

# Wilbur D. Mills Educational Service Cooperative Evaluation

Evaluation Date: January 20, 2023

## Section 1: User Satisfaction and Service Adequacy

<b>1A. Annual User Satisfaction survey results (all personnel of member districts) (22.2)</b> <i>User Satisfaction Survey - Please show evidence that the survey was sent to all in the ESC area. Focused effort on Superintendent and key personnel who utilize or facilitate PD. Please identify the percentage of districts that responded to your Survey.</i>	
90% or greater satisfied/very satisfied	<b>5 Excellence</b>
80-89% or greater satisfied/very satisfied	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
70-79% or greater satisfied/very satisfied	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
60-69% or greater satisfied/very satisfied	<b>2 Alert</b>
50-59% or greater satisfied/very satisfied	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>
<p><b>Evaluation Notes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● 96% overall satisfaction</li> <li>● Areas of service that should be noted for strength are:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Literacy (K-2 &amp; 3-6 Rise, Stand alone SoR Days, critical reading, and Disciplinary Literacy)</li> <li>○ Digital Learning - (Digital learning Resources/Tools, Support of digital platforms, IT Support)</li> <li>○ Novice Teacher - (Classroom management &amp; PD on relevant topics)</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Interviews:            “Science of Reading is the most powerful thing I’ve experienced in 20 plus years of teaching”, “Service with a smile”, “Service fits the school, not the school fits the service”, “5-star”, “Feels like home” Throughout the interview the climate and culture of the cooperative was evident. The directors expectation for staff is no boundaries and we serve everyone and we do it with a smile.</p>	
<b>1B. Summative PD Session Evaluation responses (22.2)</b> <i>ESC Works Final Report for 2020-21 or 2021-22</i>	
3.8 or higher on 4.0 scale	<b>5 Excellence</b>
3.4 to 3.7 on 4.0 scale	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
3.0 to 3.3 on 4.0 scale	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
2.6 to 3.2 on 4.0 scale	<b>2 Alert</b>
2.5 or below on 4.0 scale	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>

**Evaluation Notes:**

- 3.94 Overall pd evaluation scores
- Over 11,000 responses for pd evaluations

Interviews were very positive about the professional development that the Wilbur D. Mills cooperative offered to educators. Multiple interviewees mentioned literacy and math supports and the quality overall. Evidence that elementary to middle school professional development was well covered and received, schools anticipating more professional development geared towards secondary educators in the future based on feedback.

**1C. Annual Survey and Needs Assessments (17.00)** *One professional development needs survey with evidence that the survey was reviewed by ESC leadership and evidence on on-going input of district needs. (survey, agenda, results, follow-up evidence, etc.*

Meets 4 of the 4 criteria <b>AND</b> Reports survey and needs assessment results to member districts and the Department <b>AND</b> Reports any duplications to the Department ( <i>How was information shared with DESE</i> )	<b>5 Excellence</b>
Meets 4 of the 4 criteria <b>AND</b> Reports survey and needs assessment results to member districts	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
Meets 4 of 4 criteria listed below. Evidence that: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. A PD Needs Survey was administered</li> <li>2. The survey data was reviewed by cooperative leadership</li> <li>3. Ongoing input of district needs from various groups (i.e. Teacher Center Committee, job alike groups, etc.)</li> <li>4. Works with the Department to conduct surveys that complement rather than duplicate the work</li> </ol>	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
Meets 3 of 4 criteria	<b>2 Alert</b>
Meets 2 or less of the 4 criteria	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>

**Evaluation Notes:**

- Survey was given in the fall and reviewed by multiple groups
- Sought other data from various committees who gave input
- Monthly meetings with DESE prevent duplications of work.
- To share the results of the assessment, the coop shared it through their website, various meetings, and TCC report. It is also emailed to several listserv groups.
- The cooperative asks the question "What do you need from us?" as a way to provide continuous, personalized services to meet the specific needs of the district.

**1D. Provide Assistance (4.2)** *District Cost Analysis connected to examples provided.*

Meets 3 of the 3 criteria <b>AND</b> Provides evidence that exceeds the expectation in at least two (2) areas such as exceeding accreditation standards and equalizing education opportunities <b>AND</b> A cost analysis study of coordinated service	<b>5 Excellence</b>
Meets 3 of the 3 criteria <b>AND</b> Provides evidence that exceeds the expectation in at least one (1) areas such as exceeding accreditation standards and equalizing education opportunities <b>OR</b> a cost analysis study of coordinated services	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
Meets 3 of the 3 criteria listed below: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Assist member districts in meeting or exceeding accreditation standards and equalizing educational opportunities;</li> <li>2. Using educational resources more effectively through cooperation among school districts; and</li> <li>3. Promoting coordination between school districts and the Department in order to provide services that are consistent with the needs identified by school districts and the education priorities of the state</li> </ol>	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>

Meets 2 of the 3 criteria	<b>2 Alert</b>
Meets 1 of the 3 criteria	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>
<p><b>Evaluation Notes:</b>  The cooperative supports state initiatives like RISE, Math QuEST, required Tier 1 Training, school board training, bus driver training, CTE, HIPPIY, Virtual School, etc... to meet the needs of the districts in their area. The services provided address the needs that are identified in the survey and are carried out in quality and quantity. Assisting districts and providing personalized services to meet various needs is the top priority of this cooperative. "There's no way I could survive without the help of.." was heard in a meeting and when asked about an overall impression, it was stated that "They are five stars."</p> <p>There were four cost saving analyses as evidence and went deeper by sharing multiple opportunities that were provided to a smaller district that were specific and unique to the district. Evidence of personalized service. This was mentioned in interviews frequently that the cooperative met the unique needs of their district.</p>	
<p><b>1E. Teacher Center Committee and 10.00 Other Necessary Committees (9.0) TCC Committee list, noting district and position of each member. Link documentation of at least 3 meetings per year 2020-21 or 2021-22 school year.</b></p>	
Meets 5 of the 5 criteria <b>AND</b> Lists the other committees and the purposes or responsiveness to member districts <b>AND</b> Best practices are shared publicly	<b>5 Excellence</b>
Meets 5 of the 5 criteria <b>AND</b> Lists the other committees and the purposes or responsiveness to member districts	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
Meets 5 of the 5 criteria listed below: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. A teacher center will provide, if funds are available, curriculum development assistance, educational materials, and staff development services to teachers within the area</li> <li>2. A teacher center committee is composed of at least one (1) representative from the staff of each school district</li> <li>3. At least one-half (½), but not more than two-thirds (⅔) of the members are classroom teachers</li> <li>4. The committee meets at least three (3) times per year; and</li> <li>5. Other committees of local school personnel are convened to be responsive to the member districts.</li> </ol>	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
Meets 4 of the 5 criteria	<b>2 Alert</b>
Meets 3 or less of the 5 criteria	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>
<p><b>Evaluation Notes:</b>  The Wilbur Mills Cooperative goes above and beyond by having committees that bring job-alike roles together to keep all districts and staff informed and updated. The cooperative models these committees as professional learning communities and it is noted that members of these groups enjoy their time together not only for the professional dialog, but they feel like a family when they are together. There are 17 districts and there are members from each district that are represented in various groups. There are 10 teachers on the TCC and they met three times providing feedback to the needs of educators. There is an extensively detailed Google Doc with hyperlinks that include agendas and meeting purpose. The information gathered is shared publicly online and through various listserv emails.</p>	
<p><b>1F. Liaison with Postsecondary Institutions (16.00)</b>  <i>Publicly shared Post Secondary partnerships.</i></p>	
Collaborates with more than two (2) postsecondary institutions or other recognized educational agencies on a regular basis <b>AND</b> Best practices are shared publicly	<b>5 Excellence</b>
Collaborates with more than one (1) postsecondary institutions on a regular basis	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>

Shall cooperate with the state-supported postsecondary institution located within its area	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
Cooperates with one (1) postsecondary institution within the state	<b>2 Alert</b>
Does not cooperate or collaborate with a postsecondary institution	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>
<b>Evaluation Notes:</b> The cooperative partners with three higher education universities. They include ASU-Beebe, Harding University, and UCA. The curriculum supported to the pre-service teachers is provided through science, literacy, and math. There is a focus on providing opportunities for teacher pathways to support the recruitment of teachers to support the teacher shortage.	

## **Section 2: Staff Qualifications and Administration Effectiveness**

<b>2A. Director; personnel; general policies, rules and regulations; policies, procedures, expenditures, reports, and audits. (11.00, 12.00, 14.00, 21.00)</b> <i>Spreadsheet of positions occupied with appropriate licenses noted; Evaluations will be checked during site visit; Personnel policies and procedures will be part of the site visit; 2020-21 and 2021-22 annual reports.</i>	
Meets 5 of the 5 criteria <b>AND</b> All audit findings are addressed <b>AND</b> Best practices are shared publicly	<b>5 Excellence</b>
Meets 5 of the 5 criteria <b>AND</b> All audit findings are addressed	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
Meets 5 of the 5 criteria listed below: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. All positions requiring licensure are occupied by personnel possessing licensure or approved alternative</li> <li>2. Evidence of staff formal evaluations including performance evaluation of director</li> <li>3. Personnel policies are in place and current</li> <li>4. Annual reports are compiled and disseminated to individuals and entities required by statute</li> <li>5. There is no evidence of fiscal distress as witnessed by any one of criteria in 27.00 of the Rules</li> </ol>	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
Meets 4 of the 5 criteria	<b>2 Alert</b>
Meets 4 of the 5 criteria	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>
<b>Evaluation Notes:</b> All personnel at the cooperative have current licenses appropriate to the positions in which they are employed. All employees including the cooperative director are evaluated each year. Personnel policies are currently in place. Annual reports are compiled and shared to stakeholders and also placed on the website. The reports are also shared with ADE-DESE. There are no audit findings to cause issues with fiscal concerns. The cooperative has been responsive to needs of all districts. Some of the specialized support areas include: cyber team committee members, bus training, and the organization of novice teachers..	
<b>2B. Board of Directors and Executive Committee</b> <i>Documentation of Board of Directors meetings according to rubric.</i>	
The Board of Directors meet more than eight (8) times each year, and written policies and procedures for operation are filed with the State Board <b>AND</b> Records of internal improvement in efficiency of operation are available upon request <i>MAY Substitute: The executive committee and board of directors meets more than required.</i>	<b>5 Excellence</b>

The Board of Directors meet more than eight (8) times each year, and written policies and procedures for operation are filed with the State Board <i>MAY Substitute: The executive committee or board of directors meets more than required.</i>	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
The Board of Directors meet at least eight (8) times each year, and general fiduciary responsibilities for the cooperative are documented <b>OR</b> The executive committee meets at least nine (9) times per year, and the board of directors meets at least three (3) times annually. The president of the board shall serve as chair of the executive committee	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
The Board of Directors meet less than eight (8) times each year, and/or general fiduciary responsibilities for the cooperative are minimally documented	<b>2 Alert</b>
The Board of Directors meet less than eight (8) times each year, and/or general fiduciary responsibilities for the cooperative are not adequately documented	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>
<b>Evaluation Notes:</b> The cooperative directors met 11 times during the 2021-2022 school year. The superintendents also have a yearly three-day retreat to cover all mandated training requirements as outlined by the state.	

### Section 3: Extent of Local Financial Support

<b>3A. Program Services; participation of local districts; extent of local financial support; technology center; Math and Science Center (18.00, 19.00, 22.2, 24.00, 25.00)</b>	
Meets 3 of the 3 criteria <b>AND</b> . Programs and services are documented based on needs assessment and evaluation is reported <b>AND</b> . Resources of the educational service cooperative are enhanced by forming support networks among the member schools to provide extended services, provide new services and combine funding to support programs such as group purchasing, thus maximizing local school district funding. 90% or more of member districts participate by purchasing services and providing release time for staff to engage in specialized training & services <b>AND</b> . Cost analysis study has been performed for 1/3 of member districts annually and the findings have been shared in a face-to-face meeting with the superintendent <b>AND</b> . Best practices are shared publicly	<b>5 Excellence</b>
Meets 3 of the 3 criteria <b>AND</b> . Programs and services are documented based on needs assessment <b>AND</b> . 50% or more of member districts support the cooperative in offering extended services in two (2) or more activities or events or purchased services with local funds <b>AND</b> . At least one (1) cost analysis study has been performed and the findings have been shared in a face-to-face meeting with the superintendent(s)	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
Meets 3 of the 3 criteria listed below: 1. Programs and services are based on the needs of the member districts and priorities of the state 2. Each member district is entitled to participate in programs and services that are fully supported by state funds 3. Programs and other services may be supported by local funds	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
Meets 2 of the 3 criteria	<b>2 Alert</b>
Meets 1 or less of the 3 criteria	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>
<b>Evaluation Notes:</b> The cooperative has 17 districts with all of the districts participating in professional development and early childhood/special education support services. The CTE program supports all of the districts with curriculum and organization support. Fourteen of the seventeen districts are part of the CTE consortium, and combining school efforts have provided more opportunities and equipment in CTE. All of the districts utilize the support provided for the novice teachers in their districts, utilizing additional cooperative staff to assist and provide mentoring and content support. The disposition of cooperative staff was one geared towards “service” and this was a key takeaway from the district interviews. The cooperative specialists provide onsite support for instructional planning, curriculum, and	

classroom organization/management. Mr. Horn and Ms. Hayes emphasized the attitude in which they serve and expect others to serve their schools. It was sincere and evident throughout the day.

The cost sharing of services goes beyond the curriculum and professional development needs but also opportunities to support classified staff. The cooperative partnered to support schools for the bus driver training and purchasing of supplies. The leadership at the cooperative has made it a priority to provide opportunities for collaboration for the different groups of stakeholders within the member districts. The collaboration of the job-alike groups provide the support for district employees to do their job with more support and efficiency. It is evident that the cooperative programs provide opportunities to support best practices and evidence based research to support teaching and learning.

### Total Evaluation Score

Determination of Rating	Cooperative Evaluation Level
Must receive a majority score of 5 on categories (at least 6 out of 9 categories); and NO scores below 3	<b>5 Excellence</b>
Must receive at least 6 scores of 4 or some combination of 4 or 5; and NO scores below 3	<b>4 Exceeding Standards</b>
Must receive at least 6 scores of 3 or some combination of 3, 4, or 5; may include only one score of 2 (if some combination of 4 or 5 was assigned) with no additional scores below 3	<b>3 Meeting Standards</b>
Scores 2 in 2 or more categories	<b>2 Alert</b>
Scores 1 in 1 or more categories	<b>1 In Need of Improvement</b>

#### Evaluation Notes:

The novice teacher program at the WDMESC has clearly built relationships with their novice teachers and empowered novice teachers to reach out to mentors when there are issues that need addressing. This is evident from the conversations had amongst the interviews via zoom and with the mentors themselves. In addition to novice teachers, the support provided to novice administrators is thoughtful and purposeful to the needs of districts. The number of novice teachers is spread out amongst content specialists and CTE coordinator which has helped improve teacher recruitment and retention amongst districts.

It was shared from leadership that the attitude of service is the focus of the culture of the cooperative. Throughout the conversations and reviewing of materials provided, the service mindset is evident. Cooperative employees are willing to provide the support and needs of those they serve all the time. It was shared that a lot of support and shoulders to cry on are often provided after the regular work day. The dedication of supporting educators in this area of the state is observable. Collaboration of communication and support provided by Mrs. Hayes and Mr. Horn was evident by those interviewed. They are much appreciative of the "cheat sheets" the Commissioner's Memos, the detailed notes from the different job-alike meetings, and then serving as an advocate for needs, questions, and support to ADE-DESE. The cooperative administrators and member districts make a concentrated effort to collaborate and share policies, procedures, and practices to support the efficiency and best practices.

Additional programming opportunities are available through the cooperative to serve districts. The HIPPY program serves 795 families within 15 of the cooperative school districts. It serves as a way to begin the education support for the children and the parents. Wilbur Mills is one of four cooperatives who oversee the state's Migrant Program and serves districts in three cooperative areas covering the eastern part of the state. This is an essential program to meet the needs of students and families who are identified for services.

Wilbur Mills Educational Cooperative supports a diverse group of districts and strives to meet the unique needs of the district and their students. Overall rating of Excellence is well-deserved.

<b>Committee Members:</b>		
Stacy Smith, DESE	John Hoy, DESE	Megan Aukes
Sarah Owen	Tracie Jones, ERZ	Meagan Priest, School Board
Cody Bowlan	Nikki King	Dawn Besse, ESC

**Committee Chair Signature:** *Stacy Smith*