



March 11, 2020

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Sinking Fund Projects
Contract Award Recommendation for 2020 Pavement Projects
Bid Pack #1 – Jackson Early Childhood Center / Niji-Iro Elementary School / Johnson Upper
Elementary School / Churchill High School

Dear Mr. Francis:

This letter transmits an update from Plante Moran Cresa (PMC) as it relates to the assignment to assist and advise Livonia Public Schools (LPS) in its selection of a Prime Contractor for the Projects listed above. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMC, NTH Consultants, LPS administration and staff (the Team) to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate and recommend a Prime Contractor firm for these Projects.

On February 17, 2020, Construction Documents were formally issued and made available. An advertisement for bids was published in a local newspaper and also posted to the required State of Michigan website.

On March 4, 2020, three (3) bid proposals were received for the Projects, and over the next week were reviewed to determine the budget implications. Interviews were conducted on March 6th, 2020 with various members of the Team participating. The scope of work, schedule, and other particulars regarding the work were reviewed and clarified.

Upon completion of the interviews, and after subsequent clarifications and discussions, the Team is recommending T&M Asphalt Paving, Inc. for contract award at all four (4) schools as they are the lowest responsible bidder for each Project.

Including hard construction of \$993,300.00 and construction contingency of \$99,330.00, the total Project award recommendation equals \$1,092,630.00. This is inclusive of Bid Alternate #1 at Niji-Iro for an added cost of \$3,300.00. The scope of Alternate #1 consists of an area of gravel restoration North-East of the building to account for overflow parking conditions during peak demand.

For the Prime Contractor, the costs for this work will be detailed in AIA Contract A105 – 2017 Standard Form of Agreement between Owner and Contractor, pending final review and approval of terms by district legal counsel.

The Team is available at the Board's convenience to answer any questions regarding bidding, the proposals, interview process, or the recommendation herein. Please direct all questions through me via email at scott.smith@plantemoran.com.

Sincerely,

PLANTE MORAN CRESA

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Scott Smith".

Scott Smith, LEED AP
Senior Consultant

Enclosures: Cost Summary
 NTH Recommendation Letter
 Bid Tabulation



JACKSON / NIJI-IRO / JOHNSON /CHURCHILL PAVEMENT PROJECTS - COST SUMMARY

| | Hard Construction | | |
|---------------------------------|---------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| Building | Budget | Actual | Variance |
| Jackson Early Childhood Center | \$ 409,796 | \$ 422,000 | \$ (12,204) |
| Niji-Iro Elementary School | \$ 362,194 | \$ 317,800 | \$ 44,394 |
| Johnson Upper Elementary School | \$ 347,497 | \$ 244,500 | \$ 102,997 |
| Churchill High School | \$ 15,000 | \$ 9,000 | \$ 6,000 |
| | | | \$ - |
| Totals | \$ 1,134,487 | \$ 993,300 | \$ 141,187 |

| | Construction Contingency (10%) | | |
|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------|------------------|
| Building | Budget | Actual | Variance |
| Jackson/Niji-Iro/Johnson/Churchill | \$ 113,449 | \$ 99,330 | \$ 14,119 |
| | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| Totals | \$ 113,449 | \$ 99,330 | \$ 14,119 |

| | Total Project Costs | | |
|------------------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Building | Budget | Actual | Variance |
| Jackson/Niji-Iro/Johnson/Churchill | \$ 1,247,936 | \$ 1,092,630 | \$ 155,306 |
| | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| Totals | \$ 1,247,936 | \$ 1,092,630 | \$ 155,306 |



NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Infrastructure Engineering
and Environmental Services

41780 Six Mile Road, Suite 200
Northville, MI 48168
Phone: 248-553-6300
Fax: 248-324-5179

Mr. Phillip Francis
Director of Operations
Livonia Public Schools
15125 Farmington Road
Livonia, Michigan 48154

March 11, 2020
NTH Project No. 62-190279-00

**RE: 2020 Livonia Public Schools Paving Program
Bid Package No. 1 – Jackson, Niji-Iro, Johnson and Churchill
Contractor Award Recommendation
City of Livonia, Wayne County, Michigan**

Dear Mr. Francis:

Per our discussion and review of the Contractor's bids received, we have reviewed the Contractors' bid totals for the referenced project. Based on our review of the bids; specifically, the total bid to complete the work and the proposed contractor schedules, we recommend Livonia Public Schools retain T&M Asphalt Paving for the 2020 LPS Paving Program at Jackson, Niji-Iro, Johnson and Churchill Schools.

After post-bid interviews with qualified bidders, T&M Asphalt Paving was the lowest qualified bidder for each project. According to T&M's quote, the cost per school and total construction contract amount will be as follows:

| | |
|--------------------------------|------------------|
| Jackson Early Childhood Center | \$422,000 |
| Niji-Iro Elementary School | \$317,800 |
| Johnson Upper Elementary | \$244,500 |
| Churchill High School | <u>\$9,000</u> |
| GRAND TOTAL | \$993,300 |

The above includes Base Bid Cost and Bid Alternate #1 for Niji-Iro Elementary School.

However, we recommend maintaining some contingency funds for the project on the order of 10 percent (\$99,000) for unforeseen conditions that may be encountered.

Should you have any questions or need additional information regarding the project scope or budget, feel free to contact John Stadnicar at (248) 662-2730 (direct line).

Sincerely,

NTH Consultants, Ltd.

Brock Bosack
Staff Engineer

John B. Stadnicar, P.E.
Senior Vice President

BB/JBS/mam

cc: Harry Lau, Livonia Public Schools
Paul Theriault, P.E., LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa
Scott Smith, LEED AP, Plante Moran Cresa

