



November 14, 2013

Ms. Lisa Abbey, Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Environmental Consulting Services for Bond Projects
High School, Middle School and Upper Elementary School Projects

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran CRESA (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Environmental Consulting (EC) Firm. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC and LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and select an EC Firm for this project.

On October 29, 2013 proposals were received from nine (9) firms, and over the next few days were reviewed. Interviews took place on November 12 - 13 at the LPS Administration Building beginning at 8:00a.m. Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions the Bond Team selected ETC Environmental Services (ETC) as the recommended EC firm for the High School, Middle School and Upper Elementary School Projects. This recommendation is based on ETC's extensive educational experience, past experience with LPS, local staff and ability to begin immediately.

The Bond Team recommends the Board of Education approves to enter into a professional services contract with ETC, with final costs and terms to be negotiated by PMC, Clark Hill and LPS Administration and based upon the proposals received, unit costs provided and phasing plan to be enacted.

The Bond Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding the interview process and recommendation.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'P-T' followed by a flourish.

Paul Theriault, PE LEED AP
Vice President

Enclosures: Request for Proposals Summary
Request for Qualifications Summary



November 14, 2013

Ms. Lisa Abbey, Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Environmental Consulting Services for Bond Projects
Lower Elementary School Projects

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran CRESA (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Environmental Consulting (EC) Firm. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC and LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and select an EC Firm for this project.

On October 29, 2013 proposals were received from nine (9) firms, and over the next few days were reviewed. Interviews took place on November 12 - 13 at the LPS Administration Building beginning at 8:00a.m. Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions the Bond Team selected Nova Environmental, Inc. (NOVA) as the recommended EC firm for the Lower Elementary School Projects. This recommendation is based on NOVA's extensive educational experience, local staff and ability to begin immediately.

The Bond Team recommends the Board of Education approves to enter into a professional services contract with NOVA, with final costs and terms to be negotiated by PMC, Clark Hill and LPS Administration and based upon the proposals received, unit costs provided and phasing plan to be enacted.

The Bond Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding the interview process and recommendation.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'P-T' followed by a flourish.

Paul Theriault, PE LEED AP
Vice President

Enclosures: Request for Proposals Summary
Request for Qualifications Summary



Livonia Public Schools 2013 Bond Program Environmental Consultant Proposal Summary

BUSINESS NAME	Arch Environmental Group	Cardno ATC	ETC Environmental	Materials Testing Consultant	Nova Environmental	NTH Consultants	PSI	TEC	TTL Associates, Inc.	Averages
General Information										
Local Office	Farmington Hills, MI	Novi, MI	Romulus, MI	Grand Rapids, MI	Ann Arbor, MI	Northville, MI	Plymouth, MI	Troy, MI	Plymouth, MI	
Headquarters	Farmington Hills, MI	Lafayette, LA	Romulus, MI	Grand Rapids, MI	Ann Arbor, MI	Northville, MI	Oakbrook Terrance, IL	Troy, MI	Toledo, OH	
Contact	Scott P. Staber	Robert Smith	Leo Wall/Patricia	Christopher J. Kestner,	Barry E. Smith	Bill Reader	Joseph Konrad	Nanette Rose	Ken Smigielski	
Acknowledge Addenda #01-02										
Familial Disclosure & Iran Form	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes			Yes	
Proposed Fee Information										
Asbestos Abatement Related Services										
2014	\$ 73,637	\$ 62,350	\$ 30,200	\$ 62,000	\$ 35,500	\$ 54,820	\$ 12,125	\$ 20,360	\$ 85,740	\$ 48,526
Lead Based Paint Related Services										
2013	\$ 4,693	\$ 6,000	\$ 4,900	\$ 10,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 13,500	\$ 6,050	\$ 2,550	\$ 14,468	\$ 7,296
2014	\$ 13,510	\$ 20,000	\$ 14,800	\$ 30,000	\$ 10,500	\$ 41,650	\$ 19,350	\$ 8,500	\$ 46,256	\$ 22,730
Total Lead Based Paint Costs	\$ 18,203	\$ 26,000	\$ 19,700	\$ 40,000	\$ 14,000	\$ 55,150	\$ 25,400	\$ 11,050	\$ 60,724	\$ 30,025
Total Costs	\$ 91,839	\$ 88,350	\$ 49,900	\$ 102,000	\$ 49,500	\$ 109,970	\$ 37,525	\$ 31,410	\$ 146,464	\$ 78,551
Hourly Rates										
Principal	\$ 69.00	\$ 95.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 140.00	\$ 42.50	\$ 160.00	\$ 95.00	\$ 135.00	\$ 124.00	\$ 103.39
Project Manager	\$ 59.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 105.00	\$ 42.50	\$ 120.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 60.00	\$ 85.00	\$ 74.06
Project Designer	\$ 59.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 95.00	\$ 42.50	\$ 90.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 60.00	\$ 85.00	\$ 69.06
XDF Operator	\$ 59.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 95.00	\$ 42.50	\$ 82.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 60.00	\$ 63.00	\$ 59.61
Hygienist	\$ 49.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 95.00	\$ 42.50	\$ 65.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 63.00	\$ 54.39
Accounting	\$ 39.00	\$ 35.00	Included	\$ 85.00	\$ 40.00	\$ -	\$ 40.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 43.00
Clerical	\$ 39.00	\$ 35.00	Included	\$ 40.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 37.38
Average	\$ 53.29	\$ 58.57	\$ 50.00	\$ 93.57	\$ 38.93	\$ 80.29	\$ 55.71	\$ 63.57	\$ 75.71	\$ 62.98
Unit Prices										
Lead Based Paint Chip	\$ 14.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 11.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 13.56
PCM Samples	\$ 5.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 2.50	\$ 10.00	\$ 10.00	\$ -	\$ 9.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 4.61
PLM	\$ 11.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 11.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 11.78
PLM-Point Count Samples	\$ 11.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 11.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 38.00	\$ 28.56
TEM Samples	\$ 105.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 95.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 85.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 140.00
Reimbursables/Subconsultants										
Percentage Mark-up	15%	10%	0%	15%	0%	8%	10%	0%	10%	8%
NTE Reimbursable Allowance	1,000	\$ -	-	5,000	-	See Proposal	-	-	-	-
Subconsultants Mark-up	15%	10%	0%	15%	0%	10%	10%	0%	10%	8%
Notes										
					See Notes re: Asbestos Abatement Related Services Amount			Lead costs were not bid as requested in the RFP	See Varying Unit Prices	



**ENVIRONMENTAL CONSULTANT
Qualifications Summary
Livonia Public Schools 2013 Bond Program**

BUSINESS NAME	Cardno ATC	TEC	ETC Environmental	Nova Environmental	Materials Testing Consultant	PSI	TTL Associates, Inc.	Arch Environmental Group	NTH Consultants
General Information									
CITY, STATE ZIP	Novi, MI 48377	Troy, MI 48083	Romulus, MI 48174	Ann Arbor, MI	Grand Rapids, MI	Plymouth, MI	Plymouth, MI	Farmington Hills, MI 48335	Northville, MI 48168
CONTACTPERSONNAME	Robert Smith	Nanette Rose	Leo Wall/Patricia Mansfield	Barry E. Smith	Christopher J. Kestner	Joseph Konrad	Ken Smigielski	Scott P. Staber	Bill Reader
BUSINESS CLASSIFICATION									
Type of Business	Large	Small	Small, Labor Surplus	Small	Small	Large	Small	Small	Large
Classification		Women-Owned			Women-Owned				
State of Incorporation	Delaware	Michigan		Michigan		Delaware	Ohio	Michigan	Michigan
Year	1987	1966	1996	1988	1968	1972	2003	1995	1968
Years In Business	31	47	7	25	45		10	18	45
EXPERIENCE: % of revenue by discipline									
Environmental	42%	20.2%	100%	100%	7%	15%	33%	100%	27%
Geotechnical	10%	15.6%			35%	30%	5%		41%
Material Testing	16%	37.9%			58%	45%	22%		0%
Other:									
Industrial Hygiene	32%								
Engineering		26.5%							
% of total workload by discipline									
Educational	19%	30%	10%	90%		40%	11%	65%	7%
Government	12%	25%	25%	1%		45%	42%	3%	30%
Healthcare	8%	20%	5%			5%	1%	6%	2%
Industrial	21%	10%	5%			5%	2%	9%	30%
Commercial	24%	10%	20%			5%	5%	6%	31%
Residential	4%	5%	35%				1%	0%	
Other:									
Landfill, Utilities	12%								
A/E Firm/Contractor							26%		
Contractors								11%	
% of Institutional disciplines									
K-12 Public	65%	60%	60%	54%		35%	50%	90%	54%
K-12 Private	8%	10%	10%	1%		5%	7%	5%	1%
Higher Education	27%	30%	30%	45%		60%	43%	5%	45%
STAFFING									
Total # of full time Personnel	1541	72	26	12	50	1859	108	28	154
Executive Management	10	8	2	2	2	27	8	3	14
Project Managers	522	10	1	8	6	221	17	3	26
Registered Architects	7	0	0		0	2	0	1	0
Licensed Engineers	130	6	0		8	136	11	1	46
Administrative Staff	228	6	5	2	5	220	11	4	26
Non-Licensed Architects/Engineers	0	2	0		0	200	5	0	0
Technicians	314	20	0		10	1053	47	16	23
Field Staff	320	20	15		19	1053	25	0	29
INSURANCE AND BOND INFO									
General Liability peroccurrence	1,000,000	1,000,000	See attached COI - Sample Proof	1,000,000	2,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	2,000,000	1,000,000
General Liability aggregate	2,000,000	2,000,000	See attached COI - Sample Proof	2,000,000	5,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	4,000,000	2,000,000
Umbrella Liability peroccur	5,000,000	10,000,000	See attached COI - Sample Proof	5,000,000	5,000,000	5,000,000	10,000,000	1,000,000	10,000,000
Umbrella Liability aggregate	5,000,000	10,000,000	See attached COI - Sample Proof	5,000,000	5,000,000	5,000,000	10,000,000	1,000,000	10,000,000
Professional Liability per Occurrence	1,000,000	2,000,000	See attached COI - Sample Proof	3,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	2,000,000	1,000,000
Professional Liability Aggregate	2,000,000	2,000,000	See attached COI - Sample Proof	3,000,000	2,000,000	1,000,000	2,000,000	4,000,000	1,000,000
InsuranceCompany	Aon Risk Services SW, Inc.	Cranbrook General Underwriters	C&M Insurance	Michigan Insurance Co.	Van Wyk Risk & Financial Mgmt.	Marsh USA Inc.	Nautilus Insurance Co.	American Safety Indemnity	Professional Concepts Insurance
BondingCompany									
SingleBondCapacity									
AggregateBondCapacity									
WIP AND WORK PERFORMED									
WorkInProgress	59,958,374	790,000		0		4000000 (local)	750,000		12,132,231
Minimum	500	1,000		1,000		5,000	500		5,000
Maximum	5,000,000	1,000,000		500,000		100,000	500,000		2,500,000
FINANCIAL INFORMATION									
Annual revenue performed									
2008	\$ 198,545,944	\$ 6,800,000		\$ 1,765,000	\$ 4,767,172	\$ 235,000,000	\$ 832,925	\$ 2,230,000	\$ 27,563,007
2009	\$ 180,539,341	\$ 5,100,000		\$ 1,362,000	\$ 4,463,697	\$ 198,000,000	\$ 894,002	\$ 2,247,000	\$ 24,053,895
2010	\$ 182,250,895	\$ 5,000,000		\$ 1,427,000	\$ 4,321,246	\$ 188,000,000	\$ 1,311,495	\$ 2,109,000	\$ 22,356,309
2011	\$ 190,058,046	\$ 5,300,000		\$ 1,490,000	\$ 4,316,757	\$ 205,000,000	\$ 2,238,556	\$ 2,414,000	\$ 22,179,943
2012	\$ 193,273,240	\$ 6,200,000	\$ 1,502,000	\$ 1,265,000	\$ 3,994,396	\$ 221,000,000	\$ 1,901,699	\$ 2,483,000	\$ 19,850,067
FIRM LEGAL INFORMATION									
Defaulted on a Contract?	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Are there judgments or suits?	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
A party to any lawsuits or claims?	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes
An affirmative Action Program?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
A Quality Assurance Program?	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes