



**LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
AWARD RECOMMENDATIONS
JUNE 07, 2021**

Table of Contents

- A. 2021 Bond Program – Architectural/Engineering (A/E) Design Services**
1. Plante Moran Cresa Award Recommendation Letter – Project #1
 2. Plante Moran Cresa Award Recommendation Letter – Project #2
 3. A/E Proposal Summary
 4. Criteria Based Selection Scoring Summary



June 7, 2021

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: 2021 Bond Program
Architectural/Engineering Design Services Recommendation
Project #1 – Renovations to Existing Facilities and Air Conditioning Upgrades

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of professional architectural/engineering (A/E) design firms for a portion of the 2021 Bond Program. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, LPS administration and staff, and district legal counsel (the Project Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for Project #1 – Renovations to Existing Facilities and Air Conditioning Upgrades.

SELECTION PROCESS

On May 11, 2021, RFP documents were formally issued to five (5) selected firms previously reviewed by the LPS Board of Education. A pre-proposal meeting was held on May 13, 2021, with all invited firms in attendance. Proposals were received from all invited firms on May 26, 2021, and over the ensuing days were reviewed by the Project Team.

The Project Team utilized a criteria-based selection (CBS) process to evaluate each A/E design firm's RFP responses. The CBS process used pre-established and weighted criteria to evaluate the proposals to objectively shortlist two (2) A/E design firms for interviews. Criteria such as relevant experience, proposed staff and team experience, firm approach to the project, and proposed fee were evaluated.

The Project Team conducted interviews with these two (2) firms on June 2, 2021, and a follow-up meeting with French Associates, Inc., on June 3, 2021. Upon completion of the interviews and after subsequent discussion, the Project Team completed the CBS scoring process.

RECOMMENDATION

The Project Team recommends awarding the A/E design services contract for Project #1 – Renovations to Existing Facilities and Air Conditioning Upgrades for the 2021 Bond Program to **French Associates, Inc.**, pending final review of terms by district legal counsel. The recommendation doesn't include Alternate #1 – Furniture Consultant Services nor Alternate #2 – Increased Professional Liability Insurance Policy Limits. Both items will be reviewed by the Project Team at a later date.

The total contract award recommendation is \$4,484,980.00 and is further defined as follows:

\$4,418,700.00	Fixed Lump-Sum Fee (approximately 5.0%)
\$66,280.00	Not-to-Exceed Reimbursables
<hr/>	<hr/>
\$4,484,980.00	Total Contract Award Recommendation

The A/E fee will be a fixed lump-sum amount based upon the scope, budget, and timeline established in the RFP. The reimbursables are a not-to-exceed amount and will be billed as incurred.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at 248-675-9812 or brian.weber@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,
PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Brian Weber
Owner Representative



Paul Theriault
Owner Representative

CC: Dana Abrahams, Clark Hill
Attachments: A/E Proposal Summary
CBS Scoring Summary



June 7, 2021

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: 2021 Bond Program
Architectural/Engineering Design Services Recommendation
Project #2 – Additions & Renovations to the Robotics Programs and Early Childhood Center

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of professional architectural/engineering (A/E) design firms for a portion of the 2021 Bond Program. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, LPS administration and staff, and district legal counsel (the Project Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for Project #2 – Additions & Renovations to the Robotics Programs and Early Childhood Center.

SELECTION PROCESS

On May 11, 2021, RFP documents were formally issued to five (5) selected firms previously reviewed by the LPS Board of Education. A pre-proposal meeting was held on May 13, 2021, with all invited firms in attendance. Proposals were received from all invited firms on May 26, 2021, and over the ensuing days were reviewed by the Project Team.

The Project Team utilized a criteria-based selection (CBS) process to evaluate each A/E design firm's RFP responses. The CBS process used pre-established and weighted criteria to evaluate the proposals to objectively shortlist three (3) A/E design firms for interviews. Criteria such as relevant experience, proposed staff and team experience, firm approach to the project, and proposed fee were evaluated.

The Project Team conducted interviews with these three (3) firms on June 2, 2021. Upon completion of the interviews and after subsequent discussion, the Project Team completed the CBS scoring process.

RECOMMENDATION

The Project Team recommends awarding the A/E design services contract for Project #2 – Additions & Renovations to the Robotics Programs and Early Childhood Center for the 2021 Bond Program to **TMP Architecture, Inc.**, pending final review of terms by district legal counsel. The recommendation doesn't include Alternate #1 – Furniture Consultant Services nor Alternate #2 – Increased Professional Liability Insurance Policy Limits. Both items will be reviewed by the Project Team at a later date.

The total contract award recommendation is \$1,246,500.00 and is further defined as follows:

\$1,180,000.00	Fixed Lump-Sum Fee (approximately 6.5%)
\$66,500.00	Not-to-Exceed Reimbursables
<hr/>	<hr/>
\$1,246,500.00	Total Contract Award Recommendation

The A/E fee will be a fixed lump-sum amount based upon the scope, budget, and timeline established in the RFP. The reimbursables are a not-to-exceed amount and will be billed as incurred.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at 248-675-9812 or brian.weber@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,
PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Brian Weber
Owner Representative



Paul Theriault
Owner Representative

CC: Dana Abrahams, Clark Hill
Attachments: A/E Proposal Summary
CBS Scoring Summary



LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
CRITERIA BASED SELECTION SUMMARY
 May 27, 2021

PROJECT #1: \$88,500,000				
		Score 5 = BEST 0 = WORST		
ARCHITECT/ ENGINEER FIRM	SELECTION CRITERIA	PROPOSED		WEIGHTED SCORE
		POINTS	WEIGHT FACTOR	
French	Relevant Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4.5	0.30	1.35
	Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30
	Proposed Fees & Costs	5	0.30	1.50
	Proposal Score		1.00	4.35
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	4.35	60.00	261.00
	Interview Score	5.00	40.00	200.00
	Final Score			461.00
GMB	Relevant Experience		0.30	0.00
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience		0.30	0.00
	Project Approach		0.10	0.00
	Proposed Fees & Costs		0.30	0.00
	Proposal Score		1.00	0.00
Did not Propose	Proposal Score	0.00	60.00	0.00
	Interview Score	0.00	40.00	0.00
	Final Score			0.00
IDS	Relevant Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	3	0.30	0.90
	Project Approach	5	0.10	0.50
	Proposed Fees & Costs	2	0.30	0.60
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.20
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	3.20	60.00	192.00
	Interview Score	0.00	40.00	0.00
	Final Score			192.00
TMP	Relevant Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Project Approach	5	0.10	0.50
	Proposed Fees & Costs	2	0.30	0.60
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.50
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	3.50	60.00	210.00
	Interview Score	5.00	40.00	200.00
	Final Score			410.00
Wakely	Relevant Experience	3	0.30	0.90
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Project Approach	1	0.10	0.10
	Proposed Fees & Costs (5.33%)	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.40
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	3.40	60.00	204.00
	Interview Score	0.00	40.00	0.00
	Final Score			204.00

PROJECT #2: \$18,300,000				
		Score 5 = BEST 0 = WORST		
ARCHITECT/ ENGINEER FIRM	SELECTION CRITERIA	PROPOSED		WEIGHTED SCORE
		POINTS	WEIGHT FACTOR	
French	Relevant Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30
	Proposed Fees & Costs	5	0.30	1.50
	Proposal Score		1.00	4.20
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	4.20	60.00	252.00
	Interview Score	3.00	40.00	120.00
	Final Score			372.00
GMB	Relevant Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Project Approach	5	0.10	0.50
	Proposed Fees & Costs	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposal Score		1.00	4.10
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	4.10	60.00	246.00
	Interview Score	3.00	40.00	120.00
	Final Score			366.00
IDS	Relevant Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Project Approach	5	0.10	0.50
	Proposed Fees & Costs	1	0.30	0.30
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.20
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	3.20	60.00	192.00
	Interview Score	0.00	40.00	0.00
	Final Score			192.00
TMP	Relevant Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Project Approach	5	0.10	0.50
	Proposed Fees & Costs	2	0.30	0.60
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.50
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	3.50	60.00	210.00
	Interview Score	5.00	40.00	200.00
	Final Score			410.00
Wakely	Relevant Experience	1	0.30	0.30
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.30	1.20
	Project Approach	1	0.10	0.10
	Proposed Fees & Costs (4.85%)	5	0.30	1.50
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.10
Invited to Interview	Proposal Score	3.10	60.00	186.00
	Interview Score	0.00	40.00	0.00
	Final Score			186.00

LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
 ARCHITECTURAL/ENGINEERING DESIGN SERVICES
 2021 BOND PROGRAM
 REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS SUMMARY

Category	French Associates	GMB	Integrated Design Solutions (IDS)	TMP	Wakely	AVERAGES	
General Information							
Local Office	Rochester, MI	Royal Oak, MI	Troy, MI	Bloomfield Hills, MI	Warren, MI		
Headquarters	Rochester, MI	Holland, MI	Troy, MI	Bloomfield Hills, MI	Warren, MI		
Contact	Paul Corneliusen / Dale Jerome	Jeff Hoag	Charles Lewis	Gail Allevato	Brian Smilnak		
Notable Clients	West Bloomfield School District Grosse Pointe Public Schools Rochester Community Schools Clarenceville School District	Woodhaven-Brownstown Schools Grand Rapids Public Schools Birmingham Public Schools Ferndale Public Schools	South Lyon Community Schools Van Buren Public Schools Birmingham Public Schools University of Michigan	Novi Community School District Troy School District Farmington Public Schools Northville Public Schools	Farmington Public Schools Warren Consolidated Schools Chippewa Valley Schools Warren Woods Public Schools		
Acknowledge Addenda #01	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Acknowledge Addenda #02	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Agree to Contract Terms	Yes	Minor Issues	Minor Issues	Yes	Yes		
Familial Disclosure, Iran Sanctions, Equal Opportunity and Criminal Background Affidavits	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Proposed Fee Information							
Lump Sum Fee for Project #1 (Upgrades to Existing Facilities)	\$ 4,418,700	NA	\$ 5,740,000.00	\$ 5,745,000.00	\$ 4,719,000.00		\$ 5,155,675.00
Lump Sum Fee for Project #2 (Robotics and Early Childhood Center)	\$ 831,725	\$ 985,150.00	\$ 1,280,000.00	\$ 1,180,000.00	\$ 888,250.00		\$ 1,033,025.00
Reimbursables							
N.T.E. Allowance - Project #1	\$ 66,280	NA	\$ 66,000.00	\$ 99,500.00	\$ 686,400.00		\$ 229,545.00
N.T.E. Allowance - Project #2	\$ 12,475	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 23,000.00	\$ 66,500.00	\$ 129,200.00	\$ 59,235.00	
Total Proposed Fee including Reimbursables - Project #1	\$ 4,484,980	NA	\$ 5,806,000.00	\$ 5,844,500.00	\$ 5,405,400.00	\$ 5,385,220.00	
Total Proposed Fee including Reimbursables - Project #2	\$ 844,200	\$ 1,050,150.00	\$ 1,303,000.00	\$ 1,246,500.00	\$ 1,017,450.00	\$ 1,092,260.00	
Change in Scope Fee %	5.15%	6.10%	6.75%	6.50%	0.00%	4.90%	
Historical Errors & Omissions	1.50%	0.75%	2.00%	1.80%	2.50%	1.71%	
Subconsultants Mark-up %	20%	0%	10%	10%	2%	8.40%	
Fee Percentage							
Base Bid AE Fee Percentage of Budget - Project #1	4.99%	NA	6.49%	6.49%	5.33%	5.83%	
AE Fee Percentage of Budget w/ Reimbursables - Project #1	5.07%	NA	6.56%	6.60%	6.11%	6.08%	
Base Bid AE Fee Percentage of Budget - Project #2	4.54%	5.38%	6.99%	6.45%	4.85%	5.64%	
AE Fee Percentage of Budget w/ Reimbursables - Project #2	4.61%	5.74%	7.12%	6.81%	5.56%	5.97%	
Team							
Mechanical/Electrical Engineering - Project #1	United Building Systems Eng.	N/A	IDS	Peter Basso	United Building Systems Eng.		
Mechanical/Electrical Engineering - Project #2	Strategic Engineering Solutions	GMB	IDS	Peter Basso	United Building Systems Eng.		
Structural Engineering	Shymanski	GMB	SDI	Kibbe	Anderson Eckstein & Westrick		
Civil Engineering	Spalding DeDecker	GMB	Spalding DeDecker	Spalding DeDecker	Spalding DeDecker		
Interior Design	French Associates	GMB	IDS	TMP	Interior Image, Inc.		
Food Service Consultant	Cii Foodservice Design	TBD	E.F. Whitney Design	TBD	E.F. Whitney Design		
Pool Consultant	TBD	N/A	Counsilmun Hunsaker	Counsilmun Hunsaker	Aquatic Source		
Landscaping	Spalding DeDecker	GMB	Spalding DeDecker	Spalding DeDecker	Spalding DeDecker		
Insurance Information							
General Liability Limit (Occurrence/Aggregate)	\$1M/\$2M	\$1M/\$2M	\$1M/\$2M	\$1M/\$2M	\$1M/\$2M		
Automobile Liability Limit	\$2M	\$2M	\$2M	\$2M	\$2M		
Umbrella Liability Limit	\$5M	\$5M	\$5M	\$5M	\$5M		
Professional Liability Limits	\$3M/\$5M	\$5M/\$5M	\$2M/\$4M	\$2M/\$4M	\$2M/\$4M		
Alternates							
Alt #1: Provide Furniture Consulting Services	5.15%	6.50%	6.75%	4.75%	TBD		
Alt #1: Increase Professional Liability Limits to \$5M/\$5M	\$5,000/Year	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$8,500/Year	TBD		
Notes							
			An opportunity was provided to IDS to clarify their fee based on the accurate Cost of the Work values. The revised values were used in the team's analysis.	1. Savings of \$125K offered if awarded both projects. 2. Savings offered (undefined) if a previously designed ECC is adapted.			