



March 10, 2018

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for Athletic Field Improvements  
Churchill High School / Stevenson High School (turf only) / Franklin High School (turf only)

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, Foresite Design, Inc., LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractor firms for these Projects.

On February 19, 2018, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On March 6, 2018, seventeen (17) bid proposals for five (5) bid categories were received for the Project, and over the next several days were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on March 8<sup>th</sup>, 2018 and were attended by representatives from Foresite Design, Inc., PMC, and LPS. The scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and discussed.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending the firms listed in Foresite Design's letter dated March 9, 2018. The recommendation is to award four of the five bid categories only. The Team is not recommending award of the softball dugout work at Churchill High School at this time due to bid costs and inconsistencies in pricing. The Team will revisit the design and construction timeline for the dugouts and look to rebid this work at a later date. It should also be clarified that this recommendation includes only the turf work for Stevenson High School and Franklin High School for the football, baseball, and softball fields. That work will be completed in 2019. This was done to lock in pricing as well as maintain a consistent turf vendor within the district.

The recommendation also includes the acceptance of several bid alternates as well as voluntary alternates proposed by the recommended turf contractor. The accepted base bid alternates total a net add of \$252,627.68. The accepted voluntary alternates total a net credit of <\$27,334.00>.

- Sitework Contractor
  - o Alternate A-1 – Prepare D-Zone for Turf, Pavement Replacement at Concessions, Long Jump Work
- Turf Contractor
  - o Alternate B-1 – Infill D-Zone w/ Turf
  - o Voluntary Alternate #1 – Alternate Shock Pad at Football Field at all 3 schools
  - o Voluntary Alternate #2 – Alternate Shock Pad at D-Zone at all 3 schools
  - o Voluntary Alternate #3 – Alternate Turf w/ Root Zone at Football Field at all 3 schools
  - o Voluntary Alternate #4 – Alternate Turf w/ Root Zone at D-Zone at all 3 schools
- Fencing Contractor
  - o Alternate C-1 – Upgrade 8' Fence to Vinyl Coating
  - o Alternate C-2 – Replace 4' Fence with Vinyl Coating

Including hard construction of \$2,945,122.68 and construction contingency of \$131,581.00 (8% of Churchill work only), the total Project award recommendation equals \$3,076,703.68.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2007 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at [scott.smith@plantemoran.com](mailto:scott.smith@plantemoran.com).

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP  
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary  
Foresite Design, Inc. Recommendation Letter  
Bid Tabulation



**ATHLETIC FIELD IMPROVEMENTS - COST SUMMARY**

	Hard Construction		
<b>Building</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Churchill High School	\$ 1,344,705	\$ 1,644,765	\$ (300,060)
Stevenson High School	\$ 739,820	\$ 648,907	\$ 90,913
Franklin High School	\$ 745,538	\$ 651,450	\$ 94,088
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 2,830,063</b>	<b>\$ 2,945,123</b>	<b>\$ (115,060)</b>

	Construction Contingency (8%)		
<b>Building</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Churchill High School	\$ 107,576	\$ 131,581	\$ (24,005)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 107,576</b>	<b>\$ 131,581</b>	<b>\$ (24,005)</b>

	Total Project Costs		
<b>Building</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Churchill / Franklin / Stevenson	\$ 2,937,639	\$ 3,076,704	\$ (139,064)
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 2,937,639</b>	<b>\$ 3,076,704</b>	<b>\$ (139,064)</b>

\*\*\* Construction Contingency was calculated at 8% of Churchill High School work only. Construction contingency at Franklin High School and Stevenson High School will be computed and established once remaining awards are finalized

March 9, 2018

Philip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia Public Schools  
Churchill High School - Athletic Renovations 2018  
Letter of Recommendation

Dear Mr. Francis,

Enclosed, for your review, is a tabulation sheet of the bids submitted on March 6, 2018 for the Livonia Public Schools – Churchill High School Athletic Renovations - 2018. Proposals were separated into five bid categories, which we received a total of seventeen bids.

Post Bid Interviews were conducted with the apparent low bidders on March 9, 2018. Our recommendations for award to the lowest responsible bidders are as follows:

**Proposal A Site Work:**

We recommend **Cortis Brothers Trucking and Excavating** of Marine City, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal A Site Work for the contract sum of **\$778,700.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Base Bid:	\$665,000.00
Alternate A-1: Prepare d-zone for turf	\$113,700.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$778,700.00</b>

**Proposal B Synthetic Turf:**

We recommend **Astroturf Corporation** of Sharpsburg, Pennsylvania to complete the work as identified in Proposal B Synthetic Turf for the contract sum of **\$2,007,892.68**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Base Bid:	\$1,945,357.00
Alternate B-1: New turf in south d-zone	\$ 89,869.68
Voluntary Alt. #1: Alternate pad at football	( \$ 74,726.00)
Voluntary Alt. #2: Alternate pad in d-zone	( \$ 9,314.00)
Voluntary Alt. #3: Root zone turf at stadiums	\$ 48,876.00
Voluntary Alt. #4: Roof zone turf at d-zones	\$ 7,830.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,007,892.68</b>

- The Contract Sum is based on the acceptance of four voluntary alternates which offer an improved turf system and locally sourced performance shock pad. The alternate turf system features a rootzone material which allows for infill to be retained in place and offers superior performance for the athletes. The alternate performance shock pad is manufactured in Coldwater, Michigan and consists of closed cell polyethylene foam offering long term stability, sustainability and safety benefits desired for the highest performing student athletes.



**Proposal C Fencing:**

We recommend **Jaffco, Inc.** of Rochester Hills, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal C Fencing for the contract sum of **\$82,530.00**. The contract sum is based on the following breakdown:

Base Bid:	\$ 33,472.00
Alternate C-1: Upgrade 8' fence to black vinyl	\$ 16,658.00
Alternate C-2: New 4' black vinyl fence at track	\$ 32,400.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 82,530.00</b>

- The Contract Sum is based on the acceptance of two alternates which would replace the 8' perimeter and 4' track fencing with new black vinyl chainlink fencing. We feel this addition enhances the aesthetics of the site and durability of the chainlink fence.

**Proposal D Track Surface:**

We recommend **Star Trac Enterprise** of Southfield, Michigan to complete the work as identified in Proposal D Track Surface for the contract sum of **\$76,000.00**. There were no alternates incorporated within the bidding documents nor did the Contractor provide any Voluntary Alternates.

**Proposal E Dugout Construction**

Two bids were received ranging from \$158,777.00 to 329,000.00. Due to the wide spread of costs, we would not recommend award of this Bid Category.

**The total amount recommended for award is as follows:**

<b>Cortis Brothers Trucking &amp; Excavating</b>	<b>\$ 778,700.00</b>
<b>Astroturf Corporation</b>	<b>\$ 2,007,892.68</b>
<b>Jaffco, Inc.</b>	<b>\$ 82,530.00</b>
<b>Star Trac Enterprise</b>	<b>\$ 76,000.00</b>
<b>Recommended Project Total</b>	<b>\$ 2,945,122.68</b>

I have enclosed a Project Tabulation as well for record. Please advise our office of additional information that may be required from the recommended Contractor(s) so that we may secure on your behalf for presentation at the next Board of Education meeting.

If you have any questions or concerns pertaining to this information, please do not hesitate to contact our office.

Sincerely,

FORESITE DESIGN, INC.



Bruce Lemons, RLA



Michael Sims

BSL/mds

Encl : (6)



**Livonia Public Schools  
Churchill High School  
Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 03/06/18 @ 1:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		EQUAL OPPOR		ADDENDUM #1		ADDENDUM #2		Proposal A - Site Work		
													BASE BID	Alternate A-1 <i>Prepare D-zone for turf; etc</i>	REMARKS
														ADD	
<b>Cortis Brothers Trucking and Excavation, Inc</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$665,000.00</b>	<b>\$113,700.00</b>	<b>Clarifications included</b>
Brix Corporation	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$1,236,000.00	\$147,000.00	Combo Bid Categories A+E = 1,565,000 Voluntary Alternates (2) Clarifications provided
Cross Renovation, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		\$173,674.00	Combo Bid Categories A-E = \$3,508,269.00 Voluntary Alternate (1)
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N			

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder



**Livonia Public Schools  
Churchill High School  
Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 03/06/18 @ 1:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		EQUAL OPPOR		ADDENDUM #1		ADDENDUM #2		Proposal B - Synthetic Turf				
	BASE BID	Alternate B-1 <i>Turf in D-zones</i> ADD	Alternate B-2 <i>Unified lax tick marks</i> ADD	Alternate B-3 <i>Unified lax lines</i> ADD	REMARKS												
<b>Astroturf Corporation</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$1,945,357.00</b>	<b>\$89,869.68</b>	<b>\$13,986.00</b>	<b>\$31,686.00</b>	Voluntary Alternates (5)
Sprinturf, LLC	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$2,116,971.00	\$105,293.00	\$9,633.00	\$17,762.00	
A-turf, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$2,122,205.00	\$162,900.00	\$12,500.00	\$21,700.00	Voluntary Alternates (1)
Shaw Sports Turf	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$2,132,666.00	\$133,753.00	\$10,728.00	\$58,212.00	Voluntary Alternates (3)
Hellas Construction, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$2,179,732.00	\$200,407.00	\$3,402.00	\$33,843.00	
Cross Renovation, Inc.	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$2,284,548.00	\$175,475.00	\$13,534.00	\$23,380.00	Voluntary Alternates (1)
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N					
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N					
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N					

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder



**Livonia Public Schools  
Churchill High School  
Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 03/06/18 @ 1:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		EQUAL OPPOR		ADDENDUM #1		ADDENDUM #2		Proposal C - Fencing				
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	Alternate C-1 <i>Black vinyl 8' in lieu of galvanized</i> ADD	Alternate C-2 <i>Replace 4' CL with Black Vinyl CL</i> ADD	Alternate C-3 <i>Replace 4' CL with new galvanized CL</i> ADD	Alternate C-4 <i>Replace west perimeter 8' CL &amp; 12' double gate</i> ADD
<b>Jaffco Inc.</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$33,472.00</b>	<b>\$16,658.00</b>	<b>\$32,400.00</b>	<b>\$26,000.00</b>	<b>\$20,592.00</b>
Action Traffic Maintenance	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$41,575.00	\$11,755.00	\$50,625.00	\$35,738.00	\$22,144.00
RMD Holdings dba Nationwide Construction Group	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$43,574.00	\$7,933.00	\$38,655.00	\$31,337.00	\$24,529.00
Michigan Fence Outlet	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$46,400.00	\$17,988.00	\$35,160.00	\$24,925.00	\$22,410.00
Shamrock Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$56,850.00	\$37,850.00	\$37,475.00	\$31,970.00	\$23,750.00
American Fence	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$57,311.00	\$8,041.00	\$53,995.00	-\$4,375.00	\$37,587.00
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N					
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N					
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N					

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder





**Livonia Public Schools  
Churchill High School  
Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 03/06/18 @ 1:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SECURITY		IRAN ECONOMIC SANCTION DOCUMENT		FAMILIAL DSCL.		EQUAL OPPOR		ADDENDUM #1		ADDENDUM #2		Proposal D - Track Surface	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	REMARKS
<b>Star Trac Enterprise</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$76,000.00</b>	
Goddard Coatings	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$82,290.00	
All-American Tracks	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$98,777.00	
Dynamic Sports Construction	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$130,132.00	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder



**Livonia Public Schools  
Churchill High School  
Athletic Improvements 2018**

Bids Due: 03/06/18 @ 1:00 P.M.

BIDDER:	BID SEC		IRAN ECON SANC DOC		FAMILI DSCL.		EQUAL OPPOR		ADDEND. #1		ADDEND. #2		Proposal E - Dugouts	
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	BASE BID	REMARKS
<b>Cross Renovation, Inc.</b>	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	<b>\$158,777.00</b>	Combo Bid for Categories A-E = \$3,508,269.00
Brix Corporation	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	\$329,000.00	Combo Bid Categories A+E = 1,565,000 Voluntary Alternates (2) Clarifications provided
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		
	BB	CC	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N		

\*\*Bold Indicates Apparent Low Bidder

