



Real Estate Consultants

Plante Moran Cresa, LLC  
3000 Town Center, Suite 100  
Southfield, MI 48075  
Tel: 248.223.3500 | Fax: 248.223.3150  
pmcresa.com

February 11, 2022

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Asst. Superintendent of District Services  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for Construction Bids  
Stevenson HS Tennis Court Replacement

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Project listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, Foresite Design, Inc., LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractors for these Projects.

On January 26, 2022, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On February 9, 2022, twelve (12) bid proposals for two (2) bid categories were received for the Project and were subsequently reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on February 10, 2022 and were attended by representatives from Foresite Design, PMC, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending the firms listed in Foresite Design's letter dated February 10, 2022.

The recommendation includes the acceptance of Alternate 2 (Add \$21,218.00) and Alternate 4 (Add \$18,658.00) as further described in Foresite's recommendation letter.

Including hard construction of \$898,137.00 and construction contingency of \$71,851.00, this Project award recommendation equals \$969,988.00.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at [brian.weber@plantemoran.com](mailto:brian.weber@plantemoran.com).

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Brian Weber  
Vice President

Enclosures:     Budget Summary  
                  Foresite Design, Inc. Recommendation Letter  
                  Bid Tabulation



SINKING FUND - STEVENSON HS TENNIS COURT REPLACEMENT  
CONSTRUCTION BUDGET SUMMARY

	<b>Hard Construction</b>		
<b>Buildings</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Stevenson HS - Tennis	\$ 700,000	\$ 898,137	\$ (198,137)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 700,000</b>	<b>\$ 898,137</b>	<b>\$ (198,137)</b>

	<b>Construction Contingency (8%)</b>		
<b>Buildings</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Stevenson HS - Tennis	\$ 70,000	\$ 71,851	\$ (1,851)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 70,000</b>	<b>\$ 71,851</b>	<b>\$ (1,851)</b>

	<b>Total Project Costs</b>		
<b>Buildings</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Stevenson HS - Tennis	\$ 770,000	\$ 969,988	\$ (199,988)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 770,000</b>	<b>\$ 969,988</b>	<b>\$ (199,988)</b>

February 10, 2022

Philip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia Public Schools  
Stevenson High School – 2022 Tennis Renovations  
Letter of Recommendation

Dear Mr. Francis,

Enclosed, for your review, is a tabulation sheet of the bids submitted on February 9, 2022, for the Livonia Public Schools – Stevenson High Schools 2022 Tennis Renovations. Proposals were separated into two bid categories, which we received a total of twelve bids.

Post Bid Interviews were conducted with the apparent low bidders on February 10th, 2022. Our recommendations for award to the lowest responsible bidders are as follows:

**Proposal A Site Work:**

We recommend **Nagle Paving Company** of Novi, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal A Site Work for the contract sum of **\$733,960.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Proposal A Base Bid:	\$ 733,960.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 733,960.00</b>

**Proposal B Fencing:**

We recommend **RMD Holdings d/b/a Nationwide Construction Group** of Richmond, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal B Fencing for the contract sum of **\$164,177.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Proposal B Base Bid:	\$ 124,301.00
Alternate 2 – Black vinyl fence in lieu of galvanized:	\$ 21,218.00
Alternate 4 – Furnish & install new steel bollards:	\$ 18,658.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 164,177.00</b>

- The vendor recommended for award was not the “as-read” low bidder for this category, however the recommended Contract Sum is based on the acceptance of two alternates which include installation of black vinyl chainlink fence and furnishing & installing new steel bollards. We feel these additions would greatly enhance the aesthetics of the site and also provide additional durability of the chainlink fence.



**The total amount recommended for award is as follows:**

<b>Nagle Paving Company</b>	<b>\$ 733,960.00</b>
<b><u>RMD Holdings d/b/a Nationwide Construction Group</u></b>	<b><u>\$ 164,177.00</u></b>
<b><u>Recommended Project Total</u></b>	<b><u>\$ 898,137.00</u></b>

Please advise our office of additional information that may be required from the recommended Contractor(s) so that we may secure on your behalf for presentation at the next Board of Education meeting.

If you have any questions or concerns pertaining to this information, please do not hesitate to contact our office.

Sincerely,

FORESITE DESIGN, INC.



Michael Sims

MDS/cao

Encl : (2)



**Livonia Public Schools  
Stevenson High School  
Tennis Court Reconstruction 2022**

Bids Due: 02/09/22 @ 12:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADD. #1		ADD. #2		Proposal A - Site Work						
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	Alt #1: PT Concrete	Alt #2: Black Vinyl Fence	Alt #3: Reuse Stone Base	Alt #4: New Bollards	Alt #5: Prem. Asphalt Mix	REMARKS
<b>Nagle Paving Company</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$733,960.00</b>	No Bid	-	<b>-\$30,000.00</b>	<b>\$35,000.00</b>	<b>\$220,000.00</b>	
T&M Asphalt Paving Company	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$850,222.00	No Bid	-	-\$60,000.00	\$7,000.00	No Bid	
Best Asphalt, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$858,000.00	\$506,000.00	-	-\$65,000.00	\$12,000.00	N/C	
Asphalt Specialists	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$900,000.00	No Bid	-	-\$72,000.00	\$29,000.00	N/C	
WCI Contractors	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$1,157,400.00	\$6,200.00	-	-\$28,200.00	\$11,900.00	\$19,900.00	

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder



**Livonia Public Schools  
Stevenson High School  
Tennis Court Reconstruction 2022**

Bids Due: 02/09/22 @ 12:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		ADD. #1		ADD. #2		Proposal B - Fencing						
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	Alt #1: PT Concrete	Alt #2: Black Vinyl Fence	Alt #3: Reuse Stone Base	Alt #4: New Bollards	Alt #5: Prem. Asphalt Mix	REMARKS
<b>Motor City Fence</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$116,047.00</b>	<b>-\$1,225.00</b>	<b>\$32,113.00</b>	-	<b>\$19,783.00</b>	-	
Action Traffic Maintenance	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$123,430.00	\$1,470.00	\$17,640.00	-	\$33,000.00	-	
RMD Holdings, Ltd. (d/b/a Nationwide Cons. Group)	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$124,301.00	\$2,667.00	\$21,218.00	-	\$18,658.00	-	
Future Fence Company	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$133,560.00	\$1,628.00	\$30,702.00	-	\$21,870.00	-	(2) remarks included pertaining to Alt. 1 & Alt. 4
Michigan Fence Outlet	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$143,700.00	\$3,200.00	\$37,370.00	-	\$21,210.00	-	
American Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$147,955.00	\$8,529.00	\$37,099.00	-	\$24,065.00	-	
Shamrock Fence Company	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$209,900.00	-	\$45,270.00	-	No Bid	-	

**\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder**

