

227 N. Fourth Street
Geneva, Illinois 60134
630/463-3000
630/463-3020
Fax: 630/463-3029



Scott K. Ney
Director, Facility Operations

**Community Unit
School District 304**

TO: Dr. Kent Mutchler
FROM: Scott Ney
RE: 2022-23 Masonry Repairs Bid – HSS and WES
DATE: June 6, 2022

Bids were publicly posted on Thursday, May 12, 2022, in the Daily Herald.

On Wednesday, June 1, 2022 at 4:00 pm, bids were opened and read aloud for the 2022-23 HSS and WES Masonry Repairs bid.

Three (3) bidders responded. The results are shown below. The low bidder is highlighted.

The contractors submitting bids were:

April Building Services – Roselle, IL
MBB Enterprises of Chicago, Inc. – Chicago, IL
Mertes Contracting Corporation – Broadview, IL

Results are as follows:

<u>CONTRACTOR</u>	<u>Bid Bond</u>	<u>Base Bid</u>	<u>Deductive Alternate Bid #1 (HSS)</u>	<u>Unit Price #1 (Stone Sill Replacement (EA))</u>
April Building Services	X	\$162,800	\$108,200	\$2,684
MBB Enterprises of Chicago, Inc.	X	\$135,827	\$109,060	\$625
Mertes Contracting Corporation	X	\$209,374	\$175,170	\$2,300

It is my recommendation that MBB Enterprises of Chicago, Inc. be awarded the 2022 Masonry Repairs contract. The total project cost, which includes a \$9,500 Contingency Allowance, is \$135,827.



Cashman Stahler Group

June 3, 2022

Mr. Scott Ney
Director of Facility Operations
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
227 N. Fourth Street
Geneva, IL 60134

**2022 Masonry Renovations
Geneva Community Unit School District 304
Project Number: CSG765**

RE: Bid Recommendation

Scott,

I am writing in regards to the bidding for the referenced project and to recommend a bidder to you and the Board of Education. First, I would like to provide a little background regarding the project and the bidding.

Project Scope of Work

In general, the project scope of work includes window sill masonry repairs at Williamsburg Elementary School and tuckpointing and miscellaneous masonry repairs at Harrison Street Elementary School.

Bidding Approach

Bids were solicited from masonry contractors who will act as general contractors for the project. We published a bid notice for the project in the Daily Herald on Thursday, May 12, 2022.

To solicit additional interest in the project, we contacted four (4) masonry contractors that have successfully completed past projects for our firm or for the District. We also sent the bid notice to three (3) digital bidding services to which many contractors subscribe for information related to public construction projects.

Beyond the firms we contacted, three (3) additional masonry contractors requested the bid documents after seeing the bid notice published in the newspaper.

The bid documents consisted of thirteen (13) 30"x42" drawings and two hundred ninety-eight (298) pages of Specifications and contract requirements in a Project Manual. The bid documents were issued electronically on Friday, May 20, 2022 to all interested bidders and to the digital bidding services.

On Monday, May 23, 2022, we held a mandatory pre-bid meeting at Williamsburg Elementary School to review important project requirements with interested bidders and to tour the project area at Williamsburg. A total of three (3) masonry contractors attended the pre-bid meeting.

Prequalification Submittal

As part of the bid document requirements, interested bidders were required to submit prequalification documents via email to the Architect by 4:00 p.m. on Friday, May 27, 2022. A total of three (3) registered bidders submitted the required documents.

Bid Opening

On Wednesday, June 1, 2022, at 4:00 p.m., we held a public bid opening at the Coultrap Educational



Cashman Stahler Group

Services Center. By bid time, we received three (3) sealed bids and the bid opening was attended by two (2) bidders and a representative from the laborers union.

The bid form included a base bid, one (1) deductive alternate bid, and one (1) unit price as summarized below:

- 1. Base bid: All work of the Contract Documents
- 2. Deductive Alternate Bid #1: All work at Harrison Street Elementary School
- 3. Unit Price #1: Replacement stone window sills & flashing

Bid Results

We received sealed bids from the following bidders and the bids were publicly opened and read:

<u>Bidder</u>	<u>Base Bid</u>	<u>Alt. Bid #1</u>	<u>Unit Price #1</u>
April Building Services	\$162,800	(\$108,200)	\$2,684
MBB Enterprises of Chicago	\$135,827	(\$109,060)	\$625
Mertes Contracting	\$209,374	(\$175,170)	\$2,300

Comparison to Budget

The District budget for the work was Ninety-Five Thousand Dollars (\$95,000). The base bid amount also includes a Nine Thousand Five Hundred Dollar (\$9,500) Owner's Contingency Allowance to cover costs of typical unforeseen conditions.

Bid Analysis - MBB Enterprises of Chicago, Inc.

The lowest apparent bidder was MBB Enterprises of Chicago, Inc. (MBB). The Cashman Stahler Group has worked with MBB on several large and small masonry renovation projects since 2010. MBB also completed a masonry renovation last summer for the District at Geneva Middle School North and South and performed well.

They were incorporated in 1992 and have proven to be very skilled at masonry tuckpointing, brick and stone restoration, terra cotta restoration, and new masonry construction. Their firm is also a certified Women Business Enterprise in State of Illinois. Due to our positive experiences with MBB, our firm has solicited MBB's assistance in cost estimating for masonry restoration projects.

MBB's bonding capabilities are \$7,000,000 for a single project or \$15,000,000 aggregate. That speaks to the size of their firm and their project capabilities. MBB has averaged over \$19,200,000 in annual construction over the last five years.

Safety is critical on all projects and a firm's low insurance experience modification rating (EMR) typically reflects the success of the firm's safety programs. An EMR of 1.0 is considered the industry average. MBB has a current EMR of 0.62. That is an excellent rating and should reflect a successful safety program at their firm.

Regarding project experience with MBB Enterprises of Chicago, the Cashman Stahler Group has over 20-years of excellent experience with the firm. Below is a partial listing of our project experience with MBB Enterprises:

- 2010, at New Trier High School' Winnetka Campus, MBB completed a complicated tuckpointing and face brick and cut stone masonry restoration with a total cost exceeding \$1,056,000. The work was completed during a 50-work-day summer break. This was our firm's first experience with MBB and the project went very well. That project reflected a change in MBB's business



Cashman Stahler Group

- approach when they started to pursue more suburban work instead of focusing solely on the work in Chicago.
- In 2012, at New Trier's Winnetka Camps, MBB was a subcontractor to Auburn Corporation on a window replacement & masonry restoration project at the 1927 Gates Gymnasium. They completed \$19,500 of difficult window lintel replacements on the project to support the window replacement.
 - In 2015, MBB completed a \$163,978 masonry restoration project at the historic 1922 Egyptian Revival Reebie Storage Warehouse in Lincolnpark involving complicated terra cotta restoration. The building is on the National Register of Historic Places and is a designated Chicago Landmark. This was a very technically challenging project since the work had to meet the highest standards to the historic nature of the building.
 - In 2021, MBB completed a \$49,480 masonry renovation project at Geneva Middle School North and Geneva Middle School South repairing a masonry pier, replacing cast stone window sills, and other miscellaneous masonry repairs.

On Thursday, June 2, 2022, we conducted a telephone bid review meeting with Michael Schwall, Vice President, of MBB Enterprises of Chicago. We reviewed their submitted bid and the overall scope of work. MBB had no reservations about their bid and welcomed the opportunity to work again with Geneva CUSD 304.

Recommendation

In conclusion, we believe MBB Enterprises of Chicago, Inc. has included all the required work in their bid and are a highly qualified masonry contractor that should perform well on the District's masonry renovation work this summer.

The Cashman Stahler Group recommends that the Geneva Community Unit School District 304 Board of Education award an Owner-Contractor Agreement to **MBB Enterprises of Chicago, Inc.** for the Work indicated in the Contract Documents for a Contract Sum of **One Hundred Thirty-Five Thousand Eight Hundred Twenty-Seven Dollars and Zero Cents (\$135,827.00)**.

If you have any questions or comments, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

CASHMAN STAHLER GROUP, INC.

Stephen J. Cashman, AIA, LEED AP BD+C
Principal Architect

cc: Project File
Attachments: None