



March 30, 2018

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects
Contract Award Recommendation for Roof Replacement Projects
Holmes Middle School / Franklin High School (Partial) / LPS Transportation Building &
Warehouse (Partial)

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, Roofing Technology Associates, Ltd. (RTA), LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for these Projects.

On March 9th, 2018, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On March 27th, 2018, six (6) bid proposals from three (3) contractors were received for the Projects, and over the next several days were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on March 28th, 2018 and were attended by representatives from RTA, PMC, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, safety, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending the firms listed in RTA's letter dated March 29, 2018. The recommendation is to award work at Holmes Middle School, Franklin High School, Transportation Building and Warehouse Building. The recommendation includes acceptance of Alternate No. 2 – Insulated Metal Panel Fascia at Holmes Middle School. Alternate No. 2 provided the option to install an insulated metal panel system in lieu of a composite fascia system as specified in the base bid documents.

The Team is not recommending award of Alternate No. 1 – Roof Replacement at Churchill High School at this time due to elevated costs as well as the consideration that this is currently not a critical need within the district. Based on follow-up interviews, the higher costs are driven by isolated location of this roof which would be more cost-effective to replace when combined with future roofing projects at the school.

Including hard construction of \$2,691,900.00 and construction contingency of \$215,352.00, the total Project award recommendation equals \$2,907,252.00.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2007 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at scott.smith@plantemoran.com.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary
 Roofing Technology Associates, LTD. Recommendation Letter
 Bid Tabulation
 School Maps Indicating Scope



ROOFING REPLACEMENTS - COST SUMMARY

	Hard Construction		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Holmes Middle School	\$ 2,028,050	\$ 2,243,400	\$ 215,350
Franklin High School	\$ 279,400	\$ 239,500	\$ (39,900)
Transportation/Warehouse	\$ 208,890	\$ 209,000	\$ 110
Totals	\$ 2,516,340	\$ 2,691,900	\$ 175,560

	Construction Contingency (8%)		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Holmes/Franklin/Trans./Warehouse	\$ 201,307	\$ 215,352	\$ 14,045
Totals	\$ 201,307	\$ 215,352	\$ 14,045

	Total Project Costs		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Holmes/Franklin/Trans./Warehouse	\$ 2,717,647	\$ 2,907,252	\$ 189,605
Totals	\$ 2,717,647	\$ 2,907,252	\$ 189,605



ROOFING TECHNOLOGY ASSOCIATES, LTD.

38031 SCHOOLCRAFT
LIVONIA, MICHIGAN 48150-1065
(734) 591-4444 • FAX (734) 591-1660 • E-MAIL: rta@rtaltd.com
Web site www.rtaltd.com

March 29, 2018
Project No. 18-001

Mr. Phillip Francis
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia MI 48154-5474
pfrancis@livoniapublicschools.org

RE: BID EVALUATION
Roof Replacement
Holmes Middle School, Franklin High School, Warehouse & Transportation Bldg.
Livonia, Michigan

Dear Mr. Francis:

The bids for the referenced project were received by the School District on March 27, 2018 and opened in public. We have reviewed the bids which have been tabulated on the attached form.

The low bidder for Holmes Middle School is Lutz Roofing Company with a total price of \$2,243,400 for the roofing base bids and Alternate No. 2 (fascia panel replacement). We have reviewed their bid with them on March 28th and they have a complete understanding of the project.

Their bid breakdown is as follows:

Roof Base Bid	\$1,994,000
Alternate No. 2	<u>\$ 249,400</u>
TOTAL	\$2,243,400

The low bidder for Franklin High School, Warehouse and Transportation Buildings is J.D. Candler Roofing, Inc. with a total price of \$448,500. We have reviewed their bids with them on March 28th. They completely understand the scope of work.

Mr. Phillip Francis
March 29, 2018
Project No. 18-001
Page 2



Their bid breakdown is as follows:

Franklin High School	\$239,500
Warehouse & Trans. Bldg.	<u>\$209,000</u>
TOTAL	\$448,500

It is recommended to have a contingency fund for unforeseen conditions of approximately 8%.

We would recommend awarding contracts to both Roofing Contractors. They have indicated that they could meet the schedule for this summer. RTA has worked successfully with both contractors in the past on several projects.

Sincerely,

ROOFING TECHNOLOGY ASSOCIATES, LTD.

Michael C. Bode, RRC
Project Manager

MCB/lab

Attachment

Cc: Scott Smith



Bid Results 2018 Roof Replacements

	QUALITY ROOFING	JD CANDLER	LUTZ ROOFING
BID SECURITY	Yes	Yes	Yes
ADDENDUMS	Yes	Yes	Yes
EQUAL OPPORTUNITY STATEMENT	Yes	Yes	Yes
FAMILIAL DISCLOSURE STATEMENT	Yes	Yes	Yes
IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTIONS ACT	Yes	Yes	Yes
Holmes Middle School			
Roof	No bid	No bid	\$ 1,994,000
Aluminum Fascia Panel System	No bid	No bid	\$ 299,000
Total Holmes - Base Bid	-----	-----	\$ 2,293,000
Alternate No. 2 - Insulated Metal Panel Fascia (In Lieu of Aluminum)	No bid	No bid	\$ (49,600)
Total Holmes - With Alternate	-----	-----	\$ 2,243,400
Franklin High School			
	No bid	\$ 239,500	\$ 251,000
Warehouse & Transportation			
	\$ 236,366	\$ 209,000	\$ 242,000
Alternate No. 1 – Churchill High School			
	No Bid	\$ 198,000.00	\$ 228,000.00