



March 7, 2019

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for 2019 Pavement Projects  
Bid Pack #2 - Garfield Community School / Livonia Career Technical Center / Webster Elementary

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of a Prime Contractor for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend a Prime Contractor firm for these Projects.

On February 7, 2019, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On February 27, 2019, four (4) bid proposals were received for the Projects, and over the next several days were reviewed to determine the budget implications. An interview with the recommended bidder was conducted on March 6, 2019 with various members of the Team participating. The scope of work, schedule, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and clarified.

Upon completion of the interview, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending Nagle Paving Company for contract award at all three schools. Nagle Paving Company has successfully completed numerous pavement replacement projects for Livonia Public Schools over the past several years.

Including hard construction of \$945,910.00 and construction contingency of \$94,591.00, the total Project award recommendation equals \$1,040,501.00.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district's legal counsel.

The Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at [scott.smith@plantemoran.com](mailto:scott.smith@plantemoran.com).

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Scott Smith".

Scott Smith, LEED AP  
Senior Consultant

Enclosures:   Cost Summary  
                  NTH Recommendation Letter  
                  Bid Tabulation



**GARFIELD / LCTC / WEBSTER PAVEMENT PROJECTS - COST SUMMARY**

<b>Building</b>	<b>Hard Construction</b>		
	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Garfield Community School	\$ 210,000	\$ 318,490	\$ (108,490)
Livonia Career Technical Center	\$ 350,000	\$ 308,650	\$ 41,350
Webster Elementary School	\$ 240,000	\$ 318,770	\$ (78,770)
			\$ -
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 800,000</b>	<b>\$ 945,910</b>	<b>\$ (145,910)</b>

<b>Building</b>	<b>Construction Contingency (10%)</b>		
	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Garfield / LCTC / Webster	\$ 80,000	\$ 94,591	\$ (14,591)
	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 80,000</b>	<b>\$ 94,591</b>	<b>\$ (14,591)</b>

<b>Building</b>	<b>Total Project Costs</b>		
	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Garfield / LCTC / Webster	\$ 880,000	\$ 1,040,501	\$ (160,501)
	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 880,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,040,501</b>	<b>\$ (160,501)</b>



NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Infrastructure Engineering  
and Environmental Services

41780 Six Mile Road  
Northville, MI 48168  
Phone: 248-553-6300  
Fax: 248-324-5179

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, Michigan 48154

March 6, 2019  
NTH Project No. 62-180275-00

**RE: 2019 Livonia Public Schools Paving Program  
Bid Package No. 2 – Garfield, LCTC, and Webster  
Contractor Award Recommendation  
City of Livonia, Wayne County, Michigan**

Dear Mr. Francis,

Per our discussion and review of the Contractor’s bids received, we have reviewed the Contractors' bid totals for the referenced project. Based on our review of the bids; specifically, the total bid to complete the work and the proposed contractor schedules, we recommend Livonia Public Schools issue a contract with Nagle Paving for the 2019 Garfield, LCTC, and Webster Pavement Improvement Projects.

Nagle Paving was the lowest qualified bidder for each project. According to Nagle’s quote, the cost per school and total construction contract amount will be as follows:

Garfield School	\$ 318,490
LCTC	\$ 308,650
Webster Elementary School	<u>\$ 318,770</u>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$ 945,910</b>

However, we recommend maintaining some contingency funds for the project on the order of 10 percent for unforeseen conditions that may be encountered.

Should you have any questions or need additional information regarding the project scope or budget, feel free to contact John Stadnicar at (248) 662-2730 (direct line).

Sincerely,

NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Keith V. Laurenz, P.E.  
Senior Staff Engineer

John B. Stadnicar, P.E.  
Senior Vice President

KVL/JBS/kg

cc: Harry Lau, Livonia Public Schools  
Paul Theriault, P.E., LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa  
Scott Smith, LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa



**Proposal: Pavement Replacement at Garfield / LCTC / Webster**

**Location: Livonia Administrative Offices**

**Date: February 27, 2019 at 1:00 pm**

**Recorded By:** Scott Smith (Plante Moran Cresa)

**Read By:** Harry Lau (Livonia Public Schools)

Contractor Name	Bid Security	Bid Formality				Base Bid Amounts				Alternate	Comments / Voluntary Alternates
		Add (1 thru 2)	EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Garfield	LCTC	Frost	Total	Garfield	
Nagle Paving Company	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 318,490	\$ 308,650	\$ 318,770	\$ 945,910	\$ (7,500)	
T&M Asphalt Paving, Inc.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 326,000	\$ 349,000	\$ 340,000	\$ 1,015,000	\$ (5,000)	
Asphalt Specialists, Inc.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 340,200	\$ 355,000	\$ 331,000	\$ 1,026,200	\$ (13,200)	Combined Bid of \$1,025,000 if awarded all (3) schools
Best Asphalt	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 450,000	\$ 359,000	\$ 453,000	\$ 1,262,000	\$ (77,000)	Combined Bid of \$1,252,000 if awarded all (3) schools
									\$ -		