



January 11, 2019

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects  
Contract Award Recommendation for 2019 Pavement Projects  
Bid Pack #1 - Churchill High / Emerson Middle / Coolidge Elementary / Frost Middle

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of a Prime Contractor for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend a Prime Contractor firm for these Projects.

On November 12, 2018, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On December 6, 2018, six (6) bid proposals were received for the Projects, and over the next several weeks were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on December 10th, 2018 with various members of the Team participating. The scope of work, schedule, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and clarified.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending T&M Asphalt Paving, Inc. for contract award at all four schools. This includes acceptance of a combined bid savings of \$6,800.00 noted on their proposal form if awarded all four Projects. T&M Asphalt Paving, Inc. was the low bidder at Churchill High School, Emerson Middle School, and Coolidge Elementary School. They were the apparent second low bid at Frost Middle School. However, upon further review, the apparent low bidder did not include the full scope of work.

Including hard construction of \$1,090,000.00 and construction contingency of \$109,000.00, the total Project award recommendation equals \$1,199,000.00.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at [scott.smith@plantemoran.com](mailto:scott.smith@plantemoran.com).

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Scott Smith, LEED AP  
Senior Consultant

Enclosures:    Cost Summary  
                  NTH Recommendation Letter  
                  Bid Tabulation



**CHURCHILL / EMERSON / COOLIDGE / FROST PAVEMENT PROJECTS - COST SUMMARY**

<b>Building</b>	<b>Hard Construction</b>		
	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual **</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Churchill High School	\$ 280,000	\$ 260,873	\$ 19,127
Emerson Middle School	\$ 490,000	\$ 444,229	\$ 45,771
Coolidge Elementary School	\$ 100,000	\$ 107,827	\$ (7,827)
Frost Middle School	\$ 250,000	\$ 277,071	\$ (27,071)
			\$ -
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,120,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,090,000</b>	<b>\$ 30,000</b>

<b>Building</b>	<b>Construction Contingency (10%)</b>		
	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Churchill/Emerson/Coolidge/Frost	\$ 112,000	\$ 109,000	\$ 3,000
	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 112,000</b>	<b>\$ 109,000</b>	<b>\$ 3,000</b>

<b>Building</b>	<b>Total Project Costs</b>		
	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual</b>	<b>Variance</b>
Churchill/Emerson/Coolidge/Frost	\$ 1,232,000	\$ 1,199,000	\$ 33,000
	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$ 1,232,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,199,000</b>	<b>\$ 33,000</b>

\*\* Represents Actual Bid Amount after proration of combined bid savings of \$6,800.00.



**NTH Consultants, Ltd.**

Infrastructure Engineering  
and Environmental Services

41780 Six Mile Road, Suite 200  
Northville, MI 48168  
Phone: 248-553-6300  
Fax: 248-324-5179

Mr. Phillip Francis  
Director of Operations  
Livonia Public Schools  
15125 Farmington Road  
Livonia, Michigan 48154

January 10, 2019  
NTH Project No. 62-180275-00

**RE: 2019 Livonia Public Schools Paving Program  
Bid Package No. 1 – Churchill, Coolidge, Emerson and Frost Pavements  
Contractor Award Recommendation  
City of Livonia, Wayne County, Michigan**

Dear Mr. Francis,

Per our discussion and review of the Contractor’s bids received, we have reviewed the Contractors' bid totals for the referenced project. Based on our review of the bids; specifically, the total bid to complete the work and the proposed contractor schedules, we recommend Livonia Public Schools retain T&M Asphalt Paving for the 2019 Churchill, Coolidge, Emerson and Frost Pavement Improvement Project.

After post-bid interviews with qualified bidders, the apparent low bidder for Frost did not have a complete scope for that school. T&M was the lowest qualified bidder for each project, including Frost. According to T&M’s quote, the cost per school and total construction contract amount will be as follows:

Churchill High School	\$262,500
Coolidge Elementary School	\$108,500
Emerson Middle School	\$447,000
Frost Middle School	\$278,800
TOTAL	\$1,096,800
Combined Bid Savings	(\$6,800)
Grand TOTAL	\$1,090,000

However, we recommend maintaining some contingency funds for the project on the order of 10 percent (\$109,000) for unforeseen conditions that may be encountered.

Should you have any questions or need additional information regarding the project scope or budget, feel free to contact John Stadnicar at (248) 662-2730 (direct line).

Sincerely,

NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Keith V. Laurenz, P.E.  
Senior Staff Engineer

John B. Stadnicar, P.E.  
Senior Vice President

KVL/JBS/kg

cc: Harry Lau, Livonia Public Schools  
Paul Theriault, P.E., LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa  
Scott Smith, LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa

