

April 6, 2017

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Construction Bids – Balance of Awards  
Churchill High School

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, George W. Auch Co., French Associates, and LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for this Project.

On January 23, 2017, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan websites.

On February 10, 2017, two (2) bid proposals were received for this bid category, and over the next several weeks were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were held during this period and were attended by various members of the Bond Team. Additional due diligence was performed and included sampling various paint products at the school to validate their performance in order to assist in making this recommendation.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Bond Team is recommending the firm listed in George W. Auch Co.'s Award Recommendation Letter dated April 4, 2017 for contract award. Including hard construction, CM fees and costs, and construction contingency dollars, this current Project award recommendation equals \$1,373,713 and includes the Painting and CM Fees and Costs, with a Construction Contingency Budget of \$1,260,726 for a total of \$2,634,439. The total REVISED project award recommendation equals \$18,219,974 and is inclusive of Hard Construction, CM Fees and Cost, a Construction Contingency Budget as well as Alternates A-1, A-2, A-8, and A-9 as noted in our letter dated February 27, 2017.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor. The CM costs and fees will be detailed in Amendment #06 to AIA – C132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Construction Manager, both pending final review and approval by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendations of the Bond Team. Please direct all questions through me via email.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "P-T-C", with a horizontal line underneath.

Paul Theriault, PE, LEED AP  
Principal

Enclosures:    Budget Summary  
                  Award Recommendation Letter  
                  Summary of Costs  
                  Bid Tabulation

CHURCHILL HIGH SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION - BUDGET SUMMARY

	Hard Construction		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Churchill High School	\$ 14,797,990	\$ 15,882,358	\$ (1,084,368)
Totals	\$ 14,797,990	\$ 15,882,358	\$ (1,084,368)

	CM Fees/Costs		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Churchill High School	\$ 1,176,548	\$ 1,076,890	\$ 99,658
Totals	\$ 1,176,548	\$ 1,076,890	\$ 99,658

	Construction Contingency		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Churchill High School	\$ 1,394,544	\$ 1,260,726	\$ 133,818
Totals	\$ 1,394,544	\$ 1,260,726	\$ 133,818

	Total Project Costs		
Building	Budget**	Actual	Variance
Churchill High School	\$ 17,369,082	\$ 18,219,974	\$ (850,892)
Totals	\$ 17,369,082	\$ 18,219,974	\$ (850,892)

\*\* The original budget currently remains at \$17,369,082.

The Bond Team is recommending an additional \$1,000,000 to augment this budget from the Bond Owner Contingency line item, not from the Sinking Fund as previously discussed.

**George W. Auch Company**  
General Contractors / Construction Managers

P.O. Box 430719 (48343-0719)  
735 S. Paddock Street  
Pontiac, Michigan 48341-3241

(248) 334-2000 Fax (248) 334-3404

Since 1908



**AUCH**  
A Second Century of Building Trust

April 4, 2017

Phillip M. Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

**RE: Recommendation for Award – 02  
Churchill High School – Auditorium & Classroom Renovations  
Proposal P – Painting  
Pre-Construction and Construction Management Services  
GWA Project No. 8146**

Dear Mr. Francis,

The George W. Auch Company is pleased to present this recommendation to accompany the previous recommendation sent on February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2017 for the Livonia – Churchill High School Auditorium and Classroom Renovations Project.

As you are aware, there have been some challenges within the district concerning paint adhesion to existing walls. The design and construction team consisting of Livonia Public Schools, French Associates, Plante Moran CRESA, NTH Consultants and the George W. Auch Company engaged in some additional due diligence research in an effort to ensure that the proper resolution to the paint adhesion issue. Working closely with the low responsive bidder, Seven Brothers Painting, we completed a series of paint mock-ups at Churchill High School using various products proposed by Sherwin Williams. On April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2017 at 11:00am, NTH Consultants performed a series of adhesion tests. Some products performed superior to other products, however, multiple products have proved proper adhesion to the existing walls. Based on the NTH test report that will be issued shortly, French Associates will be providing a firm recommendation of the painting products to be used at various locations at Churchill High School. We have completed our post-bid evaluation with Seven Brothers Painting from the bid received on February 10<sup>th</sup>, 2017 and have confirmed that they have complete scope of work that complies with the plans and specifications. We are recommending Seven Brothers Painting to be awarded the bid category of Proposal P – Painting.

Enclosed are the bid tabulation sheets and a revised copy of the complete bid recommendation summary. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Please do not hesitate to contact me with any questions or concerns regarding the bid alternates.

Very truly yours,

**GEORGE W. AUCH COMPANY**

  
Mitch DeLange  
Project Manager

Enclosure

CC: Paul Theriault, Scott Smith – Plante Moran CRESA  
Jeff Hamilton – George W. Auch Co.  
Keti Mitevaska – French Associates





Livonia Public Schools  
**Churchill High School - Classroom Auditorium Renovations**  
 Bid Summary - 04/10/2017  
 GWA #8146



DESCRIPTION OF WORK	SUBCONTRACTOR	BID AMOUNT	ACCEPTED ALTERNATES
Selective Demolition	DKI International, Inc.	\$ 442,000	
Alternate A-1			\$ 19,000
Concrete Flatwork	McCarthy Construction Co.	\$ 386,490	
Foundations	Six-K Construction	\$ 170,000	
Masonry	Brazen & Greer	\$ 712,000	
Alternate A-9			\$ 10,000
Structural & Miscellaneous Steel	Rohmann Iron	\$ 874,500	
Rough & Finish Carpentry	Wally Kosorski & Co., Inc.	\$ 1,123,950	
Roofing	JD Candler Roofing	\$ 234,500	
Metal Wall Panels	Exterior Metals	\$ 116,530	
Storefront / Glass & Glazing	Glasco Corp.	\$ 433,442	
Overhead Coiling Doors	KVM Door Systems, Inc.	\$ 32,790	
Gypsum Wall Assemblies	Diversified Constuction	\$ 874,950	
Hard Tile / Terrazzo	Michielutti Bros.	\$ 237,800	
Alternate A-8			\$ 6,100
Acoustical Ceilings & Wall Panels	ANM Construction	\$ 776,000	
Alternate A-1			\$ 62,000
Resilient Flooring & Carpet	Shamrock Floorcovering	\$ 426,400	
Painting	Seven Brothers Painting	\$ 296,823	
Markerboards and Tackboards	Cig Jan	\$ 60,712	
Signage	Stamprite	\$ 20,668	
Toilet Compartments / Access	Rayhaven Group	\$ 35,100	
Metal Lockers	Steel Equipment	\$ 258,400	
Theater Equipment	Wenger Corp.	\$ 456,998	
Alternate A-2			\$ 26,186
Window Treatments	Creative Windows	\$ 24,600	
Theater Seating	Irwin Seating	\$ 170,432	
Lifts	Acton Sales	\$ 24,000	
Fire Suppression System	Professional Sprinkler	\$ 23,880	
Plumbing	Oakland Plumbing	\$ 254,413	
HVAC Mechanical	Quality Aire Systems	\$ 3,555,000	
TAB	Air Solutions	\$ 49,900	
Electrical	Metro Electric Eng. Tech.	\$ 3,648,000	
Chain Link Fence	Industrial Fence	\$ 38,794	
<b>SUBTOTAL:</b>		<b>\$ 15,759,072</b>	<b>\$ 123,286</b>
Hard Construction Cost:			\$ 15,882,358.00
Pre-Construction			\$ 71,400
CM Staffing			\$ 564,760
CM Reim. / GC's			\$ 174,780
CM Fee			\$ 265,950
Project Subtotal			\$ 16,959,248
Contingency			\$ 1,260,726
<b>TOTAL CHURCHILL HS PROJECT:</b>			<b>\$ 18,219,974</b>





**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS**  
**CHURCHILL HIGH SCHOOL - AUDITORIUM & CLASSROOM RENOVATIONS**  
 GEORGE AUCH PROJECT # 8146



Date: 4/10/2017

**CM Reim/GC's**

Cost Code	Description	Quantity	Unit	Labor Unit Price	Labor Budget	Material Unit Price	Material Budget	Total Budget	Previous To-Date	This Period	Costs To-Date	Variance
1040	Mobilization	2	each		\$0	\$250	\$500	\$500	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$500
1045	Office supplies	1	LS			\$500	\$500	\$500	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$500
1050	Layout	1	LS			\$4,000	\$4,000	\$4,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$4,000
1096	Directed subcontractor overtime	1	ls	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1205	Temporary Field Office	0	Months		\$0	\$450	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1225	Temporary Electric Trailer	0	Months		\$0	\$100	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1227	Temporary Heat Trailer	0	Months		\$0	\$250	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1230	Drinking Water	17	Months		\$0	\$40	\$680	\$680	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$680
1235	Temporary Telephone	20	Months		\$0	\$400	\$8,000	\$8,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$8,000
1243	Temporary Fax	0	Months		\$0	\$100	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1245	Temporary Toilets	20	Months		\$0	\$300	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$6,000
1250	Temporary Office Furniture/Equipment	20	Months		\$0	\$100	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$2,000
1270	Progress Photos	10	Months		\$0	\$70	\$700	\$700	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$700
1275	First Aid	20	Months		\$0	\$50	\$1,000	\$1,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$1,000
1280	Fire Extinguishers	6	LS		\$0	\$250	\$1,500	\$1,500	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$1,500
1285	Project Signs	1	each		\$0	\$3,500	\$3,500	\$3,500	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$3,500
1310	Temp. Electric-building	0		\$0	\$0	\$300	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1320	Temp. Heat-building	0	Months	\$0	\$0	\$4,000	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1335	Temp. Partitions/Enclosures	1	ls	\$0	\$0	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$20,000
1340	Temp. Road / Access	0	ls	\$0	\$0	\$7,500	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
1370	Equipment - General Conditions	87	weeks		\$0	\$100	\$8,700	\$8,700	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$8,700
1380	Trucking	20	trips	\$160	\$3,200	\$60	\$1,200	\$4,400	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$4,400
1405	General (periodic) Clean-Up 8hrs/wk	80	weeks	\$520	\$41,600		\$0	\$41,600	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$41,600
1420	Final Clean-Up (Aud. Only)	1	ls	\$8,500	\$8,500	\$0	\$0	\$8,500	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$8,500
1440	Debris Removal - Dumpsters	20	each		\$0	\$450	\$9,000	\$9,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$9,000
1515	Temporary Fencing	1	ls		\$0	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$2,000
1550	Safety	12	Months		\$0	\$500	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$6,000
1605	Building Permit In Summary	1	ls	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	by owner
1630	Misc. Permits In Summary	1	ls	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	by owner
1636	Consumer's Energy Gas Charges	1	ls	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	by owner
1701	Special Services	1	ls						\$ -	\$0	\$0	by owner
1730	Testing In Summary	1	ls	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	by owner
1745	Punchlist	4	Weeks	\$1,800	\$7,200	\$500	\$2,000	\$9,200	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$9,200
1752	GC Contingency	0	ls	\$0	\$0	\$500	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
2017	Misc. Cut & Patch	1	ls	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$0	\$0	\$10,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$10,000
17260	Postage & Express Mail Charges	20	Month	\$0	\$0	\$250	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$5,000
17265	Printing / Technology	1	LS	\$0	\$0	\$18,000	\$18,000	\$18,000	\$ -	\$0.00	\$0	\$18,000
	CGL Insurance	1	LS	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$4,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$4,000
	<b>TOTAL</b>							<b>\$174,780</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$174,780</b>

**CM Staffing**

Cost Code	Description	Quantity	Unit	Labor Unit Price	Labor Budget	Material Unit Price	Material Budget	Total Budget	Previous To-Date	This Period	Costs To-Date	Variance
17075	Mileage	16	Month		\$0	\$500	\$8,000	\$8,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$8,000
17105	Principle in Charge Constr.	160	hours	\$110	\$17,600	\$0	\$0	\$17,600	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$17,600
17110	Project Manager	87	Weeks	\$1,390	\$120,930	\$0	\$0	\$120,930	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$120,930
1095	Overtime	350	hours	\$100	\$35,000	\$0	\$0	\$35,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$35,000
1130	Superintendent	87	Weeks	\$3,270	\$284,490	\$0	\$0	\$284,490	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$284,490
1135	Assist. Supt.	0	Weeks	\$3,120	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$0
17145	Administrative Service	1	LS	\$17,440	\$17,440	\$0	\$0	\$17,440	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$17,440
17141	Project Engineer	87	Weeks	\$900	\$78,300	\$0	\$0	\$78,300	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$78,300
17180	Misc. Bid Expense	1	LS	\$0	\$0	\$3,000	\$3,000	\$3,000	\$ -	\$0	\$0	\$3,000
	<b>TOTAL</b>							<b>\$564,760</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$564,760</b>

<b>GRAND TOTAL GCs/CM Reim. - FRANKLIN HIGH ONLY</b>								<b>\$739,540</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$739,540</b>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	------------------	------------	------------	------------	------------------

**Pre-Construction - CM Reim. / GC's**

17265	Printing/Reproduction Charges	1	LS	\$0	\$0	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,000
	Pre-Purchasing							\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
	<b>Total</b>							<b>\$2,000</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$2,000</b>

**Pre-Construction - CM Staffing**

17075	Mileage	1	Month		\$0	\$500	\$500	\$500	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$500
17105	Principle in Charge Precon	60	hours	\$116	\$6,960	\$0	\$0	\$6,960	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$6,960
17110	Project Manager Precon	200	hours	\$60	\$12,000	\$0	\$0	\$12,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$12,000
17115	Estimator	1	hours	LS	\$45,000	\$0	\$0	\$45,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$45,000
17141	Project Engineer Precon	95	hours	\$52	\$4,940	\$0	\$0	\$4,940	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$4,940
	<b>Total</b>							<b>\$69,400</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$69,400</b>

<b>GRAND TOTAL GCs/CM Reim. FOR TOTAL CONTRACT</b>								<b>\$810,940</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$810,940</b>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	------------------	------------	------------	------------	------------------



LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS  
 Churchill High School Auditorium Classroom Renovation  
 George W. Auch Company (Proj. #8146)  
 Letter of Recommendation #2



COMPANY	SPECIFICATION SECTION	TRADE	ADDENDA	AMOUNT
Seven Brothers Painting, Inc. 50805 Rizzo Shelby Twp., MI 48315 PH: (586) 323-7054 FX: (586) 323-2431 Contact: Tony Vushej	Division 1 Section 07 92 00 Section 07 91 00	PROPOSAL A: Selective Demolition General Requirements Joint Sealants Painting	NOTED	
		Base Bid Amount		\$296,823
		Churchill High School Total		\$296,823
<b>TOTAL CONTRACT AWARD FOR CHURCHILL HIGH SCHOOL ADDITION AND RENOVATION:</b>				<b>\$296,823</b>