting to address any questions or concerns that may arise.

Please feel free to contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Steve Banchemo

Steve Banchemo
Sr. Project Manager

cc: Mr. Paul Theriault, Plante Moran Cresa
Ms. Keti Mitevska, French Associates
Mr. Bill McCarthy, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Ms. Lisa Bondy, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Mr. Rob Sturdy, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Mr. Dave Hampton, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
File

Livonia Public Schools Bid Pack #2
 Cleveland, Coolidge, Rosedale, Cooper Frost Entry Archways
 Window Treatments



BD#	Bid Division Description	Contractor	Contract Breakdown							Totals
			Cleveland	Coolidge	Rosedale	Cooper	Frost	Totals		
104	Concrete	CI Contracting	\$43,800.00	\$48,900.00	\$28,550.00	\$52,750.00	\$80,000.00	\$	\$254,000.00	
106	Masonry	Zimmerman Masonry	\$9,965.00	\$12,020.00	\$11,095.00	\$18,080.00	\$15,965.00	\$	\$67,125.00	
107	Steel	Graph-X Signs	\$5,374.75	\$5,374.75	\$5,374.75	\$5,374.75	\$5,374.75	\$	\$26,873.75	
120	Painting	*Seven Bros. Painting	\$2,562.00	\$2,562.00	\$2,562.00	\$2,644.00	\$52,067.00	\$	\$62,397.00	
122	Signage	J.L. Geisler	\$7,873.20	\$17,908.20	\$7,071.20	\$7,043.20	\$7,068.20	\$	\$46,964.00	
130	Window Treatments	*Lake Orion Window Treatment	\$24,963.46	\$22,266.46	\$11,836.46	NA	NA	\$	\$59,066.38	
143	Electrical	*Munro Electric	\$18,180.00	\$12,950.00	\$15,250.00	\$15,220.00	\$15,880.00	\$	\$77,480.00	
		Subtotal	\$ 112,718.41	\$ 121,981.41	\$ 81,739.41	\$ 101,111.95	\$ 176,354.95	\$	\$ 593,906.13	
		CM Pre Construction Services	\$ 1,460.00	\$ 1,460.00	\$ 1,460.00	\$ 1,460.00	\$ 1,460.00	\$	\$ 7,300.00	
		CM Staffing Labor	\$ 316.67	\$ 316.67	\$ 316.67	tbd	tbd	\$	\$ 950.00	
		CM General Conditions	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	\$	\$ 500.00	
		General Conditions	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	tbd	tbd	\$	\$ -	
		CM Fee	\$ 2,062.71	\$ 2,229.45	\$ 1,505.09	tbd	tbd	\$	\$ 5,797.25	
		Sub Total	\$ 116,657.79	\$ 126,087.52	\$ 85,121.17	\$ 102,671.95	\$ 177,914.95	\$	\$ 608,453.38	
		Project Contingency	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$	\$ -	
		Total	\$ 116,657.79	\$ 126,087.52	\$ 85,121.17	\$ 102,671.95	\$ 177,914.95	\$	\$ 608,453.38	



Livonia Public Schools Bid Pack #2
 Cleveland, Coolidge, Rosedale, Cooper Frost Entry Archways
 Window Treatments

BASE BID INFORMATION									
Bid Division / Description	Apparent Low Bidder	Base Bid	PLM Bond	VE/CBD	Total	# of Bids Rec'd	Low	High	
104 Concrete	CI Contracting	\$247,150.00	\$6,650.00		\$254,000.00	3	\$247,150.00	\$438,225.00	
106 Masonry	Zimmerman Masonry	\$66,300.00	\$825.00		\$67,125.00	3	\$66,300.00	\$92,005.00	
107 Steel	Graph-X Signs	\$26,873.75	\$0.00		\$26,873.75	8	\$26,873.75	\$49,750.00	
120 Painting	*Seven Bros. Painting	\$60,876.00	\$1,521.00		\$62,397.00	2	\$4,600.00	\$60,876.00	
122 Signage	J.L. Geisler	\$46,964.00	\$0.00		\$46,964.00	9	\$46,964.00	\$84,051.91	
130 Window Treatments	*Lake Orion Window Treatment	\$57,346.00	\$1,720.38		\$59,066.38	4	\$57,346.00	\$77,926.00	
143 Electrical	*Munro Electric	\$75,980.00	\$1,500.00		\$77,480.00	5	\$46,075.00	\$105,500.00	
TOTALS		\$581,489.76	\$12,416.38		\$593,906.13	34	\$495,308.75	\$908,333.91	

*=2nd Low Bidder

BUDGET SUMMARY	
Construction Budget	\$500,000.00 ***
Base Bid Total	\$593,906.13
Variance	-\$93,906.13