

227 N. Fourth Street  
 Geneva, Illinois 60134  
 630/463-3000  
 630/463-3020  
 Fax: 630/463-3029



**Scott K. Ney**  
 Director, Facility Operations

**Community Unit  
 School District 304**

TO: Dr. Kent Mutchler  
 FROM: Scott Ney  
 RE: 2021-22 Roof Repairs Bid – Multiple Schools  
 DATE: May 5, 2021

Bids were publicly posted on Thursday, April 1, 2021 in the Daily Herald.

On April 27, 2021 at 4:00 pm, bids were opened and read aloud for the 2021-22 Roof Repairs Bid.

Three (3) bidders responded. The results are shown below. The low bidder is highlighted.

The contractors submitting bids were:

Bennett & Brosseau Roofing, Inc. – Romeoville, IL  
 Preservation Services, Inc. – Romeoville, IL  
 Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. – St. Charles, IL

Results are as follows:

Contractor	Addenda	Bid Bond	Base Bid #1 (GHS and Boiler House)	Alt. #1 (10-year warranty at Boiler House)	Alt #2 (EPDM roof system replacement at HSS)	Alt #3 (Liquid-Applied Roof Membrane at Boiler House)	Base plus Alt. 2,3
Bennett & Brosseau Roofing, Inc.	X	X	\$247,000	(\$500)	\$215,000	\$24,500	\$486,500
Preservation Services, Inc.	X	X	\$210,000	(\$1,700)	\$180,000	\$21,000	\$411,000
Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.	X	X	\$313,000	(\$4,200)	\$218,000	\$26,000	\$557,325

It is my recommendation that Preservation Services, Inc. be awarded the 2021 Roof Repairs contract including Base Bid #1 (GHS and Boiler House) for \$210,000.00, Alternate #2 (HSS) for \$180,000, and Alternate #3 (Boiler House) for \$21,000. The total project cost, which includes a \$45,500 Contingency Allowance, is \$411,000.



**Cashman Stahler Group**

May 4, 2021

Mr. Scott Ney  
Director of Facility Operations  
Geneva Community Unit School District 304  
227 N. Fourth Street  
Geneva, IL 60134

**2021 Roof Replacements**  
**Geneva Community Unit School District 304**  
**Project Number: CSG737**

**RE: Bid Recommendation**

Scott,

I am writing in regards to the bidding for the referenced project and to recommend a bidder to you and the Board of Education. First, I would like to provide a little background regarding the project and the bidding.

**Project Scope of Work**

In general, the project scope of work includes the roof repairs and roof replacement work at Geneva High School, the High School Boiler House, and Harrison Street Elementary School. The roof renovations included in this project's scope are summarized as follows:

**Geneva High School Roof Area O and Roof Area V Repairs:**

- Repairs to existing fully-adhered ethylene propylene diene monome (EPDM) rubber single ply roof system including select replacement of existing insulation indicated was wet in the District's most recent infrared survey, select replacement of rippled EPDM membrane, and replacement of select EPDM flashings.
- The repairs are being conducted to allow the roof area to be scanned this fall in preparation for application of a liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane and flashings to the EPDM roof during the 2022 summer break.

**Geneva High School Boiler House Roof Replacement:**

- At the north roof area, application of a new liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane and flashings over an existing fully-adhered EPDM rubber single ply roof system.
- At the south roof area, replacement of a deteriorated EPDM roof system with a new liquid-applied polyurethane membrane & flashings over a new SBS modified bitumen roof system.

**Harrison Street Elementary School Roof Area L Repairs:**

- Replacement of a deteriorated EPDM roof system with a fully-adhered EPDM roof system and flashing including new roof drains, sheet metal conductor head & downspout. In addition, a new steel roof deck will be installed over the existing steel roof deck in accordance with the structural engineer's recommendations.

**Bidding Approach**

Bids were solicited from roofing contractors who will act as general contractors for the project. We published a bid notice for the project in the Daily Herald on Thursday, April 1, 2021.

To solicit additional interest in the project, we contacted six (6) roofing contractors that have successfully completed past projects for our firm or for the District. We also sent the bid notice to ConstructConnect digital bidding board to which many contractors subscribe for information related to public construction projects.



**Cashman Stahler Group**

Beyond the firms we contacted, twelve (12) additional roofing contractors requested the bid documents after seeing the bid notice published in the newspaper.

The bid documents consist of thirteen (13) 30"x42" drawings and three hundred sixty-four (364) pages of Specifications and contract requirements in a Project Manual. The bid documents were issued electronically on Wednesday, April 7, 2021 to all interested bidders.

On Tuesday, April 13, 2021, we held a mandatory pre-bid meeting at Geneva High School to review important project requirements with interested bidders and to tour the project areas at the high school and boiler house. A total of seven (7) contractors attended the pre-bid meeting.

**Prequalification Submittal**

As part of the bid document requirements, interested bidders were required to submit prequalification documents via email to the Architect by 5:00 p.m. on Friday, April 23, 2021. A total of three (3) registered bidders submitted the required documents.

During the bid period, three (3) registered bidders that attended the mandatory pre-bid notified us that they would not be bidding. Each firm stated they recently obtained work that precluded them from undertaking this project.

**Bid Opening**

On Tuesday, April 27, 2021, at 4:00 p.m., we held a public bid opening at the Coultrap Educational Services Center. By bid time, we received three (3) sealed bids and the bid opening was attended by three (3) bidders.

The bid form included a base bid, alternate bids, and unit prices as summarized below.

- Base bid: Work at Geneva High School and Boiler House
- Deductive Alternate Bid #1: Providing a 10-year warranty at Boiler House versus 20-year
- Additive Alternate Bid #2: Work at Harrison Street Elementary School
- Additive Alternate Bid #3: Adding a Liquid-Applied Roof Membrane at Boiler House south roof
- Unit Price #1: Replacement of deteriorated gypsum roof deck
- Unit Price #2: Repairing deteriorated gypsum roof deck
- Unit Price #3: Replacing deteriorated steel roof deck
- Unit Price #4: Replacing deteriorated plywood sheathing
- Unit Price #5: Replacing deteriorated wood blocking
- Unit Price #6: Replacing two layers of flat polyisocyanurate insulation
- Unit Price #7: Replacing one layer of tapered polyisocyanurate insulation
- Unit Price #8: Replacing 60 mil EPDM roof membrane

**Bid Results**

We received sealed bids from the following bidders and the bids were publicly opened and read. The unit price bid results can be found on the bid tabulation that is attached to this recommendation. The District's intention was to accept the base bid and the additive alternate bids #2 and #3 if allowed by the budget.

<b>Bidder</b>	<b>Base Bid</b>	<b>Alt. Bid #1</b>	<b>Alt. Bid #2</b>	<b>Alt. Bid #3</b>	<b>Base plus Alt. 2, 3</b>
Bennett & Brosseau Roofing	\$247,000	(\$500)	\$215,000	\$24,500	\$486,500
Preservation Services, Inc.	\$210,000	(\$1,700)	\$180,000	\$21,000	\$411,000
Malcor Roofing	\$313,325	(\$4,200)	\$218,000	\$26,000	\$557,325

**Comparison to Budget**

The District budget for the work was Four Hundred Fifty-Five Thousand Dollars (\$455,000). We are pleased that one of the bids were under the budgeted amount with a second just above the amount. The base bid amount also



## Cashman Stahler Group

includes a Forty-Five Thousand Five Hundred Dollar (\$45,500.00) Owner's Contingency Allowance which we believe should adequately cover the costs of typical unforeseen conditions.

### Bid Analysis - Evaluation of Preservation Services Inc.

The lowest apparent bidder was Preservation Services, Inc. (PSI) located in Romeoville, Illinois. They were incorporated in 1992 and typically focus their work on mission-critical facilities including data centers, hospitals, banks, and telephone switching centers. Recently, they have decided to enter the public school bidding environment.

Preservation Services has completed approximately \$7,300,000 of roofing work over the last five years. Of the 45 projects they have completed in those five years, the average size of the projects are over \$700,000. Their largest project during that period was the completion of a roof replacement on the Old Post Office building in Chicago for \$6,185,000. PSI's bonding capabilities are \$5,000,000 for a single project or \$10,000,000 aggregate with Liberty Mutual Insurance Company.

Safety is critical on all projects and a firm's low insurance experience modification rating (EMR) typically reflects the success of the firm's safety programs. An EMR of 1.0 is considered the industry average and reflective of a good safety record. Preservation Services has a current EMR of 0.77. That is an excellent rating and should reflect a successful safety program at their firm.

On Thursday, April 29, 2021, I held a Zoom scope review meeting with Frank Castagnoli, general manager, and Brennan Quinn, project manager, from Preservation Services. We reviewed the required scope of work, submitted bid form, and general project requirements at each location. They had no reservations with their bid and were looking forward to working for the District. Based on our bid review, I believe they fully understand the required scope of work in the Contract Documents.

Due to their recent entry into the public school market, the Cashman Stahler Group does not have any experience with the firm nor does District staff. We contacted architect and project manager references received from PSI related to projects they completed. All of the individuals we contacted had excellent experiences with PSI on their projects. The repeatedly stated that their work was of excellent quality, that their staff had good communication skills, that PSI typically provided the appropriate number of workers for their projects, and that they invite them to bid on all of their work. We heard no negative comments about Preservation Services, Inc. and those we talked with believed we would likely have a very good experience. Their customers include AT&T Services, BP, MB Financial, Presence Health, CoreSite, Capital One, and the University of Chicago.

### Recommendation

In conclusion, we believe Preservation Services Inc. has included all the required work in their bid and are a quality roofing contractor that should perform well on the roof replacement work this summer.

The Cashman Stahler Group recommends that the Geneva Community Unit School District 304 Board of Education award an Owner-Contractor Agreement to **Preservation Services Inc.** for the Work indicated in the Contract Documents for a Contract Sum of **Four Hundred Eleven Thousand Dollars (\$411,000.00)** for the base bid work and additive alternate bids #2 and #3.

If you have any questions or comments, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

**CASHMAN STAHLER GROUP, INC.**

Stephen J. Cashman, AIA, LEED AP BD+C  
Principal Architect

cc: Project File  
Attachments: Completed bid tabulation

# Bid Tabulation - Geneva CUSD 304 - 2021 Roof Renovations

Geneva High School, Boiler House & Harrison St.  
 Geneva Community Unit School District 304  
 Project CS6737

Bid Opening: Tuesday, April 27, 2021, 4:00 P.m.  
 Bid Opening Location: Coultrap Educational Services Center, 227 N. Fourth St., Geneva, IL 60134



Cashman Stahler Group  
 Architects

Registered Bidder Company Name	Bid Security Submitted?		Addenda Acknowledged?				Base Bid Amount	Alternate Bids				Unit Prices								Contractor Alternates & Notes
	Bond	Check	#1	#2	#3	#4		Deduct #1 - 10 Year	Add #2 - Harrison St	Add #3 - Liquid Roof Boiler Hs	#1 Replace Gyp Deck	#2 Repair Gyp Deck	#3 Replace Stl Deck	#4 Plywd Sheath.	#5 W/d Blocking	#6 Two Layers Insul	#7 Tapered Insul	#8 EPDM Membr		
C.J. Adler Roofing							Withdraw													
Beel Line Services							No bid received													
Bennett & Brosseau Roofing	X		X	X	X	X	\$ 247,000.00	-\$500.00	\$215,000.00	\$24,500.00	\$30.00/SF	\$20.00/SF	\$12.00/SF	\$8.00/SF	\$5.00/LF	\$8.00/SF	\$6.00/SF	\$5.50/SF	Base bid plus alt. bids #2	
Combined Roofing							Withdraw													
Knieberocker Roofing							Withdraw													
Preservation Services, Inc.	X		X	X	X	X	\$ 210,000.00	-\$1,700.00	\$180,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$28.00/SF	\$28.00/SF	\$6.25/SF	\$6.50/SF	\$2.45/LF	\$6.50/SF	\$5.75/SF	\$5.75/SF	Apparent low bidder, base plus alt. bids #2 & #3 equals \$411,000	
Malcor Roofing	X		X	X	X	X	\$ 313,325.00	-\$4,200.00	\$218,000.00	\$26,000.00	\$32.00/SF	\$22.00/SF	\$13.00/SF	\$7.85/SF	\$4.25/LF	\$2.75/SF	\$8.10/SF	\$2.50/SF	Base bid plus alt. bids #2 & #3 equals \$557,325	