



**Library Materials Challenge Executive Report  
May 18, 2026**

**Title: *Eat Pray Love*  
Authors: Elizabeth Gilbert  
ISBN: 9780143038412**

## **Report Contents**

Timeline

Executive Summary

Supporting Review Material

Library Materials Challenge Form

Library Materials Challenge Form Additional Attachments

SLAC Library Materials Challenge Evaluation Rubrics

Board Policy

## **Timeline**

Library Materials Challenge Form Received	March 2, 2026
Board Notification	March 3, 2026
Superintendent Notification	March 3, 2026
School Library Advisory Council Notification	March 3, 2026
Campus Administration Notification	March 3, 2026
SLAC Review Process Window	March 3 - May 6, 2026
School Library Advisory Council Meeting	May 6, 2026
School Board Meeting	May 18, 2026

## Executive Summary

As communicated to the School Library Advisory Council (SLAC) on March 3, 2026, the district received a Library Materials Challenge Form for *Eat Pray Love* by Elizabeth Gilbert (ISBN: 9780143038412). In accordance with Board policy and legal requirements, the SLAC is responsible for reviewing each challenged title and making a recommendation to the Board within 90 days of receipt.

The local SLAC must consist of at least five members, with each member appointed by the board, and with each trustee appointing an equal number of members. A majority of the voting members of the SLAC must be persons who are parents of students enrolled in the district and who are not employed by the district. The SLAC also includes board appointed members who serve as nonvoting members from the following groups: teachers, librarian, school administrators, members of the business community and clergy.

To support this process, SLAC members were directed to conduct a comprehensive review of the material and provide evidence-based feedback for each title using a standardized rubric. The review process was completed within the window of March 3, 2026 - May 6, 2026. All recommendations developed by the SLAC must align with applicable federal and state laws, as well as district policies, including EFB (LEGAL), EFB (LOCAL), and EFB (EXHIBIT), which govern the selection, review, and reconsideration of library materials.

During the May 6, 2026 meeting, the SLAC formally reviewed the compiled report for this title and engaged in discussion before taking action. The SLAC members completed the Library Materials Challenge Evaluation Rubric. One voting member of the SLAC reported to have read the book, in its entirety, two voting members read part of the book. One non-voting member reported to have read the book, in its entirety.

One voting member noted that the book has "harmful material" providing supporting evidence. Two non-voting members also included supporting evidence for this book having "harmful material" meeting the definition, as stated in the rubric. One voting member cited "obscene material" providing evidence, while one non-voting member also provided supporting evidence with "obscene material" meeting the definition. Two voting members cited the book being "educationally unsuitable" with supporting evidence. Two non-voting members also noted that this book is "educationally unsuitable" and that the content meets the definition. One voting member noted "profane content" providing supporting evidence. Two voting members indicated "indecent content" and provided evidence that the content meets the definition. Two voting members indicated that this material meets the threshold definitions and that this book should not be approved for CISD. Four non-voting members also indicated that the book content contains a threshold that meets definitions and should not be approved due to "harmful content", "obscene material", and the book being "educationally unsuitable".

The recommended action was made by Chris Caldwell to remove the book from the CISD library collection due to "indecent content" with a second by Anna Shore. The SLAC voted 3-1 to remove the book from the CISD library collection due to "indecent content".

The School Library Advisory Council submits its recommendation to remove the book from the CISD library collection due to "indecent content" to the Celina ISD School Board for consideration and final action regarding this title.

Supporting Review Material

<b>Title:</b> <i>Eat, Pray, Love</i>	<b>Author:</b> Elizabeth Gilbert
<b>ISBN:</b> 13: 9780143038412	<b>Last Check-Out:</b> 2011
<b>Current Library Level:</b> Celina High, 1 copy	<b>Recommended Library/Age Level:</b> Titlewave: Adult School Library Journal: Public Library
<b>Book Summary- New York Times Reviews, Hater's Guide &amp; Legal Nomads</b>	
<p><i>Eat, Pray, Love</i></p> <p>The book is famously organized into 108 chapters, divided into three sections of 36 chapters each. This mirrors a mala (prayer beads), signaling that the journey itself is a form of meditation.</p> <p>1. Italy: The Pursuit of Pleasure (Eat)</p> <p>Following a grueling divorce and a rebound relationship that left her depleted, Gilbert lands in Rome.</p> <p>Objective: To rediscover the physical senses.</p> <p>Key Theme: L'arte di non fare niente (The art of doing nothing).</p> <p>Outcome: She stops viewing food and leisure as "guilty pleasures" and starts seeing them as essential components of being human. She regains her physical health and the ability to feel joy without external validation.</p> <p>2. India: The Pursuit of Devotion (Pray)</p> <p>Gilbert moves to an ashram (implied to be the Gurudev Siddha Peeth) to undergo rigorous spiritual discipline.</p> <p>Objective: To find forgiveness and quiet the "monkey mind."</p> <p>Key Theme: Seva (Selfless service).</p> <p>Outcome: Through hours of meditation and scrubbing floors, she experiences a spiritual breakthrough. She manages to "forgive" her ex-husband and herself, moving from a state of frantic seeking to a state of internal stillness.</p> <p>3. Indonesia: The Pursuit of Balance (Love)</p> <p>The final leg in Bali is designed to bridge the gap between the indulgence of Italy and the asceticism of India.</p> <p>Objective: To integrate the spiritual and the physical.</p> <p>Key Theme: Pikiran Tenang (Quiet mind/Balance).</p> <p>Outcome: She studies under a medicine man, Ketut Liyer, and helps a struggling healer, Wayan, secure a home. However, the true test of her balance comes when she meets Felipe.</p> <p>The Ending: Integration and Resolution</p> <p>The ending of the book is often misinterpreted as a "romantic rescue," but professionally, it is viewed as an integration of self.</p> <p>The Conflict: When Gilbert falls for Felipe, she initially panics. She fears that a new relationship will destroy the hard-won autonomy she gained in Italy and India.</p>	

The Resolution: She realizes that true balance isn't about being alone or being "perfectly" spiritual; it's about the ability to remain grounded while being vulnerable.  
The Final Scene: The book concludes on a boat trip to the Gili Islands. Gilbert looks at Felipe and realizes she has achieved the prophecy given to her years prior—she is "whole." She has moved from a woman defined by her roles (wife, girlfriend) to a woman defined by her own internal equilibrium.  
Key Takeaway: The ending signifies that the "journey" doesn't end in a destination, but in a shift of perspective where she no longer needs to run away to find herself.

### **Book Review & Awards**

*Note: It is an honor for a book to receive a review from a book review publication. Many are not reviewed and a starred review is the highest review in the industry.*

Booklist starred, 01/01/06  
Library Journal, 01/01/06  
Library Journal starred, 01/01/06  
New York Times, 02/26/06  
Publishers Weekly starred, 11/21/05

### **Book Review 1**

#### **Kirkus Reviews (January 1, 2006)**

An unsuccessful attempt at a memoir from novelist and journalist Gilbert (The Last American Man, 2002, etc.).

While weeping one night on the bathroom floor because her marriage was falling apart, the author had a profound spiritual experience, crying out to and hearing an answer of sorts from God. Eventually, Gilbert left her husband, threw herself headlong into an intense affair, then lapsed into as intense a depression when the affair ended. After all that drama, we get to the heart of this book, a year of travel during which the author was determined to discover peace and pleasure. In Rome, she practiced Italian and ate scrumptious food. Realizing that she needed to work on her "boundary issues," she determined to forego the pleasure of sex with Italian men. In India, she studied at the ashram of her spiritual guru (to whom she had been introduced by the ex-lover), practiced yoga and learned that in addition to those pesky difficulties with boundaries, she also had "control issues." Finally she headed to Bali, where she became the disciple of a medicine man, befriended a single mother and fell in love with another expat. Quirky supporting characters pop up here and there, speaking a combination of wisdom and cliché. At the ashram, for example, she meets a Texan who offers such improbable aphorisms as, "You gotta stop wearing your wishbone where your backbone oughtta be." Gilbert's divorce and subsequent depression, which she summarizes in about 35 pages, are in fact more interesting than her year of travel. The author's writing is prosaic, sometimes embarrassingly so: "I'm putting this happiness in a bank somewhere, not merely FDIC protected but guarded by my four spirit brothers."

## Book Review 2

### **Library Journal (November 15, 2006)**

At 30, Gilbert had everything an American woman was expected to want in order to be happy—a husband, a successful career, a house. She should have been ready to start a family, but, instead, found herself panic-stricken, anxious, confused, and miserable. On the night she lay sobbing on her bathroom floor, Gilbert made the decision to seek a divorce, which became painful and expensive. In order to regain balance in her life, she embarked on a yearlong journey around the world. Selling all of her belongings, Gilbert planned to spend four months in each of three countries that started with the letter "I": Italy, India, and Indonesia. Her first stop is Rome, because she loves the language and wants to experience the exquisite cuisine. She gains pounds and friends before moving on to Mumbai, India, where her goal is to meditate in an ashram. From India, Gilbert travels to Bali, where she hopes to achieve balance. Gilbert recounts her experiences in a mostly upbeat, exuberant manner that is almost infectious. An award-winning, critically acclaimed author, she does a very credible job of reading her own book and lends a degree of authenticity that another voice might not bring. Recommended for all public library collections.—Gloria Maxwell, Penn Valley Community Coll., Kansas City, MO Copyright 2006 Reed Business Information.



## Library Materials Challenge Form

Under Texas Education Code (TEC) §33.027, a parent, district employee, or person residing in a school district may submit a written challenge to any library material in a school's library catalog. To submit a written challenge, an eligible individual must complete and submit the Library Materials Challenge Form. In accordance with TEC §33.027, an individual completing the form must identify how the challenged library material violates library standards adopted by the Texas State Library and Archive Commission (TSLAC).

Upon receipt of a Library Materials Challenge Form:

- The district must submit a copy of the form to its local school library advisory council (LSLAC), no later than the fifth day after the written challenge is received.
- The district's LSLAC must make a recommendation for action no later than the 90th day after the council receives the challenge.
- If a school district has not established an LSLAC, the school district's board of trustees must take action on the written challenge at the first open meeting held after the 90th day after receipt of a written challenge.
- A school district must prohibit student access to challenged library material until the district takes action in response to the challenge.

An individual may submit an appeal to the board of trustees regarding a district's response to a written challenge. The board must take action on an appeal at the first open meeting held after the appeal is filed.

Name: Michael Wagoner Date: 03/02/2026  
Email: mwwagoner@yahoo.com Phone: 757-971-0190  
Street Address: 5079 Still Meadow Ln  
City: Celina State: TX Zip Code: 75009  
District/Charter School: CISD  
Campus: CHS

Select all the following that apply:

- Parent/guardian of student enrolled in the district  
 District employee  
 District resident

### Library Materials Challenge Form Instructions

1. Part I: Enter the title of the text, author, ISBN (if known), and how the challenged library material violates the TSLAC standards.
2. Part II: Follow the school district's instructions for submitting the Library Materials Challenge Form.

## Library Materials Challenge Form, page 2

**Part I: In the space below or in a separate attachment, provide the title of the text, author, ISBN (if known), and how the challenged library material violates the TSLAC standards. If submitting a separate attachment, please indicate below that there is an attachment.**

Eat Pray Love by Elizabeth Gilbert

Sec 33.021 sexually explicit material; 43.21 patently offensive

Attachment provided

### **Part II: Submitting the Library Materials Challenge Form**

For questions regarding library materials, please contact the Celina ISD District Librarian, Rhonda Thornton, [rhondathornton@celinaisd.com](mailto:rhondathornton@celinaisd.com).

This completed form can be hand-delivered to the Celina ISD Central Administration Building at 205 S. Colorado, Celina, Texas, or submitted via email to Dr. Kyla Prusak, Chief Academic Officer, at [kylaprusak@celinaisd.com](mailto:kylaprusak@celinaisd.com).

Celina ISD Local Policy: [EFB \(LOCAL\)](#)

[Texas State Library and Archives Commission \(TSLAC\) Collection Development Standards](#)

# Eat, Pray, Love

#1 NEW YORK TIMES BESTSELLER  
ELIZABETH GILBERT



## Book Summary

A memoir that follows a woman's year-long journey of self-discovery after a difficult divorce through Italy, India and Indonesia.

## Summary of Concerns

This book contains; alcohol, controversial cultural/religious/social commentary, DEI/CRT, depression, divination, divorce, profanity, sex toys (discussed), sexual content and transvestism involving a minor (implied).

*Young Adult*

**By Elizabeth Gilbert**

ISBN 9780143038412

**CONTENT WARNING**

You are about to access material that may contain content of an ADULT nature. These files may include pictures and materials that some viewers may find offensive. If you are under the age of 18, or if such material offends you or if it is illegal for you to view these materials, please exit now.

**4** /5

**Adults Only**

Page	Content
33	<p>I moved right in with David after I left my husband. He was—is—a gorgeous young man. A born New Yorker, an actor and writer, with those brown liquid-center Italian eyes that have always (have I already mentioned this?) unstitched me. Street-smart, independent, vegetarian, foulmouthed, spiritual, seductive. A rebel poet-Yogi from Yonkers. God's own sexy rookie shortstop. Bigger than life. Bigger than big. Or at least he was to me. The first time my best friend Susan heard me talking about him, she took one look at the high fever in my face and said to me, "Oh my God, baby, you are in so much trouble."</p>
87	<p>One obvious topic still needs to be addressed concerning my whole pursuit of pleasure thing in Italy: What about sex? To answer that question simply: I don't want to have any while I'm here. It's a kind of emergency life-saving policy, more than anything else. I got started early in life with the pursuit of sexual and romantic pleasure. I barely had an adolescence before I had my first boyfriend, and I have consistently had a boy or a man (or sometimes both) in my life ever since I was fifteen years old. That was—oh, let's see—about nineteen years ago, now. That's almost two solid decades I have been entwined in some kind of drama with some kind of guy. Each overlapping the next, with never so much as a week's breather in between. And I can't help but think that's been something of a liability on my path to maturity.</p>
102	<p>Now, to the innocent eye it might appear that I already am traveling. And longing to travel while you are already traveling is, I admit, a kind of greedy madness. It's kind of like fantasizing about having sex with your favorite movie star while you're having sex with your other favorite movie star.</p>
111	<p>He's right—the front of this Internet café is far too public and brightly lit a place to fall apart. He drives for a bit, then pulls the car over in the center of the Piazza della Repubblica, one of Rome's more noble open spaces. He parks in front of that gorgeous fountain with the bodacious naked nymphs cavorting so pornographically with their phallic flock of stiff-necked giant swans. This fountain was built fairly recently, by Roman standards. According to my guidebook, the women who modeled for the nymphs were a pair of sisters, two popular burlesque dancers of their day. They gained a fair bit of notoriety when the fountain was completed; the church tried for months to prevent the thing from being unveiled because it was too sexy.</p>
131	<p>"What's Rome's word?" I asked. "SEX," he announced. "But isn't that a stereotype about Rome?" "No." "But surely there are some people in Rome thinking about other things than sex?" Giulio insisted: "No. All of them, all day, all they are thinking about is SEX." "Even over at the Vatican?" "That's different. The Vatican isn't part of Rome. They have a different word over there. Their word is POWER." "You'd think it would be FAITH." "It's POWER," he repeated. "Trust me. But the word in Rome—it's SEX."</p>
287	<p>In reality, though, it turns out Bali has had exactly as bloody and violent and oppressive a history as anywhere else on earth where human beings have ever lived. When the Javanese kings first immigrated here in the sixteenth century, they essentially established a feudal colony, with a strict caste system which—like all self-respecting caste systems—tended not to trouble itself with consideration for those at the bottom. The economy of early Bali was fueled by a lucrative slave trade (which not only preceded European participation in the international slave traffic by several centuries, but also outlived Europe's trafficking of human lives for a good long while). Internally, the island was constantly at war as rival kings staged attacks (complete with mass rape and murder) on their neighbors. Until the late nineteenth century, the Balinese had a reputation amongst traders and sailors for being vicious fighters. (The word amok, as in "running amok," is a Balinese word, describing a battle technique of suddenly going insanely wild against one's enemies in suicidal and bloody hand-to-hand combat; the Europeans were frankly terrified by this practice.)</p>

Page	Content
319	white weirdo, and said, "That's because you have bad memory problem. You don't remember anymore how nice is sex. I used to have bad memory problem, too, when I was married. Every time I saw a handsome man walking down the street, I would forget I had a husband back home." She nearly fell over laughing. Then she composed herself and concluded, "Everybody need sex, Liz." At this moment, a great-looking woman came walking into the shop, smiling like a lighthouse beam. Tutti leapt up and ran into her arms, shouting, "Armenia! Armenia! Armenia!" Which, as it turned out, was the woman's name—not some kind of strange nationalist battle cry. I introduced myself to Armenia, and she told me she was from Brazil. She was so dynamic, this woman—so Brazilian. She was gorgeous, elegantly dressed, charismatic and engaging and indeterminate in age, just insistently sexy.
338	"Romance." I defined. "Women and men in love. Or sometimes men and men in love, or women and women in love. Kissing and sex and marriage—all that stuff."
355	We find one small seaside town where all the locals have gathered in a darkened street for a birthday ceremony; Yudhi and I are both pulled out of the crowd (honored strangers) and invited to dance with the prettiest girl in the village. (She's enveloped in gold and jewels and incense and Egyptian looking makeup; she's probably thirteen years old but moves her hips with the soft, sensual faith of a creature who knows she could seduce any god she wanted.) The next day we find a strange family restaurant in the same village where the Balinese proprietor announces that he's a great chef of Thai food, which he decidedly is not, but we spend the whole day there anyhow, drinking icy Cokes and eating greasy pad thai and playing Milton Bradley board games with the owner's elegantly effeminate teenage son. (It occurs to us only later that this pretty teenage boy could well have been the beautiful female dancer from the night before; the Balinese are masters of ritual transvestism.)
358	When we return to Ubud, I go straight back to Felipe's house and don't leave his bedroom for approximately another month. This is only the faintest of exaggerations. I have never been loved and adored like this before by anyone, never with such pleasure and single-minded concentration. Never have I been so unpeeled, revealed, unfurled and hurled through the event of lovemaking.
362	But all the fun and games caught up with me after a few weeks. After all those nights of not sleeping and all those days of too much lovemaking, my body struck back and I got attacked by a nasty infection in my bladder. A typical affliction of the overly sexed, especially likely to strike when you're not used to being overly sexed anymore. It came up as fast as any tragedy can strike. I was walking through town one morning doing some chores when suddenly I was buckled over with burning pain and fever. I'd had these infections before, during my wayward youth, so I knew what it was. I panicked for a moment—these things can be awful—but then thought, "Thank God my best friend in Bali is a healer," and I ran into Wayan's shop. "I'm sick!" I said. She took one look at me and said, "You sick from making too much sex, Liz."
365	"You're not embarrassed to fix people for problems like this, from sex?" I asked Wayan. "Liz—I'm healer. I fix all problems, with women's vaginas, with men's bananas. Sometimes for women, I even make fake penises. For making sex alone." "Dildos?" I asked, shocked. "Not everyone has Brazilian boyfriend, Liz," she admonished. Then she looked at Felipe and said brightly, "If you ever need help making stiff your banana, I can give you medicine." I was busily assuring Wayan that Felipe needed not one bit of help with his banana, but he interrupted me—always the entrepreneur—to ask Wayan if this banana-stiffening therapy of hers could perhaps be bottled and marketed. "We could make a fortune," he said. But she explained, no, it's not like that. All her medicines must be made fresh each day in order to work. And they must be accompanied by her prayers. Anyway, internal medicine is not the only way Wayan can firm up a man's banana, she assured us; she can also do this with massage. Then, to our lurid fascination, she described the different massages she does for men's impotent bananas, how she grips around the base of the thing and kind of shakes it around for about an hour to encourage the blood to flow, while incanting special prayers. I asked, "But Wayan—what happens when the man comes back every day and says, 'Still not cured, Doctor! Need another banana massage!'"

Page	Content
365	"She laughed at this bawdy idea, and admitted that, yes, she has to be careful not to spend too much time fixing men's bananas because it causes a certain amount of . . . strong feeling . . . within her, which she isn't sure is good for the healing energy. And sometimes, yes, the men get out of control. (As you would, too, if you'd been impotent for years and suddenly this beautiful mahogany-skinned woman with long black silky hair gets the engine to turn over again.) She told us about the one man who leapt up and started chasing her around the room during an impotency cure, saying: "I need Wayan! I need Wayan!" But that's not all Wayan can do. Also, she told us, she is sometimes called upon to be a teacher of sex for a couple who are either struggling with impotence or frigidity, or who are having trouble making a baby. She has to draw magic pictures on their bedsheets and explain to them
366	which sexual positions are appropriate for which time of the month. She said that if a man wants to make a baby he should make intercourse with his wife "really, really hard" and should shoot "water out from his banana into her vagina really, really fast." Sometimes Wayan has to actually be there in the room with the copulating couple, explaining just how hard and fast this must be done. I ask, "And is the man able to shoot water out of his banana really hard and really fast with Dr. Wayan standing over him watching?" Wayan told us all. What she does in the case of male infertility is to inform the man that his wife is infertile and needs to be seen privately every afternoon for "healing sessions." When the wife comes to the shop
367	alone, Wayan calls some young stud from the village to come over and have sex with her, hopefully creating a baby. Felipe was appalled: "Wayan! No!" But she just calmly nodded. Yes. "It's the only way. If the wife is healthy, she will have baby. Then everybody happy."
368	I suggested, "Maybe you should teach sex education class, Wayan. You could teach men how to touch women in a soft way, then maybe their wives would like sex more. Because if a man really touches you gently, caresses your skin, says loving things, kisses you all over your body, takes his time . . . sex can be nice." Suddenly she blushed. Wayan Nuriyasih, this banana-massaging, bladder-infection-treating, dildo-peddling, small-time-pimp, actually blushed. "You make me feel funny when you talk like that," she said, fanning herself. "This talking, it makes me feel . . . different. Even in my underpants I feel different! Go home now, you both. No more talk like this about sex. Go home, go to bed, but only sleeping, OK? Only SLEEPING!"

Profanity & Sexual or Derogatory Terms	Count
Ass / Jackass / Asshole etc.	16
Bitch	1
Breast / Tit	3
Fuck, Fucked, Fucking etc.	7
Penis	1
Piss	3
Shit / Bullshit etc.	21
Whore	1
Sacrilegious & other offensive language usage	Count
Damn	9
God / God damn etc.	31
Hell	19
Lord	3

# Library Materials Challenge Recommendation Rubric

Member Name: Anna Shore

Book Title: Eat, Pray, Love

<b>Member Type:</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Voting Member <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Voting Member
---------------------	--

<b>Committee Role:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Administrator <input type="checkbox"/> Board Member <input type="checkbox"/> Business/Community <input type="checkbox"/> Clergy <input type="checkbox"/> Counselor <input type="checkbox"/> Librarian <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Parent <input type="checkbox"/> Other
------------------------	--

<b>Book Familiarity:</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have read the entire book. <input type="checkbox"/> I have read part of the book. <input type="checkbox"/> I have not read the book.
--------------------------	--

## PART I — Threshold Definitions

If materials are found to meet one of the following criteria then it is automatically found to be necessary for removal.

1. Harmful Material - (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.

Supporting Evidence:
----------------------

<b>Determination:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition
--

2. Obscene Material - Material or a performance that: (A) the average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex; (B) depicts or describes: (i) patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or (ii) patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism, lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and (C) taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

Supporting Evidence:

The book references sex, sex toys, STD's, etc.

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

3. Pervasively Vulgar - No standard definition, but the determination of vulgarity must be taken as a whole throughout the material. "Pervasive" is defined as "existing in or spreading through every part of something."

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

4. Educationally Unsuitable – No standard definition, but the determination of unsuitability can be taken from the rubric used by the selection committee. Broad definition.

Supporting Evidence:

More of an adult rated book.

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

5. Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance.

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

6. Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive.

Supporting Evidence:
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

**Threshold Summary**

<b>Content contains the following:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Harmful Material	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Obscene Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Pervasively Vulgar
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Educationally Unsuitable	<input type="checkbox"/> Profane Content	<input type="checkbox"/> Indecent Content

Determination:

- If material meets one of the threshold definitions—**Stop review, do not approve**
- If material does not meets one of the threshold definitions—**Continue**

## PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric

Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	1 2 3 4	
2. Provides a wide range of background information	1 2 3 4	
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	1 2 3 4	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	1 2 3 4	
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	1 2 3 4	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 2 3 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	1 2 3 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	1 2 3 4	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	1 2 3 4	
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 2 3 4	

## PART II — Recommendation

Recommendation:

- Approve for library collection
- Approve with age/location restrictions
- Do not approve
- Return to committee for further review

# Library Materials Challenge Recommendation Rubric

Member Name: Chris Caldwell

Book Title: Eat Pray Love

<b>Member Type:</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Voting Member <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Voting Member
---------------------	--

<b>Committee Role:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Administrator <input type="checkbox"/> Board Member <input type="checkbox"/> Business/Community <input type="checkbox"/> Clergy <input type="checkbox"/> Counselor <input type="checkbox"/> Librarian <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Parent <input type="checkbox"/> Other
------------------------	--

<b>Book Familiarity:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read the entire book. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have read part of the book. <input type="checkbox"/> I have not read the book.
--------------------------	--

## PART I — Threshold Definitions

If materials are found to meet one of the following criteria then it is automatically found to be necessary for removal.

1. Harmful Material - (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.

Supporting Evidence:

*a lot of sex mentioned in the book*

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

2. Obscene Material - Material or a performance that: (A) the average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex; (B) depicts or describes: (i) patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or (ii) patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism, lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and (C) taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

3. Pervasively Vulgar - No standard definition, but the determination of vulgarity must be taken as a whole throughout the material. "Pervasive" is defined as "existing in or spreading through every part of something."

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

4. Educationally Unsuitable – No standard definition, but the determination of unsuitability can be taken from the rubric used by the selection committee. Broad definition.

Supporting Evidence:

Book has no educational value

Determination:

- Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

5. Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance.

Supporting Evidence:

The language in the Book is vulgar and  
do not rep the core value of the Celina School System

Determination:

- Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

6. Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive.

Supporting Evidence:

SEX SAKE about many laws

Determination:

- Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

#### Threshold Summary

Content contains the following:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Harmful Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Obscene Material	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Pervasively Vulgar
	<input type="checkbox"/> Educationally Unsuitable	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Profane Content	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Indecent Content

Determination:

- If material meets one of the threshold definitions—**Stop review, do not approve**  
 If material does not meet one of the threshold definitions—**Continue**

**PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric**

**Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet**

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	① 2 3 4	
2. Provides a wide range of background information	① 2 3 4	
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	① 2 3 4	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	① 2 3 4	
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	① 2 3 4	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 ③ 3 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	① 2 3 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	① 2 3 4	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	① 2 3 4	
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 ② 3 4	

**PART II — Recommendation**

Recommendation:

- Approve for library collection
- Approve with age/location restrictions
- Do not approve
- Return to committee for further review

# Library Materials Challenge Recommendation Rubric

Member Name: Rosemary Tallington

Book Title: Eat, Pray, Love

2011

Member Type:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Voting Member	<input type="checkbox"/> Non-Voting Member
--------------	---	--

Committee Role:	<input type="checkbox"/> Administrator	<input type="checkbox"/> Board Member	<input type="checkbox"/> Business/Community
	<input type="checkbox"/> Clergy	<input type="checkbox"/> Counselor	<input type="checkbox"/> Librarian
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Parent	<input type="checkbox"/> Other	

Book Familiarity:	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read the entire book.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have read part of the book.
	<input type="checkbox"/> I have not read the book.

## PART I — Threshold Definitions

If materials are found to meet one of the following criteria then it is automatically found to be necessary for removal.

1. Harmful Material - (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.

### Supporting Evidence:

- does not meet the threshold for "harmful material"
- The title is a memoir about adult relationships, divorce, emotional healing and a few sexual references
- Not primarily written to arouse sexual interest or exploit sexuality in a graphic or sensationalized way.
- mature - not patently offensive

### Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

2. Obscene Material - Material or a performance that: (A) the average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex; (B) depicts or describes: (i) patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or (ii) patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism, lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and (C) taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

Supporting Evidence:

- reflective travel memoir; doesn't contain sustained graphic sexual descriptions

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

3. Pervasively Vulgar - No standard definition, but the determination of vulgarity must be taken as a whole throughout the material. "Pervasive" is defined as "existing in or spreading through every part of something."

Supporting Evidence:

The mature content is not pervasive or explicit.

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

4. Educationally Unsuitable – No standard definition, but the determination of unsuitability can be taken from the rubric used by the selection committee. Broad definition.

Supporting Evidence:

suitable for upper highschool

Determination:

- Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

5. Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance.

Supporting Evidence:

Not grossly offensive or a public nuisance.

Determination:

- Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

6. Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive.

Supporting Evidence:  
- Not graphic or pornographic  
- Sexual content is limited & secondary to the memoir's themes  
(more about emotional growth, spirituality, travel & self discovery vs. sexual stimulation.)

Determination:  
 Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

**Threshold Summary**

<b>Content contains the following:</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Harmful Material	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Obscene Material	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Pervasively Vulgar
	<input type="checkbox"/> Educationally Unsuitable	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Profane Content	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Indecent Content

Determination:

- If material meets one of the threshold definitions—**Stop review, do not approve**
- If material does not meet one of the threshold definitions—**Continue**

**PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric**

**Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet**

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	1 2 (3) 4	cultural, spiritual & personal perspectives
2. Provides a wide range of background information	1 2 (3) 4	travel
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	1 2 (3) 4	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	1 2 3 (4)	
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	1 2 3 (4)	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 (2) 3 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	1 2 (3) 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	1 2 3 (4)	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	1 2 3 (4)	
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 2 (3) 4	

**PART II — Recommendation**

Recommendation:

- Approve for library collection
- Approve with age/location restrictions
- Do not approve
- Return to committee for further review

# Library Materials Challenge Recommendation Rubric

Member Name: ~~Eat, Pray, Love~~ Allison Chao

Book Title: Eat, Pray, Love

Member Type:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Voting Member	<input type="checkbox"/> Non-Voting Member
--------------	---	--

Committee Role:	<input type="checkbox"/> Administrator	<input type="checkbox"/> Board Member	<input type="checkbox"/> Business/Community
	<input type="checkbox"/> Clergy	<input type="checkbox"/> Counselor	<input type="checkbox"/> Librarian
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Parent	<input type="checkbox"/> Other	

Book Familiarity:	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read the entire book.
	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read part of the book.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have not read the book.

## PART I — Threshold Definitions

If materials are found to meet one of the following criteria then it is automatically found to be necessary for removal.

1. Harmful Material - (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.

Supporting Evidence:
----------------------

Determination:
<input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

2. Obscene Material - Material or a performance that: (A) the average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex; (B) depicts or describes: (i) patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or (ii) patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism, lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and (C) taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:  
 Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

3. Pervasively Vulgar - No standard definition, but the determination of vulgarity must be taken as a whole throughout the material. "Pervasive" is defined as "existing in or spreading through every part of something."

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:  
 Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

4. Educationally Unsuitable – No standard definition, but the determination of unsuitability can be taken from the rubric used by the selection committee. Broad definition.

Supporting Evidence:
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

5. Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance.

Supporting Evidence:
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition



**PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric**

**Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet**

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	1 2 3 4	
2. Provides a wide range of background information	1 2 3 4	
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	1 2 3 4	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	1 2 3 4	
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	1 2 3 4	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 2 3 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	1 2 3 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	1 2 3 4	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	1 2 3 4	
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 2 3 4	

**PART II — Recommendation**

Recommendation:

- Approve for library collection
- Approve with age/location restrictions
- Do not approve
- Return to committee for further review



2. Obscene Material - Material or a performance that: (A) the average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex; (B) depicts or describes: (i) patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or (ii) patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism, lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and (C) taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:  
 Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

3. Pervasively Vulgar - No standard definition, but the determination of vulgarity must be taken as a whole throughout the material. "Pervasive" is defined as "existing in or spreading through every part of something."

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:  
 Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition



6. Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive.

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:  
 Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

**Threshold Summary**

<b>Content contains the following:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Harmful Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Obscene Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Pervasively Vulgar
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Educationally Unsuitable	<input type="checkbox"/> Profane Content	<input type="checkbox"/> Indecent Content

Determination:

- If material meets one of the threshold definitions—**Stop review, do not approve**
- If material does not meets one of the threshold definitions—**Continue**

## PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric

Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	1 2 3 4	
2. Provides a wide range of background information	1 2 3 4	
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	1 2 3 4	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	1 2 3 4	
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	1 2 3 4	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 2 3 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	1 2 3 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	1 2 3 4	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	1 2 3 4	
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 2 3 4	

## PART II — Recommendation

Recommendation:

- Approve for library collection
- Approve with age/location restrictions
- Do not approve
- Return to committee for further review

# Library Materials Challenge Recommendation Rubric

Member Name: CHRIS CARTER

Book Title: EAT, PRAY, LOVE

Member Type:	<input type="checkbox"/> Voting Member	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Non-Voting Member
--------------	--	---

Committee Role:	<input type="checkbox"/> Administrator	<input type="checkbox"/> Board Member	<input type="checkbox"/> Business/Community
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Clergy	<input type="checkbox"/> Counselor	<input type="checkbox"/> Librarian
	<input type="checkbox"/> Parent	<input type="checkbox"/> Other	

Book Familiarity:	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read the entire book.
	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read part of the book.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have not read the book.

## PART I — Threshold Definitions

If materials are found to meet one of the following criteria then it is automatically found to be necessary for removal.

1. Harmful Material - (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.

Supporting Evidence:
"THE LONGEST, LOUDEST, FLESHSMACKINGEST, BED THUMPINGEST, BACK-BREAKINGEST SESSION OF LOVEMAKING" "TOO MUCH SEX" DOES NOT ALING W/ CISD MISSION.

Determination:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition
<input type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

2. Obscene Material - Material or a performance that: (A) the average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex; (B) depicts or describes: (i) patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or (ii) patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism, lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and (C) taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

Supporting Evidence:

"F" WORD USED 8 TIMES

~~APPROXIMATELY 20 PARAGRAPHS ABOUT SEX~~

Determination:

- Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

3. Pervasively Vulgar - No standard definition, but the determination of vulgarity must be taken as a whole throughout the material. "Pervasive" is defined as "existing in or spreading through every part of something."

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition  
 Content does not meet definition

4. Educationally Unsuitable – No standard definition, but the determination of unsuitability can be taken from the rubric used by the selection committee. Broad definition.

Supporting Evidence:
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

5. Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance.

Supporting Evidence:
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

6. Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive.

Supporting Evidence:
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

**Threshold Summary**

<b>Content contains the following:</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Harmful Material <input type="checkbox"/> Educationally Unsuitable	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Obscene Material <input type="checkbox"/> Profane Content	<input type="checkbox"/> Pervasively Vulgar <input type="checkbox"/> Indecent Content
--	---	--	--

Determination:

- If material meets one of the threshold definitions—**Stop review, do not approve**
- If material does not meets one of the threshold definitions—**Continue**

**PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric**

**Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet**

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	1 2 3 4	
2. Provides a wide range of background information	1 2 3 4	
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	1 2 3 4	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	1 2 3 4	
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	1 2 3 4	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 2 3 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	1 2 3 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	1 2 3 4	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	1 2 3 4	
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 2 3 4	

**PART II — Recommendation**

Recommendation:

- Approve for library collection
- Approve with age/location restrictions
- Do not approve
- Return to committee for further review

# Library Materials Challenge Recommendation Rubric

Member Name: Liz Ann Stovall

Book Title: Eat, Pray, Love

<b>Member Type:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Voting Member	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Non-Voting Member
---------------------	--	---

<b>Committee Role:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Administrator	<input type="checkbox"/> Board Member	<input type="checkbox"/> Business/Community
	<input type="checkbox"/> Clergy	<input type="checkbox"/> Counselor	<input type="checkbox"/> Librarian
	<input type="checkbox"/> Parent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Other	

<b>Book Familiarity:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read the entire book.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have read part of the book.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have not read the book.

## PART I — Threshold Definitions

If materials are found to meet one of the following criteria then it is automatically found to be necessary for removal.

1. Harmful Material - (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.

<b>Supporting Evidence:</b> <i>sex toys transvestism w/ a young boy potentially encouraged by an adult (father) • mentioned as a custom of that culture - not socially appropriate here</i>
--

<b>Determination:</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition
--

2. Obscene Material - Material or a performance that: (A) the average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex; (B) depicts or describes: (i) patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or (ii) patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism, lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and (C) taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

3. Pervasively Vulgar - No standard definition, but the determination of vulgarity must be taken as a whole throughout the material. "Pervasive" is defined as "existing in or spreading through every part of something."

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

4. Educationally Unsuitable – No standard definition, but the determination of unsuitability can be taken from the rubric used by the selection committee. Broad definition.

Supporting Evidence:

written for an adult audience, not teens!  
- 34 year old woman going through a divorce  
- academic purpose?  
- not sure students will be able to relate

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

5. Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance.

Supporting Evidence:

Determination:

- Content meets definition
- Content does not meet definition

6. Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive.

Supporting Evidence:
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

**Threshold Summary**

<b>Content contains the following:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Harmful Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Obscene Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Pervasively Vulgar
	<input type="checkbox"/> Educationally Unsuitable	<input type="checkbox"/> Profane Content	<input type="checkbox"/> Indecent Content

Determination:

- If material meets one of the threshold definitions—**Stop review, do not approve**
- If material does not meets one of the threshold definitions—**Continue**

## PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric

Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	1 2 3 4	
2. Provides a wide range of background information	1 2 3 4	
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	1 2 3 4	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	1 2 3 4	
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	1 2 3 4	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 2 3 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	1 2 3 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	1 2 3 4	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	1 2 3 4	
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 2 3 4	

## PART II — Recommendation

Recommendation:

- Approve for library collection
- Approve with age/location restrictions
- Do not approve
- Return to committee for further review

# Library Materials Challenge Recommendation Rubric

Member Name: Rhonda Thornton

Book Title: Eat, Pray, Love

Member Type:	<input type="checkbox"/> Voting Member	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Non-Voting Member
--------------	--	---

Committee Role:	<input type="checkbox"/> Administrator	<input type="checkbox"/> Board Member	<input type="checkbox"/> Business/Community
	<input type="checkbox"/> Clergy	<input type="checkbox"/> Counselor	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Librarian
	<input type="checkbox"/> Parent	<input type="checkbox"/> Other	

Book Familiarity:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> I have read the entire book.
	<input type="checkbox"/> I have read part of the book.
	<input type="checkbox"/> I have not read the book.

## PART I — Threshold Definitions

If materials are found to meet one of the following criteria then it is automatically found to be necessary for removal.

1. Harmful Material - (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.

Supporting Evidence:

*While I do not believe this book meets the definition of "harmful material" it is classified as Adult non-fiction. The themes of adult life experiences included are divorce and mid life transitions are not relateable to our students. Divorce is a topic that can relate to student if a teenager character was in the book. Therefore even though it is not harmful, it may be unsuitable for teens,*

Determination:

Content meets definition

Content does not meet definition



4. Educationally Unsuitable – No standard definition, but the determination of unsuitability can be taken from the rubric used by the selection committee. Broad definition.

Supporting Evidence: While this book is a memoir with social and spiritual value, it does not meet the definitions of patently obscene, vulgar, or harmful, it is classified as Adult Non-Fiction. therefore it is a developmental mismatch. The themes of mid-life issues, identity crises and fertility problems do not fit the social-emotional learning goals of 9-12 grade students. There are other YA novels that can cover similar themes of global travel & self discovery.

Determination:

Content meets definition

Content does not meet definition

5. Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance.

Supporting Evidence:


There are some instances of hard language but it isn't grossly offensive. Not glorified.

Determination:

Content meets definition

Content does not meet definition

6. Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive.

Supporting Evidence: 
Determination: <input type="checkbox"/> Content meets definition <input type="checkbox"/> Content does not meet definition

**Threshold Summary**

<b>Content contains the following:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Harmful Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Obscene Material	<input type="checkbox"/> Pervasively Vulgar
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Educationally Unsuitable	<input type="checkbox"/> Profane Content	<input type="checkbox"/> Indecent Content

Determination:

- If material meets one of the threshold definitions—**Stop review, do not approve**
- If material does not meets one of the threshold definitions—**Continue**

**PART II — Selection Criteria Rubric**

Rating Criteria: 4 = Fully Meets | 3 = Meets | 2 = Partially Meets | 1 = Does Not Meet

Selection Criteria	Rating (1-4)	Evidence/Notes
1. Presents multiple viewpoints	1 2 3 <u>4</u>	
2. Provides a wide range of background information	1 2 3 <u>4</u>	
3. Includes accurate, authentic factual content from authoritative	1 2 3 <u>4</u>	
4. Has high potential user appeal and interest	<u>1</u> 2 3 4	Not appealing for H.S.
5. Offers a global perspective and promotes equity of access in print, electronic	1 2 3 <u>4</u>	
6. Represents diverse viewpoints and cultural groups within the state	1 2 <u>3</u> 4	
7. Enriches and supports the TEKS and curriculum, considering interests	<u>1</u> 2 3 4	
8. Fosters growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, societal standards	1 2 <u>3</u> 4	
9. Encourages reading enjoyment, promotes higher-level thinking, supports	<u>1</u> 2 3 4	Not for HS students
10. Represents ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions at the state, national, and global level	1 2 3 <u>4</u>	

**PART II — Recommendation**

Recommendation:

Approve for library collection

Approve with age/location restrictions

Do not approve - Not Young Adult - Educationally Lacking

Return to committee for further review

<b>Standards</b>	<p>The <i>School Library Programs: Standards and Guidelines for Texas</i> are adopted by the Texas State Library and Archives Commission. The standards and guidelines are applicable to local Texas school districts. <i>13 TAC 4.1</i></p> <p>A district shall consider the standards in developing, implementing, or expanding library services. <i>Education Code 33.021(b)</i></p>
Collection Development	<p>A district shall adhere to the standards for school library collection development in developing or implementing the district's library collection development policies. <i>Education Code 33.021(c)</i></p>
<b>Library Material Definitions</b>	<p>"Harmful material" means material whose dominant theme taken as a whole:</p>
Harmful Material	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Appeals to the prurient interest of a minor, in sex, nudity, or excretion;</li> <li>2. Is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and</li> <li>3. Is utterly without redeeming social value for minors.</li> </ol> <p><i>Education Code 33.020(1); Penal Code 43.24(a)</i></p>
Indecent Content	<p>"Indecent content" means content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive. <i>Education Code 33.020(2)</i></p>
Library Material	<p>"Library material" means any book, record, file, or other instrument or document in a district's library catalog. The term does not include instructional material, as defined by Education Code 31.002 [see EFA], or materials procured for the TexShare consortium under Subchapter M, Chapter 4, Government Code. <i>Education Code 33.020(3)</i></p>
Obscene	<p>"Obscene" means material or a performance:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The average person, applying contemporary community standards, would find that taken as a whole appeals to the prurient interest in sex;</li> <li>2. Depicts or describes: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Patently offensive representations or descriptions of ultimate sexual acts, normal or perverted, actual or simulated, including sexual intercourse, sodomy, and sexual bestiality; or</li> <li>b. Patently offensive representations or descriptions of masturbation, excretory functions, sadism, masochism,</li> </ol> </li> </ol>

lewd exhibition of the genitals, the male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal, covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state or a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs; and

3. Taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value.

*Penal Code 43.21(a)(1); Miller v. California, 413 U.S. 15 (1973)*

Patently Offensive

"Patently offensive" means so offensive on its face as to affront current community standards of decency. *Penal Code 43.21(a)(4)*

Profane Content

"Profane content" means content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance. *Education Code 33.020(4)*

**Library Collection  
Development  
Standards**

A district must approve and institute a collection development policy that describes the processes and standards by which a school library acquires, maintains, and withdraws materials.

A school library collection should include materials that are age appropriate and suitable to the campus and students it serves and include a range of materials. A school library collection should:

1. Enrich and support the Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills (TEKS) and curriculum established by Education Code 28.002 [see EHAA], while taking into consideration students' varied interests, maturity levels, abilities, and learning styles;
2. Foster growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, and societal standards;
3. Encourage the enjoyment of reading, foster high-level thinking skills, support personal learning, and encourage discussion based on rational analysis; and
4. Represent the ethnic, religious, and cultural groups of the state and their contribution to Texas, the nation, and the world.

*13 TAC 4.2(a)-(b)*

Responsibility

A district is responsible for ensuring its school libraries implement and adhere to these collection development standards. *13 TAC 4.2(j)*

A district should ensure a professional librarian certified by the State Board for Educator Certification or other dedicated professional library staff trained on proper collection development stan-

dards is responsible for the selection and acquisition of library materials. *13 TAC 4.2(f)*

Procedures

A district must develop collection assessment and evaluation procedures to periodically appraise the quality of library materials in the school library to ensure the library's goals, objectives, and information needs are serving its school community and should stipulate the means to weed or update the collection. *13 TAC 4.2(g)*

A district may adopt local policies and procedures in addition to the standards adopted under Education Code 33.021(c) that do not conflict with the adopted standards or other requirements of the Education Code. *Education Code 33.021(e)*

Policy  
Requirements

A school library collection development policy must:

1. Describe the purpose and collection development goals;
2. Designate the responsibility for collection development;
3. Establish procedures for the evaluation, selection, acquisition, reconsideration, and deselection of materials;
4. Consider the distinct age groups, grade levels, and possible access to materials by all students within a campus;
5. Include a process to determine and administer student access to material rated by library material vendors as "sexually relevant" as defined by Education Code 35.001 consistent with any policies adopted by the Texas Education Agency (TEA) and local school board requirements; *[This regulation is inoperable; see Book People, Inc. v. Wong, 91 F.4th 318 (5th Cir. 2024).]*
6. Include an access plan that, at a minimum, allows efficient parental access to the district's library and online library catalog; and
7. Comply with all applicable local, state, and federal laws and regulations. Specifically, a collection development policy must:
  - a. Recognize that parents are the primary decision makers regarding their student's access to library material;
  - b. Prohibit the possession, acquisition, and purchase of harmful material, library material rated sexually explicit material by the selling library material vendor under Education Code 35.002 *[inoperable; see Book People, Inc. v. Wong, 91 F.4th 318 (5th Cir. 2024)]*, library material that is pervasively vulgar or educationally unsuitable as

referenced in *Bd. of Educ. V. Pico*, 457 U.S. 853 (1982), library material containing indecent content or profane content, or library material that refers a person to an internet website containing content prohibited under this provision, including by use of a link or QR code, as defined by Health and Safety Code 443.001;

- c. Recognize that obscene content is not protected by the First Amendment to the United States Constitution;
- d. Be required for all library materials available for use or display, including material contained in school libraries, classroom libraries, online catalogs, library mobile applications, and any other library catalog a student may access;
- e. Ensure schools provide library catalog transparency, including, but not limited to:
  - (1) Online catalogs that are publicly available; and
  - (2) Information about titles and how and where material can be accessed;
- f. Recommend schools communicate effectively with parents regarding collection development, including, but not limited to:
  - (1) Access to district/campus policies relating to school libraries;
  - (2) Consistent access to library resources; and
  - (3) Opportunities for students, parents, educators, and community members to provide feedback on library materials and services;
- g. Prohibit the removal of material based solely on the ideas contained in the material or the personal background of the author of the material or characters in the material; and
- h. Demonstrate a commitment to compliance with the Children's Internet Protection Act (Pub. L. No. 106-554) including through the use of technology protection measures, as defined by the Act.

13 TAC 4.2(c); Education Code 33.021(d)(2)

*Findings of Fact*

"Educationally unsuitable" is a finding of fact based on many factors. Given the number of possible factors, a finding of fact must include reasoning for a library material being unsuitable or suitable.

The determination must be consistent with the First Amendment to the U.S. Constitution. *Parent v. Lovejoy*, No. 073-R10-08-2024 (Tex. Comm'r of Educ. April 29, 2025)

"Pervasively vulgar" requires a finding of fact that vulgarity is present and referenced throughout a library material. Since "pervasive" means existing in or spreading through every part, a determination that a library material is "pervasively vulgar" requires a review of the whole book. The determination must be consistent with the First Amendment to the U.S. Constitution. *Parent v. Lovejoy*, No. 073-R10-08-2024 (Tex. Comm'r of Educ. April 29, 2025)

Evaluation of  
Materials

Evaluation of materials as referenced in this provision includes a consideration of the factors described at 13 Administrative Code 4.2(b), consideration of local priorities and district standards, and at least two of the following:

1. Consideration of recommendations from parents, guardians, and local community members;
2. Consultation with the district's educators and library staff and/or consultation with library staff of similarly situated districts and their collections and collection development policies;
3. An extensive review of the text of item;
4. The context of a work, including consideration of the contextual characteristics, overall fit within existing school library collection, and potential support of the school curriculum; or
5. Consideration of authoritative reviews of the items from sources such as professional journals in library science, recognized professional education or content journals with book reviews, national and state award recognition lists, library science field experts, and highly acclaimed author and literacy expert recommendations.

13 TAC 4.2(d)

Acquisition of  
Library Materials  
*Policy  
Requirements*

The board of a district shall adopt a policy for the acquisition of library materials, including procedures for the procurement of library materials and the receipt of donated library materials. The policy must require the board to:

1. Approve all library materials that have been donated to or that are to be procured by a school library in the district, with the advice and recommendations of the district's local school library advisory council (SLAC) if the district established a SLAC;

2. Make the list of library materials not including those library materials to which this provision does not apply that have been donated to or that are proposed to be procured by a school library accessible for review by the public for at least 30 days before final approval;
3. Approve or reject the list of library materials that have been donated to or that are proposed to be procured by a school library in an open meeting; and
4. Ensure compliance with the library standards approved under Education Code 33.021.

*Education Code 33.026(a)*

These provisions do not apply to library materials that have been donated to or that are to be procured by a school library that:

1. Replace a damaged copy of a library material with the same International Standard Book Number (ISBN) that is currently in the school library catalog;
2. Are additional copies of a library material with the same ISBN that is currently in the school library catalog; or
3. Have the same ISBN and have been approved for the same grade levels by the board of the district from a previous proposed list of library materials.

*Education Code 33.026(f)*

*Board Review  
and Meeting*

Each member of the board of a district is entitled to review each list of library materials that have been donated to or that are proposed to be procured by a school library in the district and propose changes to each list described by 33.026(a)(1) before the board votes to approve or reject the list.

The board shall approve or reject a list of library materials that have been donated to or that are proposed to be procured by a school library at the first open meeting of the board held on or after the 30th day after the date the list is made accessible for review by the public.

*Education Code 33.026(b-c)*

A district may not add a donated library material to the school library catalog or otherwise make the donated library material available for student use unless the board of the district approves the addition of that donated library material to the school library catalog for the grade levels for which the material is intended. *Education Code 33.026(e)*

<i>School Library Advisory Council Recommendation</i>	If a district established a local SLAC, the SLAC shall meet to determine the SLAC's recommendations regarding library materials that have been donated to or that are proposed to be procured by a school library before the date of the open meeting of the board. The local SLAC meeting may occur during the period the list is available for review by the public. <i>Education Code 33.026(d)</i>
Policy Review	A district's collection development policy should be reviewed at least every three years and updated as necessary. <i>13 TAC 4.2(h)</i>
<b>Instruction in TEKS</b>	Nothing in Education Code Chapter 33, Subchapter B may be construed as limiting the acquisition of instructional material necessary for the teaching of, instruction in, or demonstration of knowledge of the essential knowledge and skills adopted under Education Code 28.002. <i>Education Code 33.0205</i>
<b>Parental Access</b>	<p>A district shall adopt procedures that provide for a parent of a child enrolled in the district or school to access the catalog of available library materials at each school library in the district or school and submit to the district or school a list of library materials that the parent's child may not be allowed to check out or otherwise access for use outside of the school library. The procedures must allow for a parent to submit the list of library materials through an electronic physical form or the district's online library catalog system.</p> <p>A district may not allow a student to check out or otherwise use outside the school library a library material the student's parent has included in the list submitted by the parent.</p> <p><i>Education Code 33.023</i></p> <p>[See CMD(LEGAL) for information regarding funds that may be used to comply with this provision.]</p>
Record of Student Library Use	A district that uses a learning management system or an online learning portal shall, through the system or portal, provide to each parent of a child enrolled in the district or school a record of each time the parent's child checks out or otherwise uses outside the school library a library material. The record must include, as applicable, the title, author, genre, and return date of the library material. [See also FL(LEGAL) for provisions regarding access by parents.] <i>Education Code 33.024</i>
<b>School Library Advisory Council</b> Permissive Establishment	The board may establish a local SLAC to assist the district in ensuring that local community values are reflected in each school library catalog in the district. A district that does not establish a local SLAC must ensure that the district's procedures for adding or removing library materials to or from a school library catalog comply with the library standards approved under Education Code 33.021 and the meeting requirements below. <i>Education Code 33.025(a)</i>

Mandatory  
Establishment

The board shall establish a local SLAC if the parents of at least 10 percent of the students enrolled in the district or 50 or more parents of students enrolled in the district, whichever is fewer, present to the board a petition to establish a local SLAC. A SLAC established under this provision may not be abolished until the third anniversary of the date on which the SLAC was established. *Education Code 33.025(b)*

A district that establishes a local SLAC must consider the recommendations of the local SLAC before adding library materials to a school library catalog, removing library materials from a school library catalog following a challenge under Education Code 33.027, or making changes to policies or guidelines related to a school library catalog. *Education Code 33.025(c)*

Composition

The local SLAC must consist of at least five members, with each member appointed by the board, and with each trustee appointing an equal number of members. A majority of the voting members of the SLAC must be persons who are parents of students enrolled in the district and who are not employed by the district. One of those members shall serve as chair of the SLAC. The board may also appoint one or more persons to serve as nonvoting members of the SLAC from any of the following groups:

1. Classroom teachers employed by the district;
2. Librarians employed by the district;
3. School counselors certified under Education Code, Chapter 21, Subchapter B, employed by the district;
4. School administrators employed by the district;
5. The business community; and
6. The clergy.

*Education Code 33.025(f)*

Duties

The local SLAC's duties include recommending:

1. Policies and procedures for the acquisition of library materials consistent with local community values;
2. To the board whether library materials proposed for acquisition under Education Code 33.026 are appropriate for each grade level of the school or campus for which the library materials are proposed to be acquired;
3. If feasible, joint use agreements or strategies for collaboration between the district and local public libraries and community organizations;

4. The removal of any library materials that the SLAC determines to be harmful material or material containing indecent content or profane content that is inconsistent with local community values or age appropriateness;
5. The policies and procedures for processing challenges received under Education Code 33.027; and
6. The action to be taken by the district in response to a challenge received under Education Code 33.027.

Any recommendation made by the local SLAC must adhere to the library standards approved under Education Code 33.027.

*Education Code 33.025(d-e)*

**Meetings**

The local SLAC shall meet at least two times each year and at other times as necessary to fulfill the SLAC's duties. For each meeting, the SLAC shall:

1. At least 72 hours before the meeting, post notice of the date, hour, place, and subject of the meeting on a bulletin board in the central administrative office of each campus in the district and ensure that such notice is posted on the district's internet website, if the district has an internet website;
2. Prepare and maintain minutes of the meeting that state the subject and content of each deliberation and each vote, order, decision, or other action taken by the SLAC during the meeting;
3. Make an audio or video recording of the meeting; and
4. Not later than the 10th day after the date of the meeting, submit the minutes and audio or video recording of the meeting to the district.

**Minutes**

As soon as practicable after receipt of the minutes and audio or video recording, the district shall post the minutes and audio or video recording on the district's internet website, if the district has an internet website.

*Education Code 33.025*

**Challenge or Appeal  
of Library Material**

A parent of or person standing in parental relation to a student enrolled in a district, a person employed by the district, or a person residing in the district may submit:

1. To the district a written challenge to any library material in the catalog of a school library in the district using a form adopted by TEA [see below at Challenge Form]; or

2. To the district's board an appeal of an action taken by the district in response to a written challenge received.

*Education Code 33.027(a)(1)-(2)*

Challenge Form

TEA shall adopt and post on TEA's internet website a form to be used in making a written challenge under Education Code 33.027(a)(1). Each school district shall post the form on the district's internet website, if the district has an internet website. The form shall require the person submitting the form to identify how the challenged library material violates the library standards approved under Education Code 33.021. *Education Code 33.027(e)*

Copy of Challenge to SLAC

Not later than the fifth day after the date on which a school district receives a written challenge under Education Code 33.027(a)(1), the district shall provide a copy of the challenge to the district's local SLAC if the district established a SLAC. The SLAC shall make a recommendation for action by the district not later than the 90th day after the date on which the SLAC receives the copy. *Education Code 33.027(b)*

Library Material Review Committee

If the procedures recommended by the local SLAC, if applicable, and adopted by the board permit the appointment of library material review committees that consist of persons who are not members of the SLAC to review library materials challenged under 33.027(a)(1), the SLAC may base their recommendation for action to be taken by the district under 33.027(b) on the recommendation of a library material review committee if the committee consists of at least five persons appointed by the board, a majority of whom are parents of students enrolled in the district and are not employed by the district. The library materials review committee must follow the Meetings and Minutes procedures described above. *Education Code 33.027(c)*

Board Action on Written Challenge

The board shall take action on a written challenge submitted under Education Code 33.027(a)(1) at the first open meeting of the board held after the 90th day after the date on which the district receives a written challenge or, if applicable, the local SLAC has made a recommendation regarding the challenge.

The board shall take action on an appeal under Education Code 33.027(b) at the first open meeting of the board held after the date the appeal is filed.

*Education Code 33.027(d)*

In taking action on a written challenge or appeal, the board shall consider:

1. If applicable, the advice of the district's local SLAC; and

2. Whether the library material challenged or appealed is suitable for the subject and grade level for which the library material is intended, including by considering whether the library material adheres to the library standards approved under Education Code 33.021 and reviews, if any, of the library material conducted by academic experts specializing in the subject covered by the library material or in the education of students in the subject and grade level for which the library material is intended.

*Education Code 33.027(f)*

**Access During  
Challenge**

A district that receives a challenge to a library material under Education Code 33.027(a)(1) shall prohibit students enrolled in the district from accessing the library material until the district takes action in response to the challenge. *Education Code 33.027(g)*

**Notice of Removed  
Material**

If a challenge to a library material results in the board, with the recommendation of the local SLAC, if applicable, removing the library material from a school library catalog, the board shall notify each teacher assigned as the classroom teacher at the grade level for which the library material was determined to be not appropriate and instruct the teacher to remove any copy of the library material from the teacher's classroom library. *Education Code 33.027(h)*

**Action Not Required**

If a challenge to a library material results in the board, with the recommendation of the local SLAC, if applicable, not removing the library material from a school library catalog, the board is not required to take any action in response to a written challenge of the library material submitted before the second anniversary of the date of the determination to not remove the library material. *Education Code 33.027(i)*

**Liability**

A district or a teacher, librarian, or other staff member employed by a district is not liable for any claim or damage resulting from a library material vendor's violation of Education Code Chapter 35. *Education Code 35.004*

**Joint Facilities**

A district may enter into contracts with a county or municipality in which the district is located to provide joint library facilities. The board and the commissioner's court of the county or governing body of the municipality must conduct public hearings before entering into such a contract. The hearings may be held jointly. *Education Code 33.022*

---

**Note:** For information related to the selection of instructional materials, see EFA.

---

The purpose of this policy is to ensure that the District provides a wide range of library materials for students and faculty that support student achievement and present varying levels of difficulty, diversity of appeal, and a variety of points of view. This policy also provides standards for collection development and the selection and evaluation of library materials.

**School Library  
Advisory Council**

The Board has established a school library advisory council (SLAC). At the first meeting of the SLAC, the members shall select a chair.

The SLAC shall meet at least two times each year but may hold additional meetings in order to consider recommendations from District staff and fulfill its statutory duties.

**Collection  
Development Policy**

In this policy, "library materials" is defined by law and may include printed and electronic library acquisitions, including online catalogs, and other ancillary or supplementary materials maintained in a campus library. [See EFB(LEGAL)]

The library collection development standards shall apply to all library materials available for use or display, including material contained in school libraries, classroom libraries, online catalogs, library mobile applications used in the District, and any other library catalog a student may access.

In developing library collections, the District shall consider the age groups, grade levels, and access to library material by all students on a campus.

**Responsibility**

The District shall ensure the members of the SLAC, librarians, professional library staff, and other designated professional staff are trained or receive information on the proper collection development standards.

The Superintendent shall develop administrative procedures to ensure that library collections comply with applicable law, library standards, and the District's collection development purpose and goals.

**Collection  
Development Goals**

In addition to the requirements in state law and rules, the District's library collections shall:

1. Present multiple viewpoints related to controversial issues [see EMB regarding instruction about controversial issues].
2. Provide a wide range of background information that will enable students to make intelligent decisions in their daily lives.

3. Include accurate and authentic factual content from authoritative sources.
4. Have a high degree of potential user appeal and interest.
5. Offer a global perspective that promotes equity of access, including print and nonprint materials such as electronic and multimedia, to meet the needs of individual learners.
6. Represent diverse viewpoints and cultural groups of the state and their contributions to the state, the nation, and the world, to ensure the collection embodies the background of all students.

**Recommendation  
and Procurement of  
Materials**

Library materials shall be recommended and procured in accordance with guidelines adopted by the Texas State Library and Archives Commission and the District standards and priorities expressed in this policy.

Librarians and other professional staff shall assist the SLAC in developing the list of library material recommendations to be presented to the Board. The librarians and other professional staff shall ensure that the materials:

1. Enrich and support the TEKS and the state and local curriculum, taking into consideration students' varied interests, maturity levels, abilities, and learning styles.
2. Foster growth in factual knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, and societal standards.
3. Encourage the enjoyment of reading, foster high-level thinking skills, support personal learning, and encourage discussion based on rational analysis.
4. Represent ethnic, religious, and cultural groups of the state and their contributions to the state, the nation, and the world.

The Superintendent shall ensure that administrative procedures regarding the development of recommendations of library materials consider at least two of the following factors:

1. Recommendations from students, parents or guardians, teachers, and District residents.
2. Consultation with District teachers and library staff.
3. Consultation with library staff from other districts.
4. Extensive review of the library material.
5. Context of the library material, including overall fit within the existing collection and support of District curriculum.

6. Reviews of the library material from sources such as professional journals in library science, recognized professional education or content journals with book reviews, national and state award recognition lists, library science field experts, and highly acclaimed author and literacy expert recommendations.
7. Coverage of topics, authors, series, or genres that fill gaps in the school library collection.

The SLAC shall recommend to the Board a list of library materials for procurement.

The Board shall consider the SLAC's recommended list of library materials that have been donated or proposed by the SLAC for procurement. Each Board member may propose changes before the Board takes action on the list of donated or proposed library materials.

The Board shall either approve or reject the library materials that have been donated or proposed for procurement.

Donated and  
Proposed  
Procurement List

At least 30 days prior to the Board's vote to accept donated library materials or approve procurement of library materials, the Superintendent shall make accessible to the public the list of library materials in accordance with law.

Access Plan

The District shall allow efficient parental access to the District's library and any available online catalogs.

Online catalogs shall be publicly available. The District shall publish information about library material titles, including how and where material can be accessed.

Each campus shall communicate the following to parents and guardians:

- Access to policies relating to school libraries and library materials;
- Consistent access to library materials and resources; and
- Opportunities for students, parents and guardians, educators, and community members to provide feedback on library materials and services.

Parental  
Involvement

Parents and guardians are the primary decision-makers regarding their child's access to library material. In general, a student is afforded the opportunity to self-select library materials as part of literacy development and the library program. District staff may assist a student in selecting library material; however, the ultimate determination of appropriateness remains with the student and parent or

guardian. Parents and guardians are encouraged to communicate with the campus librarian and their child's teacher about special considerations regarding library materials self-selected by their child.

In accordance with state law and administrative procedures, parents or guardians may submit to the principal or a staff member designated by the principal a list of library materials that the parent's or guardian's child shall not be allowed to check out or access for use outside of the school library. The Superintendent shall develop procedures that permit a parent or guardian to submit the request in at least one of the methods permitted by law.

The parent or guardian may select alternative library materials for their child. [For information on parental rights regarding instructional materials and other instructional resources, see EFA(LEGAL).]

The District shall focus on maximizing transparency with parents while meeting student needs and providing enrichment opportunities with library materials. Parental involvement in library acquisition, maintenance, and campus activities is encouraged.

*Access  
Procedures*

School Library

A parent or guardian who wishes to access a school's library shall first submit a request to the principal. The principal or a staff member designated by the principal shall work with the parent or guardian to determine a time to access the library that will not interfere with the delivery of instruction or disrupt student use of library services.

Library Catalog

A parent or guardian who wishes to access the catalog of library materials for any school in the District shall submit a written request to the school's principal. The principal or a staff member designated by the principal shall respond to the request in accordance with administrative procedures.

*Protection from  
Inappropriate  
Material*

In accordance with law and guidance from the Texas State Library and Archives Commission, library materials shall not include "harmful material"; any library material that is pervasively vulgar or educationally unsuitable; any library material containing indecent or profane content; any library material that refers a person to a website, including by use of a link or QR code, containing content legally prohibited under law; or any other material legally prohibited from inclusion in a public school library. [See EFB(LEGAL)]

Obscene material is not protected by the First Amendment to the United States Constitution.

Library materials shall comply with the Children's Internet Protection Act (CIPA), including technology protection measures. [See CQ]

**Challenge of Library Material**

A District employee, a parent or guardian of a District student, or a District resident may challenge library material maintained in the District's library program.

The SLAC shall recommend to the Board for adoption the procedures for challenging library materials.

**Guiding Principles**

The following principles shall guide the review of a challenge of library material:

1. An individual may challenge library material used in the District's library program, despite the fact that the professional staff, SLAC, and the Board followed the proper procedure and adhered to the objectives and criteria for recommending and procuring library materials set out in this policy.
2. Access to challenged material shall be restricted during the challenge process.

In addition to compliance with state law and this policy, a criterion for the final decision on challenged library materials is the appropriateness of the material for its intended use. No challenged library material shall be removed solely because of the ideas expressed in the library material or the personal background of the library material's author or the personal background of the characters in the material.

**Formal Challenge**

The District shall make the Texas Education Agency form to challenge library material available on the District's website.

If a District employee, a parent or guardian of a District student, or a District resident wishes to challenge library material, they shall follow the procedures to complete and submit the challenge form.

In addition to copies of the completed form being provided to the members of the SLAC in accordance with law, copies shall also be provided to the Board, the Superintendent, the school librarian, and any other staff designated in administrative procedures.

**SLAC Recommendation**

The SLAC shall consider the challenge in accordance with Board-adopted procedures and in accordance with law and shall make a recommendation to the Board.

Any meeting of the SLAC or a review committee, if any, must comply with the meeting requirements under Education Code 33.025(g) and (h), including required notices, meeting minutes, audio or

video recordings, and submission of minutes and audio or video recordings of the meeting to the District.

The Superintendent, the school librarian, the individual submitting the challenge, and any other appropriate staff shall receive a copy of the SLAC's recommendation.

**Appeal**

An individual who submitted a challenge may appeal the decision of the SLAC to the Board in accordance with the challenge procedures.

When considering the appeal, the Board shall consider the factors in Education Code 33.027(f). The Board shall consider appeals in accordance with timelines set out in law.

**Frequency of Review**

After a library material has been challenged and the Board determines not to remove the library material from a school library catalog, it may not be challenged again before the second anniversary of the Board's final decision not to remove the material.

**Removal of Library Materials**

If a challenge to a library material results in the removal of the library material from the school library catalog, each teacher assigned as the classroom teacher at the grade level for which the library material was removed shall be notified and instructed to remove any copy of the library material from the teacher's classroom library, if applicable.

**Maintenance of Library Materials**

In accordance with state guidelines and District administrative procedures, collections shall be evaluated and updated regularly based on the collections' age, relevance, diversity, and variety. The Superintendent shall ensure administrative procedures are established for regular maintenance of the library collection on each campus. Standard maintenance procedures for any library collection include repair, replacement, and removal of materials as necessary. Regular maintenance shall also include scheduled inventories of the collection. Disposal of any District-owned library materials shall be in accordance with District policy and procedures. [See CI]

**Gifts and Donations**

The Board shall accept gifts and donations of library materials with the understanding that the use and disposition of the materials and monies will be in accordance with District policy and the selection criteria noted above. [See CDC]

**Policy Review**

This policy shall be reviewed at least every three years and revised as necessary.

## **Resolution Establishing a Local School Library Advisory Council**

WHEREAS, Senate Bill 13 from the 89th Legislative Session relates to a District's library materials and catalog, the establishment of a local school library advisory council (SLAC), and parental rights regarding public school library catalogs and access by the parent's child to library materials;

WHEREAS, Education Code 33.025 allows a District to establish a SLAC to assist the District in ensuring that local community values are reflected in each school library catalog in the District;

WHEREAS, a District that establishes a SLAC must consider the recommendations of the SLAC before adding library materials to a school library catalog, removing library materials from a school library catalog following a challenge to the library material, or making changes to policies or guidelines related to a school library catalog;

WHEREAS, the SLAC's duties include recommending:

1. Policies and procedures for the acquisition of library materials consistent with local community values;
2. To the Board of Trustees whether library materials proposed for acquisition under the law are appropriate for each grade level of the District or campus for which the library materials are proposed to be acquired;
3. If feasible, joint use agreements or strategies for collaboration between the District and local public libraries and community organizations;
4. The removal of any library materials that the SLAC determines to be harmful material or material containing indecent content or profane content that is inconsistent with local community values or age appropriateness;
5. The policies and procedures for processing challenges received;
6. The action to be taken by the District in response to a challenge;

WHEREAS, any recommendation made by the SLAC must adhere to the library standards approved under Education Code 33.021;

WHEREAS, the SLAC must consist of at least five members, with each member appointed by the Board of Trustees, and with each Trustee appointing an equal number of members;

WHEREAS, a majority of the voting members of the SLAC must be persons who are parents of students enrolled in the District and who are not employed by the District;

WHEREAS, one of those members of the SLAC shall serve as chair of the council;

WHEREAS, the Board of Trustees may also appoint one or more persons to serve as nonvoting members of the SLAC from any of the following groups:

7. Classroom teachers employed by the District;
8. Librarians employed by the District;

DATE ISSUED:

1 of 2

EFB(EXHIBIT)

9. School counselors certified under Subchapter B, Chapter 21, employed by the District;
10. School administrators employed by the District;
11. The business community;
12. The clergy;

WHEREAS, the SLAC shall meet at least two times each year and at other times as necessary to fulfill the council's duties;

WHEREAS, for each meeting, the SLAC shall:

13. Post at least 72 hours before the meeting:
14. Post notice of the date, hour, place, and subject of the meeting on a bulletin board in the central administrative office of each campus in the District;
15. Ensure that the notice required is posted on the District's website, if the District has a website;
16. Prepare and maintain minutes of the meeting that state the subject and content of each deliberation and each vote, order, decision, or other action taken by the SLAC during the meeting;
17. Make an audio or video recording of the meeting;
18. Not later than the 10th day after the date of the meeting, submit the minutes and audio or video recording of the meeting to the District;

WHEREAS, as soon as practicable after receipt of the minutes and audio or video recording discussed above, the District shall post the minutes and audio or video recording on the District's website, if the District has a website.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Board of Trustees of \_\_\_\_\_ School District establishes a local school library advisory council.

FURTHER RESOLVED that the members of the SLAC are:

***[identify the members of the SLAC]***

Adopted this \_\_\_\_\_ (date) day of \_\_\_\_\_ (month), \_\_\_\_\_ (year), by the Board.

Board President's signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Board Secretary's signature: \_\_\_\_\_