April 28, 2017

Mr. Phillip Francis Director of Operations Livonia Public Schools 15125 Farmington Road Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects

Contract Award Recommendation for 2017 Pavement Replacement Projects

**Buchanan Elementary School** 

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Project listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend a Prime Contractor firm for this Project.

In April 2017, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On April 27, 2017, three (3) bid proposals were received for the Project, and over the next two days were reviewed to determine budget implications. Interviews were conducted on April 28th and were attended by representatives from NTH Consultants, PMC, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending Nagle Paving Company for contract award at Buchanan Elementary School. The recommendation includes the acceptance of their Voluntary Alternate. Including hard construction of \$219,290.00 (\$223,790.00 base bid less \$4,500.00 voluntary alternate savings) and construction contingency of \$32,894.00, the total Project award recommendation equals \$252,184.00.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2007 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district's legal counsel.

Mr. Phillip Francis
Livonia Public Schools
April 28, 2017
Page 2

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at scott.smith@plantemoran.com.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

Scott Smith, LEED AP Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary

NTH Recommendation Letter

**Bid Tabulation** 



## **BUCHANAN PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT - COST SUMMARY**

	Hard Construction							
Building	Budget		Actual	Variance				
Buchanan Elementary	\$ 250,000	\$	219,290	\$	30,710			
				\$	-			
Totals	\$ 250,000	\$	219,290	\$	30,710			

	Construction Contingency (15%)						
Building	Budget		Actual		Variance		
Buchanan Elementary	\$ 37,500	\$	32,894	\$	4,607		
	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-		
Totals	\$ 37,500	\$	32,894	\$	4,607		

	Total Project Costs						
Building	Budget		Actual	Variance			
Buchanan Elementary	\$ 287,500	\$	252,184	\$	35,317		
	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-		
Totals	\$ 287,500	\$	252,184	\$	35,317		





41780 Six Mile Road Northville, MI 48168 Phone: 248-553-6300 Fax: 248-324-5179

Mr. Phillip Francis Director of Operations Livonia Public Schools 15125 Farmington Road Livonia, Michigan 48154 April 28, 2017 NTH Project No. 62-160382-1703

RE: 2017 Livonia Public Schools Paving Program – Buchanan Pavements
Contractor Award Recommendation
Buchanan Elementary School
City of Livonia, Wayne County, Michigan

Dear Mr. Francis,

Per our discussion and review of the Contractor's bids received, we have reviewed the Contractors' bid totals for the referenced project. Based on our review the bids; specifically, the total bid to complete the work and the proposed contractor schedules and we recommend Livonia Public Schools retain Nagle Paving Company for the 2017 Buchanan Pavement Improvement Project. According Nagle's quote, the total construction contract amount should be \$219,290.00, including an accepted alternate. However, we recommend maintaining some contingency funds for the project on the order of 15 percent (\$33,000) for unforeseen conditions that may be encountered.

Should you have any questions or need additional information regarding the project scope or budget, feel free to contact John Stadnicar at (248) 662-2730 (direct line).

Sincerely,

NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Anita R. Phillips, EIT Assistant Project Engineer

Conto R. Phillips

John B. Stadnicar, P.E. Senior Vice President

ARP/JBS/mam

cc: Paul Theriault, P.E., LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa

Scott Smith, LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa

Recorded by: Anita Phillips

Witnessed by: Harry Lau



**Proposal: Buchanan Elementary Pavement Replacement** 

Location: Livonia Administrative Offices

Date: April 27, 2017

Contractor Name	Bid Security	Addendum Acknowledge	EOE	Fam. Dis.	Iran	Ва	se Bid Amounts	Comments / Voluntary Alternates
Nagle Paving	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$	223,790	Voluntary Alternate: Use Tufftrack in lieu of Geoblock (\$4,500.00)
Best Asphalt	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$	265,000	
Pavex	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	\$	282,000	