

February 7, 2025

Lewiston-Altura Public Schools ISD857
c/o Gwen Carman, Superintendent
100 County Road 25
Lewiston, MN 55952

**SUBJECT: Lewiston-Altura High School - 2025 Roof Replacement Project
Prime Contract Bid Award Recommendations**

With Superintendent Carman presiding, prime contract bids for the 2025 Roof Replacement project were received and publicly opened starting at 2:00 P.M. on Thursday, February 6, 2025.

We had a budget of \$1,650,000 for the roof replacement scope of work and as seen in the attached bid tabulation, we received five total bids for the work with a variety of bid options. The low bids for the two options are as follows:

- 1) Base Bid: 4-ply asphalt/gravel built-up roof replacement with a 30-year warranty from McDowall Company for \$1,848,700 AND the Alternate#3 Fall 2025 completion DEDUCT of \$250,000 for a grand total of \$1,598,700. This roof system is much thicker than the single-layer EPDM/rubber roof and will perform better in our climate for the life of the roof. Please note: this built-up roof can be restored near the end of life (around year 25) for about 30% of the replacement cost and extends the service life by about 60-70%.
- 2) Alternate Bid: 45mil KEE fully adhered EPDM rubber roof replacement with a 20-year warranty from Ledegar Roofing for \$1,410,841. This bid was submitted as only the EPDM/rubber option AND had the Alternate#3 Fall 2025 completion. This roof system does not have a viable restoration option and would require replacement near the end of service life. While this roof system is less costly, we feel that the Base Bid Built-Up roof offers a better product and life cycle.

After careful review and consideration of the bid results, InGensa, Inc. requests and recommends that the Lewiston-Altura ISD #857 School Board approve the award of the bid by approved motion as follows:

AWARD the following bid proposal by approved motion:

- 1) **BASE BID: 4-PLY ASPHALT/GRAVEL BUILT-UP ROOF SYSTEM** to:

McDowall Company	BASE BID in the amount of:	\$1,848,700.00
	ALTERNATE#3 – FALL 2025 COMPLETION DEDUCT:	(\$250,000.00)
- 2) The total contract amount to McDowall Company will be: **\$1,598,700.00**

Unit prices for replacement of any deteriorated wood blocking, drain bowl assemblies, and wet insulation that may be encountered during the construction are also included on the bid tabulation.

Respectfully,

Gary A. Lovitz
Senior Project Manager, InGensa, Inc.

Enclosed: Final bid tabulation



Lewiston-Altura School District
2025 Roof Replacement at Lewiston-Altura High School

OWNER: Lewiston-Altura School District
 MANUFACTURER'S REPRESENTATIVE: Tremco Roofing and Building Maintenance
 CONSULTANT: Ingensa Inc.

Bid Tabulation
 Thursday, Feb 6th, 2025
 Bid Opening at 2:00 P.M.

	BIDDER	BIDDER	BIDDER	BIDDER	BIDDER
	McDowall Company 1431 Prosper Dr Waite Park, MN 56387 320-251-8640	Ledegar Roofing Company, Inc. 1701 Miller St. La Crosse, WI 54601 608-785-0901	McPhillips Bros. Roofing Co. 2590 Centennial Drive St. Paul, MN 55109 651-770-2062	Schwickert's Tecta America 330 Poplar St. Mankato, MN 56001 507-387-3101	John A. Dalsin & Son 2830 South 20th Ave Minneapolis, MN 55407 612-729-9334
# of Workdays Necessary	60	50	55	60	90
Addenda Received	x	x	x	x	x
BASE BID ROOF AREAS:					
BASE BID 1 - Replace roof Areas 1, 2, 3, 5, 9A, 9B, 10A, 10B, & 11 Gravel Surface Built-Up Roof Design	\$ 1,848,700.00	\$ -	\$ 2,750,000.00	\$ 2,349,000.00	\$ 2,328,000.00
ALTERNATES: (the intent is that Alternate 2 and 3 would be one or the other, not both)					
ALTERNATE BID 1 - Add/Deduct to change base bid roof design to an Adhered 45-mil Fleeceback KEE Roof System	\$ 40,000.00	\$ -	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 758,000.00	\$ -
ALTERNATE BID 2 - Add/Deduct to allow Spring project start date	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2,750.00	\$ -	\$ -
ALTERNATE BID 3 - Add/Deduct to allow Fall project completion date	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 1,410,841.00	\$ 2,750.00	\$ -	\$ -
UNIT PRICES:					
UP #1 - Replace Deteriorated Wood Blocking	\$ 5.00	\$ 6.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 3.65
UP #2 - Damaged Drain Bowl Assembly	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 2,700.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 3,200.00	\$ 2,800.00
UP #3 - Replace Deteriorated Insulation	\$ 4.00	\$ 6.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 6.80	\$ 3.65
BID CALCULATIONS					
BASE BID - (BUR DESIGN)	\$ 1,848,700.00	\$ -	\$ 2,750,000.00	\$ 2,349,000.00	\$ 2,328,000.00
BASE BID + ALTERNATE 1 - (KEE DESIGN)	\$ 1,808,700.00	\$ -	\$ 2,500,000.00	\$ 1,591,000.00	
BASE BID + ALTERNATE 2 - (BUR DESIGN EARLY START)		\$ -			
BASE BID + ALTERNATE 3 - (BUR DESIGN LATE COMPLETION)	\$ 1,598,700.00				
BASE BID + ALTERNATE 1 + ALTERNATE 2 (KEE DESIGN EARLY START)		\$ -			
BASE BID + ALTERNATE 1 + ALTERNATE 3 (KEE DESIGN LATE COMPLETION)	\$ 1,558,700.00	\$ 1,410,841.00			