

227 N. Fourth Street  
 Geneva, Illinois 60134  
 630/463-3000  
 630/463-3020  
 Fax: 630/463-3029



**Scott K. Ney**  
 Director, Facility Operations

**Community Unit  
 School District 304**

TO: Dr. Andrew Barrett  
 FROM: Scott Ney  
 RE: 2024 HES Roof Renovations Bid Summary  
 DATE: May 6, 2024

Bids were publicly posted on Thursday, April 4, 2024, in the Daily Herald.

On April 25, 2024, at 1:00 pm, bids were opened and read aloud for the 2024 HES Roof Renovations Bid.

Three (3) bidders responded. The results are shown below. The low bidder is highlighted.

The contractors submitting bids were:

- Combined Roofing Services, LLC – West Chicago, IL
- L. Marshall Roofing & Sheet Metal, Inc – Glenview, IL
- Malcor Roofing of Illinois - St. Charles, IL

Results are as follows:

Contractor	Bid Bond	Base Bid Amount	Unit Price #1 Replace 2 Layers Insulation, per sq. ft.	Unit Price #2 Replace Tapered Insulation, per sq. ft.	Unit Price #3 Replace Cover Board, per sq. ft.	Unit Price #4 Replace EPDM Roof, per sq. ft.
Combined Roofing Services, LLC	x	\$744,550.00	\$8.00	\$6.00	\$5.00	\$4.00
L. Marshall Roofing & Sheet Metal, Inc	x	\$973,000.00	\$9.00	\$9.00	\$9.00	\$13.00
Malcor Roofing of Illinois	x	\$766,975.00	\$2.24	\$3.25	\$1.00	\$4.00

It is my recommendation that Combined Roofing Services, LLC. be awarded the 2024 Heartland Elementary Roof Renovations contract for the Base Bid of \$744,550.00. The base bid amount also includes a Two Hundred Thousand Dollar (\$200,000) Owner's Contingency Allowance which we believe should adequately cover the costs of typical unforeseen conditions.



**Cashman Stahler Group**

May 3, 2024

Mr. Scott Ney  
Director of Facility Operations  
Geneva Community Unit School District 304  
227 N. Fourth Street  
Geneva, IL 60134

**2024 Roof Renovations - Heartland Elementary School**  
**Geneva Community Unit School District 304**  
**Project Number: CSG811**

**RE: Bid Recommendation**

Scott,

I am writing in regards to the bidding for the referenced project and to recommend a bidder to you and the Board of Education. First, I would like to provide a little background regarding the project and the bidding.

### **Project Scope of Work**

In general, the project scope of work includes application of a liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane at Heartland Elementary School.

The roof renovations are generally summarized as follows:

- Limited roof repairs to existing fully-adhered ethylene propylene diene monome (EPDM) rubber single ply roof systems if any wet insulation is encountered during the work.
- Surface preparation and application of a liquid-applied polyurethane roof membrane and flashings for a twenty (20) year system warranty.

### **Bidding Approach**

Bids were solicited from roofing contractors who will act as general contractors for the project. We published a bid notice for the project in the Fox Valley Daily Herald on Thursday, April 4, 2024.

To solicit additional interest in the project, we contacted nine (9) roofing contractors that have successfully completed past projects for our firm or for the District. We also sent the bid notice to two (2) digital bidding service to which many contractors subscribe for information related to public construction projects.

Beyond the firms we contacted, seven (7) additional roofing contractors requested the bid documents after seeing the bid notice published in the newspaper or through a digital bidding service.

The bid documents consist of eleven (11) 30"x42" drawings and three hundred fourteen (314) pages of Specifications and other contract requirements in a Project Manual. The bid



**Cashman Stahler Group**

documents were issued electronically on Tuesday, April 9, 2024 to all interested bidders and registered digital bidding services.

On Tuesday, April 16, 2024, we held a mandatory pre-bid meeting at Coultrap Educational Services Center to review important project requirements with all registered bidders. A total of three (3) contractors attended the pre-bid meeting along with one (1) Tremco roofing material manufacturer representative.

**Prequalification Submittal**

As part of the bid document requirements, interested bidders were required to submit prequalification documents via email to the Architect by 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, April 23, 2024. A total of three (3) registered bidders submitted the required prequalification documents.

**Bid Opening**

On Thursday, April 25, 2024, at 1:00 p.m., we held a public bid opening at the Coultrap Educational Services Center. At bid time, we received three (3) sealed bids and the bid opening was attended by two (2) bidders and one (1) roofing manufacturer representative.

**Bid Results**

We received sealed bids from the following bidders and the bids were publicly opened and read. The unit price bid results can be found on the bid tabulation that is attached to this recommendation.

<b>Bidder</b>	<b>Base Bid</b>
Combined Roofing Services, Inc..	\$744,550.00
L. Marshall Roofing	\$973,000.00
Malcor Roofing of Illinois	\$766,975.00

**Comparison to Budget**

The District budget for the work was Nine Hundred Eighty-One Thousand (\$981,000). We are pleased that Combined Roofing Services' is approximately Twenty-Four Percent (24%) under the budgeted amount. The base bid amount also includes Two Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$200,000) in an Owner's Contingency Allowance to cover the costs of any unforeseen conditions.

**Bid Analysis - Evaluation of Combined Roofing Services, LLC.**

The lowest apparent bidder was Combined Roofing Services, LLC. located in West Chicago, Illinois. In 2008, American Roofing and Repair combined assets with E.W. Olson Roofing and became one company: Combined Roofing Services, LLC. E.W. Olson Roofing actually dates from 1891. Their current total of work in progress and under contract is approximately \$12,000,000. Their average annual amount of construction performed over the past five years is \$17,630,258.



## Cashman Stahler Group

They have a current Workers' Compensation Experience rating (EMR) of 0.90. An EMR of less than 1.0 is considered an excellent rating and should reflect a successful safety program at their firm. They have a current surety line of credit of \$6,000,000 per single job with an aggregate bonding capacity of \$15,000,000 through Arch Insurance Company.

On Friday, April 26, 2024, I held a scope review meeting with J.J. Matthews, Co-President, of Combined Roofing Services, LLC. We reviewed the required scope of work, their submitted bid form, and general project requirements. J.J. had no reservations with their bid and said their firm was looking forward to working with the District and our firm. Based on our bid review, I believe they fully understand the required scope of work in the Contract Documents.

Though Combined Roofing Services has not worked for the Cashman Stahler Group or Geneva CUSD 304 in the past, they are a certified Tremco AlphaGuard Bio contractor and are highly regarded. We contacted owner and architect references received from Combined Roofing related to projects they completed. All of the individuals we spoke with had good experiences with them. In particular, Hutchinson Design Group, Ltd. stated that they were one of their preferred contractors and that Combined Roofing Services had successfully completed over \$10,000,000 of their roofing work in 2022 and 2023.

### Recommendation

In conclusion, we believe Combined Roofing Services, LLC. has included all the required work in their bid, are a quality roofing contractor, and should perform well on the roof replacement work this summer.

The Cashman Stahler Group recommends that the Geneva Community Unit School District 304 Board of Education award an Owner-Contractor Agreement to **Combined Roofing Services LLC.** for the Work indicated in the Contract Documents for a Contract Sum of **Seven Hundred Forty-Four Thousand Five Hundred Fifty Dollars and Zero Cents (\$744,550.00)** for the base bid work.

If you have any questions or comments, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

**CASHMAN STAHLER GROUP, INC.**

Stephen J. Cashman, AIA, LEED AP BD+C  
Principal Architect

cc: Project File

Attachments: Completed bid tabulation