



Lowest and Best Bid Response Evaluation of IFB#02012017:

Overall Responses:

There were a total of eight vendor responses to the IFB. Given a wide gap in pricing NewPath only conducted a “deep dive” into three of those responses given the amount of justification necessary to go another direction other than price. The three lowest and best responses in order based on price were RJ Young, Logista and Toshiba. While somewhat different in some aspects, all three responses gave qualifying responses in every category of our IFB. Beyond the pricing aspect of the IFB were other considerations that were scored in the IFB by four committee members from both TPSD and TCSD (two each). The cumulative scoring totals changed the lowest and best response order of those three vendors. Logista, Toshiba then RJ Young, in order, was the final outcome.

Logista (Lowest and Best Bid Response)

Fact Sheet:

- All of the signature pages were complete and signed by David Finnegan, Vice President of Contract Sales for Logista.
- Response formatting was followed as requested in the IFB.
- Company Information: Expanded response with in-depth information about what Logista does along with the supporting qualifications to support what they do. Technicians are certified on the products they are offering in this IFB.
- Insurance Requirement: The Certificate of Insurance was submitted as requested.
- Equipment Technical Specifications: All of the required specifications were supported by the product information for all units proposed and acknowledged.
- Delivery, Installation, Testing and Training: All of the required responses were complete and acknowledged. A breakdown of the chain-of-command related to this IFB was thoroughly listed including each individual’s certifications and expertise.
- Account Management: All of the requirements were responded to completely or acknowledged.

- Service/Monitoring Requirements: Full response to all requirements. Logista also has a NOC (Network Operations Center) and is the only respondent to the IFB with this capability.
- Pricing: Logista acknowledged all of the pricing format and required acknowledgements.
- Additional Requirements: Logista demonstrated the ability to handle projects of this magnitude and much larger projects as well. The Educational References (in Mississippi) that they listed were called and verified. Given the fact that DeSoto CSD runs over 8 million mono images a month, 3 times the volume for this IFB's 4 districts, there is no doubt that Logista can handle the work load of this IFB.
- Network Requirements: Logista acknowledged all of the Network Connectivity Requirements listed in this IFB.
- Security Requirements: Logista acknowledged all of the security requirements of this IFB. Logista is R2 and NIST certified. (They are trained and capable of properly wiping and erasing, then properly removing products from use.)

Implementation Plan:

The implementation plan by Logista is listed thoroughly in a Scope of Work and Tasks that are subset in all the definitive steps to complete the installation and training in proper fashion. In this segment of past deals Logista has demonstrated, on two other awards involving NewPath, that the Installation/Training portion is their biggest strength. They installed over 1,000 units in DeSoto County School District in less than 6 weeks.

Service:

The biggest question/concern in the Logista response is the service piece for this four year contractual term. Beyond the written response given by Logista in the IFB, NewPath had an in-depth conversation with Logista about how they intend to provide a proactive service/support responsiveness for both districts. Logista has stated that, upon award, they'll have a lead technician relocated within the two district area with back up from day one. During this time they'll bring in other personnel as additional support who will eventually take the reins from the lead technician once both districts are settled in and comfortable with the program. Logista currently has technicians located in Columbus, New Albany and Tupelo. They have stated that this IFB award will provide them the opportunity to expand and solidify their service/support footprint.

Reports & Monitoring:

The provided samples along with proven ability with current NewPath clients shows that Logista is very much ahead of the curve for reporting and remote monitoring of the devices. They

currently have a Network Observation Center (NOC) that include clients such as the Department of Defense, Regions Bank and Ruby Tuesday's on a regional / nationwide basis.

Product Offering:

Logista has offered the Kyocera products across the board. The MFD's (copiers) are Kyocera products relabeled under the Copystar name. In all areas Logista has met or exceeded all the minimum requirements with features, speeds and feeds in each category. They have exceeded the required minimums in the majority of each product category. Logista meets all the required IT specifications as well. It is the opinion of NewPath that the products offered by all the vendors in the IFB responses are very similar in quality. There are a few instances that one manufacturer offers a slightly different set of "whistles & bells" over another. Some units may be slightly more "user friendly" than other competing brands too. Overall, in the past several years, most of the offered products in this IFB have "moved to the middle" in quality and durability. This applies to the technology side as well.

Final Vendor Scoring Results:

(Note: This is the public information that the vendor respondents see. Category responses by individual committee members is not included nor shared.)

Vendor Name	Mono CPI Rate	Mono Images	Monthly Mono Minimum	Color CPI	Color Images	Monthly Color Minimum	Total Monthly Minimum Payment	Monthly Reduction in Spend	48 Month Contract Savings	Cost Eligible Proposed Products (30%)	Quality of Vendor's Services/Products (15%)	Reputation of Vendor's Ability & Stability to Perform (15%)	Remote Monitoring/Supply & Service Program (15%)	Installation & Implementation Plan (25%)	Composite Vendor IFB Scores
Logista - Kyocera	\$0.0116000	2,250,000	\$26,100.00	\$0.0330000	55,000	\$1,815.00	\$27,915.00	\$10,045.48	\$482,183.04	26.679%	12.250%	11.000%	10.500%	16.000%	76.429%
Toshiba	\$0.0122600	2,250,000	\$27,585.00	\$0.0382000	55,000	\$2,101.00	\$29,686.00	\$8,274.48	\$397,175.04	25.088%	12.000%	12.000%	10.000%	10.000%	69.088%
RJ Young - Samsung, Lexmark & Ricoh	\$0.0101900	2,250,000	\$22,927.50	\$0.0345000	55,000	\$1,897.50	\$24,825.00	\$13,135.48	\$630,503.04	30.000%	9.500%	9.250%	8.750%	9.500%	67.000%
JT Ray - Konica Minolta	\$0.0130000	2,250,000	\$29,250.00	\$0.0400000	55,000	\$2,200.00	\$31,450.00	\$6,510.48	\$312,503.04	23.680%	14.000%	11.000%	9.000%	8.000%	65.680%
CopyPlus	\$0.0144900	2,250,000	\$32,602.50	\$0.0350000	55,000	\$1,925.00	\$34,527.50	\$3,432.98	\$164,783.04	21.570%	14.000%	11.000%	8.000%	10.000%	64.570%
Dex Imaging - Kyocera	\$0.0129000	2,250,000	\$29,025.00	\$0.0386000	55,000	\$2,123.00	\$31,148.00	\$6,812.48	\$326,999.04	23.910%	13.000%	8.000%	7.000%	7.000%	58.910%
XMC	\$0.0144000	2,250,000	\$32,400.00	\$0.0400000	55,000	\$2,200.00	\$34,600.00	\$3,360.48	\$161,303.04	21.525%	13.000%	7.000%	8.000%	8.000%	57.525%
Copy Plus Alternate Bid (Not Considered)	\$0.0146300	2,250,000	\$32,917.50	\$0.0350000	55,000	\$1,925.00	\$34,842.50	\$3,117.98	\$149,663.04	21.375%	0.000%	0.000%	0.000%	0.000%	21.375%
NovaCopy - Konica Minolta (No Bid)	\$0.0000000	2,250,000	\$0.00	\$0.0000000	55,000	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	#DIV/0!	0.000%	0.000%	0.000%	0.000%	#DIV/0!

The Savings broken down by each District in the Co-operative:

Client	Mono CPI Rate	Mono Images	Monthly Mono Minimum	Color CPI	Color Images	Monthly Color Minimum	Total Monthly Minimum Payment	Monthly Reduction in Spend	Total Contract Reduction in Spend	Reduced Spend %
TPSD and TCS Combined Payment	\$0.0116000	2,250,000	\$26,100.00	\$0.0330000	55,000	\$1,815.00	\$27,915.00	\$10,045.48	\$482,183.04	-26.46%
TUPELO PSD's Current Assessed Spend:	\$0.0116000	1,500,000	\$17,400.00	\$0.0330000	50,000	\$1,650.00	\$19,050.00	\$5,728.97	\$274,990.56	-23.12%
TISHOMINGO CS's Current Assessed Spend:	\$0.0116000	750,000	\$8,700.00	\$0.0330000	5,000	\$165.00	\$8,865.00	\$4,316.51	\$207,192.48	-32.75%

Summary:

While there were two other submissions by RJ Young and Toshiba that were very competitive the ultimate conclusion is Logista is the lowest and best offering. Beyond price the other scoring categories were completed by district personnel in both TPSD and TCSD. NewPath had no role in those categorical results.

The current vendor, RJ Young, offered the best price, however, their past performance and lack of responsiveness to responsibilities over this past four years reflected heavily in the ultimate decision and scoring of the five other categories beyond price by the committee members. In

short, while RJ Young answered the IFB question in proper fashion, they failed to demonstrate some of those same requirements over this past four year contract.

NewPath has investigated, at length, the Logista response and also followed up on the installation and service questions in which Logista has provided more details that were satisfactory in every instance. NewPath's recommendation is that Logista be submitted for School Board approval in the two district members of the co-operative agreement for IFB#02012017.