



February 24, 2017

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects
Contract Award Recommendation for 2017 Pavement Replacement Projects
Franklin HS / Holmes MS / Hoover ES / Randolph ES / Grant ES

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for these Projects.

In February 2017, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan websites.

On February 23, 2017, three (3) bid proposals were received, and over the next day were reviewed to determine budget implications. Interviews were conducted on February 24th and were attended by representatives from PMC, NTH Consultants, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending Nagle Paving Company for contract award at Franklin High School, Holmes Middle School, Hoover Elementary School, Randolph Elementary School, and Grant Elementary School. The award recommendation includes acceptance of Alternate #1 at Franklin High School and Nagle Paving Company's proposed Voluntary Alternate #2.

Including hard construction (\$988,720.00) and construction contingency (\$98,872.00) dollars, the total Project award recommendation equals \$1,087,592.00.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2007 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Scott Smith".

Scott Smith, LEED AP
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary
 Cost Breakdown
 Bid Tabulation



Franklin / Holmes / Hoover / Randolph / Grant - COST SUMMARY

	Hard Construction	
Building	Actual	
Franklin High School	\$	212,590
Holmes Middle School	\$	215,490
Hoover Elementary School	\$	210,065
Randolph Elementary School	\$	117,680
Grant Elementary School	\$	232,895
Totals	\$	988,720

	Construction Contingency (10%)	
Building	Actual	
Franklin High School	\$	21,259
Holmes Middle School	\$	21,549
Hoover Elementary School	\$	21,007
Randolph Elementary School	\$	11,768
Grant Elementary School	\$	23,290
Totals	\$	98,872

	Total Project Costs	
Building	Actual	
Franklin High School	\$	233,849
Holmes Middle School	\$	237,039
Hoover Elementary School	\$	231,072
Randolph Elementary School	\$	129,448
Grant Elementary School	\$	256,185
Totals	\$	1,087,592



2017 Pavement Replacement Project Cost Breakdown

School	Base Bid	Alternate #1	Voluntary Alternate #2	Total
Franklin High School	\$ 177,575	\$ 43,265	\$ (8,250)	\$ 212,590
Holmes Middle School	\$ 226,990		\$ (11,500)	\$ 215,490
Hoover Elementary School	\$ 218,565		\$ (8,500)	\$ 210,065
Randolph Elementary School	\$ 119,180		\$ (1,500)	\$ 117,680
Grant Elementary School	\$ 235,645		\$ (2,750)	\$ 232,895
Total	\$ 977,955	\$ 43,265	\$ (32,500)	\$ 988,720

Alternate #1: Geoblock Pavers at Franklin HS

Voluntary Alternate #2: Utilize TuffTrack Paver System in Lieu of Geoblock Pavers



Proposal: Pavement Replacement at Franklin / Holmes / Hoover / Randolph / Grant

Location: Livonia Administrative Offices

Date: February 23, 2017 at 1:00 pm

Recorded By: Scott Smith (Plante Moran CRESA)

Witness: Harry Lau (Livonia Public Schools)

Contractor Name	Bid Security	Bid Formality				Base Bid Amounts						Alt. #1 - Franklin	Comments / Voluntary Alternates
		Add	EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Franklin	Holmes	Hoover	Randolph	Grant	Total		
Nagle Paving Company	Yes	1 & 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 177,575	\$ 226,990	\$ 218,565	\$ 119,180	\$ 235,645	\$ 977,955	\$ 43,265	Voluntary Alternates
T&M Asphalt Paving, Inc.	Yes	1 & 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 199,750	\$ 237,500	\$ 257,500	\$ 140,300	\$ 255,400	\$ 1,090,450	\$ 45,000	Clarifications
Best Asphalt, Inc.	Yes	1 & 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 258,000	\$ 279,000	\$ 276,000	\$ 183,000	\$ 344,000	\$ 1,340,000	\$ 37,000	

Alternate #1 - Provide Geoblock at Franklin HS Loop