April 28, 2017

Mr. Phillip Francis Director of Operations Livonia Public Schools 15125 Farmington Road Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects

Contract Award Recommendation for Tennis Court Replacement

Churchill High School

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Project listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for this Project.

In April 2017, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On April 27, 2017, seven (7) bid proposals for three (3) bid categories were received for the Project, and over the next two days were reviewed to determine budget implications. Interviews were conducted on April 28th and were attended by representatives from NTH Consultants, PMC, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending the firms listed in NTH Consultants letter dated April 28, 2017. Including hard construction of \$610,690.00 and construction contingency of \$91,600.00, the total Project award recommendation equals \$702,290.00.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2007 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

Mr. Phillip Francis
Livonia Public Schools
April 28, 2017
Page 2

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at scott.smith@plantemoran.com.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

Scott Smith, LEED AP Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary

NTH Recommendation Letter

Bid Tabulation



CHURCHILL TENNIS COURT REPLACEMENT - COST SUMMARY

	Hard Construction								
Building	Budget		Actual		Variance				
Churchill High School	\$ 500,000	\$	610,690	\$	(110,690)				
				\$	-				
Totals	\$ 500,000	\$	610,690	\$	(110,690)				

	Construction Contingency (15%)									
Building	Budget	Actual			Variance					
Churchill High School	\$ 75,000	\$	91,600	\$	(16,600)					
	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-					
Totals	\$ 75,000	\$	91,600	\$	(16,600)					

	Total Project Costs									
Building	Budget		Actual	Variance						
Churchill High School	\$ 575,000	\$	702,290	\$	(127,290)					
	\$ 1	\$	-	\$	-					
Totals	\$ 575,000	\$	702,290	\$	(127,290)					





41780 Six Mile Road Northville, MI 48168 Phone: 248-553-6300 Fax: 248-324-5179

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, Michigan 48154

April 28, 2017 NTH Project No. 62-160382-1702

RE: 2017 Livonia Public Schools Paving Program – Churchill Tennis Courts

Contractor Award Recommendations

Churchill High School

City of Livonia, Wayne County, Michigan

Dear Mr. Francis,

Per our discussion and review of the Contractor's bids received, we have reviewed the Contractors' bid totals for the referenced project. Based on our review the bids; specifically, the total bid to complete the work and the proposed contractor schedules and we recommend Livonia Public Schools retain the following Contractors for the 2017 Churchill Tennis Court Replacement Project.

Contractor	Amount
2.1 Nagle Paving Company – for the demolition, earthwork, retaining wall, curb, concrete and asphalt work	\$486,775.00
2.2 Michigan Fencing Outlet – for the fencing and tennis court equipment installation	\$94,650.00
2.3 Goddard Coatings Company – for the installation of the new tennis court surfaces	\$29,265.00

However, we recommend maintaining some contingency funds for the project on the order of 15 percent (\$91,600) for unforeseen conditions that may be encountered.

Should you have any questions or need additional information regarding the project scope or budget, feel free to contact John Stadnicar at (248) 662-2730 (direct line).

Sincerely,

NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Anita R. Phillips, EIT Assistant Project Engineer John B. Stadnicar, P.E. Senior Vice President

ARP/JBS/mam

cc:

Paul Theriault, P.E., LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa Scott Smith, LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa

Recorded by: Anita Phillips

Witnessed by: Harry Lau



Proposal: Churchill Tennis Courts - Site Work

Location: Livonia Administrative Offices

Date: April 27, 2017

Contractor Name	Bid Security	Addendum Acknowledge	EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Base Bid A	Amounts	Comments / Voluntary Alternates
Nagle Paving	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$	486,775	
Pavex	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$	487,000	
Best Asphalt	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$	575,000	

Recorded by: Anita Phillips

Witnessed by: Harry Lau



Proposal: Churchill Tennis Courts - Fencing and Tennis Court Equipment

Location: Livonia Administrative Offices

Date: April 27, 2017

				_			Alternate #		Alternate #2	
	Bid	Addendum					Reuse Existi	ing	Install	
Contractor Name	Security	Acknowledge	EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Base Bid Amounts	Fencing		Windscreen	Comments / Voluntary Alternates
Michigan Fencing Outlet	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 94,650	\$ (7	7,800)	\$ 6,500.00	
Pavex	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 104,000	\$ (6	5,000)	\$ 16,500.00	

Recorded by: Anita Phillips



Proposal: Churchill Tennis Courts - Tennis Court Surfacing

Location: Livonia Administrative Offices Witnessed by: Harry Lau

Date: April 27, 2017

	Bid	Addendum	505				
Contractor Name	Security	Acknowledge	EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Base Bid Amou	Ints Comments / Voluntary Alternates
Goddard Coatings	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 2	9,265
Pavex	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$ 5	2,000