



Davis School District Board of Education

Sensitive Materials Appeal Committee Recommendation

June 20, 2023

In accordance with policy *4I-202 School Library Media Centers*, the Sensitive Materials Appeal Committee has met and reviewed appeal requests. The committee's recommendations are outlined in the table below. We anticipate the board will approve/accept the Sensitive Materials Appeal Committee Recommendation for June 20, 2023 in the upcoming business meeting for the Board of Education. Please call/text/email any questions to Assistant Superintendent Dr. Logan Toone.

Title	Initial District Review Committee Decision	Appeals Committee Recommendation
The Holy Bible (King James Version)*	Retain (High Schools)	Retain (All Levels)

**Given the intense community interest in the decision regarding The Bible, the appeal committee offers the following background and rationale statement along with their recommendation.*

Background and Rationale

In December 2022, Davis School District received a request from a community member to review The Holy Bible (King James Version) to determine whether it should continue to be included in school libraries.

Utah Code (53G-10-103) requires school districts to include parents who are reflective of the community when determining if a book contains sensitive material. Davis District uses a lottery-selected committee with a parent majority to comply with this law. In accordance with Utah Code, guidance from Utah's Attorney General (*June 1, 2022 Memo*), and guidance from the Utah State Board of Education (*Model Policy*), the District's Library Media policy requires committees to use a two-step review process. Committees first determine whether the book contains material which violates the bright line rule outlined in Utah Code (76-10-1227). If the book does not violate the bright line rule, the committee then considers age appropriateness of the book. Age appropriateness is determined by considering violent or vulgar content as well as whether the book – taken as a whole – has serious literary, artistic, political, or scientific value for minors. Consideration of a book's value for minors is dependent upon reliable expert reviews, the committee's own experience and backgrounds, and the committee's assessment of community standards (*USBE Model Policy & DSD Library Media Policy*).

The initial review committee assigned to review The Bible determined that The Bible does not contain material which violates the "bright line rule." They then considered age appropriateness of The Bible and determined that The Bible was age appropriate for continued inclusion in high school libraries, but not in junior high or elementary school libraries. Within days of the announcement of this determination, the district received several appeal requests and immediately began processing



Davis School District Board of Education

Sensitive Materials Appeal Committee Recommendation

June 20, 2023

appeals. District policy outlines the appeal process which requires an appeal committee (consisting of three district board members) to reconsider the determinations made by the initial review committee and make a recommendation for the full board's consideration.

The appeal committee reviewed all relevant information pertaining to the original committee's determination, as well as all information pertaining to appeal requests and public comments. The appeal committee determined that The Bible does not contain material which violates "bright line rule." They then considered age appropriateness of The Bible using the standards outlined in law/policy. Based on their assessment of community standards, the appeal committee determined that The Bible has significant, serious value for minors which outweighs the violent or vulgar content it contains. Therefore, the appeal committee considers The Bible to be age appropriate and recommends that it be retained in school libraries at all levels (elementary, junior high, and high school).