



March 7, 2018

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects
Contract Award Recommendation for Pavement Projects
Cooper Upper Elementary School / Buchanan Elementary / Randolph Elementary

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of a Prime Contractor for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend a Prime Contractor firm for these Projects.

On February 15, 2018, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On March 5, 2018, two (2) bid proposals were received for the Projects, and over the next several days were reviewed to determine the budget implications. An interview with the low bidder was conducted on March 7th, 2018 with various members of the Team participating. The scope of work, permitting, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and clarified.

Upon completion of the interview, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending Nagle Paving Company for contract award at all three schools. This includes acceptance of alternate C-1 at Cooper Upper Elementary School in the amount of \$52,500.00. Including hard construction of \$882,280.00 and construction contingency of \$88,228.00, the total Project award recommendation equals \$970,508.00.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2007 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at scott.smith@plantemoran.com.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary
 NTH Recommendation Letter
 Bid Tabulation



COOPER / BUCHANAN / RANDOLPH PAVEMENT PROJECTS - COST SUMMARY

	Hard Construction		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Cooper Upper Elementary School	\$ 544,909	\$ 464,340	\$ 80,569
Buchanan Elementary School	\$ 147,636	\$ 211,250	\$ (63,614)
Randolph Elementary School	\$ 174,818	\$ 206,690	\$ (31,872)
			\$ -
Totals	\$ 867,364	\$ 882,280	\$ (14,916)

	Construction Contingency (10%)		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Cooper / Buchanan / Randolph	\$ 86,736	\$ 88,228	\$ (1,492)
	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Totals	\$ 86,736	\$ 88,228	\$ (1,492)

	Total Project Costs		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Cooper / Buchanan / Randolph	\$ 954,100	\$ 970,508	\$ (16,408)
	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Totals	\$ 954,100	\$ 970,508	\$ (16,408)



NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Infrastructure Engineering
and Environmental Services

41780 Six Mile Road, Suite 200
Northville, MI 48168
248.553.6300
248.324.5179 Fax

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, Michigan 48154

March 7, 2018
NTH Project No. 62-170218-00

**RE: 2018 Livonia Public Schools Paving Program-Buchanan, Cooper, and Randolph Schools
Contractor Award Recommendation
City of Livonia, Wayne County, Michigan**

Dear Mr. Francis:

Per our discussion and review of the Contractor's bids received, we have reviewed the Contractors' bid totals for the referenced project. Based on our review of the bids; specifically, the total bid to complete the work and the proposed contractor schedules, we recommend Livonia Public Schools retain Nagle Paving Company for the 2018 Bid Package No. 2 for Buchanan, Cooper, and Randolph Schools' Pavement Improvement Project. According to Nagle's quote, the cost per school and total construction contract amount will be as follows:

Buchanan Elementary School	\$211,250
Cooper Upper Elementary School	\$411,840
Cooper Alternate No. 1	\$ 52,500
<u>Randolph Elementary School</u>	<u>\$206,690</u>
TOTAL	\$882,280

Additionally, we recommend allocating contingency funds for the projects, approximately 10 percent, for unforeseen conditions that may be encountered.

Should you have any questions or need additional information regarding the project scope or budget, feel free to contact John Stadnicar at (248) 662-2730 (direct line).

Sincerely,

NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Anita R. Phillips, EIT
Assistant Project Engineer

John B. Stadnicar, P.E.
Senior Vice President

ARP/JBS/kg

cc: Harry Lau, Livonia Public Schools
Paul Theriault, P.E., LEED AP, Plante Moran CRESA
Scott Smith, LEED AP, Plante Moran CRESA

