

227 N. Fourth Street
 Geneva, Illinois 60134
 630/463-3000
 630/463-3020
 Fax: 630/463-3029



Scott K. Ney
 Director, Facility Operations

**Community Unit
 School District 304**

TO: Dr. Kent Mutchler
 FROM: Scott Ney
 RE: 2023-24 Roof Renovations Bid Summary
 DATE: April 18, 2023

Bids were publicly posted on Thursday, March 30, 2023, in the Daily Herald.

On April 18, 2023, at 9:00 am, bids were opened and read aloud for the 2023 Roof Renovations Bid.

Two (2) bidders responded. The results are shown below. The low bidder is highlighted.

The contractors submitting bids were:
 Knickerbocker Roofing - Harvey, IL
 Malcor Roofing of Illinois - St. Charles, IL

Results are as follows:

Contractor	Bid Bond	Base Bid Amount	Deductive Alternate Bid #1 HSS	Deductive Alternate Bid #2 GMSS	Deductive Alternate Bid #3 FES	Unit Price #1	Unit Price #2	Unit Price #3	Unit Price #4	Unit Price #5
Knickerbocker Roofing	X	\$2,464,000.00	\$1,260,800.00	\$321,400.00	\$141,100.00	\$11.00/sq. ft	\$9.50/sq. ft	\$8.00/sq. ft	\$9.00/sq. ft	\$15.00/sq. ft
Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.	X	\$1,604,500.00	\$998,000.00	\$165,000.00	\$76,500.00	\$2.25/sq. ft	\$3.25/sq. ft	\$1.00/sq. ft	\$4.00/sq. ft	\$6.00/sq. ft

It is my recommendation that Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. be awarded the 2023 Roof Renovations contract for the Base Bid #1 for \$1,604,500. The base bid amount also includes a Two Hundred Three Thousand Dollar (\$203,000) Owner's Contingency Allowance which we believe should adequately cover the costs of typical unforeseen conditions.



Cashman Stahler Group

April 18, 2023

Mr. Scott Ney
Director of Facility Operations
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
227 N. Fourth Street
Geneva, IL 60134

2023 Roof Renovations
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
Project Number: CSG785

RE: Bid Recommendation

Scott,

I am writing in regards to the bidding for the referenced project and to recommend a bidder to you and the Board of Education. First, I would like to provide a little background regarding the project and the bidding.

Project Scope of Work

In general, the project scope of work includes the roof repairs, liquid-applied roof membrane work, and miscellaneous mechanical and electrical work at the following district buildings:

- Coultrap Educational Services Center
- Fabyan Elementary School
- Geneva Middle School South
- Harrison Street Elementary School

The roof renovations included in this project's scope are generally summarized as follows:

- Limited roof repairs to existing fully-adhered ethylene propylene diene monome (EPDM) rubber single ply roof systems at all buildings except Fabyan Elementary School.
- Limited roof repairs to existing built-up asphalt roof systems at Fabyan Elementary School.
- Rooftop mechanical and electrical work at Coultrap Educational Services Center.
- Surface preparation and application of a liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane and flashings for a twenty (20) year system warranty.

Bidding Approach

Bids were solicited from roofing contractors who will act as general contractors for the project. We published a bid notice for the project in the Daily Herald on Thursday, March 30, 2023.

To solicit additional interest in the project, we contacted eight (8) roofing contractors that have successfully completed past projects for our firm or for the District. We also sent the bid notice to one (1) digital bidding service to which many contractors subscribe for information related to public construction projects.

Beyond the firms we contacted, two (2) additional roofing contractors requested the bid documents after seeing the bid notice published in the newspaper or through a digital bidding service.

The bid documents consist of thirty-one (31) 30"x42" drawings and four hundred forty (440) pages of Specifications and other contract requirements in a Project Manual. The bid documents were issued electronically on Wednesday, April 5, 2023 to all interested bidders and registered digital bidding services.

On Tuesday, April 11, 2023, we held a mandatory pre-bid meeting at Coultrap Educational Services



Cashman Stahler Group

Center to review important project requirements with all registered bidders. A total of four (4) contractors attended the pre-bid meeting along with one (1) roofing material manufacturer representative.

Prequalification Submittal

As part of the bid document requirements, interested bidders were required to submit prequalification documents via email to the Architect by 4:00 p.m., Friday, April 14, 2023. A total of three (3) registered bidders submitted the required prequalification documents.

Bid Opening

On Tuesday, April 18, 2023, at 9:00 a.m., we held a public bid opening at the Coultrap Educational Services Center. At bid time, we received two (2) sealed bids and the bid opening was attended by one (1) bidder and one (1) roofing manufacturer representative.

The bid form included a base bid, deductive alternate bids, and unit prices as summarized below:

- Base bid: All work in the Bid Documents
- Deductive Alternate Bid #1: Deduct Harrison Street Elementary School work.
- Deductive Alternate Bid #2: Deduct Geneva Middle School South work.
- Deductive Alternate Bid #3: Deduct Fabyan Elementary School work.
- Unit Price #1: Replacing two layers of flat polyisocyanurate insulation
- Unit Price #2: Replacing one layer of tapered polyisocyanurate insulation
- Unit Price #3: Replacing cover board
- Unit Price #4: Replacing 60 mil EPDM roof membrane
- Unit Price #5: Replacing built-up four ply asphalt roof membrane

Bid Results

We received sealed bids from the following bidders and the bids were publicly opened and read. The unit price bid results can be found on the bid tabulation that is attached to this recommendation. The alternate bids were included to track costs per building.

Bidder	Base Bid	Alt. Bid 1	Alt. Bid 2	Alt. Bid 3
Knickerbocker Roofing	\$2,464,000	(\$1,260,800)	(\$321,400)	(\$141,100)
Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.	\$1,604,500	(\$998,000)	(\$165,000)	(\$76,500)
Preservation Services Inc.	No bid			
Riddiford Roofing	No bid			

Comparison to Budget

The District budget for the work was Two Million Two Hundred One Thousand Five Hundred Fifteen Dollars (\$2,201,515). We are pleased that Malcor Roofing's bid is approximately Twenty-Eight Percent (28%) under the budgeted amount. The base bid amount also includes a Two Hundred Three Thousand Dollars (\$203,000) Owner's Contingency Allowance which we believe should adequately cover the costs of typical unforeseen conditions.

Bid Analysis - Evaluation of Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.

The lowest apparent bidder was Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. located in St. Charles, Illinois. Their firm has been in business since 2012 and they average annual amount of construction over the last five years has been \$16,000,000.

They have worked three (3) times for the district in the recent past and have a current Workers' Compensation Experience rating (EMR) of 0.72. An EMR of less than 1.0 is considered an excellent rating and should reflect a successful safety program at their firm. They have a current surety line of credit of \$5,000,000 per project and maximum bonding limit of \$15,000,000 through Merchants National Bonding.

On Tuesday, April 18, 2023, I held a scope review meeting with Jason Doran, Project Manager, from Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. We reviewed the required scope of work, their submitted bid form, and general project requirements.



Cashman Stahler Group

Jason had no reservations with their bid and were looking forward to working for the District again. Based on our bid review, I believe they fully understand the required scope of work in the Contract Documents.

Malcor Roofing has worked successfully for Geneva CUSD 304 in the past on three projects. First, during the summer of 2019, they completed a \$246,300 roof renovation project at Geneva High School where roof area M was repaired, prepared, and coated with the Tremco AlphaGuard Bio liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane that is now proposed for the existing EPDM roofs at the high school.

During the following summer of 2020, Malcor Roofing completed a \$501,911 roof repair, restoration, and roof replacement project at five (5) schools throughout the district. Based on our discussions with Scott Ney about these projects, both went well and the district was pleased both with Malcor Roofing's work and the performance of Jason Doran on those projects.

Lastly, during the summer of 2021, Malcor Roofing completed a \$2,959,000 large, complex, roof repair and liquid-applied roof coating project at Geneva High School. It was a challenging project but they completed it on time and under budget.

Outside of the district, Malcor Roofing successfully completed a \$992,250 roof replacement and liquid-applied roof coating project on SBS-modified bitumen roofs at S.E. Gross Middle School in Brookfield, IL for Brookfield - La Grange Park School District 95. Both our firm and the district were very pleased with their performance. They just recently were low bidder for a \$516,500 project at another building in the same district.

We also contacted architect and project manager references received from Malcor Roofing related to projects they completed. All of the individuals we spoke with had excellent experiences with Malcor Roofing on their projects. Pat Dacy, Director of Capital Projects at West Aurora School District 129, stated that Malcor Roofing is one of their "go to" roofing contractors and that they have extensive experience with the specified Tremco AlphaGuard Bio roof system.

Recommendation

In conclusion, we believe Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc. has included all the required work in their bid and are a quality roofing contractor that should perform well on the roof replacement work this summer.

The Cashman Stahler Group recommends that the Geneva Community Unit School District 304 Board of Education award an Owner-Contractor Agreement to **Malcor Roofing of Illinois, Inc.** for the Work indicated in the Contract Documents for a Contract Sum of **One Million Six Hundred Four Thousand Five Hundred Dollars and Zero Cents (\$1,604,500.00)** for the base bid work.

If you have any questions or comments, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

CASHMAN STAHLER GROUP, INC.

A handwritten signature in green ink that reads "Stephen J. Cashman".

Stephen J. Cashman, AIA, LEED AP BD+C
Principal Architect

cc: Project File

Attachments: Completed bid tabulation

Bid Tabulation - Geneva CUSD 304 - 2023 Roof Renovations

Geneva High School
 Geneva CUSD 304
 Project CSG785

Bid Opening: Tuesday, April 18, 2023, 9:00 a.m.
 Opening Location: Coultrap Educational Services Center, 227 N. Fourth St., Geneva, IL 60134



Cashman Stahler Group
 Architects

Registered Bidder Company Name	Bid Security Submitted?		Base Bid Amount	Deductive Alternate Bid No. 1 - Deducting Harrison Elementary School Work	Deductive Alternate Bid No. 2 - Deducting Geneva Middle School South Work	Deductive Alternate Bid No. 3 - Deducting Fabyan Elementary School Work	Unit Prices					Contractor Alternates & Notes
	Bond	Check					#1 Replace 2 Layers Insul., per SF.	#2 Replace tapered Insul., per SF.	#3 Replace cover board, per SF.	#4 Replace EPDM roof, per SF.	#5 Replace built-up asphalt roof, per SF.	
Knickerbocker Roofing	X		\$ 2,464,000.00	\$ (1,260,800.00)	\$ (321,400.00)	\$ (141,100.00)	\$ 11.00	\$ 9.50	\$ 8.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 15.00	None
Malcor Roofing of Illinois	X		\$ 1,604,500.00	\$ (998,000.00)	\$ (165,000.00)	\$ (76,500.00)	\$ 2.25	\$ 3.25	\$ 1.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 6.00	None
Preservation Services Inc.			No bid									
Riddiford Roofing			No bid									