

227 N. Fourth Street
 Geneva, Illinois 60134
 630/463-3000
 630/463-3020
 Fax: 630/463-3029



Scott K. Ney
 Director, Facility Operations

**Community Unit
 School District 304**

TO: Dr. Kent Mutchler
 FROM: Scott Ney
 RE: 2022-23 Roof Renovations Bid – Geneva High School
 DATE: February 22, 2022

Bids were publicly posted on Thursday, January 6, 2022 in the Daily Herald.

On Wednesday, February 9th, 2022 at 9:00 a.m., bids were opened and read aloud for the 2022-23 Roof Renovations Bid.

Six (6) bidders responded. The results are shown below. The low bidder is highlighted.

The contractors submitting bids were:

- Anthony Roofing – Aurora, IL
- DCG Roofing Solutions – Melrose Park, IL
- Knickerbocker Roofing – Harvey, IL
- Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. – St. Charles, IL
- Preservation Services Inc. – Romeoville, IL
- Riddiford Roofing – Arlington Heights, IL

Results are as follows:

Contractor	Addenda	Bid Bond	Base Bid #1 GHS	Alt. Bid GHS	Total Base plus Alt Bid
Anthony Roofing	X	X	\$4,875,000	(\$1,343,000)	\$3,532,000
DCG Roofing Solutions	X	X	\$4,110,354	(\$600,000)	\$3,510,354
Knickerbocker Roofing	X	X	\$3,850,000	(\$69,600)	\$3,780,400
Malcor Roofing	X	X	\$2,959,000	\$0	\$2,959,000
Preservation Services	X	X	\$3,774,000	(\$300,000)	\$3,474,000
Riddiford Roofing	X	X	\$3,398,785	(\$82,000)	\$3,316,785

It is my recommendation that Malcor Roofing of IL., Inc. be awarded the 2022-23 Roof Renovations contract that includes the Total Bid (GHS) for \$2,959,000. The base bid amount also includes a Two Hundred Ninety Thousand Dollar (\$290,000) Owner's Contingency Allowance which we believe should adequately cover the costs of typical unforeseen conditions.



Cashman Stahler Group

February 21, 2022

Mr. Scott Ney
Director of Facility Operations
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
227 N. Fourth Street
Geneva, IL 60134

2022 Roof Replacements - Geneva High School
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
Project Number: CSG753

RE: Bid Recommendation

Scott,

I am writing in regards to the bidding for the referenced project and to recommend a bidder to you and the Board of Education. First, I would like to provide a little background regarding the project and the bidding.

Project Scope of Work

In general, the project scope of work includes the roof repairs and roof membrane work at Geneva High School and the adjacent modular classroom building. The roof renovations included in this project's scope are generally summarized as follows:

- Preparation of the existing fully-adhered ethylene propylene diene monome (EPDM) rubber single ply roof system and application of a liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane and flashings for a twenty (20) year system warranty.
- Limited replacement of several existing deteriorated outside-air intake hoods and related roof curbs.

Bidding Approach

Bids were solicited from roofing contractors who will act as general contractors for the project. We published a bid notice for the project in the Daily Herald on Thursday, January 6, 2022.

To solicit additional interest in the project, we contacted twelve (12) roofing contractors that have successfully completed past projects for our firm or for the District. We also sent the bid notice to three (3) digital bidding services to which many contractors subscribe for information related to public construction projects.

Beyond the firms we contacted, five (5) additional roofing contractors requested the bid documents after seeing the bid notice published in the newspaper or through a digital bidding service.

The bid documents consist of fourteen (14) 30"x42" drawings and four hundred nineteen (419) pages of Specifications and other contract requirements in a Project Manual. The bid documents were issued electronically on Thursday, January 20, 2022 to all interested bidders and registered digital bidding services.

On Tuesday, January 25, 2022, we held a mandatory pre-bid meeting via Zoom to review important project requirements with all registered bidders. A total of twelve (12) contractors attended the Zoom pre-bid meeting.

Prequalification Submittal

As part of the bid document requirements, interested bidders were required to submit prequalification



Cashman Stahler Group

documents via email to the Architect by 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, February 1, 2022. A total of eight (8) registered bidders submitted the required prequalification documents.

Bid Opening

On Wednesday, February 9, 2022, at 9:00 a.m., we held a public bid opening at the Coultrap Educational Services Center. At bid time, we received six (6) sealed bids and the bid opening was attended by six (6) bidders and one (1) roofing manufacturer representative.

The bid form included a base bid, an alternate bid, and unit prices as summarized below.

- Base bid: Work at Geneva High School and Modular Classroom Building
- Alternate Bid #1: Alternative start date of March 28th
- Unit Price #1: Replacing deteriorated steel roof deck
- Unit Price #2: Replacing two layers of flat polyisocyanurate insulation
- Unit Price #3: Replacing one layer of tapered polyisocyanurate insulation
- Unit Price #4: Replacing 60 mil EPDM roof membrane

Bid Results

We received sealed bids from the following bidders and the bids were publicly opened and read. The unit price bid results can be found on the bid tabulation that is attached to this recommendation. Alternate Bid No. 1 is for an alternative on-site construction start date of March 28, 2022 versus the base bid start date of July 7, 2022. The District's intention was to determine if the contractors viewed the early state date as a cost savings.

Bidder	Base Bid	Alt. Bid 1	Base plus Alt. 1
Anthony Roofing	\$4,875,000	(\$1,343,000)	\$3,532,000
DCG Roofing Solutions Inc.	\$4,110,354	(\$600,000)	\$3,510,354
Knickerbocker Roofing	\$3,850,000	(\$69,600)	\$3,780,400
Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.	\$2,959,000	\$0	\$2,959,000
Preservation Services Inc.	\$3,774,000	(\$300,000)	\$3,474,000
Riddiford Roofing	\$3,398,785	(\$82,000)	\$3,316,785

Comparison to Budget

The District budget for the work was Three Million One Hundred Ninety-Nine Thousand Five Hundred Sixty-One Dollars (\$3,199,561). We are pleased that Malcor Roofing's bid is under the budgeted amount. The base bid amount also includes a Two Hundred Ninety Thousand Dollar (\$290,000) Owner's Contingency Allowance which we believe should adequately cover the costs of typical unforeseen conditions.

Bid Analysis - Evaluation of Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.

The lowest apparent bidder was Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. located in St. Charles, Illinois. Their firm has been in business since 2012 and they average annual amount of construction over the last five years has been \$16,000,000.

They have worked twice for the district in the recent past and have a current Workers' Compensation Experience rating (EMR) of 0.73. An EMR of less than 1.0 is considered an excellent rating and should reflect a successful safety program at their firm. They have a current surety line of credit of \$5,000,000 per project and maximum bonding limit of \$15,000,000 through Merchants National Bonding.

On Friday, February 11, 2022, I held a Zoom scope review meeting with Jason Doran, Project Manager, from Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. We reviewed the required scope of work, their submitted bid form, and general project requirements. Jason had no reservations with their bid and were looking forward to working for the District again. Based on our bid review, I believe they fully understand the required scope of work in the Contract Documents.

Malcor Roofing has worked successfully for Geneva CUSD 304 in the past on two projects. First, during the summer of 2019, they completed a \$246,300 roof renovation project at Geneva High School where roof area M was repaired,



Cashman Stahler Group

prepared, and coated with the Tremco AlphaGuard Bio liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane that is now proposed for the existing EPDM roofs at the high school.

During the following summer of 2020, Malcor Roofing completed a \$501,911 roof repair, restoration, and roof replacement project at five (5) schools throughout the district. Based on our discussions about these projects, both went well and your were pleased both with Malcor Roofing's work and the performance of Jason Doran on those projects.

They did not include a deduction for the early start date because they feel they'll have less weather-related delays if they perform the work during the summer break. They are confident they can complete all the work by the Substantial Completion date of Friday, August 5, 2022. Since their business is nearby in St. Charles, they intend to pre-purchase all the required materials and store them at their yard and deliver materials to the high school on an as-needed basis.

We also contacted architect and project manager references received from Malcor Roofing related to projects they completed. All of the individuals we spoke with had excellent experiences with Malcor Roofing on their projects. Pat Dacy, Director of Capital Projects at West Aurora School District 129, stated that Malcor Roofing is one of their "go to" roofing contractors and that they have extensive experience with the specified Tremco AlphaGuard Bio roof system.

Recommendation

In conclusion, we believe Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. has included all the required work in their bid and are a quality roofing contractor that should perform well on the roof replacement work this summer.

The Cashman Stahler Group recommends that the Geneva Community Unit School District 304 Board of Education award an Owner-Contractor Agreement to **Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.** for the Work indicated in the Contract Documents for a Contract Sum of **Two Million Nine Hundred Fifty-Nine Thousand Dollars and Zero Cents (\$2,959,000.00)** for the base bid work.

If you have any questions or comments, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

CASHMAN STAHLER GROUP, INC.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Stephen J. Cashman".

Stephen J. Cashman, AIA, LEED AP BD+C
Principal Architect

cc: Project File

Attachments: Completed bid tabulation

Bid Tabulation - Geneva CUSD 304 - GHS 2022 Roof Renovations

Geneva High School
 Geneva Community Unit School District 304
 Project CS6753



Bid Opening: Wednesday, February 9, 2022, 9:00 a.m.
 Bid Opening Location: Coultrap Educational Services Center, 227 N. Fourth St., Geneva, IL 60134

Registered Bidder Company Name	Bid Security Submitted?		Addenda Acknowledged?			Base Bid Amount	Alternate Bid #1 - March 28, 2022 Start Date	Base Bid Plus Alt. Bid #1	Unit Prices				Contractor Alternates & Notes	
	Bond	Check	#1	#2	#3				#1 Replace Stl. Deck, per SF.	#2 Replace Layers Insul., per SF.	#3 Tapered Insul., per SF.	#4 Replace EPDM Membr., per SF.		
All American Exteriors						No bid.								
Anthony Roofing	X		X	X	X	\$ 4,875,000.00	\$ (1,343,000.00)	\$ 3,532,000.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 10.50	\$ 8.00	\$ 2.50	None	
Bennett & Brosseau Roofing						No bid.								
DCG Roofing Solutions Inc.	X		X	X	X	\$ 4,110,354.00	\$ (600,000.00)	\$ 3,510,354.00	\$ 17.50	\$ 6.50	\$ 10.50	\$ 7.50	None	
Knickerbocker Roofing	X		X	X	X	\$ 3,850,000.00	\$ (69,600.00)	\$ 3,780,400.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 6.40	\$ 5.90	\$ 3.20	None	
L. Marshall Roofing						No bid.								
Malcor Roofing	X		X	X	X	\$ 2,959,000.00	\$ -	\$ 2,959,000.00	\$ 13.00	\$ 3.25	\$ 3.75	\$ 5.00	None. Apparent low bidder.	
Preservation Services Inc.	X		X	X	X	\$ 3,774,000.00	\$ (300,000.00)	\$ 3,474,000.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 5.00	None	
Riddiford Roofing	X		X	X	X	\$ 3,398,785.00	\$ (82,000.00)	\$ 3,316,785.00	\$ 19.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 11.00	\$ 9.00	None	