

February 22, 2016

Ms. Lisa Abbey
Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Construction Re-Bids
Johnson Upper Elementary School / Holmes Middle School

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, Barton Malow, Stantec, LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for this Project.

In December 2015 and January 2016, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan websites.

On February 11, 2016, 4 bid proposals were received for one bid category which was not included in the previous award recommendations. Interviews were held over the next week and were attended by various members of the Bond Team.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Bond Team is recommending the firms listed in Barton Malow's Award Recommendation Letter dated February 17, 2016 for contract award. Including hard construction, CM fees and costs, and construction contingency dollars, the total Project award recommendation equals \$53,245. The total REVISED project award recommendation equals \$12,429,068. This does not include any Alternates at this time.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor. The CM costs and fees will be detailed in Amendment #05 to AIA – C132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Construction Manager, both pending final review and approval by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendations of the Bond Team. Please direct all questions through me via email.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Budget Summary
 Award Recommendation Letter
 Summary of Costs
 Bid Tabulations

Johnson/Holmes - BUDGET SUMMARY

| | Hard Construction | | |
|--------------------------|-------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Building | Budget | Actual | Variance |
| Johnson Upper Elementary | \$ 4,165,826 | \$ 5,144,058 | \$ (978,232) |
| Holmes Middle | \$ 5,489,191 | \$ 5,727,147 | \$ (237,956) |
| Totals | \$ 9,655,017 | \$ 10,871,205 | \$ (1,216,188) |

| | CM Fees/Costs | | |
|--------------------------|---------------|------------|------------|
| Building | Budget | Actual | Variance |
| Johnson Upper Elementary | \$ 333,266 | \$ 338,981 | \$ (5,715) |
| Holmes Middle | \$ 439,135 | \$ 349,185 | \$ 89,950 |
| Totals | \$ 772,401 | \$ 688,166 | \$ 84,235 |

| | Construction Contingency | | |
|--------------------------|--------------------------|------------|-------------|
| Building | Budget | Actual | Variance |
| Johnson Upper Elementary | \$ 396,496 | \$ 411,525 | \$ (15,029) |
| Holmes Middle | \$ 522,452 | \$ 458,172 | \$ 64,280 |
| Totals | \$ 918,948 | \$ 869,697 | \$ 49,251 |

| | Total Project Costs | | |
|--------------------------|---------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Building | Budget | Actual | Variance |
| Johnson Upper Elementary | \$ 4,895,588 | \$ 5,894,564 | \$ (998,976) |
| Holmes Middle | \$ 6,450,778 | \$ 6,534,504 | \$ (83,726) |
| Totals | \$ 11,346,366 | \$ 12,429,068 | \$ (1,082,702) |

February 17, 2016

Ms. Lisa Abbey
Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Rd.
Livonia, MI 48154

Subject: Livonia Public Schools
2013 Bond Project
Johnson Upper Elementary School Renovations
Steel Re-Bid Award

Dear Ms. Abbey,

Barton Malow Company and Stantec have evaluated the bid proposals for the steel work at Johnson Upper Elementary School. A bid review was conducted with the contractor listed below and everything was found to be in order. Therefore, it is our recommendation that the Livonia Public Schools Board of Education awards the following contract as presented:

| Johnson | Bid Category | Vendor | Base Bid (excluding PLM Bonds) | Amount Included for PLM Bonds | Alternates | Total |
|---------|--------------|--------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------|----------|
| 051000 | Steel Work | Morkin and Sowards | \$25,325 | \$0 | \$0 | \$25,325 |

This project was advertised in the local paper and state website during the months of February 2016. Four bids were received on Thursday, February 11, 2016 at 12:00 p.m. This is for the steel portion of the interior renovations to Johnson Upper Elementary School. The steel package was re-bid because only one bid was received on the original bid date and it was late. The contractor listed above is the low qualified bidders. The intent is to award one contract for both Johnson and Holmes.

The projects will begin this spring and will be complete in the fall of 2016. This award recommendation is within the 2013 Bond Issue Program. A bid summary and bid tabulation sheets are attached for review.

Please feel free to contact me at 586.615.7719 or stephanie.hachey@bartonmalow.com if you should have any questions or comments regarding this award recommendation.

Sincerely,
BARTON MALOW COMPANY



Stephanie Hachey
Project Manager

Copy: Scott Lone, Barton Malow Company
Mike Baker, Stantec
File

February 17, 2016

Ms. Lisa Abbey
Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Rd.
Livonia, MI 48154

Subject: Livonia Public Schools
2013 Bond Project
Holmes Middle School Renovations
Steel Re-Bid Award

Dear Ms. Abbey,

Barton Malow Company and Stantec have evaluated the bid proposals for the steel work at Holmes Middle School. A bid review was conducted with the contractor listed below and everything was found to be in order. Therefore, it is our recommendation that the Livonia Public Schools Board of Education awards the following contract as presented:

| Holmes | Bid Category | Vendor | Base Bid (excluding PLM Bonds) | Amount Included for PLM Bonds | Alternates | Total |
|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------|----------|
| 051000 | Steel Work | Morkin and Sowards | \$23,190 | \$0 | \$0 | \$23,190 |

This project was advertised in the local paper and state website during the months of February 2016. Four bids were received on Thursday, February 11, 2016 at 12:00 p.m. This is for the steel portion of the interior renovations to Holmes Middle School. The steel package was re-bid because only one bid was received on the original bid date and it was late. The contractor listed above is the low qualified bidders. The intent is to award one contract for both Johnson and Holmes.

The projects will begin this spring and will be complete in the fall of 2016. This award recommendation is within the 2013 Bond Issue Program. A bid summary and bid tabulation sheets are attached for review.

Please feel free to contact me at 586.615.7719 or stephanie.hachey@bartonmalow.com if you should have any questions or comments regarding this award recommendation.

Sincerely,
BARTON MALOW COMPANY



Stephanie Hachey
Project Manager

Copy: Scott Lone, Barton Malow Company
Mike Baker, Stantec
File

Livonia Public Schools
 2013 Bond Issue Program
 Johnson Upper Elementary School
 Bid Package 3 Renovations

Hard Construction Costs:

| Johnson | Bid Category | Vendor | Base Bid (excluding PLM Bonds) | Amount Included for PLM Bonds | Alternates | Total |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------|--------------------|
| 033000 | Concrete | Brenca | \$103,800 | \$1,500 | \$0 | \$105,300 |
| 042000 | Masonry Work | Baker Construction | \$163,150 | \$1,500 | \$0 | \$164,650 |
| 051000 | Steel Work | Morkin and Sowards | \$25,325 | \$0 | \$0 | \$25,325 |
| 061000 | Carpentry Work | Advanced Building Group | \$392,000 | \$7,000 | \$0 | \$399,000 |
| 084000 | Aluminum/Glazing | Hewett | \$518,190 | \$7,810 | \$0 | \$526,000 |
| 093000 | Hard Tile | Southeastern | \$24,221 | \$621 | \$0 | \$24,842 |
| 095000 | Metal Studs/Ceilings | Commercial Contracting Corp. | \$390,893 | \$3,107 | \$0 | \$394,000 |
| 096000 | Carpet/Vinyl Floor | Cohns | \$138,600 | \$1,400 | \$0 | \$140,000 |
| 090000 | Painting Work | Seven Brothers | \$130,615 | \$3,265 | \$0 | \$133,880 |
| 101000 | Visual Display Boards | Cig Jan | \$36,386 | \$0 | \$0 | \$36,386 |
| 105000 | Lockers | Steel Equipment | \$60,425 | \$700 | \$0 | \$61,125 |
| 123000 | Casework | Architectural Systems Group | \$170,250 | \$1,000 | \$0 | \$171,250 |
| 200593 | Testing & Balancing | Internations Test and Balance | \$38,300 | \$0 | \$0 | \$38,300 |
| 230000 | Mechanical Work | Great Lakes Mechanical | \$1,731,000 | \$19,000 | \$0 | \$1,750,000 |
| 260000 | Electrical Work | J & J Electric | \$1,162,000 | \$12,000 | \$0 | \$1,174,000 |
| Construction Contract total: | | | | | | \$5,144,058 |

CM Fees and Costs Summer 2016 Johnson

| | |
|--------------------------|------------------|
| CM Labor: | \$203,878 |
| Office Costs: | \$7,800 |
| General Condition Costs: | \$33,000 |
| Fee: | \$94,303 |
| CM Cost Total: | \$338,981 |

| | |
|-----------------------|--------------------|
| TOTAL COST: | \$5,483,039 |
| Contingency: | \$411,525 |
| Project Total: | \$5,894,564 |

Livonia Public Schools
 2013 Bond Project
 Holmes Middle School
 Bid Package 3 Renovations

Hard Construction Costs:

| Holmes | Bid Category | Vendor | Base Bid (excluding PLM Bonds) | Amount Included for PLM Bonds | Alternates | Total |
|--------|-----------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------|-------------|
| 033000 | Concrete | Brencal | \$95,800 | \$1,400 | \$0 | \$97,200 |
| 042000 | Masonry Work | Baker Construction | \$232,000 | \$2,100 | \$0 | \$234,100 |
| 051000 | Steel Work | Morkin and Sowards | \$23,190 | \$0 | \$0 | \$23,190 |
| 061000 | Carpentry Work | Advanced Building Group | \$432,300 | \$7,700 | \$0 | \$440,000 |
| 084000 | Aluminum/Glazing | Hewett | \$412,797 | \$6,203 | \$0 | \$419,000 |
| 093000 | Hard Tile | Southeastern | \$33,077 | \$848 | \$0 | \$33,925 |
| 095000 | Metal Studs/Ceilings | RE Leggette | \$383,409 | \$5,376 | \$0 | \$388,785 |
| 096000 | Carpet/Vinyl Floor | Cohn's | \$150,500 | \$1,500 | \$0 | \$152,000 * |
| 099000 | Painting Work | Seven Brothers | \$155,178 | \$3,879 | \$0 | \$159,057 |
| 101000 | Visual Display Boards | Cig Jan | \$36,130 | \$0 | \$0 | \$36,130 |
| 105000 | Lockers | Steel Equipment | \$171,500 | \$1,800 | \$0 | \$173,300 |
| 123000 | Casework | Architectural Systems Group | \$82,360 | \$500 | \$0 | \$82,860 |
| 200593 | Testing & Balancing | International Test and Balance | \$46,600 | \$0 | \$0 | \$46,600 |
| 230000 | Mechanical Work | Great Lakes Mechanical | \$2,035,000 | \$20,000 | \$0 | \$2,055,000 |
| 260000 | Electrical Work | J & J Electric | \$1,372,000 | \$14,000 | \$0 | \$1,386,000 |

Prime Contract total: \$5,727,147

Notes:

* 2nd bidder - apparent low bidder withdrew bid

CM Fees and Costs Summer 2016 Holmes

CM Labor: \$203,878
 Office Costs: \$7,800
 General Condition Costs: \$33,000
 Fee: \$104,507

CM Cost Total: \$349,185

TOTAL COST: \$6,076,332
Contingency: \$458,172
Project Total \$6,534,504

