



June 8, 2016

Ms. Lisa Abbey  
Assistant Superintendent of Business Services  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Student Desks & Chairs  
Emerson MS / Frost MS / Holmes MS / Churchill HS / Franklin HS / Stevenson HS / LCTC

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Classroom Furniture Vendors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, LPS administration and staff, and the classroom furniture committee comprised of LPS administration, principals, and teaching staff (Furniture Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Vendors for this Project.

Beginning in the fall of 2014, LPS assembled the furniture committee to discuss the needs and requirements of replacement student furniture. Since that time, various meetings and discussions were conducted and furniture samples evaluated. When appropriate, furniture was piloted in select schools and feedback was provided. Using this feedback, an RFP was assembled to obtain competitive bids on furniture meeting the general needs as identified by the furniture committee. This RFP was specific to the secondary programs, however bidders were requested to provide pricing in different options and configurations as well as hold their pricing firm for a period of three (3) years so that this furniture could be considered at other schools within the district.

On April 27, 2016, bidding documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan websites.

On May 12, 2016, six (6) bid proposals were received which included both base bid desks/chairs as well as many voluntary alternates. Where voluntary alternates were quoted, physical samples and product literature were to be provided to LPS for review and consideration. Over the next several weeks they were reviewed and inspected to determine the budget implications and conformance to the RFP. Interviews were also conducted and were attended by various members of the Furniture Team.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Furniture Team is recommending the following awards:

**Student Chairs**

Interior Environments for a contract total of \$320,232.

**Student Desks**

Staples Business Advantage for a contract total of \$556,428 (\$551,428 base bid + \$5,000 alternate to remove existing student desks/chairs in these schools).

The pricing above is based on the quantity of desks and chairs as provided by LPS Administration. The vendors listed above have confirmed holding their unit pricing for the specific types of furniture above for a 3-year period. Furthermore, each product will come with a 20 year warranty.

The costs for this work will be detailed in their contract, a draft of which was included in this RFP, pending final review and approval by district legal counsel.

Physical samples of the desk and chair are available for viewing at the LPS Administration building.

The Furniture Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the interview process, or the recommendations of this update. Please direct all questions through me via email.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP  
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Bid Tabulations



## SECONDARY PROGRAM STUDENT CHAIRS

STUDENT CHAIR QUANTITY 6600

Vendor	Description	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Bid Bond	Add. #1	Familial Disclosure	EOE	Iran Sanctions
Staples Business Advantage	Alumni Explorer Chair (4 Leg)	\$ 186,912.00	\$ 28.32	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Interior Environments	ArtcoBell Discover Chair (4 Leg)	\$ 190,278.00	\$ 28.83	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Holland Desk & Chair	Alumni Explorer Chair (4 Leg)	\$ 201,498.00	\$ 30.53	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
School Specialty	Classroom Select Chair (4 Leg)	\$ 261,690.00	\$ 39.65	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Dew-El Corp.	Virco Metaphor N918 Chair (4 Leg)	\$ 290,400.00	\$ 44.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Holland Desk & Chair	Alumni Integrity Smooth Chair (4 Leg)	\$ 291,522.00	\$ 44.17	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Staples Business Advantage	Alumni Integrity Smooth Chair (4 Leg)	\$ 294,690.00	\$ 44.65	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Staples Business Advantage	Alumni Explorer Chair (Cantilevered Leg)	\$ 318,120.00	\$ 48.20	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Interior Environments</b>	<b>ArtcoBell Alphabet Chair (4 Leg)</b>	<b>\$ 320,232.00</b>	<b>\$ 48.52</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>
Holland Desk & Chair	Alumni Explorer Chair (Cantilevered Leg)	\$ 327,162.00	\$ 49.57	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Dew-El Corp.	Mien BFF Chair (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 343,200.00	\$ 52.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Interior Environments	ArtcoBell Discover Chair (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 360,426.00	\$ 54.61	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Holland Desk & Chair	Alumni Integrity Smooth Chair (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 372,042.00	\$ 56.37	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Staples Business Advantage	Alumni Integrity Smooth Chair (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 382,734.00	\$ 57.99	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Interior Environments	ArtcoBell Alphabet Chair (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 405,438.00	\$ 61.43	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
School Specialty	Classroom Select Elliptical Chair (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 454,938.00	\$ 68.93	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Great Lakes Furniture Supply	V/S Panto-Swing LuPo Chair (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 521,400.00	\$ 79.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
School Specialty	Classroom Select NeoMove Elliptical (Cantilever Leg)	\$ 601,326.00	\$ 91.11	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes



## SECONDARY PROGRAM STUDENT DESKS

STUDENT DESK QUANTITY 6200

Vendor	Description	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Bid Bond	Add. #1	Familial Disclosure	EOE	Iran Sanctions
Staples Business Advantage	Alumni Integrity Desk w/ Hard Plastic Top	\$ 551,428.00	\$ 88.94	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Holland Desk & Chair	Alumni Integrity Desk w/ Hard Plastic Top	\$ 552,296.00	\$ 89.08	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
School Specialty	Classroom Select Elliptical Desk w/ Hard Plastic Top - Year 1	\$ 618,140.00	\$ 99.70	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Great Lakes Furniture Supply	V/S Uno-M Student Desk w/ Ligno-Dur Top	\$ 644,800.00	\$ 104.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Dew-El Corp.	Mien TLC Cantilever Desk	\$ 725,400.00	\$ 117.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
School Specialty	Classroom Select Elliptical Desk w/ Hard Plastic Top - Year 2/3	\$ 728,004.00	\$ 117.42	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Staples Business Advantage	Alumni Integrity Desk w/ Chem Top	\$ 771,838.00	\$ 124.49	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Interior Environments	KI Portico Student Desk w/ Hard Plastic Top	\$ 794,220.00	\$ 128.10	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Great Lakes Furniture Supply	V/S Uno-M Student Desk w/ Hard Plastic Top	\$ 799,800.00	\$ 129.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Dew-El Corp.	Virco Text Adjustable Desk	\$ 837,000.00	\$ 135.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Great Lakes Furniture Supply	V/S Uno-M Student Desk w/ CDF Top	\$ 855,600.00	\$ 138.00	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes