November 2, 2023

Mr. Glen Finkel
Assistant Superintendent of Technology Services
Kent Intermediate School District
2930 Knapp St NE
Grand Rapids, MI 48525

Dear Glen,

Plante Moran and Kent Intermediate School District have completed the review of the proposals in response to the Public Address & Clock System request for proposal (RFP). This letter outlines the work completed, as well as the resulting recommendation.

Background

Kent Intermediate School District (the "ISD") undertook a process to select a new ISD-wide Public Address & Clock System solution. Plante Moran worked with members of the technology services, safety and security, and facilities departments to identify technical requirements, review key criteria, and evaluate the solutions. This process included the following key activities:

- Met with the ISD staff to discuss and review technical requirements
- Developed a detailed request for proposal (RFP)
- Analyzed proposals and issued clarifications to vendors
- Interviewed finalist vendors

Six proposals were received in response to the RFP and were reviewed for completeness, cost and compliance with the RFP specifications. The four lower cost proposals were selected for further analysis and review. Post-bid interviews were conducted for the four finalists and clarifications were issued to the four finalists to validate compliance with RFP requirements and normalize the bid prices. Through the diligence process, it was determined that the finalist with the lowest bid (Acorn) did not meet baseline RFP requirements, and two other finalists (Parkway and SVT) did not fully meet all the requirements of the RFP either (see analysis table for further details). The remaining finalist (VSC) was the only vendor able to reuse existing AND speakers recently acquired by the ISD and currently operational in some school buildings.

Recommendation

Based on review of the responses, discussions, interviews and clarifications with the finalist vendors, and the validation of references conducted by the ISD staff, the ISD is recommending the project be awarded to VSC Inc. (VSC) in amount not to exceed **$2,327,670.00** (not including performance bond) contingent upon successful contract negotiations. Plante Moran supports this recommendation. It was determined that VSC's proposed solution meets all

the requirements of the RFP and provides some additional benefits to the ISD (e.g., integration of video surveillance cameras, and possibility to integrate with classroom audio and video streaming solutions in the future). Additionally, we recommend that the ISD set aside a 15% contingency of **$355,000** to address unforeseen circumstances that may arise throughout the course of the implementation.

Plante Moran appreciates the opportunity to be of assistance to Forest Hills Public Schools. Please contact Jacinto Cordero at 248.223.3358 or Jacinto.Cordero@plantemoran.com, or me at 248.223.3799, mark.warner@plantemoran.com if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Mark Warner, Partner

cc: Amy Sasina, Jacinto Cordero, Matt Lindner

Attachments: Kent ISD Public Address & Clock System RFP analysis

Kent Intermediate School District
Public Address & Clock System RFP analysis

	Acorn	Parkway	SVT	VSC	MOSS	Bluum
Solution:	Telecor+Informacast	Carehawk	Carehawk	Audio Enhancement	Informacast	Audio Enhancement
Vendor Background						
Location:	Hamilton, MI	Holland, MI	Brighton, MI	Novi, MI	Grand Rapids, MI	Phoneix, AZ
# of years in business:	21	78 years	65	41	46	As Tierney since 1977
Total workforce:	14	177	110	19	124	900
Costs						
Base Bid Total	**$1,840,872.19**	**$2,205,412.26**	**$2,323,526.50**	**$2,507,300.00**	**$3,481,976.01**	**$4,569,806.87**
Normalizations						
Use clocks/speaker combo				-$202,960.00		
Use large clocks		$25,600.00	$13,366.40	$11,300.00		
Protection for hallway clocks in KEC-O & KEC-B		No additional cost	$930.00	$216.00	Not a finalist	Not a finalist
Add mobile app		$93,000.00	$108,000.00	Included		
Remove Sales Tax		N/A	-$71,572.64	N/A		
Add Ambient Noise Sensors		$47,400.00	$24,762.52	Included		
Add Emergency Button Covers (382 devices)		Inclided	$6,581.86	$8,404.00		
Add Campus Strobes A/A	$2,100.00	$21,284.23	$55,721.68	$14,420.00		
Reuse AND speakers (estimate 150 speakers)		N/A	N/A	-$45,000.00		
District View		N/A	N/A	$24,240.00		
Total normalized	**$1,842,972.19**	**$2,392,696.49**	**$2,461,316.32**	**$2,317,920.00**	**$3,481,976.01**	**$4,569,806.87**
Additionals						
Integrate ISD's VS Cameras (all buildings)	Not selected	Not selected	Not selected	$9,750.00	Not a finalist	Not a finalist
Award summary						
Total bid cost				**$2,327,670.00**		
Performance bond	Not selected	Not selected	Not selected	$32,667.00	Not a finalist	Not a finalist
Total award				**$2,360,337.00**		
Contingency (15%)				$355,000.00		
Non compliance or solution limitations	* No AD integration * Networking challenges * Hallway clocks display limitations * Bell schedule survivability	* AD integration in roadmap * No CAP integration to digital signage	* AD integration in roadmap * No CAP integration to digital signage	Awarded solution is compliant with the ISD's requirements		