

**Buffalo-Hanover-Montrose Schools #877 Transportation Proposal Analysis
4/23/2012**

Contractor	Year 1	Year 2	Total	Year 3 inflater	Year 4 Inflator	Year 3 Cost	Year 4 Cost	Total 4-Year Cost	Difference from Low for 4-Year Proposal
Vision Transportation*	\$ 3,175,925.00	\$ 3,175,925.00	\$ 6,351,850.00	2.5%	2.5%	\$ 3,255,323.13	\$ 3,336,706.20	\$ 12,943,879.33	
First Student	\$ 3,233,933.00	\$ 3,314,781.00	\$ 6,548,714.00	2.5%	2.5%	\$ 3,397,650.53	\$ 3,482,591.79	\$ 13,428,956.31	\$ (485,076.98)
Minnesota Central (Illinois Central)	\$ 3,298,609.00	\$ 3,397,568.00	\$ 6,696,177.00	3.0%	3.0%	\$ 3,499,495.04	\$ 3,604,479.89	\$ 13,800,151.93	\$ (856,272.60)
Positive Connections	\$ 3,323,892.00	\$ 3,423,608.00	\$ 6,747,500.00	3.0%	3.0%	\$ 3,526,316.24	\$ 3,632,105.73	\$ 13,905,921.97	\$ (962,042.64)
American Student Transportation	\$ 3,361,362.00	\$ 3,428,589.00	\$ 6,789,951.00	2.0%	2.0%	\$ 3,497,160.78	\$ 3,567,104.00	\$ 13,854,215.78	\$ (910,336.45)
Metropolitan Transportation Network	\$ 3,469,929.00	\$ 3,469,929.00	\$ 6,939,858.00	2.0%	2.0%	\$ 3,539,327.58	\$ 3,610,114.13	\$ 14,089,299.71	\$ (1,145,420.38)
Voigt Bus	Submitted a letter stating that they were not submitted a proposal								
2010-11 Comparable Costs**	\$ 3,406,262.26							\$ 13,625,049.04	4-year assuming 2010-11 actual carried forward
Vision costs with fuel clause	\$ 3,263,925.00	\$ 3,263,925.00				\$ 3,343,323.13	\$ 3,424,706.20	\$ 13,295,879.33	4-year cost with fuel clause
Net Savings from 2010-11 costs	\$ (142,337.26)	\$ (142,337.26)				\$ (62,939.14)	\$ 18,443.94	\$ (329,169.71)	Net savings from 10-11 costs assuming same costs for four years forward

*Includes 10 new vehicles per year and a guarantee to meet average fleet age of 6 years with no regular route bus greater than 11 years old and no spare bus more than 12 years old.

**Includes actual fuel escalator costs for 2010-11 at \$1.80 per gallon. Proposals above include fuel escalator cost at \$3.00 per gallon for all years. 2010-11 is the last known year for actual contract costs. Rates are the same for 2011-12 as 2010-11 and fuel escalator cost factor moved to \$2.00 per gallon. Estimated costs for 2011-12 would be approximately \$33,000 higher than 2010-11 due to fuel clause change and fuel price increases.