ROOFING TECHNOLOGY ASSOCIATES, LTD.

38031 SCHOOLCRAFT
LIVONIA, MICHIGAN 48150-1065
(734) 591-4444 ● FAX (734) 591-1660 ● E-MAIL: rta@rtaltd.com
Web site www.rtaltd.com

November 3, 2026
Project No. 26-052

Mr. Jeffrey Burnside
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia MI 48154-5474
jburnsid@livoniapublicschools.org

RE: BID EVALUATION
Roof Replacement
- Coolidge Elementary School
- Garfield Community School
- Roosevelt Elementary School
- (3) High School Annex Buildings (CHS, FHS, SHS)

Livonia, Michigan

Dear Mr. Burnside:

On October 27, 2026, Livonia Public Schools (LPS) received and publicly opened bids for the referenced roof replacement projects. Four (4) bids were received for Coolidge Elementary School, two (2) for Garfield Community School, four (4) for Roosevelt Elementary School, and four (4) for the Annex Buildings at Churchill, Franklin, and Stevenson High Schools. RTA, Plante Moran Realpoint, and LPS (the Project Team) subsequently reviewed the bids, which are summarized in the attached bid tabulation.

Bid Results

The apparent low bidder for Coolidge Elementary School is Lutz Roofing at $1,124,000 with Royal Roofing as the apparent second-low bidder at $1,132,700.

The apparent low bidder for Garfield Community School is Royal Roofing at $765,700 with Lutz Roofing as the apparent second-low bidder at $1,543,000.

The apparent low bidder for Roosevelt Elementary School is Lutz Roofing at $1,024,000 with Bloom Roofing as the apparent second-low bidder at $1,124,491.

The apparent low bidder for the three (3) Annex Buildings at Churchill, Franklin, and Stevenson High Schools is Summit Point Roofing, with a Base Bid of $169,785 ($56,595 per building). Summit Point Roofing also submitted Alternate Price No. 1 for sheet metal fascia cladding at $18,090 ($6,030 per building) and Alternate Price No. 2 for new 6-inch gutters and 3-inch by 4-

inch downspouts at $14,550 ($4,850 per building). The total bid, including both alternates, is $202,425.

MTD Construction is the apparent second-low bidder for the Annex Buildings, with a Base Bid of $177,000, Alternate Price No. 1 of $25,500, and Alternate Price No. 2 of $22,500, for a total bid of $225,000.

Due Diligence

On October 29, 2026, the Project Team conducted virtual post-bid interviews with Summit Point Roofing, Royal Roofing, and Lutz Roofing to review their respective bids, proposed construction approaches, and their qualifications for the referenced roof replacement projects.

During the post-bid interview, Summit Point Roofing was asked to provide additional pricing for manufacturer's extended 25-year workmanship warranty, alternate pricing to upgrade from the standard lifetime laminated shingles to a premium lifetime designer laminated shingle, and a list of references for steep-slope roofing work on similar projects of this size. The attached spreadsheet indicates the added cost for these upgrades.

Summit Point Roofing provided five references of similar size and scope. Plante Moran Realpoint contacted one of the listed references, as well as an additional reference familiar to Plante Moran Realpoint that has worked with Summit Point Roofing on previous projects. Both references reported satisfactory project experiences and expressed no concerns regarding the contractor's performance. Based on this information and the post-bid interview process, RTA finds the contractor's experience and qualifications acceptable for the proposed work.

Recommendations

RTA has worked with both Lutz Roofing and Royal Roofing on several projects within and outside of the district and find their work to be acceptable. Although RTA has not previously worked with Summit Point Roofing, our recommendation is based on the information obtained during the post-bid interview process and the contractor's references.

Based on our evaluation of the submitted bids, review of the required bid documentation, and information obtained during the post-bid interviews, RTA recommends that Livonia Public Schools award the roof replacement contracts to the respective apparent low bidders identified below.

RTA recommends accepting Alternate No. 1 for sheet metal fascia cladding and Alternate No. 2 for new gutters and downspouts at the three (3) Annex Buildings. Further investigation into the manufacturer's extended 25-year workmanship warranty is necessary and may be recommended to add via change order at a later date.

The recommended contract amount for the Annex Buildings includes Summit Point Roofing's Base Bid of $169,785, Alternate No. 1 for sheet metal fascia cladding at $18,090, and Alternate No. 2 for new gutters and downspouts at $14,550 for a total of $202,425. RTA does not recommend accepting the premium lifetime designer laminated shingle upgrades.

RTA further recommends that LPS establish a construction contingency allowance of approximately 6% of the total recommended contract awards to address unforeseen conditions that may arise during construction.

Project	**Recommended Contractor**	**Contract Amount**
Coolidge Elementary School	Lutz Roofing	$1,124,000
Garfield Community School	Royal Roofing	$765,700
Roosevelt Elementary School	Lutz Roofing	$1,024,000
(3) Annex Buildings	Summit Point Roofing	$202,425
Total Recommended Awards		$3,116,125
6% Contingency		$186,968
Total Including 6% Contingency		**$3,303,093**

Sincerely,

ROOFING TECHNOLOGY ASSOCIATES, LTD.

Alexander P. Wisney, RRO
Project Manager

Ronald D. Kinne, RRC, RRO
Senior Project Manager

Attachments

Cc: Collin Frink

LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS | BID TABULATION

Coolidge Elementary School • Garfield Community School • Roosevelt Elementary School • 3 High School Annex Buildings

Roof Replacement Bid Opening October 27, 2026

Contractor	Bloom Roofing	Lutz Roofing	MTD	Royal Roofing	Summit Point	Tri Star	Weatherseal
Annex Buildings (Base Bid)	-	-	**$177,000.00**	-	**$169,785.00**	**$179,700.00**	**$216,500.00**
CHS	-	-	$59,000.00	-	$56,595.00	$59,900.00	$71,500.00
FHS	-	-	$59,000.00	-	$56,595.00	$59,900.00	$71,500.00
SHS	-	-	$59,000.00	-	$56,595.00	$59,900.00	$71,500.00
Annex Buildings (Alt. 1 - Fascia Cladding)	-	-	**$25,500.00**	-	**$18,090.00**	**$45,000.00**	**$19,635.00**
CHS	-	-	$8,500.00	-	$6,030.00	$15,000.00	$6,545.00
FHS	-	-	$8,500.00	-	$6,030.00	$15,000.00	$6,545.00
SHS	-	-	$8,500.00	-	$6,030.00	$15,000.00	$6,545.00
Annex Buildings (Alt. 2 - Gutters)	-	-	**$22,500.00**	-	**$14,550.00**	**$28,500.00**	**$23,895.00**
CHS	-	-	$7,500.00	-	$4,850.00	$9,500.00	$7,965.00
FHS	-	-	$7,500.00	-	$4,850.00	$9,500.00	$7,965.00
SHS	-	-	$7,500.00	-	$4,850.00	$9,500.00	$7,965.00
Coolidge Elementary School	**$1,239,681.00**	**$1,124,000.00**	**$1,415,000.00**	**$1,132,700.00**	-	-	-
Garfield Community School	-	**$1,543,000.00**	-	**$765,700.00**	-	-	-
Roosevelt Elementary School	**$1,124,491.00**	**$1,024,000.00**	**$1,198,000.00**	**$1,141,600.00**	-	-	-
Acknowledgement of Addendum 1	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Acknowledgement of Addendum 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Familial Disclosure	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Affidavit of Compliance Iran Sanctions	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Equal Employment Opportunity	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS | ANNEX BUILDINGS

Churchill • Franklin • Stevenson | Base Bid & Upgrade Pricing

ORIGINAL BASE BID	Combined	Churchill HS	Franklin HS	Stevenson HS
Original base bid	$169,785	$56,595	$56,595	$56,595

ADDITIONAL COSTS (ABOVE BASE BID)	Combined	Churchill HS	Franklin HS	Stevenson HS
25-year workmanship warranty	$4,110	$1,370	$1,370	$1,370
GAF Camelot II shingle upgrade	$96,525	$32,175	$32,175	$32,175
CertainTeed Grand Manor shingle upgrade	$153,540	$51,180	$51,180	$51,180

TOTAL PRICE BY OPTION	Combined	Churchill HS	Franklin HS	Stevenson HS
Original base bid	$169,785	$56,595	$56,595	$56,595
Base bid + 25-year warranty	$173,895	$57,965	$57,965	$57,965
GAF Camelot II w/o extended warranty	$266,310	$88,770	$88,770	$88,770
GAF Camelot II + 25-year warranty	$270,420	$90,140	$90,140	$90,140
CertainTeed Grand Manor w/o extended warranty	$323,325	$107,775	$107,775	$107,775

NOTE: Summit Point Roofing cannot provide CertainTeed 5-Star Manufacturer's limited warranty paired with CertainTeed Grand Manor shingles.