

March 20, 2015

Ms. Lisa Abbey
Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Contract Award Recommendation for Construction Bids
Hayes/Kennedy/Roosevelt Elementary Schools

Dear Ms. Abbey:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of Prime Contractors for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, McCarthy & Smith, LPS administration and staff (the Bond Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend Prime Contractors firms for this Project.

On March 4, 2015 bid proposals were received for two bid categories of work, which were not included in the previous award recommendations earlier this month. Interviews were held over the next week and were attended by various members of the Bond Team.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Bond Team is recommending the firms listed in McCarthy & Smith's Award Recommendation Letter dated March 17, 2015 for contract award. Including hard construction, CM fees and costs, and construction contingency dollars, this Project Award recommendation equals \$174,323.00. The total REVISED Project award recommendation equals \$8,907,518.00. This also includes several Alternates as detailed in the letter.

For the Prime Contractors, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor. The CM costs and fees will be detailed in Amendment #04 to AIA – C132 – 2009 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Construction Manager, both pending final review and approval by district legal counsel.

The Project Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendations of the Bond Team. Please direct all questions through me via email.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA



Paul Theriault, PE, LEED AP
Vice President

Enclosures: Budget Summary
 Award Recommendation Letter
 Summary of Costs
 Bid Tabulations

HAYES/KENNEDY/ROOSEVELT - BUDGET SUMMARY

Testing & Balancing and Visual Display Boards

Hard Construction	
Building	Actual Budget
Hayes Elementary	45,923.67
Kennedy Elementary	44,926.67
Roosevelt Elementary	65,073.66
Totals	155,924.00
CM Fees/Costs	
Building	Actual Budget
Hayes Elementary	826.34
Kennedy Elementary	809.03
Roosevelt Elementary	1,171.89
Totals	2,807.26
Construction Contingency	
Building	Actual Budget
Hayes Elementary	4,592.33
Kennedy Elementary	4,493.17
Roosevelt Elementary	6,507.16
Totals	15,592.66
Total Project Costs	
Building	Actual Budget
Hayes Elementary	51,342.34
Kennedy Elementary	50,228.87
Roosevelt Elementary	72,752.71
Totals	174,323.92

HAYES/KENNEDY/ROOSEVELT - BUDGET SUMMARY - REVISED

	Hard Construction		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Hayes Elementary	\$ 2,318,578	\$ 2,469,373	\$ (150,795)
Kennedy Elementary	\$ 2,071,629	\$ 2,253,912	\$ (182,283)
Roosevelt Elementary	\$ 3,675,710	\$ 2,742,182	\$ 933,528
Entryways	\$ -	\$ 78,300	\$ (78,300)
Totals	\$ 8,065,917	\$ 7,543,767	\$ 522,150

	CM Fees/Costs		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Hayes Elementary	\$ 185,486	\$ 202,311	\$ (16,825)
Kennedy Elementary	\$ 165,730	\$ 198,433	\$ (32,703)
Roosevelt Elementary	\$ 294,057	\$ 207,222	\$ 86,835
Entryways		\$ 1,409	\$ (1,409)
Totals	\$ 645,273	\$ 609,375	\$ 35,898

	Construction Contingency		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Hayes Elementary	\$ 220,678	\$ 246,937	\$ (26,259)
Kennedy Elementary	\$ 197,174	\$ 225,391	\$ (28,217)
Roosevelt Elementary	\$ 349,848	\$ 274,218	\$ 75,630
Entryways		\$ 7,830	\$ (7,830)
Totals	\$ 767,700	\$ 754,376	\$ 13,324

	Total Project Costs		
Building	Budget	Actual	Variance
Hayes Elementary	\$ 2,724,742	\$ 2,918,621	\$ (193,879)
Kennedy Elementary	\$ 2,434,533	\$ 2,677,736	\$ (243,203)
Roosevelt Elementary	\$ 4,319,615	\$ 3,223,622	\$ 1,095,993
Entryways	\$ -	\$ 87,539	\$ (87,539)
Totals	\$ 9,478,890	\$ 8,907,518	\$ 571,372

previous variance \$ 745,695

Total for Rebids \$ 174,323



McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Construction Services

A.3.

March 17, 2015

Lisa Abbey, Director of Business Services
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia Public Schools – 2013 Bond Program
Bid Package #3 – Hayes, Kennedy and Roosevelt Elementary School Remodeling Projects

SUBJ: Contract Award Recommendation
BD 121 Visual Display Boards and BD 185 Test and Balancing

Dear Ms. Abbey,

On Wednesday, March 4, 2015 at 12:00 p.m., sealed bids were received and publicly opened for the above referenced project. Bids were opened, recorded and tabulated.

The project team conducted post bid interviews with each of the qualified bidders for each bid division of work. During the post bid interview, the project team reviewed the scope of work, project schedule, manpower requirements, and specified materials with each of the contractors. Based upon the project team’s review of the proposals and bidders, we propose the following recommendations to Livonia Public Schools for contract award:

Bid Division 121: Visual Display Boards (Hayes, Kennedy and Roosevelt)

Tom Schiller

Cig Jan Products

33000 Hanna Lake Industrial Drive
Caledonia, MI 49316

Base Bid	\$49,560.00
PLM Bond (Travelers Casualty and Surety Company of America)	\$750.00
Alternate A1-HA Remove and replace existing tack boards that are not on the teaching wall	\$1,542.00
Alternate A1-KE Remove and replace existing tack boards that are not on the teaching wall	\$0.00
Alternate A1-RO Remove and replace existing tack boards that are not on the teaching wall	<u>\$8,272.00</u>
TOTAL	\$60,124.00

Bid Division 185: Test and Balance (Hayes, Kennedy and Roosevelt)

Eddie Tarazi

International Test and Balance Inc.

17135 West 10 Mile Road Ste 112
Southfield, MI 48075

Base Bid	\$92,000.00
PLM Bond (West Bend Mutual Insurance Company)	<u>\$3,800.00</u>
TOTAL	\$95,800.00

TOTAL AWARD RECOMMENDATION AMOUNT: \$ 155,924.00

I trust the above recommendation meets the approval of the administration and the Board of Education. I will be in attendance at the March 23, 2015 board meeting to address any questions or concerns that may arise.

Please feel free to contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Steve Banchemo

Steve Banchemo
Sr. Project Manager

cc: Mr. Paul Theriault, Plante Moran Cresa
Ms. Keti Mitevska, French Associates
Mr. Bill McCarthy, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Ms. Lisa Bondy, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Mr. Rob Sturdy, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
Mr. Dave Hampton, McCarthy & Smith, Inc.
File

Award Summary
 WITH: Visual Display Boards and Balancing



Bid Division / Description	Apparent Low Bidder	BASE BID INFORMATION						BREAKDOWN BY SCHOOL (not including alternates)			
		Base Bid	PLM Bond	VE / CBD	Total	# of Bids Rec'd	Bid Range		Hayes	Kennedy	Roosevelt
							Low	High			
103 Selective Demolition (Hayes)	DKI	\$59,900.00	\$1,500.00		\$61,400.00	4	\$59,900.00	\$82,600.00	\$61,400.00		
103 Selective Demolition (Kennedy)	Great Lake Construction Services	\$47,600.00			\$47,600.00	4	\$47,600.00	\$61,750.00		\$47,600.00	
103 Selective Demolition (Roosevelt)	DTS Services	\$67,750.00	\$1,700.00		\$69,450.00	4	\$67,750.00	\$79,800.00			\$69,450.00
104 Concrete	Contek, Inc.	\$202,800.00	\$1,700.00		\$204,500.00	3	\$202,800.00	\$207,740.00	\$66,550.00	\$76,650.00	\$61,300.00
106 Masonry	Zimmerman	\$295,300.00	\$3,500.00		\$298,800.00	6	\$295,300.00	\$592,820.00	\$138,966.67	\$80,766.67	\$79,066.67
107 Steel	Morkin & Sowards	\$38,430.00			\$38,430.00	5	\$38,430.00	\$82,400.00	\$10,822.00	\$14,320.00	\$13,288.00
108 Carpentry / General Trades	Wally Kosorski	\$165,780.00	\$3,730.00		\$169,510.00	4	\$165,780.00	\$527,233.00	\$39,613.33	\$68,953.33	\$60,943.33
109 Roofing	JD Candler*	\$11,200.00			\$11,200.00	2	\$11,200.00	\$18,900.00	\$4,600.00	\$4,600.00	\$2,000.00
113 Hollow Metal / Wood Doors / Finish Hardware	Rayhaven	\$196,954.00	\$1,480.00		\$198,434.00	6	\$196,954.00	\$215,645.00	\$52,715.33	\$85,957.33	\$59,761.33
114 Alum Entrances; Windows; Glass & Glazing (Hayes)	Hewett*	\$212,500.00	\$2,200.00		\$214,700.00	5	\$212,500.00	\$296,897.00	\$214,700.00		
114 Alum Entrances; Windows; Glass & Glazing (Kennedy)	Architectural Glass*	\$201,500.00	\$1,511.00		\$203,011.00	5	\$201,500.00	\$300,000.00		\$203,011.00	
114 Alum Entrances; Windows; Glass & Glazing (Roosevelt)	Preferred Glass	\$343,925.00	\$8,598.00		\$352,523.00	5	\$343,925.00	\$465,242.00			\$352,523.00
115 Metal Studs / GPDW / EIFS	DTS Services	\$96,000.00	\$2,400.00		\$98,400.00	3	\$96,000.00	\$133,000.00	\$13,325.00	\$30,750.00	\$54,325.00
116 Hard Tile	Boston Tile**	\$85,820.00	\$930.00		\$86,750.00	4	\$85,820.00	\$102,816.00	\$21,410.00	\$34,110.00	\$31,230.00
117 Acoustical Treatments (Hayes)	DTS Services	\$99,260.00	\$2,980.00		\$102,240.00	7	\$99,260.00	\$168,000.00	\$102,240.00		
117 Acoustical Treatments (Kennedy)	DTS Services	\$96,030.00	\$2,890.00		\$98,920.00	7	\$96,030.00	\$158,600.00		\$98,920.00	
117 Acoustical Treatments (Roosevelt)	DTS Services	\$116,705.00	\$3,505.00		\$120,210.00	8	\$116,705.00	\$187,600.00			\$120,210.00
118 Carpet & Resilient Flooring (Hayes)	Cohns*	\$90,000.00	\$800.00		\$90,800.00	6	\$90,000.00	\$118,250.00	\$90,800.00		
118 Carpet & Resilient Flooring (Kennedy)	Cohns	\$72,500.00	\$500.00		\$73,000.00	6	\$72,500.00	\$108,300.00		\$73,000.00	
118 Carpet & Resilient Flooring (Roosevelt)	Cohns*	\$126,000.00	\$1,200.00		\$127,200.00	6	\$126,000.00	\$147,250.00			\$127,200.00
119 Terrazzo	Michielutti Bros	\$15,000.00			\$15,000.00	2	\$15,000.00	\$25,500.00	\$15,000.00		
120 Painting (Hayes)	Continental	\$49,450.00	\$1,500.00		\$50,950.00	7	\$49,450.00	\$83,138.00	\$50,950.00		
120 Painting (Kennedy)	F&P Painting	\$46,500.00	\$1,162.50		\$47,662.50	7	\$46,500.00	\$113,169.00		\$47,662.50	
120 Painting (Roosevelt)	Continental	\$54,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$56,000.00	7	\$54,000.00	\$108,992.00			\$56,000.00
121 Visual Display Boards	Cig Jan	\$49,560.00	\$750.00		\$50,310.00	2	\$49,560.00	\$60,300.00	\$14,115.00	\$14,660.00	\$21,535.00
122 Signage	JL Geisler	\$39,087.00			\$39,087.00	5	\$39,087.00	\$69,272.00	\$16,715.00	\$15,949.00	\$6,423.00
125 Toilet Partition	Dew-EI*	\$43,650.00			\$43,650.00	6	\$43,650.00	\$64,700.00	\$15,051.00	\$8,401.00	\$20,198.00
128 Casework	Farnell Contracting	\$237,400.00	\$2,400.00		\$239,800.00	3	\$237,400.00	\$275,300.00	\$78,600.00	\$69,300.00	\$91,900.00
130 Window Treatments	International Building Products	\$42,398.00			\$42,398.00	6	\$42,398.00	\$86,173.00	\$11,157.27	\$8,754.17	\$22,486.56
140 Plumbing (Hayes)	Mills	\$100,000.00	\$1,500.00		\$101,500.00	4	\$100,000.00	\$198,171.00	\$101,500.00		
140 Plumbing (Kennedy)	Mills	\$113,000.00	\$1,700.00		\$114,700.00	4	\$113,000.00	\$233,500.00		\$114,700.00	
140 Plumbing (Roosevelt)	Johnson Wood	\$169,000.00	\$2,400.00		\$171,400.00	4	\$169,000.00	\$270,000.00			\$171,400.00
142 HVAC (Hayes)	Great Lakes Mechanical	\$671,000.00	\$7,000.00	-\$30,000.00	\$648,000.00	5	\$671,000.00	\$776,000.00	\$648,000.00		
142 HVAC (Kennedy)	Great Lakes Mechanical	\$657,000.00	\$7,000.00	-\$30,000.00	\$634,000.00	6	\$657,000.00	\$744,000.00		\$634,000.00	
142 HVAC (Roosevelt)	Great Lakes Mechanical	\$788,000.00	\$8,000.00	-\$30,000.00	\$766,000.00	4	\$788,000.00	\$920,000.00			\$766,000.00
143 Electrical (Hayes)	J&J Electrical	\$475,000.00	\$5,000.00		\$480,000.00	3	\$475,000.00	\$623,700.00	\$480,000.00		
143 Electrical (Kennedy)	J&J Electrical*	\$482,000.00	\$5,000.00		\$487,000.00	3	\$482,000.00	\$616,000.00		\$487,000.00	
143 Electrical (Roosevelt)	Greenline	\$492,000.00	\$12,000.00		\$504,000.00	3	\$492,000.00	\$696,000.00			\$504,000.00
149 Fencing	American Fence	\$12,932.00			\$12,932.00	3	\$12,932.00	\$20,645.00	\$4,448.00	\$4,434.00	\$4,050.00
185 Test and Balance	International Test & Balance	\$92,000.00	\$3,800.00		\$95,800.00	2	\$92,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,266.67	\$30,266.67	\$35,266.67
TOTALS		\$7,254,931.00	\$102,336.50	-\$90,000.00	\$7,267,267.50	186	\$7,255,021.00	\$10,069,403.00	\$2,282,945.27	\$2,253,765.67	\$2,730,556.56

*= 2nd Low
 **=3rd Low

Construction Budget Summary	Base Bid	Alternates	Total W/ Alternates	
Hayes Elementary School	\$2,282,945.27	\$186,428.00	\$2,469,373.27	48.27898002
Kennedy Elementary School	\$2,253,765.67	\$146.00	\$2,253,911.67	44.59129644
Roosevelt Elementary School	\$2,730,556.56	\$11,625.00	\$2,742,181.56	40.22504525
2014 Entry Projects Concrete Alternate	\$0.00	\$78,300.00	\$78,300.00	
TOTALS	\$7,267,267.50	\$276,499.00	\$7,543,766.50	

* Not low bidder

Award Summary
WITH: Visual Display Boards and Balancing



Bid Division / Description	ALTERNATES									
	A-1HA	A-3HA	A-4HA	E-1HA	A-1KE	A-3KE	E-1KE	A-1RO	A-3RO	A-10
103 Selective Demolition (Hayes)	\$1,500.00	\$1,400.00								
103 Selective Demolition (Kennedy)					\$200.00	\$0.00				
103 Selective Demolition (Roosevelt)								\$2,353.00		
104 Concrete										\$78,300.00
106 Masonry			-\$3,500.00							
107 Steel										
108 Carpentry / General Trades		\$17,806.00				\$6,946.00				
109 Roofing			\$183,180.00							
113 Hollow Metal / Wood Doors / Finish Hardware										
114 Alum Entrances; Windows; Glass & Glazing (Hayes)										
114 Alum Entrances; Windows; Glass & Glazing (Kennedy)										
114 Alum Entrances; Windows; Glass & Glazing (Roosevelt)										
115 Metal Studs / GPDW / EIFS										
116 Hard Tile			-\$7,500.00							
117 Acoustical Treatments (Hayes)										
117 Acoustical Treatments (Kennedy)										
117 Acoustical Treatments (Roosevelt)										
118 Carpet & Resilient Flooring (Hayes)										
118 Carpet & Resilient Flooring (Kennedy)										
118 Carpet & Resilient Flooring (Roosevelt)										
119 Terrazzo										
120 Painting (Hayes)		-\$1,000.00								
120 Painting (Kennedy)										
120 Painting (Roosevelt)								\$1,000.00		
121 Visual Display Boards	\$1,542.00				\$0.00			\$8,272.00		
122 Signage										
125 Toilet Partition										
128 Casework										
130 Window Treatments										
140 Plumbing (Hayes)										
140 Plumbing (Kennedy)										
140 Plumbing (Roosevelt)										
142 HVAC (Hayes)										
142 HVAC (Kennedy)										
142 HVAC (Roosevelt)										
143 Electrical (Hayes)				-\$7,000.00						
143 Electrical (Kennedy)							-\$7,000.00			
143 Electrical (Roosevelt)										
149 Fencing										
185 Test and Balance										
	\$3,042.00	\$18,206.00	\$172,180.00	-\$7,000.00	\$200.00	\$6,946.00	-\$7,000.00	\$10,625.00	\$1,000.00	\$78,300.00
*= 2nd Low										
**=3rd Low	\$3,042.00	\$18,206.00	\$172,180.00	-\$7,000.00	\$200.00	\$6,946.00	-\$7,000.00	\$10,625.00	\$1,000.00	
	\$186,428.00				\$146.00			\$11,625.00		\$78,300.00

- | | |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-1HA | Remove and Replace existing tack boards that are not on the teaching wall |
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-3HA | Provide and install new student corridor lockers. |
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-4HA | Provide and install new metal fascia over existing precast fascia |
| Alternate (Electrical) No. E-1HA | Wireless Clocks |
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-1KE | Remove and Replace existing tack boards that are not on the teaching wall |
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-3KE | Provide and install new student corridor lockers. |
| Alternate (Electrical) No. E-1KE | Wireless Clocks |
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-1RO | Remove and Replace existing tack boards that are not on the teaching wall |
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-3RO | Paint Media Center exposed roof deck |
| Alternate (Architectural) No. A-10 | Replace Stamped Concrete |

Project: Bid Package #3
Owner: Livonia Public Schools
Architect: French Associates
Construction Mgr: McCarthy & Smith, Inc.



Bid Due Date: Wednesday, March 4, 2015 @ 12:00 p.m.

BD #: 121 Visual Display Boards - Hayes/Kennedy/Roosevelt Elementary Schools

Bidder	Base Bid	PLM Bond	Total	Alternates			Bid Security	Fam. Disc.	Iran Sanct.	Add #1	Add #2	Add #3	Add #4	Add #5	Remarks
				Alt. #A1-HA	Alt. #A1-KE	Alt. #A1-RO									
1 Cig Jan Products 39 Twin Oaks Drive Lapeer, MI 48446 (810) 667-6594	\$49,560.00	\$750.00	\$50,310.00	\$1,542.00	\$0.00	\$8,272.00	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
2 Claridge Products 66879 Orchared Lake W. Bloomfield, MI (248) 535-1136	\$60,300.00	\$500.00	\$60,800.00	\$2,065.00	\$217.00	\$13,737.00	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Bid Check

Project: Bid Package #3
Owner: Livonia Public Schools
Architect: French Associates
Construction Mgr: McCarthy & Smith, Inc.



Bid Due Date: Wednesday, March 4, 2015 @ 12:00 p.m.

BD #: 185 Test & Balance - Hayes/Kennedy/Roosevelt Elementary Schools

	Bidder	Base Bid	PLM Bond	Total	Bid Security	Fam. Disc.	Iran Sanct.	Add #1	Add #2	Add #3	Add #4	Add #5	Remarks
1	International Test 17135 W. Ten Mile Road Southfield, MI 48075 (248) 559-5864	\$92,000.00	\$3,800.00	\$95,800.00	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Bid Check
2	Enviro Aire 28915 Harper St. Clair Shores, MI 48081 (586) 779-6200	\$99,300.00	\$3,960.00	\$103,260.00	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	