

March 11, 2026

Mr. William Green
Assistant Superintendent of District Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects
Contract Award Recommendation for 2026 Pavement Projects
Central Office – Phase #3

Dear Mr. Green:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Realpoint (PMR) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of a Prime Contractor for the Project listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMR, Spalding DeDecker, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend a Prime Contractor firm for this Project.

On January 28, 2026, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On February 24, 2026, five (5) bid proposals were received for the Project, and were reviewed and evaluated by the team. Post bid interviews with the three (3) apparent low bidders were conducted the week of February 24th, 2026, with various members of the Team participating. The scope of work, schedule, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and clarified.

Upon completion of the interview, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is **recommending Nagle Paving** for contract award as they are the lowest responsible bidder for the Project.

Including hard construction of \$1,100,990.00 and construction contingency of \$110,010.00, the total Project award **recommendation equals \$1,211,000.00**. The amount includes hard construction amounts for Alternates 1 through 3A.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at collin.frink@plantemoran.com.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN REALPOINT



Collin Frink
Vice President

Enclosures: Cost Summary
Spalding DeDecker Recommendation Letter
Bid Tabulation
Phase 3 Map – Area of Work



**SINKING FUND
2026 PAVING PROJECTS
COST SUMMARY**

	Hard Construction		
Project	Budget	Actual	Variance
Central Office: Phase 3	\$ 1,240,000	\$ 1,100,990	\$ 139,010
Totals	\$ 1,240,000	\$ 1,100,990	\$ 139,010

	Construction Contingency		
	Budget (10%)	Actual (10%)	Variance
Project Contingency	\$ 124,000	\$ 110,010	\$ 13,990
Totals	\$ 124,000	\$ 110,010	\$ 13,990

	Total Project Costs		
	Budget	Actual	Variance
Project Total	\$ 1,364,000	\$ 1,211,000	\$ 153,000
Totals	\$ 1,364,000	\$ 1,211,000	\$ 153,000

March 11, 2026

Mr. William Green
Assistant Superintendent of District Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

Re: Livonia Public Schools - Central Office Phase 3
Award Recommendation Letter
SD Job No.: NP25-149

Dear Mr. Green:


Based on our review of the received project bids, we find the low bidder, Nagle Paving Company, of Novi, Michigan, satisfactory to perform the work under this contract. Other bidding companies included AI's Asphalt, Asphalt Specialists Inc., Best Asphalt, and R&R Asphalt. From our post-bid interview discussions with Rob Wilson of Nagle Paving Company, we find them to understand the proposed scope of work and project requirements.

Per our discussions, the recommended project scope of work includes the base bid scope along with alternate scope number 1, 1A, 2, 2A, 3 and 3A, as outlined in the bid documents. Their total bid cost for the recommended scope of work totals \$1,100,990.00. In addition to this hard construction cost, we also recommend approving a construction contingency in the amount of \$110,010.00, or approximately 10% of the total hard construction cost, to address unforeseen conditions or construction issues as they arise. Therefore, the total recommended project award amount is \$1,211,000.00.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, please contact our office at your convenience.

Sincerely,

SPALDING DEDECKER



Jacob R. Ensley, P.E.
Vice President | Project Manager


Proposal: Central Office Paving Phase 3

Location: Livonia Public Schools Central Office

Date: February 24, 2026

Contractor Name	Bid Security	Bid Formality					Base Bid Amounts								Base Bid Plus All Alternates
		EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Addendum 1	Addendum 2	Alternate 1	Alternate 1A	Alternate 2	Alternate 2A	Alternate 3	Alternate 3A			
Nagle Paving	X	X	X	X	X	X	\$ 483,540	\$ 161,300	\$ 189,100	\$ 75,000	\$ 87,950	\$ 43,800	\$ 60,300	\$ 1,100,990	
ASI	X	X	X	X	X	X	\$ 492,000	\$ 307,000	\$ 465,000	\$ 131,000	\$ 198,000	\$ 112,500	\$ 157,000	\$ 1,862,500	
Als Asphalt	X	X	X	X	X	X	\$ 464,000	\$ 272,789	\$ 480,406	\$ 131,155	\$ 215,510	\$ 118,864	\$ 184,387	\$ 1,867,111	
Best Asphalt	X	X	X	X	X	X	\$ 316,945	\$ 360,378	\$ 547,201	\$ 149,119	\$ 240,047	\$ 125,547	\$ 189,181	\$ 1,928,417	
R&R Asphalt	X	X	X	X	X	X	\$ 1,025,489	\$ 233,057	\$ 346,995	\$ 123,330	\$ 183,570	\$ 107,546	\$ 160,653	\$ 2,180,640	



 Area of work