

**Bid Evaluation Matrix**

<b>CESC Evaluation</b>							
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Points Available</b>	<b>ISI</b>	<b>Call One</b>	<b>NIU</b>	<b>Comcast</b>	<b>AT&amp;T</b>	
Price of eligible products and services	30	30	20	25	15	10	10
Prior experience/recommendations	20	20	14	18	20	-	-
Diversity of service path (to NETPOP)	20	20	-	20	20	-	-
Prices for ineligible services, products, and fees	15	15	-	15	15	-	-
Quality / Completeness of Bid	15	7	-	10	15	5	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>92</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>88</b>	<b>85</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>

<b>South Evaluation</b>							
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Points Available</b>	<b>ISI</b>	<b>Call One</b>	<b>NIU</b>	<b>Comcast</b>	<b>AT&amp;T</b>	
Price of eligible products and services	30	-	30	25	20	15	15
Prior experience/recommendations	20	-	14	18	20	-	-
Diversity of service path (to NETPOP)	20	-	20	20	20	-	20
Prices for ineligible services, products, and fees	15	-	-	15	15	-	-
Quality / Completeness of Bid	15	-	-	10	15	5	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>64</b>	<b>88</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>

1Gbps Pricing for CESC							
Pricing Responses	MRC	Term	Ext. MRC	NRC	Total Proposed Cost	Annual Cost (Normed)	
Call One - 36 month pricing*	\$ 2,770.00	36	\$ 99,720.00	\$ -	\$ 99,720.00	\$ 33,240.00	
ISI Communications**	\$ 2,100.00	36	\$ 75,600.00	\$ 6,400.00	\$ 82,000.00	\$ 27,333.33	
<del>ISI - Batavia Fiber**</del>	<del>\$ 2,000.00</del>	<del>36</del>	<del>\$ 72,000.00</del>	<del>\$ -</del>	<del>\$ 72,000.00</del>	<del>\$ 24,000.00</del>	
Comcast	\$ -	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	
AT&T	\$ 2,827.20	36	\$ 101,779.20	\$ 19,017.00	\$ 120,796.20	\$ 40,265.40	
NIU	\$ 2,250.00	36	\$ 81,000.00	\$ 7,800.00	\$ 88,800.00	\$ 29,600.00	

1Gbps Pricing for South							
Pricing Responses	MRC	Term	Ext. MRC	NRC	Total Proposed Cost	Annual Cost (Normed)	
Call One - 36 month pricing*	\$ 2,770.00	36	\$ 99,720.00	\$ -	\$ 99,720.00	\$ 33,240.00	
ISI Communications**	\$ 2,100.00	36	\$ 75,600.00	\$ 16,400.00	\$ 92,000.00	\$ 30,666.67	
<del>ISI - Batavia Fiber**</del>	<del>\$ 2,000.00</del>	<del>36</del>	<del>\$ 72,000.00</del>	<del>\$ -</del>	<del>\$ 72,000.00</del>	<del>\$ 24,000.00</del>	
Comcast	\$ 3,300.00	36	\$ 118,800.00	\$ -	\$ 118,800.00	\$ 39,600.00	
AT&T	\$ 2,827.20	36	\$ 101,779.20	\$ 97,773.00	\$ 199,552.20	\$ 66,517.40	
NIU	\$ 2,250.00	36	\$ 81,000.00	\$ 25,316.00	\$ 106,316.00	\$ 35,438.67	

Determination: Two ISPs are desired for diverse service and paths. After consideration of all proposals including customer referrals, service levels, and pricing we have rated ISI and Comcast as the preferred option for services. Comcast's additional service offering for Threat Management Services (TMS) was a differentiator as it allows for greater levels of protection than all other providers.

\* Call One's bid was not complete as we did not receive all pricing and associated charges.

\*\* ISI Communications submitted two proposals. The bid we considered uses a dedicated link with Kane County fiber used for transport. The second, identified as Batavia fiber, is not a dedicated link for transport and does not meet our requirements for service.