



August 9, 2021

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: 2021 Bond Program
Construction Management (CM) Services Recommendation
Project #1 – Building Renovations and AC Upgrades
Project #2 – Robotics and Early Childhood Center

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Construction Management firms for the 2021 Bond Program. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, LPS administration and staff, and district legal counsel (the Project Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for Project #1 & Project #2.

SELECTION PROCESS

On June 17, 2021, RFP documents were formally issued to six (6) selected firms previously reviewed by the LPS Board of Education. A pre-proposal meeting was held on June 21, 2021, with all firms in attendance. Proposals were received from five (5) of the invited firms on June 30, 2021, and over the ensuing days were reviewed by the Project Team.

The Project Team utilized a criteria-based selection (CBS) process to evaluate each CM firm's proposal. The CBS process used pre-established and weighted criteria to evaluate the proposals to objectively shortlist three (3) CM firms for interviews. Criteria such as relevant experience, proposed staff and team experience, firm approach to the project, and proposed fees were evaluated.

The Project Team conducted interviews with these three (3) firms on July 19, 2021. Upon completion of the interviews and after subsequent discussions, the Project Team completed the CBS scoring process and finalized a recommendation.

RECOMMENDATION

The Project Team recommends awarding the CM services contract for **Project #1 and Project #2** for the 2021 Bond Program to **Clark Construction Company**, pending final review of terms by district legal counsel. The recommendation includes an alternate approach as provided by Clark Construction to perform a portion of the air conditioning upgrades during the school year and complete all work by December 2026.

The total contract award recommendation is **\$4,682,848.00** and is further defined as follows:

\$337,250	Not-to-Exceed Preconstruction Phase Services
\$4,155,101	Not-to-Exceed Construction Phase Personnel Costs
\$190,497	Not-to-Exceed Construction Phase Reimbursables
<u>\$4,682,848</u>	<u>Total Contract Award Recommendation</u>

The contract award recommendation does not include the Construction Manager's Fee of 2.0% of the Cost of the Work, nor Project specific General Conditions at this time. These costs will be incorporated into the Construction Manager's contract on a Project-by-Project basis once bids are received for each of the contractor bid packages.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at 248-675-9812 or brian.weber@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,
PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Brian Weber
Owner Representative

CC: Dana Abrahams, Clark Hill
Attachments: CM Proposal Summary
CBS Scoring Summary

LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT SERVICES
2021 BOND PROGRAM
REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS SUMMARY

Category	Barton Malow Builders	The Christman Company	Clark Construction	McCarthy & Smith	Rockford Construction	AVERAGES	
General Information							
Local Office	Southfield	Detroit, MI	Auburn Hills, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Detroit, MI		
Full-Time Personnel at Local Office	79 (Education Group)	65	150	75	43		
Headquarters	Southfield	Lansing, MI	Lansing, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Grand Rapids, MI		
Full-Time Personnel for Entire Firm	600	485	280	75	300		
Contact	Stephanie Hatchey	Mary LeFevre	Gary Steller	Bill McCarthy	Jennifer Boswinkle		
Notable Clients	Livonia Public Schools Bloomfield Hills School District Troy School District Birmingham Public Schools	Grand Rapids Public Schools Lansing School District Muskegon Public Schools Detroit Public Schools	Brighton Area Schools Dearborn Public Schools Warren Consolidated Schools Huron Valley Schools	Livonia Public Schools Ann Arbor Public Schools Clarenceville School District Farmington Public Schools	Birmingham Public Schools Grand Rapids Public Schools Caledonia Public Schools Northview Public Schools		
Acknowledge Addenda	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA		
Agree to Contract Terms	Exceptions Noted	Exceptions Noted	Minor Exceptions Noted	Exceptions Noted	Exceptions Noted		
Familial Disclosure, Iran Sanctions, Equal Opportunity and Criminal Background Affidavits	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Proposed Fee Information							
Project #1 - NTE Preconstruction	NA	\$250,000.00	\$285,000.00	\$530,000.00	\$145,660.00	\$299,132.00	
Project #1 - NTE Personnel Cost	NA	\$3,270,360.00	\$3,526,184.00	\$3,930,000.00	\$2,926,054.00	\$3,439,070.20	
Project #1 - NTE Reimbursable Expenses	NA	\$290,303.00	\$171,833.00	\$269,582.00	\$484,210.00	\$269,582.60	
Project #1 - Precon/Personnel/Reimbursables	NA	\$3,810,663	\$3,983,017	\$4,729,582	\$3,555,924	\$4,007,785	
Project #1 - Overhead & Profit (Fee) (%)	NA	2.00%	2.30%	1.80%	2.40%	2.10%	
Project #1 - Overhead & Profit (Fee) (\$)	NA	\$1,770,000.00	\$2,035,500.00	\$1,593,000.00	\$2,124,000.00	\$1,858,500.00	
Project #1 - Total Proposed Fees (\$)	NA	\$5,580,663.00	\$6,018,517.00	\$6,322,582.00	\$5,679,924.00	\$5,866,284.80	
Project #1 - Total Proposed Fees (%)	NA	6.31%	6.80%	7.14%	6.42%	6.63%	
Project #1 - Estimated General Conditions	NA	0.5% - 1.25%	0.75% - 1.75%	1.5% - 3.0%	4%		
Project #2 - NTE Preconstruction	NA	\$50,000.00	\$49,346.00	\$92,000.00	\$66,120.00	\$64,366.50	
Project #2 - NTE Personnel Cost	NA	\$908,770.00	\$1,176,405.00	\$650,000.00	\$1,041,202.00	\$944,094.25	
Project #2 - NTE Reimbursable Expenses	NA	\$99,530.00	\$60,064.00	\$91,092.00	\$113,682.00	\$91,092.00	
Project #2 - Precon/Personnel/Reimbursables	NA	\$1,058,300	\$1,285,815	\$833,092	\$1,221,004	\$1,099,553	
Project #2 - Overhead & Profit (Fee) (%)	NA	2.75%	4.20%	1.90%	2.30%	\$0.03	
Project #2 - Overhead & Profit (Fee) (\$)	NA	\$503,250.00	\$768,600.00	\$347,700.00	\$420,900.00	\$510,112.50	
Project #2 - Total Proposed Fees (\$)	NA	\$1,561,550.00	\$2,054,415.00	\$1,180,792.00	\$1,641,904.00	\$1,609,665.25	
Project #2 - Total Proposed Fees (%)	NA	8.53%	11.23%	6.45%	8.97%	8.80%	
Project #2 - Estimated General Conditions	NA	0.5% - 1.5%	0.75% - 1.5%	1.5% - 3.0%	6.75%		
Combined Bid - NTE Preconstruction	\$185,900	\$275,000	\$337,250	\$622,000	\$211,780	\$326,386	
Combined Bid - NTE Personnel Cost	\$5,186,149	\$3,659,160	\$4,155,101	\$4,580,000	\$3,967,256	\$4,309,533	
Combined Bid - NTE Reimbursable Expenses	\$115,500	\$352,338	\$190,497	\$314,057	\$597,892	\$314,057	
Combined Bid - Precon/Personnel/Reimbursables	\$5,487,549	\$4,286,498	\$4,682,848	\$5,516,057	\$4,776,928	\$4,949,976	
Combined Bid - Overhead & Profit (Fee) (%)	2.00%	1.90%	2.00%	1.82%	2.38%	2.02%	
Combined Bid - Overhead & Profit (Fee) (\$)	\$2,136,000.00	\$2,029,200.00	\$2,136,000.00	\$1,940,700.00	\$2,544,900.00	\$2,157,360	
Combined Bid - Total Proposed with Fees (\$)	\$7,623,549	\$6,315,698	\$6,818,848	\$7,456,757	\$7,321,828	\$7,107,336	
Combined Bid - Total Proposed with Fees (%)	7.14%	5.91%	6.38%	6.98%	6.86%	6.65%	
Combined Bid - Estimated General Conditions	1.5% - 2.5%	0.5% - 1.25%	0.75% - 1.75%	1.5% - 3.0%	4.0% - 6.75%		
Alternates							
Alt #1: \$10M Umbrella	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$17,500/Year	\$0		
Alt #1: \$15M Umbrella	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$25,000/Year	\$0		
Alt #1: \$20M Umbrella	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$37,000/Year	\$0		
Alt #2: PLI of \$5M/\$5M	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$10,000/Year	\$0		
Alt #2: Project Specific Insurance Policy	TBD	\$250,000	\$130,000	TBD	\$5,000		
Bonding Capacity							
Single Project	\$400,000,000	\$175,000,000	\$200,000,000	Not Provided	\$100,000,000		
Firm's Aggregate	\$2,500,000,000	\$2,000,000,000	\$750,000,000	Not Provided	\$400,000,000		
Safety							
2000 EMR	0.40	0.61	0.74	0.74	0.54		
2019 EMR	0.45	0.61	0.67	0.81	0.57		
Notes							

Estimated Cost of the Work

Project #1 - Upgrades to existing facilities	\$	88,500,000
Project #2 - Robotics and Early Childhood Center	\$	18,300,000



LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS
 CM - CRITERIA BASED SELECTION SUMMARY
 July 13, 2021

PROJECT #1: \$88,500,000					PROJECT #2: \$18,300,000					PROJECTS 1&2: \$106,800,000						
CM FIRM	SELECTION CRITERIA	Score 5 = BEST 0 = WORST			WEIGHTED SCORE	CM FIRM	SELECTION CRITERIA	Score 5 = BEST 0 = WORST			WEIGHTED SCORE	CM FIRM	SELECTION CRITERIA	Score 5 = BEST 0 = WORST		
		POINTS	PROPOSED WEIGHT FACTOR	WEIGHTED				POINTS	PROPOSED WEIGHT FACTOR	WEIGHTED				POINTS	PROPOSED WEIGHT FACTOR	WEIGHTED
Barton Malow	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00	Barton Malow	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00	Barton Malow	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00		
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		
	Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30		Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30		Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30		
	Proposed Fees & Costs (7.14%)*	2	0.30	0.60		Proposed Fees & Costs (7.14%)*	5	0.30	1.50		Proposed Fees & Costs (7.14%)	2	0.30	0.60		
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.50		Proposal Score		1.00	4.40		Proposal Score		1.00	3.50		
	Proposal Score	3.50	60.00	210.00		Proposal Score	4.40	60.00	264.00		Proposal Score	3.50	60.00	210.00		
	Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score	3.00	40.00	120.00		
	Final Score			210.00		Final Score			264.00		Final Score			330.00		
Christman	Relevant Experience	4	0.20	0.80	Christman	Relevant Experience	4	0.20	0.80	Christman	Relevant Experience	4	0.20	0.80		
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		
	Project Approach	4	0.10	0.40		Project Approach	4	0.10	0.40		Project Approach	4	0.10	0.40		
	Proposed Fees & Costs (6.31%)	4	0.30	1.20		Proposed Fees & Costs (8.53%)	3	0.30	0.90		Proposed Fees & Costs (5.91%)	5	0.30	1.50		
	Proposal Score		1.00	4.00		Proposal Score		1.00	3.70		Proposal Score		1.00	4.30		
	Proposal Score	4.00	60.00	240.00		Proposal Score	3.70	60.00	222.00		Proposal Score	4.30	60.00	258.00		
	Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score	4.00	40.00	160.00		
	Final Score			240.00		Final Score			222.00		Final Score			418.00		
Clark	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00	Clark	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00	Clark	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00		
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	4	0.40	1.60		
	Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30		Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30		Project Approach	3	0.10	0.30		
	Proposed Fees & Costs (6.80%)	3	0.30	0.90		Proposed Fees & Costs (11.23%)	0	0.30	0.00		Proposed Fees & Costs (6.38%)	4	0.30	1.20		
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.80		Proposal Score		1.00	2.90		Proposal Score		1.00	4.10		
	Proposal Score	3.80	60.00	228.00		Proposal Score	2.90	60.00	174.00		Proposal Score	4.10	60.00	246.00		
	Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score	5.00	40.00	200.00		
	Final Score			228.00		Final Score			174.00		Final Score			446.00		
McCarthy & Smith	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00	McCarthy & Smith	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00	McCarthy & Smith	Relevant Experience	5	0.20	1.00		
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	3	0.40	1.20		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	3	0.40	1.20		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	3	0.40	1.20		
	Project Approach	2	0.10	0.20		Project Approach	2	0.10	0.20		Project Approach	2	0.10	0.20		
	Proposed Fees & Costs (7.14%)**	2	0.30	0.60		Proposed Fees & Costs (6.45%)**	5	0.30	1.50		Proposed Fees & Costs (6.98%)**	3	0.30	0.90		
	Proposal Score		1.00	3.00		Proposal Score		1.00	3.90		Proposal Score		1.00	3.30		
	Proposal Score	3.00	60.00	180.00		Proposal Score	3.90	60.00	234.00		Proposal Score	3.30	60.00	198.00		
	Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score	4.00	40.00	0.00		
	Final Score			180.00		Final Score			234.00		Final Score			198.00		
Rockford	Relevant Experience	1	0.20	0.20	Rockford	Relevant Experience	1	0.20	0.20	Rockford	Relevant Experience	1	0.20	0.20		
	Proposed Team / Staff Experience	2	0.40	0.80		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	2	0.40	0.80		Proposed Team / Staff Experience	2	0.40	0.80		
	Project Approach	5	0.10	0.50		Project Approach	4	0.10	0.40		Project Approach	4	0.10	0.40		
	Proposed Fees & Costs (6.42%)	4	0.30	1.20		Proposed Fees & Costs (8.97%)	3	0.30	0.90		Proposed Fees & Costs (6.86%)	3	0.30	0.90		
	Proposal Score		1.00	2.70		Proposal Score		1.00	2.30		Proposal Score		1.00	2.30		
	Proposal Score	2.70	60.00	162.00		Proposal Score	2.30	60.00	138.00		Proposal Score	2.30	60.00	138.00		
	Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score		40.00	0.00		Interview Score	4.00	40.00	0.00		
	Final Score			162.00		Final Score			138.00		Final Score			138.00		

*Barton Malow only provided a combined bid. These values were averaged from that combined proposal for comparison purposes.
 **Reimbursable costs were not provided by McCarthy Smith. The average value from other firms was applied to their fee for comparison purposes.

