



November 14, 2013

Ms. Lisa Abbey, Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Commissioning Services for 2014 Projects

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran CRESA (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Commissioning Agent (CA) Firm. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC and LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and select a CA Firm for this project.

On October 29, 2013 proposals were received from ten (10) firms, and over the next few days were reviewed. Interviews took place on November 12th at the LPS Administration Building beginning at 9:00a.m. Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions the Bond Team selected Sellinger Associates, Inc. as the recommended CA firm for the 2014 Projects. This recommendation is based on Sellinger's extensive educational experience, local staff and ability to begin immediately.

The Bond Team recommends the Board of Education approves to enter into a professional services contract with Sellinger Associates, Inc. in the amount of \$83,885.00, pending final negotiation by PMC and Clark Hill on behalf of LPS. Please note that this award is only for the 2014 Projects. Commissioning Services for future Projects will be addressed at a later date.

The Bond Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding the interview process and recommendation.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "P-Ther", with a stylized flourish extending to the right.

Paul Theriault, PE LEED AP
Vice President

Enclosures: Request for Proposals Summary

Request for Qualifications Summary



**Livonia Public Schools
2013 Bond Program
CA Proposal Summary
2014 Projects**

BUSINESS NAME	Albert Kahn	Facility Dynamics	Fishbeck Thompson Carr	Heapy Engineering	Horizon Engineering	Integrated Design Solutions	Peter Basso Associates	Sellinger	SHW / SES	URS	Averages
General Information											
Local Office	Detroit, MI	Columbia, MD	Novi, MI	Indianapolis, IN	Novi, MI	Troy, MI	Troy, MI	Livonia, MI	Berkley, MI	Southfield, MI	
Headquarters	Detroit, MI	Columbia, MD	Grand Rapids, MI	Indianapolis, IN	Novi, MI	Troy, MI	Troy, MI	Livonia, MI	Plano, TX	San Francisco, CA	
Contact	Lawrence S. Fill, CIPE, CxA	David Mullinix	Brian L. Hire, CxAP, LEED AP BD+C	Donn D. Young, CPMP, QCxP, LEED AP BD+C	Matthew Tunnard	Bruce J. Snyder, CEM, LEED AP BD+C	Randy M. Wisniewski	Michael O. Sellinger	John Abraam	Cynthia Porter Janes	
Familial Disclosure & Iran Form	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Proposed Fee Information											
Commissioning 2014	\$ 199,500.00	\$ 156,884.00	\$ 117,825.00	\$ 140,200.00	\$ 129,300.00	\$ 142,989.00	\$ 148,600.00	\$ 80,385.00	\$ 56,000.00	\$ 302,345.00	\$ 146,832.50
Alternate #01	\$ 17,600	\$ 5,797	\$ 5,780	\$ 2,000	\$ 4,940	\$ 6,468	\$ 4,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 2,800	\$ 13,648	\$ 5,987
Reimbursables (NTE)	\$ -	\$ 9,976	Ten Percent	\$ -	Included in Fee	\$ 2,000	TBD	\$ -	\$ 1,000	\$ 4,418	\$ 2,485
Total (w/Alternate)	\$ 217,100	\$ 172,657	\$ 123,605	\$ 142,200	\$ 134,240	\$ 151,457	\$ 152,600	\$ 83,885	\$ 59,800	\$ 320,411	\$ 154,174
Subconsultants Mark-up	5.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	1.10%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	10.00%	
Hourly Rates											
Principal	\$ 120.00	\$ 174.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 225.00	\$ 140.00	\$ 152.50	\$ 125.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 230.00	168.13
Project Manager	\$ 115.00	\$ 158.00	\$ 127.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 120.00		\$ 125.00	\$ 145.00	\$ 165.00	145.00
Registered Architect	\$ 120.00	\$ -	\$ 156.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 90.00		\$ -	\$ 92.00	\$ 190.00	94.00
Professional Engineer	\$ 120.00	\$ -	\$ 144.00	\$ 135.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 95.00		\$ 105.00	\$ 135.00	\$ 160.00	133
Commissioning Agent	\$ 110.00	\$ 142.00	\$ 119.00	\$ 135.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 107.50	\$ 130.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 115.00		\$ 123.33
Field Representative	\$ 95.00		\$ 99.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 90.00	\$ 95.00		\$ 85.00	\$ 100.00		
Draftsperson / Technician	\$ -		\$ 80.00	\$ 85.00	\$ -	\$ 65.00		\$ 50.00	\$ 80.00	\$ 82.00	
Accounting	\$ -		\$ 66.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 50.00		\$ -	\$ 65.00		
Clerical	\$ -		\$ 66.00	\$ 85.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 50.00		\$ 50.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 61.67
Sr. Project Engineer	\$ -				\$ 125.00	\$ -					
Project Engineer	\$ -				\$ 110.00	\$ -					
Mechanical Cx Authority							\$ 82.50				
Electrical Cx Authority							\$ 77.50				
Average	\$ 61.82	\$ 94.80	\$ 117.44	\$ 108.89	\$ 100.91	\$ 73.86	\$ 141.25	\$ 73.89	\$ 106.89	\$ 149.50	\$ 120.91
Notes											
						This is based upon their revised proposal		See Clarifications			



**COMMISSIONING AGENT
Qualifications Summary
Livonia Public Schools 2013 Bond Program**

BUSINESS NAME	Peter Basso Associates	Sellinger	Fishbeck Thompson Carr & Huber	SHW	STRATEGIC ENERGY SOLUTIONS	Horizon Engineering	Albert Kahn	Integrated Design Solutions	URS	Heapy Engineering	Facility Dynamics
General Information											
CITY, STATE ZIP	Troy, MI 48098	Livonia, MI	NO QUALIFICATIONS PROVIDED	Berkley, MI 48072	Berkley, MI 48072	Novi, MI 48375	Detroit, MI 48202	Troy, MI 48098	Southfield, MI 48034	Indianapolis, IN 46240	Columbia, MD 21046
CONTACT PERSON	Randy M. Wisniewski	Mike Sellinger		John Glaeser	John Abraam	Matthew Tunnard	Lawrence S. Fill	Bruce J. Snyder	Cynthia Porter Janes	Donn D. Young	David Mullinix
BUSINESS CLASSIFICATION											
Type of Business	Small	Small		Large	Small Business	Large	Large	Large	Large	Large	Large
Classification		MBE, Hispanic American									
State of Incorporation	Michigan	Michigan			Michigan		Michigan	Michigan	Michigan	Indiana	Maryland
Year	1990	1996			1997		1940	1999	1999	2008	1989
Years In Business	23	17		68	16	18	118	50	110	68	24
EXPERIENCE: % of revenue by discipline											
Architectural	61%			100%			35%	40%	23%		
Structural Engineering							15%		2%		
Mechanical Engineering		100%			70%		20%	25%	8%	44%	
Electrical Engineering	39%				30%		20%	25%	7%	29%	
Information/Technology Consulting								10%	2%	3%	
Site/Civil Engineering									3%		
% of total workload by discipline											
Educational	50%	30%		100%	25%	27%	11%	70%	8%	30%	40%
Government	5%	10%			6%	10%			8%	8%	30%
Healthcare	25%	30%			10%	32%	28%	10%	31%	32%	20%
Industrial	15%	15%			5%	2%	34%		2%	5%	10%
Commercial	14%	10%			27%	18%	9%	20%	2%	6%	
Residential		5%			12%	7%				0%	
% of Institutional disciplines											
K-12 Public	34%	60%		70%	65%	39%	80%	25%	45%	33%	25%
K-12 Private	4%	20%		1%	13%	2%	0%	2%	5%		5%
Higher Education	62%	20%		29%	22%	59%	20%	53%	50%	67%	70%
Commercial								20%			
STAFFING											
Total # of full time Personnel	86	6		(Local) 102	23	67	128	96	274	173	71
Registered Architects	0			31	0	1	17	21	24	0	0
Landscape Architects	0			0	0	0	1	0	2	0	0
Non-Licensed Architects/Engineers	25	2		35	12	8	30	40	64	41	41
Field Staff	12	1		0	0	12	2	0	20	5	0
Principals/Executive Management	20	1		10	4	4	7	7	8	15	2
Licensed Engineers	25	1		12	6	9	20	12	75	52	21
Technicians	0			0	0	1	0	3	59	21	0
Project Managers	35			8	5	3	2	2	10	6	23
Specification Writers	1			0	0	0	1	1	0	0	0
Administrative Support	12	1		7	3	16	23	12	27	23	7
LEED Certified Staff	22			37	7	29	60	14	40	80	8
INSURANCE AND BOND INFO											
General Liability per occurrence	1,000,000	1,000,000		1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000
General Liability aggregate	2,000,000	2,000,000		2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000
Umbrella Liability per occur	5,000,000	5,000,000		5,000,000	2,000,000	5,000,000	10,000,000	5,000,000	1,000,000	5,000,000	5,000,000
Umbrella Liability aggregate	5,000,000	1,000,000		5,000,000	2,000,000	5,000,000	10,000,000	5,000,000	2,000,000	5,000,000	5,000,000
Professional Liability per Occurrence	2,000,000	1,000,000		5,000,000	2,000,000	3,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	1,000,000	2,000,000
Professional Liability Aggregate	4,000,000	1,000,000		5,000,000	2,000,000	3,000,000	2,000,000	5,000,000	3,000,000	1,000,000	2,000,000
Insurance Company	Professional Concepts Insurance Agency	DesignPro Insurance Group		McLaughlin Brunson Insurance Agency	Hartford Casualty Insurance Co.	Omni Risk Management Inc.	Professional Underwriters, Inc.	DesignPro Insurance Group	Marsh Risk Insurance Services	Brower Insurance	BB&T Atlantic Risk Management
WIP AND WORK PERFORMED											
Work In Progress				153,500,447	1,748,814	2,941,041	32,900,000	12,000,000	35,500,000	15,000,000	
Minimum		100,000		500,000	250,000	-	20,000	50,000	1,000,000	4,000,000	1,000,000
Maximum		50,000,000		200,000,000	150,000,000	4,000,000	1,000,000,000	185,000,000	100,000,000	100,000,000	80,000,000
FINANCIAL INFORMATION											
Annual revenue performed											
2008	\$ 14,300,000	\$ 583,100		\$ 80,718,000	\$ 2,377,198	\$ 10,137,588	\$ 44,900,000	\$ 12,200,000	\$ 10,086,300,000	\$ 19,792,987	\$ 12,771,000
2009	\$ 11,200,000	\$ 273,100		\$ 66,052,000	\$ 1,923,075	\$ 13,061,440	\$ 34,000,000	\$ 15,500,000	\$ 9,249,100,000	\$ 21,502,119	\$ 14,247,000
2010	\$ 10,400,000	\$ 727,000		\$ 57,764,000	\$ 1,594,745	\$ 12,967,540	\$ 22,200,000	\$ 14,700,000	\$ 9,177,100,000	\$ 20,907,521	\$ 16,202,000
2011	\$ 10,600,000	\$ 726,500		\$ 49,716,000	\$ 2,830,478	\$ 16,568,000	\$ 28,000,000	\$ 15,300,000	\$ 9,545,000,000	\$ 21,402,816	\$ 17,436,000
2012	\$ 11,400,000	\$ 615,500		\$ 51,725,000	\$ 2,410,022	\$ 13,491,000	\$ 23,500,000	\$ 13,600,000	\$ 10,972,500,000	\$ 22,106,880	\$ 18,500,000
FIRM LEGAL INFORMATION											
Defaulted on a Contract?	No	No		No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Are there judgments or suits pending?	No	No		No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
A party to any lawsuits or claims?	No	No		No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No
An affirmative Action Program?	Yes	Yes		Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
A Quality Assurance Program?	Yes	No		Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No