

616 S. Coppel Rd.
Coppell, TX 75019



Phone (214) 758-0785
Fax (214) 792-9548

October 10, 2017

Mr. David Morris
Ector County ISD
802 N. Sam Houston
Odessa, TX 79761

EM: David.Morris2@ectorcountyisd.org

RE: Award Recommendation
ECISD – Blackshear Elementary Magnet School
CCG 2-158-2

Dear Mr. Morris:

Bids were received for the referenced project on October 3, 2017. Six (6) contractors submitted bids as outlined below.

CONTRACTOR	BID AMOUNT <i>(Including Owner's Contingency)</i>
CS Advantage	\$1,725,000.00
Lydick Hooks Roofing	\$1,994,583.00
QA Roofing Inc.	\$1,749,900.00
Klein Roofing	\$1,273,000.00
Wallace Construction	\$1,522,464.00
Tecta America	\$2,153,300.00

Exhibit No. 1 includes the completed Bid Tabulation. Klein Roofing submitted the lowest bid. However, multiple areas of concern were noted. The following items were noted on the bid submitted by Klein Roofing:

1. Missing Square Footage on Bid Form
2. Calculation Error on Bid Form
3. Missing Unit Pricing on Bid Form for Two (2) Items
4. Conflicting Subcontractors Listed
5. No Subcontractor Listed for Roofing (during conversations with Klein Roofing, it was indicated that all work is performed by 1099 contractors – no employees)
6. Inadequate Automobile Insurance (does not meet ECISD's minimum requirements)
7. Missing Felony Conviction Form
8. AIA Contractor's Qualification Statement (not submitted on proper form)
9. Missing Anti-Trust Form

10. Missing W-9 Form

11. Bonding Capacity (Maximum bonding capacity lists \$2.5 million aggregate. With this bid at \$1.27 million, attempted to verify outstanding bonds. Unable to reach bonding agent for verification.)

Crenshaw Consulting Group, LLC (CCG) has not worked with Klein Roofing and has no knowledge of their work history or performance. While Klein Roofing is the low bidder, CCG is concerned with their ability to successfully complete a project of this scope and size and to comply with the requirements of a public project of this type considering their difficulty in completing and submitting a responsive bid.

CCG recommends award to Wallace Construction in the amount of \$1,522,464.00 (including Owner's Contingency) for the base bid. Upon approval, CCG will prepare contracts between the ECISD and Wallace Construction. If you have any questions, please call. Thank you.

Respectfully,



Vickie Crenshaw, P.E., RRC, RRO
President

VAC/ml

Enclosure

EXHIBIT 1

		CONTRACTOR NAME: CS Advantage		CONTRACTOR NAME: Lydick Hooks		CONTRACTOR NAME: QA Roofing Inc.	
AREA	SQ FT	COST	SQ FT	COST	SQ FT	COST	
Remove & Replace Roof, Areas 1-38		\$1,665,000.00	118,572	\$1,969,583.00		\$1,684,500.00	
Comb HVAC Coils, 49 EA.		\$20,000.00		-		\$29,900.00	
R & R Power Vent Domes, 25 EA.		\$15,000.00		-		\$10,500.00	
SUBTOTAL		\$1,700,000.00		\$1,969,583.00		\$1,724,900.00	
Owner's Contingency		\$25,000.00		\$25,000.00		\$25,000.00	
TOTAL		\$1,725,000.00	118,572	\$1,994,583.00		\$1,749,900.00	
Construction Duration of 120 Calendar Days:		ACCEPT	ACCEPT	ACCEPT	ACCEPT	ACCEPT	
UNIT PRICES							
Metal Deck Repair (Overlay) (Corrugated)		\$ 10.00 /SF		\$ 6.00 /SF		\$ 8.00 /SF	
Metal Deck Replacement (Corrugated)		\$ 10.00 /SF		\$ 8.00 /SF		\$ 12.00 /SF	
Metal Deck Repair (Overlay) (Type B)		\$ 10.00 /SF		\$ 10.00 /SF		\$ 8.00 /SF	
Metal Deck Replacement (Type B)		\$ 10.00 /SF		\$ 15.00 /SF		\$ 12.00 /SF	
Gypsum Deck Repair		\$ 10.00 /SF		- /SF		\$ 14.00 /SF	
LWIC Deck Repair		\$ 6.00 /SF		\$ 8.00 /SF		\$ 14.00 /SF	
Plywood Deck Repair		\$ 4.00 /SF		\$ 6.00 /SF		\$ 2.50 /SF	
Plywood Deck Replacement		\$ 4.00 /sheet		\$ 55.00 /sheet		\$ 100.00 /sheet	
Wood Nailers, 1 x 2		\$ 3.00 /LF		\$ 4.00 /LF		\$ 2.50 /LF	
Wood Nailers, 2 x 4		\$ 4.00 /LF		\$ 5.00 /LF		\$ 3.60 /LF	
Wood Nailers, 2 x 6		\$ 5.00 /LF		\$ 5.50 /LF		\$ 4.50 /LF	
Wood Nailers, 2 x 8		\$ 6.00 /LF		\$ 6.00 /LF		\$ 6.00 /LF	
Wood Nailers, 2 x 10		\$ 7.00 /LF		\$ 7.00 /LF		\$ 7.50 /LF	
Wood Nailers, 2 x 12		\$ 8.00 /LF		\$ 8.00 /LF		\$ 9.00 /LF	
CDX Plywood, 4 x 8 x 7/16"		\$ 120.00 /EA		\$ 55.00 /EA		\$ 100.00 /EA	
ADDENDUM ACKNOWLEDGEMENT							
Addendum #1		YES		YES		YES	
Addendum #2		YES		YES		YES	
Addendum #3		YES		YES		YES	
NUMBER OF COPIES TO BE SUBMITTED							
One (1) Original Hard Copy		YES		YES		YES	
One (1) Duplicate Hard Copy		YES		YES		YES	
One (1) Digital Copy		YES		YES		YES	
REQUIRED DOCUMENTS INCLUDED							
Bid Signature Form		YES		YES		YES	
Felony Conviction Notification		YES		YES		YES	
Conflict of Interest Form		YES		YES		YES	
ECISD Bid Offer Form		YES		YES		YES	
AIA A305 - Contractor's Qualification Stmt		YES		YES		YES	
Contractor's Qualification Affidavit		YES		YES		YES	
Subcontractor Listing		YES		YES		YES	
Anti-Trust Form		YES		YES		YES	
Bid Bond		YES		YES		YES	
Completed W-9 Form		YES		YES		YES	
Sample Certificate of Insurance		YES		YES		YES	

	CONTRACTOR NAME: Klein Roofing *		CONTRACTOR NAME: Wallace Construction		CONTRACTOR NAME: Tecta America	
AREA	SQ FT	COST	SQ FT	COST	SQ FT	COST
Remove & Replace Roof, Areas 1-38		\$1,233,200.00	103,000	\$1,480,214.00	117,300	\$2,128,300.00
Comb HVAC Coils, 49 EA.		\$9,800.00		\$12,250.00		Included Above
R & R Power Vent Domes, 25 EA.		\$5,000.00		\$5,000.00		Omit
SUBTOTAL		\$1,248,000.00		\$1,497,464.00		\$2,128,300.00
Owner's Contingency		\$25,000.00		\$25,000.00		\$25,000.00
TOTAL		\$1,273,000.00	103,000	\$1,522,464.00	117,300	\$2,153,300.00

* Klein Roofing's totals were incorrect. This document reflects the corrected totals.

Construction Duration of 120 Calendar Days:

	ACCEPT	BLANK	ACCEPT
UNIT PRICES			
Metal Deck Repair (Overlay) (Corrugated)	\$ 3.00 /SF	\$ 5.00 /SF	\$ 20.00 /SF
Metal Deck Replacement (Corrugated)	\$ 3.00 /SF	\$ 8.00 /SF	\$ 25.00 /SF
Metal Deck Repair (Overlay) (Type B)	\$ 3.00 /SF	\$ 8.00 /SF	\$ 25.00 /SF
Metal Deck Replacement (Type B)	\$ 3.00 /SF	\$ 9.00 /SF	\$ 30.00 /SF
Gypsum Deck Repair	\$ 3.00 /SF	\$ 8.00 /SF	\$ 35.00 /SF
LWIC Deck Repair	\$ 3.00 /SF	\$ 26.00 /SF	\$ 40.00 /SF
Plywood Deck Repair	\$ /SF	\$ 5.00 /SF	\$ 15.00 /SF
Plywood Deck Replacement	\$ /sheet	\$ 100.00 /sheet	\$ 20.00 /sheet
Wood Nailers, 1 x 2	\$ 2.00 /LF	\$ 3.00 /LF	\$ 6.00 /LF
Wood Nailers, 2 x 4	\$ 2.00 /LF	\$ 3.00 /LF	\$ 7.00 /LF
Wood Nailers, 2 x 6	\$ 3.00 /LF	\$ 3.50 /LF	\$ 8.00 /LF
Wood Nailers, 2 x 8	\$ 3.00 /LF	\$ 3.50 /LF	\$ 9.00 /LF
Wood Nailers, 2 x 10	\$ 3.00 /LF	\$ 4.00 /LF	\$ 10.00 /LF
Wood Nailers, 2 x 12	\$ 4.00 /LF	\$ 4.00 /LF	\$ 12.00 /LF
CDX Plywood, 4 x 8 x 7/16"	\$ 20.00 /EA	\$ 75.00 /EA	\$ 50.00 /EA

ADDENDUM ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Addendum #1	YES	YES	YES
Addendum #2	YES	YES	YES
Addendum #3	YES	NO	NO

NUMBER OF COPIES TO BE SUBMITTED

One (1) Original Hard Copy	YES	YES	YES
One (1) Duplicate Hard Copy	NO	YES	YES
One (1) Digital Copy	NO	YES	YES

REQUIRED DOCUMENTS INCLUDED

Bid Signature Form	YES	YES	YES
Felony Conviction Notification	NO	YES	YES
Conflict of Interest Form	YES	YES	YES
ECISD Bid Offer Form	YES	YES	YES
AIA A305 - Contractor's Qualification Stmt	IMPROPER FORM	YES	YES
Contractor's Qualification Affidavit	YES	YES	YES
Subcontractor Listing	YES	YES	YES
Anti-Trust Form	NO	YES	YES
Bid Bond	YES	YES	YES
Completed W-9 Form	NO	YES	YES
Sample Certificate of Insurance	YES	YES	YES